Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology

Volume 16, Number 1

January 2019

ISSN 1819-8465

The Official Journal of

Bangladesh Sociological Society

Committed to the advancement of sociological research and publication.
### Contents

#### Note from the Editor: Crystallization of Classes in Bangladesh

---

#### Demonizing the Other: Travels, Texts, Orientalism

*S. Aminul Islam*

- Travels, Texts, Orientalism
- and the Pre-colonial South Asia
- and Moving Beyond:
- Towards a New Turn in Sociology

---

#### Utilisation of Herbal Medicine among Pregnant Women Attending Formal Health Care Facilities in Okene Local Government Area of Kogi State

*Alfred Eboh*

- Gabriel M. Moyaki
- Patrick Okino

---

#### Job Satisfaction and Turnover Intentions of Police Officers in Rural Communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State, Nigeria

*Ajibade David and V. Kakwagh Venatus*

---

#### Evaluating the Impact of Organisational Culture on the Entrepreneurial Orientation of Small and Medium Enterprises in South Africa

*Obey Dzomonda and Olawale Fatoki*

---

#### Investigating the Effects of Parental Divorce on Academic Performances of Young People in Lagos-State, Nigeria: A Consequence of Parental Socio-Economic Condition

*Chauke T Andrew and Obadire O Segun*

---


*Sulaiman Abdul-Rasheed and Olusi A. Adepeju*

---

#### Transgression of Corporate Governance in South Africa’s State-owned Enterprises

*K.A. Mashamaite and P.S. Raseala*

---

#### Accentuating the Right to Access Quality Education in Rural South Africa: Lessons to be learned from other Countries

*Isaiah Mmatipe Sefoka*

---

#### Emergent Social and Economic Relations After Land Reform: Exploring the Farm Compound System After Land Reform in Zimbabwe

*Clement Chipenda*

---

#### Governance of Land in South Africa and the Fallacious Bantustan Urbanisation

*Johannes Tsheola and Olga Makhudu*

---

#### An Assessment of Community and Social Development Projects (CSDPs) on Beneficiaries in Damaturu Local Government Area of Yobe State, Nigeria (2009-2013)

*M. Tasiu Dansabo and M. Mustapha Gambo*

---

#### Counselling and Government Policy as Panaceas for Repositioning Girl Child Education in Nigeria: Some Lessons from Edo State, Nigeria

*Henrietta Ijeoma Alika and Oyaziwo Aluede*
Note from the Editor

Crystallization of Classes in Bangladesh

How do we know, in any society, who belongs to what class, assuming, of course, that there are classes and class differences among the members of the society? Sociologists, since Karl Marx, have been grappling with this question in one way or the other. Stratification, the study of society with the assumption that there are strata, visible or not, in all societies, and people can be placed in these strata based on this or that category, largely in terms of social class, status and power, finally gave in to a broader concept of social inequality to analyse society in all its variations including gender, age, ethnicity etc. All such facets of inequality are the living truths for any member of a society who has to deal with them in some workable way so that social relations become possible in a society. While any one of these categories may gain prominence in a society at any given time, class has remained the most significant of these among the sociologists, although since the demise of the Soviet Union studies of class lost much of its importance and remain confined to the text books. However, in recent years, studies of class, albeit the middle class only, has resurfaced with a vengeance from a quarter who despised such studies earlier, the economists and the World Bank in particular, and as I point out in one of my previous studies\(^1\), with some ulterior motives. So the question becomes pertinent again, as to how do we know who belongs to what class?

The economists and the World Bank have a very straightforward answer, disregarding all the sociological studies, to look at the purse. In a bid to understand what happens when one graduates from poverty, the World Bank and the economists proposed an income of more than $2 per person per day, the more can be anything from, $6, $11, to $50 or even $100, as middle class “income” all over the world. A few, to bring in qualitative measures, proposed the ownership of electronic gadgets and some even proposed the ownership of a car. And the World Bank has found half the world population as belonging to that middle class!

Naïve, to say the least, as these measures sound, the sociologists must face this vulgarization of the concept of class, the middle class in particular, and come up with better understanding of the concept. After all, we don’t put our hands in someone’s pocket before we shake those hands in introduction. We do, however, use numerous signs and symbols, largely intuitively, to identify the person, his or her standing in the society before we shake hands, have a cup of tea, go to a ball game with, invite the person to my house or give my daughter in marriage (remember the “social distance” measures?). Only in the last instance we may ask the groom’s income, that too, very tactfully. So that as we go about our

\(^1\) “Beware, the Middle Class is being Hijacked by the World Bank!” Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology. Volume 11 Number 2, July 2014. Pages 7-28.
social functions on a day to day basis we do so on the assumption that we mostly know the other person’s social position, what class the person belongs to. We just know. We have to!

I say “mostly” because we do not know for certain whether the income is between $2 and $6 or $2 and $100, nor is it necessary for most social dealings. We do have more or less a clear notion of the other person’s position based on any number of factors or the summation of factors like occupation, education, family environment, inheritance, upbringing, cultural association or social network, manners, social values, and even the ways of speaking, dressing and holding the fork and we often do so “instantly”. On hind sight we may have to change or revise our estimation of the other person, but that first moment of meeting is often our best clue. We may get an estimate of the income or wealth of the person even by looks but never actually ask. Thus, class is “visible”, we can literally see the “class” of the other person, we do not have to ask. Nor do we have to become an economist or even a sociologist to do that. Every one in every class based society has to know the class of the other person so as to go about in society.

Perhaps, and in spite of the economists and the World Bank, I am stating the obvious. We do, as a matter of fact, on a daily basis, make an estimation of the other person in terms of his or her social location, class, just on the basis of “looks”! Of course, looks can be deceptive but just think how many times you have been “correct”, we could not have done otherwise.

Now, think about a group of people belonging to the same class, how would they look? I came face to face with the question when I visited Kolkata, in India, for the first time during the early 1990s. I noted something extraordinary among the populace but I could not quite put my finger to it. Then in 2006 while visiting Kolkata again with a sociologist colleague from the University of Dhaka, I had a better opportunity to go about the city and get to know the people more closely and that uneasy feeling of not knowing resurfaced in me until my colleague, a great sociologist in his own right and the Associate Editor of this journal, Professor S. Aminul Islam, put the whole thing in limelight with just one question. He asked me, “Have you noticed that the people here all look alike”? I knew immediately what was bothering me and I also knew why.

Class situation, as in the Weberian sense, is given rise to by the “market situation”, which fosters a particular “life-style” and to simplify, people following a similar life-style belong to a particular “social class”. Each social class, thus, has its own ways of acting and thinking. The culture, social contacts, residences, education and occupation etc. tend to be similar in nature. Extending this logic further, we may argue that over the years this similarity in life-style will translate into the similarity in “looks”. As a person of a middle class is identifiable by his or her looks, so would be the others of that class and as a consequence people of similar life-style will tend to look similar, “look alike”. However, this is not to invoke the “cultural stereo types”, just that following a particular life-style, behaving in particular manners, going to similar social gatherings, celebrating similar cultural events or even wearing similar

---

addresses, living in similar residence, eating similar food etc. will give rise to a similarity in disposition, personality and outlook over time. This similarity will be noticeable to others. Studies of photos of couples living together for a long time tend to show similarities in their looks, in spite of their gender differences.

Hence these people of Kolkata, who over the generations have lived a particular life-style, possibly with little social mobility, tend to look similar, if not identical. As you might know, by far, the majority of the people living in Kolkata are Bengalis, including those who moved there from Bangladesh since 1947 partition. The city lost much of its grandeur of the colonial capital city and settled as a provincial metropolis losing much of its industries and commerce to other states of India and the city became the residence of largely middle class to lower middle class wage earners. Over the years, indeed, many generations, this middle to lower middle class “life-style” consolidated in the city giving rise to the predominant middle class culture of the city and indeed the “middle class look” of its people. Hence, they looked alike to us, the outsiders.

As we debated the issue, the obvious question that came up was, why then the residents Dhaka city, populated almost entirely by Bengalis, does not display this similarity? Indeed, the absence of such similarities among the people of Dhaka the Capital of Bangladesh further substantiates the point. Dhaka City, unlike Kolkata, has been in constant flux since 1947, and particularly since independence in 1971. The population of the city began to grow rapidly from over two hundred thousand after it became the capital of East Pakistan in 1947 and later of Bangladesh in 1971. But a major change in the population structure began in the 1990s, which saw a redoubling of the population in about 20 years and reached 12 million. This has occurred in the middle of tremendous change of the economy and social and political lives. Ever newer groups of people settled in the city during this period. So that the majority of the city population during this time (2006) were “fresh” from the villages all across the country. The population was diverse in terms of their economic pursuits and life-styles. The classes, in the city as well as the country in general, were in “transition” to say the least. Consolidation of any one social group into a particular class was yet to happen. People belonged to this or that occupation, income, wealth, social or cultural categories, it would be difficult to identify particular “classes” among this melee. This variability was a far cry from the similarity noted in Kolkata, so no look-alikes.

As I noted elsewhere¹, Bangladesh did not have much of an upper class while the best part of the newly forming “urban educated middle class” of the 1960s, due largely to their education, found comfortable living options in the Western countries like the USA and Canada by the 1980s, and later in Australia and elsewhere in Europe and migrated. So that there was a clear vacuum of upper classes in the county but was soon being filled up by the new political elites and their favored groups and individuals, including some of the remaining old middle class, each ruling group - the military, urban based political parties and parties with rural roots - patronized a newer set of individuals some of whom were a part of the

¹ Note from the Editor: Middle Class in Bangladesh. Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology. Volume 14 Number 1, January 2017. Pages 4-15.
ruling parties or were blessed by them. However, the consolidation of classes got repeatedly challenged with the recurring change in political fortunes as fresher set of population got to accumulate power, wealth and social position. This gave rise to numerous occupational and income categories with varying degrees of economic, social and political power but not clear cut classes. The diverse groups of people of Dhaka followed diverse ethnic, religious, cultural and social linkages. Indeed, people found it convenient to identify themselves more in terms of their “district” of origin, almost verging on “tribalism”, than any other categories, not even close enough to form class identities or following a similar life-style, and, of course, no similar “looks”. Which only proved our point.

That was in 2006. However, recently, only a few weeks ago, I had an occasion to visit a “food-court” in what is known as a “rich” neighbourhood of Dhaka City, where most of the today's moneyed people live. The food-court seats about 300 diners at a time and is serviced by over 20 food stalls representing international and ethnic tastes. As I waited for a “take-out” order, I passed my time looking at the people, as all sociologists do in their spare time; men, women, old, young, children, teenagers, their dresses, their eating styles, over-hearing bits of their conversation, their way of speaking, largely in English, a foreign language, some hopped tables while others greeted newcomers warmly. The whole scene was one of cordial festivity. Then suddenly I had a déjà vu moment, I had seen this before. They “all look alike”!

Perhaps, not quite so. But they did look very similar in their behaviour, in their style of movement, in their dress ups, even in their hair styles. It is definitely “getting there”. The similarity in their life-style, indeed, their “looks” was uncanny. Similarity in life-style translates into similarity of social class, so that this group of people is consolidating into an identifiable social class, with a visible life-style. Hence, class formation in this part of the city is definitely moving towards consolidation, at least the upper class, which is crystallizing into one solid block.

Over the last forty years or so, the missing upper class has been forming anew. An increasing number of people with blessings from the successive ruling parties are amassing a lot of wealth, including “black” money. The ones who make it to the top of the hierarchy during the rule of one party “manages” to retain some or most of the privileges during the next regime too, even when in opposition. Therefore, those few middle class families who took advantage of the upper class vacuum after the formation of Bangladesh and began making their fortunes, often because of politics, got joined by increasingly newer groups and individuals from the lower classes and have all consolidated by now in a sizable number of millionaires, if not billionaires (there definitely are billionaires among them if “black money” can be counted). Though no serious statistics are available, sample studies point to the top 10% of the income earners with an average per capita annual income of US $11,791 in Dhaka earning over 55% of the
total income (for the whole of Bangladesh, the average per capita annual income is estimated by the study at US $359 only).

The upper class, living in this neighbourhood, where a three bedroom apartment costs over half a million US dollars and an acre of land is valued at more than US $70 million is perhaps the top 1-2% of the population and is far richer, who lead a life vastly different from the rest of the population. Like in other societies, they are the owners of the industries and commerce, owners of much of the real-state within and outside this neighbourhood, visit foreign countries regularly, some even own property in other countries and often stay there for considerable amounts of time, send the children to English-medium schools, and universities, often to countries like USA, Canada, Australia etc., are familiar with other cultures, music, movies, dress styles, congregate in social occasions like weddings, birthdays and in clubs and eateries (as the “food-court”) and coffee shops, mostly within this “upper class” neighbourhood. They are forging a “life-style” of their own.

Perhaps, they have not consolidated so much as to be easily noticeable, and are constantly being replenished by ever newer groups and individuals to their ranks, rags to riches is a common story, but the process of crystallization of this rather “small” upper class is well on its way. This is definitely in contrast with other classes¹, particularly the middle class in Bangladesh, which, as I noted in one of my earlier quoted essay, is also in the process of forming with at least three different strands but still very fluid. Yet, certain amount of crystallization is also noticeable in their “life-style” and as such their looks. During my teaching at both “private” and “public” universities, this difference in life-style among the students was “noticeable”. Students, at a certain private university with extremely high tuition, hence, students likely to be of the “upper class”, appeared much different in their behaviour, social and cultural attendance, food habits, dresses etc. compared to the students of presumably middle to lower class students in the public university, where state covered near total cost of studies. They looked different too!

As is obvious, I have based this study largely on my personal observations, taking liberty of the Weberian theory of social class, that life-style, over time, can lead to not only similar attitude and behaviour patterns, but these may easily identify an individual or a group, class, of people and to even become visible as a category, look similar to each other, so as to “look alike” even as a class. Social interaction largely depends on such identification of the “other” person or groups in society, done intuitively and routinely by the insiders but may also be visible to the outsider (as is also often reported of the other categories such as ethnicity, religion etc.) In Bangladesh the classes are in the “formative phase” and very little is available by way of hard data. However, when we look at the life-style of a group of people, a certain amount of crystallization of that life-style is noticeable, raising the possibility of recognising the group as a “class”, in this case an “upper class”.

Nazrul Islam

¹ Rahman (2016) reports an average per capita annual income of the middle 50% income earners as US $1436 and US $ 555 for the bottom 40%.
Demonizing the Other: Travels, Texts, Orientalism and the Pre-colonial South Asia, and Moving Beyond: Towards a New Turn in Sociology

S. Aminul Islam

Abstract: One of the central questions that animated many of the early sociologists and historians of South Asia was why pre-colonial South Asia had lagged behind, remained stagnant and failed to develop capitalism (Karim, 1956 for a summary of the debate). They were all influenced by the seminal works of two of the central figures classical social theory -- Marx and Weber and later by that of Karl Wittfogel. Although Karl Marx’s theory of Asiatic Mode of Production became a major focus of controversy rejected by some and accepted with modification by others, yet the debate has continued to haunt both history and social sciences. Since 1978, Edward Said’s paradigm of Orientalism has completely transformed this debate. The objective of this paper is threefold. It revisits Said’s concept of Orientalism and deploys it to examine three of the core theoretical perspectives on the Oriental society—Marx’s notion of Asiatic Society, Weber’s analysis of Indian culture and social structure and Karl Wittfogel’s theory of Oriental despotism. The paper examines these theories against the currently available historical data to disprove these theories. The paper suggests that evolutionary paradigm of social change which has informed the study of social change since the Enlightenment or the concept of European exceptionalism that Weber advocated are too narrow to study the dynamics of social change which includes both rise and fall of civilizations within an increasingly global context. The looming crisis in sociology that Gouldner predicted has become true and sociology has merely lapsed into the study of here and now. Said fails to account for what led to the formation of Orientalist discourses. The world-system theory of Wallerstein has provided narratives of European transition to capitalism. It does not provide causes of transition. Recent scholarship in history on divergence only changes the time—scale of divergence. It falls into the same trap of European exceptionalism. This paper argues that the emerging sub-discipline of societal collapse provide us with an opportunity to move beyond the prevailing crisis in sociology. The paper argues for a new perspective in sociology that combines Orientalism with cyclical theory of social change advocated by Khaldūn and Paul Kennedy, world-system theory and recent studies on societal collapse to account for the divergence. The paper outlines a four-phase model of the rise and fall of polities and sets it in the context of the collapse of the Mughal Empire and rise of the West.

Keywords: Orientalism, World-system Theory, South Asia, Mughal Empire, divergence, societal collapse, cyclical theory, social change, crisis

1 An earlier and shorter version of this paper was presented at the East-West University, Dhaka. I am thankful to Professor Fakrul Alam, Pro-Vice-Chancellor of the university, Professor Mokerrom Hossain of Virginia State University and Professor Jahir Ahmed of Jahangirnagar University for their comments.

I am deeply indebted to my long-time friend and colleague Professor Nazrul Islam for meticulous review of the paper and insightful comments for revising the paper. This paper forms the first part of a series four essays.

2 Honorary Professor, Department of Sociology, University of Dhaka, Email: aminulislam2002@Gmail.com
"There is no document of civilization which is not at the same time a document of barbarism."
- Walter Benjamin, The Threepenny Opera.

Introduction

Since the colonial period, historians and social scientists have debated over the question why South Asia in spite of its fabled wealth and vast network of international trade failed to develop capitalism on its own before being colonized. Over the last two centuries, three of the most eminent social scientists have provided theoretical perspectives to account for why capitalism failed to blossom in the inhospitable terrain of pre-colonial South Asia. The most dazzling and provocative answer was provided by Karl Marx through his views on the Asiatic Society and Asiatic Mode of Production. Max Weber fleshed out a broader and opposite theoretical analysis that gave primacy to culture and embedded social institutions agreeing with Marx on many areas. Karl Wittfogel developed the idea of hydraulic society and Oriental despotism as an expression of total power to account for the failure of the indigenous merchant class to grow and transform into a capitalist class. In spite of long running criticism of these theories, they represent a vast and enduring archive of knowledge that underlies most of the views on the Orient in humanities and social sciences. This is particularly true for sociology.

Said's seminal work entitled Orientalism (1985) has provided a powerful critical tool to examine these core theories of Oriental society. Although Said himself has referred to Marx more often and to Weber only a couple of times and a large critical literature has emerged against each of these theories, there has been hardly any comparative analysis of these three theories from the prism of Orientalism. Orientalism, however, provides a metacritical perspective. It maps out the growth of a particular form of ideology in the West that justified colonialism and imperialism, it does not explain why the Orient failed to develop capitalism on its own or test it against empirical evidence. This paper aims at revisiting Orientalism on the occasion of 40th anniversary of the publication of Said’s book and moving beyond it to provide a sociologically grounded analysis of why capitalism failed to develop in this region taking the fall of the Mughal Empire as an example. It shows how Marx, Weber and Wittfogel in their different ways produced the most powerful expression of Orientalism that continues to dominate sociology and anthropology in South Asia. The paper argues that although Orientalism provides a powerful analytical tool, it is time to leave Said behind to construct a more adequate theory of uneven pattern of the dynamics of social change in the context of South Asia. The study of social stagnation and social change demands a more complex theory that combines theory with empirical evidence and not mere textual analysis. Thus the key objective of the paper is to refute the views of Marx, Weber and Wittfogel through most of the available evidence and relate it to the emerging field of societal collapse to account for the failure of pre-colonial South Asia to develop capitalism.

Orientalism
What is now a modern classic, Edward Said’s book *Orientalism* (1978; 1985), first published in 1978 now celebrates 40th year of publication. Although his book has spawned a bitter controversy and vast literature over the last four decades, he is now almost forgotten. Yet he is more relevant today in this post-humanist age and in the context of global reconfiguration of power and ideology.

**Meaning of Orientalism**

Said developed a metaparadigm or a particular of way of looking at the vision of the Orient that the Western texts animated through an examination of a selected number of literary works, travel accounts and related texts. Borrowing from Foucault the coupling of knowledge and power, he argued that these texts and the broader field of the studies on the Orient embodied a regime of truth that constructed the vast terrain of the Orient as peopled by the infantile other sanctioning enduring domination over them. The Orient is an integral part of European material civilization and culture. Orientalism expresses and represents that part culturally and even ideologically as a mode of discourse with supporting institutions, vocabulary, scholarship, imagery, doctrines, even colonial bureaucracies and colonial style" (Said, 1985:30).

Said provided three inter-related meanings of the term. First, Orientalism refers to an academic discipline consisting of intellectuals and scholars who write about and study the Orient. Secondly, “Orientalism is a style of thought based upon an ontological and epistemological distinction made between “the Orient" and (most of the time) “the Occident". Said argues that in spite of all variations, the Orient to the Western mind had an ontological stability that endures over time. Orientalism is “… a Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having autonomy over the Orient” (Said, 1985:3). It was not only a discourse. It was for him “…valuable as a sign of European-Atlantic power over the Orient....(Said, 1985:6). The Western culture manifested rationality and order. The Oriental culture was its polar opposite displaying irrationality and mysticism. The Western people were free and constituted a superior race by developing its full faculties. In contrast, Orientals were child-like and sensuous and were destined to be a subject race. Thirdly, from the late 18th century the discourse of orientalism became institutionalized in the form of corporate institutions specifically engaged in the study of the Orient. These three definitions are inter-connected and represent structures, process and a particular world-views and increasingly over time an institutional regime.

Said does recognize that there are a number of qualifications to the idea of orientalism. First, it is not just mere idea. Secondly, it is a relationship of power and hegemony articulated through an elaborate and crystalized discourse. Thirdly, oriental discourses are not mere ‘tissue of lies’ (Said, 1985:5). They manifest both reality and a mode of ideology that conceals it.

Said also makes distinction between latent and manifest orientalism. Orientalism also varies with each orientalist. Thus orientalism is not a unified body of texts. Orientalism manifests itself in different forms. It is expressed through travel accounts, literary works, linguistic analysis, and regional studies and it also varies over 19th and 20th centuries. “There was (and is) a linguistic Orient, Freudian Orient, a Spenglerian Orient, a Darwinian Orient, a racist Orient--and so on.”(Said, 1985: 22)
Orientalism, discourse and power and the other

Said’s unique importance lies in the fact that he transferred and deployed the Foucauldian concepts of knowledge, discourse and power from the realm of the madness in the West to a vast world of the infantile Orientals and consequently to billions of people living in Asia, Africa and Latin America. It was a particular way of analyzing texts that he later called contrapuntal technique (Said, 1993). Said was not concerned with the whole corpus of the oriental knowledge, he was merely unmasking its pervading and silent underworld that was unable to talk back and represent itself. Orientalism manifested the mission of the West to construct the invisible continent of humanity as traces of its own past or its abominable other. The West had reached its pinnacle of glory leaving all others in an ‘area of darkness’ or it was an exceptional civilization of superior race with the mandate to rule over the world. Said mainly focused on the works of Silvestre de Stracy and Ernest Renan to trace the doctrine of Orientalism as “primitive accumulation” in the symbolic sphere that both triggered and justified colonialism and imperialism (Hart, 2004). It led to the growth of an ‘imaginative geography’ of strange and bizarre peoples and cultures of distant lands that Europe had begun to explore through its sciences constituting and reconstituting it in a variety of demonic forms.

Said spells out the development of Orientalism over three phases. The first phase spans a long history from antiquity to 18th century. The second phase starts from Napoleon’s invasion of Egypt which triggers objectification and visualization of the Orient by three of the major colonial powers – England, France and Germany. “Quite literally, the occupation gave birth to the entire modern experience of the Orient as interpreted from within the universe of discourse founded by Napoleon in Egypt” (Said,1985:87). It was in this phase that Orientalism begun to be institutionalized in bodies like Asiatic Society, and courses of studies. In its final phase, from the Post-World II period, it expanded and crystalized as area studies in universities and specialized research centres, mainly in the USA.

Criticism

Said has faced criticism from both the left and the right of the contemporary intellectual landscape. Mustapha Marrouchi (2013) has observed that Said is now a forgotten name and Saidism is a thing of the past. One of fiercest critiques of Said from the right is Bernard Lewis, 1976). Lewis found that Said used the term in a restricted area –the Middle East and not even the whole of it, but only the Arab region. His dating of the emergence of Orientalism in modern times is also wrong. Orientalism became an established area of study in the 17th century. His selection of authors and texts were arbitrary and prejudiced. He also used texts that was not part of Oriental scholarship, even doctored their views and resorted to wrong translations in order to prove his views. His writings, in addition, contain many factual inaccuracies. “Apart from embodying a hitherto unknown theory of knowledge, Mr. Said expresses contempt for modern Arab scholarly achievement worse than anything that he attributes to his demonic
Orientalists.” (Lewis, 1976: 10) “Mr. Said’s knowledge of Arabic and Islam shows surprising gaps.”

Lewis, 1976: 12)

Clifford (2013) criticizes Said for inconsistency of his epistemic stand between Foucault’s discursive anti-humanism that merely plays with signifiers and his strong commitment to humanism. He also hovers between a representational Orient and a real Orient expressing an epistemological ambivalence. Said has also been accused of using selected authors and texts and emphasizing on works which was marginal to the Orientalist archive. European literature and thought had also concepts and ideas which were universalizing, self-reflexive and self-critical (Varisco, 2008; Warraq, 2007). Trautman (1997) has found that Said’s theory of Orientalism cannot be used for analyzing the case of colonial South Asia. Orientalism in India manifested both ‘Indomania’ and ‘Indophobia’ over time. Oriental discourses are not invariable.

Said has faced similar and harsh criticism from Marxist scholars. Ahmed (1992) has criticized him severely for the inadequacies of Orientalism as advanced by Said. He argues that Said has deployed three separate and contradictory definitions of Orientalism. Said firstly uses it as an academic area of research, secondly as a style of thought and thirdly as a corporate institution for studying the Orient. In addition, he accuses Said of borrowing from “…many kinds of conceptual frameworks and intellectual disciplines that one is simply bewildered” (Ahmed, 1992 182). What is more disturbing for Ahmed is his failure to account for the origin of Orientalism. Why should the West interiorize the Orient? Said uses both materialist accounts of colonialism and imperialism and also psychological categories. Thus his explanations remain disjointed. In the same vein, Sardar (2002) has found seven different meanings of the term Orientalism in Said’s work. “Using these all-embracing but contradictory definitions…” he accounts for an intellectual terrain “…from antiquity to contemporary times” (Sardar, 2002:68). Moreover Said did not acknowledge his debt to his predecessors. “On purely scholarly terms, Said’s contribution is not very significant when compared to Hodgson, Daniel and Southern on the one hand, and Tibawí, Alatas and Djait on the other” (Sardar, 2002:67). Habib (2005) has also criticized him harshly. He chastises Said for excluding significant and verifiable areas of Orientalist knowledge developed through synergic interaction between Western and Oriental scholars. His use of Marx was both unethical and irresponsible which tend to undermine his creditability (Habib, 2005).

Every new paradigm or metaparadigm generates a stream of criticism. What all his critics from the right or the left miss is that Said was not concerned with the whole corpus of Orientalist knowledge. What he did was a new and revolutionary way of looking at and reading of selected texts in true Kuhnian sense (Kuhn, 1970). Orientalism did not only manifest a body of knowledge, but also a universe of power. His novelty lies in his transposing of Foucault to a realm where he is most relevant. Neither colonialism nor imperialism is a display of firepower, but also a play of interlocking and dense body of metaphors that inspire and legitimate Western domination of the world. Texts are no less powerful than arms in preserving and perpetuating this domination. As one recent author observes:

…the critique of Said’s phenomenology does little to dim the luster of his analysis. As Derrida’s critique is merely a footnote to Foucault’s great achievement, so are similar critiques of Said’s
achievement. Despite its flaws, and much like Histoire de la folie, Orientalism remains a powerful analysis of a particular configuration of power/knowledge" (Hart, 2004:75).

Said, in fact, provides us with an extremely powerful tool for textual analysis perhaps no less significant than Derrida and Rolland Barthes. It is both a technique of analysis and trope for resistance to Western hegemony. It has registered further elaboration in his book Culture and Imperialism (Said, 1993).

We read a text contrapuntally, for example, "when we read it with an understanding of what is involved when an author shows, for instance, that a colonial sugar plantation is seen as important to the process of maintaining a particular style of life in England" (Culture and Imperialism, 1993: 78)

Texts embody and reveal the deep play of economy and material interests and are inexorably linked with culture, domination and exploitation.

There is first the authority of the European observer - traveler, merchant, scholar, historian, novelist. Then there is the hierarchy of spaces by which the metropolitan economy are seen as dependent upon an overseas system of territorial control, economic exploitation, and socio-cultural vision; without these stability and prosperity at ‘home’ ... would not be possible (Culture and Imperialism, 1993: 69).

It is not only that Said had tremendous impact on the development of post-colonialism and discourse analysis (Ashcroft and Ahluwalia, 1999), he is more relevant today as Vukovich (2012:xvi) observes, “…orientalism (as opposed to “bias”) may not be eternal in the way Althusser talked of ideology, but even with the rise of China it is still on the table, only more so.” It applies not only to China, but rest of the developing world. Said, if not immortal, seems to have a very long life.

Evolution of the concept of orientalism

The word Orient entered English language from old French by 1300 meaning east which was originally derived from Latin. Thus it came to signify all lands east of Europe (Etymological dictionary online). The idea that the Orient is different and other can be traced to ideas generated by wars of the Greek city-states, led by Athens with the Persians. In 480 BCE a Persian army captured and burned Athens, but eventually the Persians were defeated and compelled to withdraw from Greek lands. It led to the birth of an enemy discourse. In the texts of Greek philosophy, geography, history and literature, Greeks often identified themselves as different from and superior to the Orientals. Greeks were virtuous, freedom – loving and dynamic while the oriental people were servile and the rulers were despotic and society stationery. Romans also held similar views about the Orient. Later this image was transferred to the Ottoman Empire when it became a threat to Europe. Medieval scholars occasionally held negative image of the Orient. One of the key scholars of this period was John of Damascus of eighth century (Sardar, 2002). Since then a large number of Western scholars from Machiavelli (1469–1527) to Montesquieu made a distinction between the Orient and the West (App,2000).

Travels and Orientalism
The image of the Orient that went to shape the European vision was largely shaped by the accounts produced by large number of travellers who from 16th century visited the different countries and regions of Asia. In fact, this “…trans-epistemic exchange that intercontinental travel enabled….“(Kalra, 2014) expanded the foundation of Orientalism and reinforced it. With the invention of the printing press, the accounts of the travellers began to be widely circulated. Many of these travel accounts became popular undergoing as many as 30th or 40th editions. Both London and Amsterdam became major centres for the books on travels during the 17th and 18th centuries (Rasel, 2012). The beginning of English travel literature can be dated from 1555 when Richard Eden translated of a book entitled The Decadence of the New World. It was followed by Richard Hakluyt's Principal Navigations. From the 17th century a continuous stream of travellers made their journey to the Orient. From England alone came 44 travel accounts. There were also travellers from the Netherlands and France. Even a less known traveller like Hodges wrote, “all the territories ... were under the absolute direction of Mussulman tyrants” (cited in Islam and Das, 2017:6).Both Hegel and Marx were heavily influenced by such travel accounts and Bernier's narratives of Mughal India, in particular.

Rubiés (2004) shows that in the seventeenth-century, Europe's familiarity with Asia became extensive. A large number of travellers and missionaries came to Mughal India which led to the formation and crystallization of the image of South Asia –its people, social institutions and culture. It fed into a particular vision of the Orient. Many of these people were also associated with English and Dutch trading companies. There was also an influx of independent observers from France. One of the earliest image of South Asia that came from Alessandro Valignano who in the middle of 16th century described Indian people in a way that was echoed and re-echoed in all subsequent works Rubiés (2004:7)

These people, who are almost black and go half naked, are universally contemptible and held to be base by the Portuguese and other Europeans; and the truth is that compared to them they are of little substance and lack refinement. They are, as Aristotle says, of a servile nature, because they are commonly poor, miserable and mean, and for any gain they will do the lowest things’.

He further wrote that the kings were avaricious and ruthlessly exploited the common people. They represented limitless tyranny and their religion was full of “many chimeras and monstrosities” (cited in Rubiés, 2004:7). In the hierarchy of civilization black-skinned Indians were only ahead of Africans. He represents “…an ideological imperative that went deep into Hispanic traditions of conquest and crusade” (cited in Rubiés, 2004:8).It was, however, Francois Bernier who came to India in 1658 or early 1659 and worked as a physician at the court of Aurangzeb for twelve years and wrote accounts of his experience in India entitled Travels in the Mogul Empire and other writings that exerted the greatest influence on his readers including some of the greatest minds in Europe. He along with two other fellow Frenchmen, Tavernier and Thevenot who were present in India at the same time and left powerful narratives of politics, economy, society and culture of the region (Karla, 1914). Bernier who is the intellectual father of racism in Europe, made a comparative analysis between France and India of his time and as a physician showed what ailed the empire of Aurangzeb. He articulated five major themes with vivid description. There was no private property. The state was despotic and arbitrary. There was no social class. The entire nobility lived on the mercy of the despot and they lose everything if they court the anger of the all-powerful emperor or any of his favourites. The Mughal cities were moving royal
camps. Bernier viewed that Indian cities were mainly administrative centres and often they were mere royal camps moving with the imperial armies. He held that Delhi or Agra “derives its chief support from the presence of the army” and “those cities resemble any place rather than Paris; they might more fittingly be compared to a camp, if the lodgings and accommodations were not a little superior to those found in the tents of armies.” (Bernier, 1791: 220). The absence of law of primogeniture led to cruel wars of succession at the end of the life of a despot.

Another such example is Willem Ysbrantsz Bontekoe’s Journal. His Journal was one of the most popular travelogues and was published in 1646 in the United Provinces. The book became immensely popular and had at least thirty editions in the seventeenth century. The travel book called Vervarelyke Schipbreuk van ‘T Oost-Indisch Jacht Ter Schelling embodies cannibalism as a central theme of the book. It recurs again and again. He reports that cannibalism was practiced by people who lived near Assam (Rasel, 2012).

“Although very lively and quick with their savage and ferocious face, this was an amazingly savage kind of people... Therefore the Moors used to avoid them. It was just like that they wanted to eat people immediately. They eat human flesh most of the time” (cited in Rasel, 2012::37). Thus the Oriental other was at its worst a cannibal and savage and at its best depraved. It also finds its echo in the considered view of Charles Grant who lived and worked in India. “In fact, the people are universally and wholly corrupt, they are as depraved as they are blind, and as wretched as they are depraved” (cited in Sardar, 2002:42).

**Orientalism in Western Social Thought**

*Views of Montesquieu*

Like Aristotle and a host of other scholars since then, Montesquieu viewed that geography determined both human personality and social system. He mostly relied on the travel literature of his time to trace the differences between East and the Orient. Taking the description of the Ottoman state as a model, he developed his idea of despotism that characterized most of the Orient. Compared to the despotic Orient, the West was the home of freedom and liberty. This difference was fundamental and not amenable to change for it was determined by different geographical and climatic conditions of two regions. Europe was the home of freedom, law and liberty as a consequence of its climate. The hot and humid climate of the Orient gave birth to servile human personality, despotic rulers and social stagnation. As he observed, “laws, customs and manners of the ‘Orient’—even the most trivial, such as mode of dress—remain the same today as they were a thousand years ago” (cited in Anderson, 1974:464)

*Hegel on the Orient*

For Hegel the West was the theatre of unfolding of reason and freedom culminating in universal history in the form of modernity. Although the Orient witnessed the beginning of history and its early stage, it
could not advance any further. India for Hegel was a land of dream and fantasy that found full expression in the powerful sociological theory of Weber. “So the Indians are like wholly debased persons who, devoid of all spirituality, empty and in despair, acquire for themselves a dream world by the use of opium, a world or bliss of insanity”(Hegel,2011 :252 ). The caste system produced rigid distinctions that chained men only to a capricious fate.

Everything is petrified into these distinctions, and over this petrification a capricious destiny holds sway. Morality and human dignity are unknown; evil passions have their full swing; the Spirit wanders into the Dream-World, and the highest state is Annihilation (Hegel, 2001:165).

Indian religions produce a state of human life which is more like death. “To attain this Death of Life during life itself — to constitute this abstraction — requires the disappearance of all moral activity and volition, and of all intellection too, as in the Religion of Fo;” (Hegel,2001:174). Thus Indians knew only about negative freedom. “This lack of freedom that marks the Hindu’s concrete life, what we call the state, purpose, wholeness, rational law, or ethical life can have no place, cannot be present” (Hegel,2011: 282). For these reasons, Indians have not been able to attain state as a political form. “So everything necessary for a state is lacking. Therefore in India there can be no state whatsoever” (Hegel, 2011: 256). What India instead gave birth to was the extreme form of despotism. “In India, therefore, the most arbitrary, wicked, degrading despotism has its full swing” (Hegel, 282). “China, Persia, Turkey — in fact Asia generally, is the breeding ground (boden) of despotism…” (Hegel, 2011: 257), “and, in a bad sense, of tyranny;” (Hegel, 2001:179). Hegel gave emphasis to self-sufficient, isolated and indifferent village communities. As ordinary people experienced negative freedom, they were indifferent to what was happening to the polity which underwent “.. a ceaseless interplay of uprisings, conspiracies and brutal episodes … the main history consists of these upheavals and intrigues, these murderous deeds, these atrocities”(Hegel,211: 283). As a result, Indians had no history. These were the founding themes of orientalism that Marx in his early writings repeated and found culmination in the sociological theory of neo-Kantian Weber and which continues to feed the doctrine of European exceptionalism until now.

**Theoretical Foundation of Orientalism: Marx, Max Weber and Wittfogel: Asiatic Mode of Production, Oriental cultures and Oriental Despotism**

The orientalist thought that evolved through the intellectual landscape of Europe over a period of more than two millennia found strong theoretical foundation in the works three modern social theorists— Karl Marx, Max Weber and Karl Wittfogel. Although three scholars differed in all possible ways, they arrived at a common view of the Orient.

**Marx on the Orient**

Marx’s views on the Orient and the Asiatic Mode of Production have been a focus of scholarly debate over a long period of time and still persist (Anderson, 1974; Krader, 1975; Dunn, 1982; Melotti, 1977; Ahmed ,1992: Anderson, 2010). The curtain over the Asiatic society rose on 7 April, 1853 after Marx became interested in the Eastern question and filed his first dispatch on it (Marx, 1897). It snowballed into a series of dispatches on colonies and other contemporary issues for the *New York Herald Tribune*, a considerable number of letters he wrote on the colonial question that kept him engaged with the issue
of the Asiatic society for his whole life. He filed in all 33 dispatches on India (Ahmed, 1992). In these journalistic pieces and in his writings for the next thirty years, Marx had an abiding interest about the Orient reading about it and making occasional comments on the theme. Although he did develop any systematic account on the social formation of the orient, his ideas on it continued to mature and he abandoned his older ideas as he found new materials on the Asiatic society. As Anderson (2010) shows he began to revise his views on the Orient and developed a much more sophisticated view. So the themes I discuss below are from his earlier writings. With his dispatch of 7 April, 1853, he began surprisingly with the words “[B]ut Turkey no more than the rest of the world remains stationary….”(Marx in Avelling, 1897:3). He first mentioned ‘Oriental’ and ‘Asiatic’ and India in his third dispatch which was published in the New Herald Tribune on 12 April, 1853. He wrote, “[B]efore the discovery of the direct route to India, Constantinople was the mart of an extensive commerce; and even now, though the products of India find their way into Europe by the overland route through Persia….“(Marx in Avelling, 1897:14). He even condemns the Times for starting a “crusade” against the Sarcens. “We find The Times advocating the dismemberment of Turkey, and proclaiming the unfitness of the Turkish race to govern any longer in that beautiful corner of Europe…. The whole of the talent at the disposal of that paper is exerted to…. enlist British sympathies for a new crusade against the remnant of the Saracens” (Marx in 1897 in Avelling : 23 ). But then came a curious change of mind. On 2 June, when he talked about India, it was a different Marx who again underwent a change of heart later in his life. It is also worth noting that if he harshly criticized the Orient, he was no less scathing against the colonial rulers of Europe.

London, June 2, 1853
. . . Bernier rightly considered the basis of all phenomena in the East — he refers to Turkey, Persia, and Hindustan— to be the absence of private property in land. This is the real key, even to the Oriental heaven. . . .Marx and Engels, nd.:313

In reply Engels wrote back to Marx:

Manchester, June 6, 1853
. . . The absence of property in land is indeed the key to the whole of the East. Herein lies its political and religious history. But how does it come about that the Orientals did not arrive at landed property, even in its feudal form? I think it is mainly due to the climate, taken in connection with the nature of the soil, especially with the great stretches of desert which extend from the Sahara straight across Arabia, Persia, India and Tartary up to the highest Asiatic plateau. Artificial irrigation is here the first condition of agriculture and this is a matter either for the communes, the provinces or the central government. An Oriental government never had more than three departments: finance (plunder at home), war (plunder at home and abroad), and public works (provision for reproduction) (Marx and Engels, nd: 314).

In the Critique of political economy, Marx wrote in 1859, “[I]n broad outline, the Asiatic, ancient, feudal and modern bourgeois modes of production can be designated as the progressive epochs in the economic formation of society (Krader, 1975: 93).

Marx wrote in the Grundrisse,
Because the unity as real proprietor and the real presupposition of communal property, it follows that this unity can appear as a particular entity above the many real particular communities….a unity realized in the form of the despot, the father of many communities-to the individual through the mediation of the particular commune (Marx, 1973: 473).

From Adam Smith and Richard Jones Marx derived the idea that in the Orient because the despot owned all land, the state could collect both tax and revenue from people. This is totally different from the West where the institution of private ownership ensures that the revenue goes to the landlord. The state only claims taxes for public works. Although Marx mentioned the Asiatic mode of production only once in his writings, it has fuelled an unending controversy. Many have rejected it, a few has accepted it with or without modifications. In spite of Perry Anderson’s call for a ‘decent burial’ of the concept (Anderson, 1974: 548), it has continued to have a life of its own.

To reiterate briefly, Marx held that the Asiatic society was changeless. It was a society without history. In spite of the rise and fall of political dynasties and regimes, its economy was motionless. The political storms on the surface did not affect its material foundation over hundreds of years. It remained a pre-class society and did not register any change in the absence of the dialectics of class conflict. Marx agreed with Engels that the Asiatic society was stationary because its climatic conditions called for complex system of irrigation that could be achieved only by a centralized bureaucracy leading to the rise of the state before the class-society. It gave rise to despotic state which claimed both tax and rent from the subject population. The impoverished peasants continued to hold stubbornly to the simplest techniques of production with plough and loom within a self-sufficient and self-enclosed village community that produced bare necessities with which they lived on generations after generations as if in an eternal slumber reproducing the same material foundation unaffected by the dialectics of motion. But the British arms destroyed this tranquility and planted the material foundation of capitalism and introduced the play of dialectics and possibility for its future development at the end of colonialism. Krader, Habib and Anderson have shown that Marx had changed his views on the Asiatic society towards the end of life as new materials became available to him. However, it remained in the form of scattered notes. He was not able to leave before his death any coherent account of his new ideas. By 1879, he had realized that many of his earlier views were wrong. Later he found that India had a complex system of land ownership including private ownership of land. Trade and commerce had flourished and even Delhi had become the greatest city of the world (Anderson, 2010; Krader, 1974).

Weber on the Orient

Max Weber in his influential books-- Religion of India and Religion of China (Weber, 1958b;1958c) developed a complex theory to analyze why the Orient failed to develop capitalism. He found that Indian religions such as Hinduism, Buddhism and Jainism had given birth to a cultural universe and institutional complex that blocked India’s road to capitalism. Similar were the fate of China and the Islamic society. The culture of other –worldliness, irrationality, magic, the doctrine of reincarnation and the caste system contributed to the economic and cultural stagnation of India. He found that although India once was on the road to urban development similar to Europe, several factors prevented such development. Hinduism is so open in terms of its holy ends that Weber doubted whether it was a religion at all. In
Hinduism it was rituals that mattered; it was a religion of rituals. Its two basic doctrines are re-incarnation or transmigration of souls and *karma*. The totality of deeds in this life was to determine the status of a person in his/her re-birth. These two doctrines proclaimed that only way to a better life was adherence to one’s caste obligations through which one could hope for higher caste status at re-birth. It led to traditionalism at its highest intensity. “So long as the *karma* doctrine was unshaken, revolutionary ideas or progressivism were inconceivable….It was impossible to shatter traditionalism based on caste ritualism, anchored in *karma* doctrine by rationalizing the economy” (Weber, 1958b: 123).

The caste system came to rest upon magic. Brahmins enjoyed predominantly high status for the magical charisma they commanded on the basis of their command over sacred language and ritual knowledge. It placed them close to the centre of power as land owners and priests. The royal power had to be legitimated through appropriate rituals and ceremonies administered only by Brahmins. Under Hinduism it was not possible for concepts like citizenship or even subjects to emerge for all was subsumed under the concept of dhrama. The development of salvation doctrines took the form of mystical union with the divine being. “All religious holy seeking on such a foundation had to take the form of mystical seeking of god, mystical possession, or, finally, mystical communion with the godhead” (Weber, 1958b: 152). “The world is an eternal, meaningless “wheel” of recurring births and deaths steadily rolling on through all eternity” (Weber, 1958: 167). All salvation religions of India, Weber argued, seek complete flight from the realm of everyday life (Weber, 1958b).

The patrimonial state did not allow the bourgeoisie to flourish in autonomous cities. In India, “[A]ll cities were fortresses of the realm” (Weber, 1958b: 127). In India the struggle by the bourgeoisie against the patrimonial rulers failed due to ‘absolute pacification’ of the salvation religions such as Buddhism and Jainism which emerged in the cities and the caste system did not allow cities to have autonomous military power and thus blocked the development of the city in the Western sense. In Indian cities, the king had despotic and arbitrary power which manifested in extreme form under what he termed sultanism and had control over the guilds. The sovereign was also able to use caste divisions to foreclose a cohesive urban community that became the institutional scaffold for the rise of capitalism in the West as was the Protestant ethic that created the leitmotiv or spirit of capitalism or the ‘Prometheus Unbound’ as a latter day scholar (Landes, 1969) called it.

By now a considerable body of literature has accumulated that shows that Weber was wrong in most of what he wrote about the Orient. Protestantism did not lead to rationalization in the West; rather in some cases it reinforced belief in magical practices. Rather, rationalization had its origin, as Hobson argues (2004), in the Muslim world and China. Most autonomous cites in Europe had gone under the tutelage of powerful monarchs over the seventeen and eighteenth century and had little role in economic development of the West (Ogilvie, 2011). Isin (2013) argues that Weber’s concept of citizenship as a unique property of the West is contestable. The example of Ottoman Turkey shows that *waqf* was an instrument that provided examples of civic responsibilities in which women also played an important role.
Critics have shown that Weber developed his views of Indian religions on the basis of texts on religions. What he held can be called Brahmonic view of Hinduism (Thaper https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TQnWQpKBgM). In their actual practice Indian religions were much more flexible and there were variations in the practice of religious rituals in everyday life. A textual view blinded his vision so much so that he failed to notice that in everyday life Indians could adapt to different political and economic situations. Vaishyas could be more this-worldly than any other people in the world. He did not have any idea of the flexibility of the caste system which was documented much later by M.N. Srinivas (1966). He showed that social mobility was an inexorable part of the caste system. People regularly rose up or went down the caste ladder.

*Karl Wittfogel and Oriental Despotism*

Karl Wittfogel (1957) borrowing from Marx and Weber developed his theory of hydraulic society which could be found in all regions of the Orient and Russia. In his view, hydraulic society is a specific form of society that manifests total and absolute power of the state. It resulted from the need for artificial irrigation on a vast scale in the arid landscape of the Orient. Such a complex task could only be developed by a centralized bureaucracy and despotic state. So in the Orient, state emerged before the classes.

Large-scale irrigation produces high agricultural surplus which give rise to the agro-managerial class as an apparatus of the state. Power becomes concentrated in the hands of this class. It results in a despotic state - a state more powerful than the civil society. The state conscripts corvee labour, confiscates property at will, tends to absorb religion within its apparatus, destroys all autonomous fountains of power and silences all resistance. It precluded the development of the bourgeoisie and capitalism in the Orient. Although Wittfogel found that there were regions which manifested despotism, yet they lacked hydraulic structures, he resorted to cultural diffusion to account for its presence in these areas. As we will see later what Wittfogel produced was in the words of Nietzsche (1954: 46) “…mobile army of metaphors, metonyms, anthropomorphisms….”

Wittfogel’s work has attracted huge scholarly attention. The *Oriental Despotism* contains 556 pages of text including a bibliography that runs into 38 pages. But surprisingly the index of the book *Oriental Despotism* has a solitary entry under irrigation which is concerned with its origin. The related entry-water-works has six references to irrigation works and seven to flood control. None of these entries provide any information of irrigation works. He does, however, mention two empirical instances. One is about a canal in China and another from Bengal, a land of rebels. Ironically, he found from Bengal that mighty rivers of the Ganges and the Brahmaputra produced enormous hydrological problems and so by 1900 it had ninety seven miles of irrigation works and 1,298 miles of embankments. What he failed to realize was that whatever irrigation canals and embankments Bengal had were constructed mostly under the British rule. He does mention the hydraulic works of China merely by referring to Wilcock’s book *Egyptian Irrigation*. Two of the most important missing items in his bibliography are Statistics of Hydraulic Works and Hydrology of England, Canada, Egypt, and India published in 1885 by Jackson, and Wilson’s *Irrigation in India* which was published in 1903. Both Jackson and Wilson visited India and
made an empirical study of water works. They found that pre-colonial India had three major water works which were not meant for irrigation and most of the water structures were built during the colonial period. Egyptian water works on the Nile had not led to the rise of despotism. “In other words, there is no direct causal relationship between hydraulic agriculture and the development of the Pharaonic political structure and society” (Butzer, 1976: 110).

All subsequent attempts to confirm his hypothesis until 2017 have failed to find any support for his theory. Thus Orientalism forms a continuous stream of discourse from antiquity to early years of 21st century and hardly shows any sign of abating. According to Hobson (2008), “… Eurocentric thinkers constructed … an imaginary line of *civilizational apartheid* between East and West” (Hobson 2008:57, emphasis in the original). “Conversely, the East was painted as series of absences” (Hobson, 2008:57).

Marx, Weber and Wittfogel reinforced, expanded and articulated a complex vision of the Orient that had following key features which was aptly summarized by Karim (1956). Many historians and social scientists of South Asia directly or indirectly came under the spell of the ideas of Orientalism that continue to persist even today best epitomized by the expression *Homo Hierarchicus* (Dumont, 1972). Some of these eminent scholars include G. S. Ghurye and D. P. Mukerji T. N. Madan (Patel, 2013), Desai, 1946; Karim, 1956; Sen, 1982).

The oriental society was characterized by:

- Absence of history
- Absence of dynamic linkage among people and self-sufficient village community
- Absence of geographical linkage and isolated villages
- Absence of private property
- Absence of landed aristocracy
- Absence of temperate climate and centralized irrigation system
- Absence of freedom and despotic state
- Absence of cities
- Absence of strong merchant class
- Absence of classes
- Absence of formal law
- Absence of human quality
- Absence of rationality
- Absence of Change in society

*A Society without history*

It was Hegel as shown above who described the Orient as a region without history. It failed to march onward like Europe and join its universal history and remained motionless producing a graveyard of civilization. Marx in his early writings voiced a similar view. “Indian society has no history at all, at least
no known history. What we call its history is but the history of successive intruders who founded their empires on the passive basis of that unresisting and unchanging society" (Marx, nd.:83).

But a host of recent authors like Janet Abu-Lughod (1989), Andre Gunder Frank (1998), Pomeranz (2001) Hobson, Ferguson (2004a;2004b), and others have shown that until 1800 South Asia and China were almost equal partners of the global economy and there was hardly any difference between the economics of Western Europe and the two regions of Asia.

**Self-sufficient village community**

Another well–trenched myth about India was the concept of self-sufficient villages. Sir Henry Maine was the most important architect of this myth. Metcalf (1997) shows the myth of Indian village communities served three functions. First, it created a polarity between the ancient and the modern. The essence of ancient India was the division of society into self-contained inwardly-turned communities consisting of co-operative communal villagers. Secondly, it was an entity that was different and opposed to the colonial state. Finally, village in this myth as Marx and many others including nationalists assumed survived in their primordial form through centuries in spite of all upheavals of political regimes.

Ludden (1985) shows that such 19th century narratives are “quaint historical fiction” (Ludden, 1985:7). Indian villages were interacting with state, markets and cities and manifested changes over time. In particular, the method of taxation in cash from Akbar’s time forced peasants to sell their products in nearby towns to pay taxes and it led to the end of whatever self-sufficiency villages had. Pioneering works by Andre Gunder Frank, Janet Abu-Lughod, Chaudhuri (1990) and many other historians have shown that Indian villages were linked to local, regional and even international trade networks from the remote past. Tavernier (1925:24) wrote: “In India a village must be very small if it has not a money-changer, whom they call sharoff, who acts as banker to make remittances of money and issues letters of exchange.” Ludden (1999) demonstrates that far from being stagnant, in many areas of the Punjab, Gujarat, Bengal, and southeastern plains—a far–flung network of manufacturing involving cotton farming and production of textiles had emerged to feed international trade. These regions made up some of “…the great industrial regions of the early modern world, and they produced the bulk of cotton cloth in world markets in 1750” (Ludden, 1999:146). He also describes how villages in Tamil Nadu had become extensively commercialized and commoditized even before the 18th century. He notes the rise of agrarian urbanism in the coastal regions closely linked to the global trading network through the Indian Ocean by 1700.

Tavernier mentions that even the smallest villages sold all sorts of foodstuff from rice to sweetmeats and he found 4,000 pilgrims travelling without taking with them any provisions for their daily needs as they could procure those locally. Literary sources from Bengal indicate that in some places there were two and more days of markets in a day. Other evidences indicate that markets were widespread in pre-colonial India. The villages were so open to new information and cultivation of new crops that when
tobacco was brought to India in 1600, it began to be cultivated all over India within half a century-1650. Maize which came from the new world also began to be cultivated widely. Sericulture was unknown in Bengal before the 15th century, by the 17th century it became one of the largest producers of silk in the world (Habib, 1982b).

Absence of private property in pre-colonial South Asia

The pattern of land ownership in such a vast land as pre-colonial India is complex and varied. It did have different forms in different parts of the empire. It defies any simple generalization. Now increasing evidences show that private property existed in South Asia from the Vedic times. Radha Kumud Mookherji, a member of the Bengal Land Revenue Commission in the colonial period who prepared a report for the government wrote, “Since the beginning of history, Society in India has been based on the principle of private property and private property in land”. (Mookherji, 1958: 1). It is always the head of the family who owned land, and could transmit his rights to his heirs (Mookherji, 1958: 3). Mookherji quoted from the most important Hindu law book of Jaimani to the effect “… the king cannot give away the earth because it is not his property…. ” (Mookherji, 1958:17). The Arthashastra made it clear. It advocated that “[T]ax –payers shall sell or mortgage their fields to tax –payers alone; Brahmans shall sell or mortgage their Brahmdeya or gifted land only to those who with such lands…..” (Chaturvedi, 2006:105) Mookherji (1958) quoted from Macdonald and Keith’s work that Vedic literature did not show any trace of communal ownership of land. The community ownership probably referred to waste land or pasture. Smritisastras mention that even the king was not owner of the land; he as a sovereign was under obligation to pay taxes. Jaunpur Brick Inscription of CE 1207 mentions land given as security to two bankers for a loan. The cave inscription of Usavadādata mentions that he donated the land after purchasing it from a Brahmin. Chola inscriptions provide documents of 276 land sales including houses which involved peasants, merchants and even members of the royal household(Ayer, 1937).

The form of land ownership did not change much in Mughal India. In Islam, kharaj lands constituted privately owned land. “Kharaj lands were the full property of their owners, and therefore they had right to sell them as they liked; when the owner of the land died, it was divided between his heirs” (Orhanlu cited in Islahi, 2014:29 ). There is documentary evidence of land sales in Mughal India. David Ludden shows that the term rayot that emerged in Mughal India meant “… an individual tax-paying property owner who had a receipt for revenue payments that constitutes an official title to land, a pattah(Ludden,1985: 141). From the Deccan, we find evidence of land sale. A document of 1594 provides evidence of land sale in Petalchor sub-district duly attested by the Qazi. Another document from Poona in the middle of the 18th century shows a farmer selling seven bighas of his mirasdari land at Rs. 250. The village assembly could sell even waste land (Fukazwa, 1982). According to Habib, (1982a: 246), Zamindari had become inheritable. It could be sold and mortgaged. “Still more striking was the way in which zamindari right was freely sold.” One land document of 1682 pertaining to a village in Bhowal (near Dhaka) shows that an inhabitant named Tita Khan purchased a plot of land marked by boundaries at a cost of 12 taka. What is often forgotten as Douglas C. North and Robert Paul Thomas in their classic work on the rise of the West (1995:63) show private ownership emerged in England only in 13th century and even then”… it applied to a minority of English land.”
Centralized irrigation

Neither India nor Bengal ever had any centralized hydraulic work as claimed by Wittfogel. Koshambi (1957) in one of the earliest reviews of the book shows that in ancient India water works, flood control and irrigation was also locally organized. Ibn Batuta observed absence of irrigation in India in the early 14th century. Babur records his surprise at not finding any irrigation network in India in his autobiography (Baburnama.1970). “Wells were”, according to the authoritative Cambridge Economic History of India, “probably the major source of artificial irrigation in most areas” (Habib, 1982b:49). Firuz Tughluk (1351-86) was a major figure who built several canals in India. Two of his largest canals were constructed to supply water to a newly built city. Other canals that he built were small and the state had little responsibility for their upkeeping. As one of his governors asserted “…the excavation and maintenance of' public canals'{anhr-d i 'ammo) was the responsibility of the local people and landholders” (cited in Habib, 1982b: 49).

By now a considerable body of literature has grown up that shows that a centralized system of irrigation did not exist in any other region of the Orient. Leach (1959) showed admirably that the extensive water works of Sri Lanka were produced gradually over a long period of time and in a piecemeal way that did not require great state involvement. Even the impressive water works of Java and Khamer Empire have proved to be a fiction of imagination. In a recent work, Harrower (2009) shows that in South West Arabia large –scale irrigation was neither necessary nor provided food for large population. Dry farming, terrace farming and community-based irrigation seem to have contributed most to agricultural production. Yet the myth refuses to die (Bechtel, 2016)

Oriental Despotism

The idea of Oriental despotism that originated with the Greeks found great popularity in the 17th century. Lucette Valensi (1993) argues that modern conceptions of the despotic Oriental state originated in Venetian ambassadors’ reports from the Ottoman Sultan’s court in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. They fixed, in the European mind, the memorable image of an all-powerful despot. It gained greater currency over the 18th century with the translation and publication of the Arabian Nights in 1704 that began to define the Sultan as a despot. In spite of Voltaire’s critical stance that the term originally meant master of the house in Greek and later on a petty European prince, the myth has continued to flourish.

As Toynbee (1958) points out, “the worst cases of total power and atrocious abuse of it ..."can be found in non-hydraulic regions: Socialist Germany, Tsarist and Communist Russia." The Oriental cultivators were not slaves; there is a single instance of plantation slavery in Asia. It rather flourished in Roman Italy, West Indies and America. Many of the sultans, kings and emperors of the Orient were weak rulers. Kosamab (1957) noted that Wittfogel made considerable use of Arthashastra to highlight his theory, yet it is a mystery why the same hydraulic society produced a mild ruler like Asoke after a short period of 50 years. The Chinese travellers provided evidence that under the Guptas during 4th and 5th centuries
and Harsha in the early 7th century “penal legislation was extremely mild” (Kosambi, 1957: 1417). Many European states, on the other hand, was more autocratic. In 1533, the English Parliament passed an Act that gave the king “plenary, whole, and entire power “over the “body politic” and demanded “natural and humble obedience “to the king (Chengdan, 2010:6688). In fact, Prussian kings, Austrian emperors and the Russian Czars were all omnipresent rulers without exception.

The absence of city

In Grundrisse Marx(1973) wrote,”[I]n Asiatic Society, where the monarch appears as the exclusive proprietor of the agricultural surplus product, whole cities arise, which are at bottom nothing more than wandering encampments…..". (Marx, 1973 :467). One of the key arguments of Max Weber was also that urban autonomy in the West was a major factor in the development of capitalism in the West. The Orient lacked it and thus it also lacked city in the proper sense of the term. This view has proved to be wrong. India from the ancient times had developed a vast network of cities. In spite of their decadence during the later period of Hindu rule, they revived and registered remarkable growth for several centuries under the Muslim rule. The largest Indian city in the seventeenth century was Agra with a population estimated to be 800,000. In 1580s, Lahore closely followed it with a population of 700,000 in 1615. Delhi by 1660s had a population of 500,000 and thus equal to Paris. Dhaka, Patna, Ahmedabad and Surat each could boast of a population as high as 200,000 in early 17th century. In Akbar's time there were more than 3200 towns and 450 small markets called qasba had grown up (Habib1982b). Not all these cities were royal forts or centres of administration. Surat provides an important example of a city based upon trade and commerce. The rich bankers of Surat, observes Chaudhuri (1990), provided finance for traders of a large number of cities across a vast region extending from Delhi to Hormuz and Bandar Abbas. Habib(1982a) also points out that some cities like Multan or Lahore depended on international trade and flourished or fell into ruin as trade routes changed. John Henry Grose who visited the city in the middle of 18th century found it to be one of the finest examples of a commercial city that rose to great prosperity through trade (Chaudhuri, 1990). Many cities of South Asia, Middle east or China of the early centuries of our common era had attained an enduring ‘civic form’(Chaudhuei,1990:361). One of its best examples is Nanking. Nanking attained its primacy on the basis of industrial production and trade after the capital of China moved to Peking (Beijing). Major cities like Cairo, Alexandria, Surat, Cambay, Malacca, and Canton provided all necessary support to the merchants and bankers involved in transcontinental trade. Muslim cities were connected with a vast network of trade straddling Asia, Europe and Africa. Lombard (1975:10) found these to have grown up on the basis of trade. They were a “series of urban islands linked by trade routes.”

Pomeranz and Topik (2015) show how cities in the orient led to a cosmopolitan world. “Diasporas of trading peoples –such as the overseas Chinese, Muslims, and the Hindus—joined together in an enormous and complex network of commerce” (Pomeranz and Topic, 2015:5). They further go on to suggest that business men from the different parts of the world including Gujratis, Fujianese, Persians,
Armenians, Jews and Arabs lived in the Asian port cities. The merchants of these cities had developed a code of conduct that included honesty and sound principles of business. “All of these cities and areas of the Islamic World, from Spain and North Africa in the west to Afghanistan and India in the east, were in constant touch with each other, with apparently no restrictions at all on the free flow of people, ideas, techniques, fashions, goods, and capital” (Pomeranz and Topik, 2015:60-61).

Even Marx changed his views on the Oriental city later in his life. Marx probably made his sixteen thousand-word notes on Phear’s The Aryan Village in India and Ceylon in 1881. At one point in his notes, he writes of Mughal Emperor Akbar, “He made Delhi into the greatest and finest city then existing in the world” (Marx [1879–80] 1960, 33 cited in Anderson, 2010). A number of recent studies, on the other hand, have shown that urban autonomy was not helpful for economic growth in Europe or at best played a positive role at an early phase capitalistic development as they were monopolistic and became a barrier to entry(Oglive, 2011). The textile industry in Venice, Wallerstein (1974) shows, declined due to guild restrictions. In England it flourished because it was located in the suburbs outside the direct control of the cities.

**Absence of classes and the caste system**

Marx held that caste was “some sort of neurosis in Indian civilization” (le://K:/east west lecture/EPWAsiatic_Mode_of_Production_Caste_and_the_Indian_Left.pdf). Weber went further to identify it as the central institution that paralyzed the Indian society. The caste system completely restricted social mobility and failed to produce social dynamism necessary for development of a capitalist society in India. M.N. Srinivas(1966), however, shows that social mobility was an enduring and continuous feature of the caste system. The original Kshatriyas varna did not exist over a period of 2000 years. All the Kshatriyas during this period came from lower castes. The caste system showed a continuous upward mobility through a process called *sanskritisation*. It is ironic for Max Weber that the caste system is still strong in India and Hinduism as powerful as ever. Yet India is projected to grow into the third largest economy of the world by 2050.

**Absence of change and economic stagnation in the Orient**

There is now a remarkable body of literature that shows that the Orient was not economically stagnant. Janet Abu-Lughod (1989), in her path-breaking work, *Before European Hegemony: The World System AD1250-1350*, showed how the Indian Ocean region had become part of a global trading network traversing the Arabian Sea, Indian Ocean, and South China Sea in the 13th and 14th centuries. Andre Gunder Frank, in a more revolutionary work entitled *ReOrient : Global Economy in the Asian Age* claimed that rather than isolated countries and regions, Asia constituted a capitalist world system for over 5000 years. The rise of the West in modern times is a misnomer, a product of Eurocentricism. It is a myth which has been constructed by the hegemonic West. Frank shows that a world system had developed over a period of five thousand years from Mesopotamia and Egypt from 2700 BCE based on international and inter-regional trade. These regions had become linked to the Indus Valley civilization and to central Asia and Africa. This world system continued over eight phases of rise and
fall until 1600 CE when Europe came to dominate the world. Thus the European domination was nothing new. Neither the Protestant ethic nor any other exceptionalism explains Europe’s rise or development of capitalism. Contemporary European travellers also provide graphic accounts of how villages, cities, regions and continents had become interlinked through trade networks. South Asia became dynamic hotbed of economic development. A vast network of roads and waterways including oceans connected them and a regular and extensive system of transport of boats, caravans and ships operated in the region.

The Grand Trunk Road which was first built by Chandragupta, the Maurya Emperor and rebuilt by Sher Shah that ran 2700 kilometres from Chittagong in Bangladesh through Delhi and ended in Kabul and became connected to the Black Sea and the Caspian turned into a major artery of international trade. By first millennium, South Asia had flourished as a major hub of international trade being connected with central Asia, Southeast Asia, Middle East, Ottoman Empire and Africa. The Muslim civilization also became connected with all the known regions of the world giving rise to a global network for the movements of goods, ideas and people.

John Fryer, an English physician found in 1679 during his journey from Surat to Broach that a huge caravan of oxen and camels ‘clogged’ the roads and he saw one day a single caravan of 500 oxen. This inter-regional trade had become linked with a large fleet of ships that moved among cities across the Indian Ocean (Chaudhuri, 190). As Fitch provides a graphic account of what he saw in course of his travels in India during 1583-1591.

I went from Agra to Satagam in Bengal, in the companie of one hundred and four score boates laden with salt, opium, hinge [asafetida: Hindustani hing], lead, carjwts, and divers other commodities, downe the river Jemena. The chiefe marchants are Moores and Gentiles.” p18 from above Ralph Fitch 1583-1591p 1-47…Here in Bengal they have every day in one place or other a great market which they call Chandeau, and they have many great boats which they cal pericose,*wherewithal! They go from place to place and buy rice and many other things; these boates have 24 or 26 oares to rowed them; they be great of burthen, but have no coverture (Fitch in Foster, 1921: 25).

It is worth mentioning that Thomas Roe, an English diplomat who came to the court of Mughal Emperor Jahangir stayed between 1614 and 1618 observed as he travelled in 1615 from Surat to Khandesh a caravan of 10,000 bullocks loaded with goods. Several years later, another traveller Mundy another caravan of 14,000 bullocks equally loaded with a variety of merchandise(Habib,1993). Habib(1993) calculates these people called Banjäeas carried about 821 million metric ton-miles of goods in the 17th century compared to 2,500 million-metric ton-miles the Indian railway carried in 1882.

As Frank has argued and the evidence provided by a number of recent historians have provided strong evidence and this paper also reinforces that the Nobel Prize-winning economic Robert North and his co-author Paul Thomas’s highly lauded book The Rise of the West and the paradigm of institutionalism which still remains a powerful theoretical paradigm for development economics is wrong. Blaut (1993)
effectively demonstrates that each of the imputed European exceptionalism and the whole European miracle are no more than myths firmly based only in Eurocentric ideology.

Hobson (2015) also effectively unmasks the myth of the rise of the West and describes it as Eurocentric “big bang” theory that assumes the Orient as stationary for hundreds of years and Europe enjoyed some exceptional attributes that produced the miracle of capitalism. He argues that Europe is a late developing continent. What we see as the rise of China and the same argument can be applied to India in recent years is the fact that it is returning to its previous supremacy. The received knowledge that Italian city states were the crucible of capitalist development is not true. These cities only served as the intermediaries of inter-continental trade and it equally holds for the rest of Europe. The silver that Spain and Portugal Plundered from the New World found came to sink in China and India and as Alexander Dow observed Bengal “… was the sink where gold and silver disappeared without the least prospect of return….“(Dow,1792,vol.3: xxii).

**Why did pre-colonial India fail to produce capitalism?**

For Marx the question why the Orient failed to produce capitalism came naturally because he was looking at the Orient from an evolutionary perspective that he found in the West. For Weber and many others who constructed Orientalism the West had inherent and exceptional qualities that allowed it to develop the unique civilization of capitalism. It was not possible for the Orient to achieve it. It was fated to be colonized and ruled by the West that would drive it towards capitalism.

In recent years, both the evolutionary perspective and the doctrine of European exceptionalism have come under increasing attack by a number of eminent historians, particularly by the California School. The California School led by Kenneth Pomeeranz whose book *The Great Divergence: China, Europe, and the Making of the Modern World Economy* published in 2000 triggered a new interpretation of the divergence between the Orient and the West which was developed earlier by Janet Abu-Lughod, Andre Funder Frank and a number of other authors. The leading scholars of this school include Roy Bin Wong and Jack Goldstone. They argue that there was little difference between India, China, and Ottoman Empire and the Western Europe until late 18th century.

The World-system theory of Wallerstein had earlier shown powerfully that the development of modern capitalism undergoes a cyclical change and what the 18th century witnessed was the movement of the core from South Asia and China to the city states of Italy. Although Wallerstein (2011) provides a meticulous analysis of the historical process of change, he does not provide a general theory why the cores move from one region to another. But Chase-Dunn and his associates (Chase-Dunn and Hall, 1997) have done highly important works to understand the rise and fall of societies.

In the context of this new body of research, I would argue that the answer can be found in the now-abandoned cyclical perspective of social change. Although it was Ibn Khaldun (1967) who first developed a cyclical theory of social change, it was later reformulated by sociologists such as Sorokin.
But this perspective could not develop and remained at best crude. It now registers powerful come back. Glubb (1976) found that empires and civilizations rise and fall regularly over an average period of 250 years. Kennedy (1988) also came up with his persuasive theory of the rise and fall great powers in modern times and provided the reason for why it happens. In his book *Rise and Fall of Great Powers*, he argued with evidence that great powers tend to collapse over time as the administration of vast territories entail huge costs that become increasingly impossible for empires to bear. As a consequence, there is a regular cycle of rise and fall of great empires in history. It occurs because of what he calls imperial overstretching.

Peter Turchin(2006) has redeployed Khaldûn’s concept of Ashabiyya to suggest that every empire develops a fault line along its border where multi-ethnic groups exist. The poorer ethnic group or a multi-ethnic group outside the faultline may show high Ashabiyya and in course of time overwhelm the empire signaling the rise of a new empire. In his view, multi-ethnic frontier serves as a competitive pressure point where groups with low solidarity disappear and groups based on high solidarity triumph and overwhelm the old empire.

In more recent years, societal collapse has emerged as a new field of research which looks into the factors that lead to sudden collapse of complex societies. Jaret Diamond (2006) has chronicled how past societies collapsed as a consequence of ecological change, over-population, elite –inertia and bad rational policies which may seem apparently sound policy but have long-term negative consequences. As Tainter observes, “Disintegration of the social order has been a recurrent concern in Western history…..” (Tainter, 1988:2). In the same vein, I would argue that the Mughal Empire under Aurangzeb had overstretched and was destined to collapse. Although India of his time showed great commercial expansion and had become part of global capitalism, yet it was doomed to collapse due to a complex configuration of causes. Almost all these causes have been noted by historians as isolated factors without showing any necessary and organic linkage. They register as mere scattergram of historical narratives.

**Towards a New Turn in Sociological Theory**

What Gouldner (Gouldner, 1972) saw as the looming crisis of Western sociology in 1970s has now paralyzed the discipline and our time marks the end of sociological theory (Islam, 2005). The prime cause of the crisis lies in the fact that both classical and contemporary sociology is the outgrowth of Orientalism. It is not possible to move beyond the current impasse in sociology without moving beyond the mainstream sociological theories of classical and contemporary sociology. Orientalism provides an essential starting point for any such venture. Pre-colonial South Asia led to the formation of the discourse of Orientalism and thus it will remain the point of departure for any sociological understanding of the region. In this context, I would like to propose that his theory of social change can serve as a foundation of a new direction in sociology. Khaldûn provides a cyclical theory of social change in which history is a theatre of ceaseless rise and fall of civilizations (Khaldûn, 1967; Dhaouadi, 2006; Alatas,
Sorokin(1991) provided a cyclical theory of social change that viewed societies alternating between sensate culture of materialistic progress and an ideational culture that invokes spiritualism and idealism with a mixed type in between. Civilizations are endowed with ‘an immanent principle’ that give shape to their potentialities and soon it reaches its limit to growth beginning a new cycle. Toynbee (1974) argued from his survey of 21 civilizations that every civilization has a limited life span. They arise from challenges people face and their psychological and spiritual responses to the threats they face. Each of them undergoes deterministic phases in their life cycles: birth, growth, disintegration and breakdown.

I would argue that the current impasse in sociological theory can be overcome only by moving beyond what I would like to call the “here and now” perspective of contemporary sociology. It entails construction of a broader social theory that takes as its central focus the rise and fall of civilizations. It is in this context that I introduce below an outline of a broader social theory embodying Kahlûdûn, Sorokin and Toynbee’s cyclical theory of social change, the neo-Kahlûdûnian theory of Peter Turchin(2006) and Farid Alatas(2014), the idea of uneven development, Kennedy’s concept of imperial overstretching, the world-system theory’s concepts of core, semi-periphery and periphery as developed by Wallerstein (1974), recent works of Chase-Dunn and his associates (Chase-Dunn and Hall, 1997) and ideas from the recent literature on collapse. I would argue that the world-system theory of Wallerstein, in fact, is a cyclical theory. From the perspective individual civilizations and empires, what Wallerstein describes is a rise and fall of empires within the modern capitalism. This new theoretical perspective combines evolutionary and cyclical views of social change in the form of a four-phase model. It comprises evolutionary spiral, involution circle, decline circle and collapse circle. It is always a relatively backward society or a peripheral region from a multiethnic frontier which begins to ascend and establish an empire or civilization on the strength of a new charismatic leadership, either of ashabyya or a combination of ashabyya and a new or advanced production and military technology.

The beginning of a new civilization unfolds huge energy and dynamism. It develops new vision, new technology, new ideology that marks its superiority over others. The first phase may thus be called evolutionary spiral in which a civilization remains open, absorbs new ideas and achieves great opulence reaching the ‘magic mountain.’ Then it begins to lose its solidarity and cohesion within a sea of prosperity. It begins to encounter threats from its distant multi-ethnic frontier as new social groups become dominant and challenge the old civilization or empire. The material interests of the ruling class bind it to the existing techno-economic regime. As Marx famously argued, the material interests of the ruling class becomes so many fetters that an existing mode of production fails to develop new forces of production. Only a new class brings into play fundamentally new forces of production (Cohen, 1978). Thus the old empire experiences internal and external crisis leading to state of involution or what I call Involution Circle. In this stage, it goes on functioning and may experience static expansion without undergoing further development (Geertz, 1970). It becomes overstretched and too costly to keep it functioning. It enters a Crisis Phase in which it turns inward. The civilization turns inward and fails to absorb new innovations or adopt it in piecemeal way that does not operate to stop the decline. The crisis becomes multi-faceted and ensures its gradual decline turning it into a Decline Circle. The decline
circle creates a constellation of factors that lead to downward spiral. Finally, there comes the *Collapse Circle* in which a complex sequence of factors and events result in the collapse of the society. The decline phase may last a long time. But collapse often occurs suddenly. The factors that work together may be external, internal and random. It can be combined with the notion of core, semi-periphery and periphery model of the world-system theory. In the decline phase, a particular polity moves to semi-periphery and finally to periphery if the descent continues. It may then enter a collapse circle or remain stuck in the decline phase. The collapse phase has operated so far in the pre-capitalist societies and civilizations. In the case of post-colonial societies, evolutionary spiral may not work for many countries and may remain frozen in the declining circle. The four-phase model is presented in figure 1.

**Figure 1: The Four-Phase Model of Collapse**
Causes of collapse of the Mughal Empire

The collapse of the Mughal Empire has been explained in different ways. The Aligarh School, particularly Satish Chandra (2004) and Atahar Ali (1997) have given particular emphasis to factional conflicts and crisis of the Mughal nobility. Ali (2006) has also stressed on the cultural failure or lack of technological innovation of the Mughal times. Habib (1999) has given particular importance to the Maratha invasion peasant revolts as key factors in the fall of the Mughal Empire. Leonard (1979) has underscored the alienation of the indigenous merchants and banking houses from the Mughal imperial order. These accounts, however, remain mere chronicle of events without logical sequence among them. What we need is an analysis of broader configuration of factors, forces and events that made the collapse of the empire inevitable. Below I provide a preliminary sketch of such an analysis on the basis of the model developed above.

Until a decade after the reign of Emperor Aurangzeb (1658–1707), the Mughal state was expanding. It had reached the limit of its ascent. It had become one of the largest empires of the world. It had become overstretched. It faced triple threats. There was nomadic threat from the northeast. There was Maratha threat in the southern frontier. Finally, there was distant naval threat from the Portuguese both in the Indian Ocean region and in Bengal. With the expansion of the empire there occurred vast increase of the Mughal nobility. Yet there was not enough land to support the nobility. Thus the internal threat was how to pacify the nobility and ensure their loyalty. In order to satisfy his nobility, Aurangzeb had to launch further conquests. The long warfare in the Deccan became extremely expensive. The conquered territories were less fertile and did not much increase the revenue of the state. The long absence of the emperor from the capital intensified the conflicts among them. They went to extract as much surplus from them as possible. In addition, the state also imposed new taxes. The empire experienced crop losses and famines. It fuelled widespread peasant unrest and revolts.

The Mughal Empire had begun to experience a series of rebellions from the reign of Shah Jahan launched by Khan Jahān Lodi, governor of the Deccan, followed by Jujhar Singh, a Hindu chief of Orichha and Budelkhand. Since then Deccan became the multi-ethnic pressure point for the Mughal Empire. Shah Jahan tried to pacify it through forging an alliance with two of the regional kingdoms in the south. But the Mughal Empire began also to face Portuguese piracy in Bengal from the sea. Shah Jahan shifted his capital from Agra to Delhi to solve the crisis. The emperor ignored these signals of the coming storm and went on to launch an attack on Kabul in a bid expand his empire further. The Mughal army failed with great losses.

As stated earlier, with the expansion of the empire, the Mughal nobility and the bureaucracy had also expanded enormously. In spite of the vastness of the empire, there was not enough land to support the huge bureaucracy and its luxurious lifestyle. It became the decisive factor that led to the ultimate fall of the Mughal Empire. Every effort to solve the problem led to more problems escalating and deepening the crisis leading to the collapse of the empire. It gradually and sequentially spiralled into a vicious circle.
without any escape route. I discuss below in a sketchy way the expanding spiral of the fall. Figures 2 describes the fall of the Mughal Empire.
First, as stated earlier, the Mughal Empire had become overstretched and too expensive to govern. Secondly, the nobility and the bureaucracy of the empire expanded vastly in the second half of the 17th century causing a shortage of crown land to support them. The size of the Amirs or mansabdars having ranks of 1000 zat or more nearly doubled during the latter half of the reign of the Emperor Aurangzeb. It had difficult to find jigirs for them. Secondly, it led to intensive and pervading conflict within the ruling class. Thirdly, Aurangzeb was forced to go for further conquest to find more land to accommodate the nobility. It triggered a broad-ranging crisis. Warfare in the south became very expensive. The newly acquired territories were less fertile and did not yield much revenue. The state began to suffer from escalating fiscal crisis. The long absence of Aurangzeb from the capital because of his engagement in war against Marathas exacerbated the factional conflicts within the nobility. It was not possible to restore the loyalty, cohesion and stability of the ruling class. Fourthly, this long warfare in the south had become highly expensive leading to tax-raise and imposition of new taxes. The nobility and the bureaucracy pressed for money tried to extract as much rent as possible from the peasantry. It caused widespread peasant unrest and revolts in different parts of the empire which became again almost impossible to contain.

Fifthly, Leonard (1979) argues that a major cause of the decline of the Mughal Empire in the 18th century was the role of the indigenous merchant class, particularly the banking houses who in the past were useful allies of the Mughal Government. During a century between 1650 and 1750, the merchants and banking houses became much more involved in revenue collection. Yet they became alienated from the ruling class and began to move away from the declining state which was pressed for money as they found new allies and source of investment into the European companies. The breakdown of the alliance between the Mughal state and the indigenous merchant class and banking houses turned into a powerful factor in the fall of the empire. Sixthly, Aurangzeb pressed with the disunity and discontent of the nobility resorted to the imposition of a strict Islamic ideology for restoring its loyalty. The outcome, however, was decrease in the loyalty of his Hindu nobility and subjects that drained the legitimacy of the emperor as a vast majority of his subjects were non-Muslims.

Seventhly, as Ali (2006) emphasizes the Mughal regime suffered from cultural failure. India was not only example of it. All agrarian empires of the Orient had experienced it. The Islamic world had in spite of its brilliant achievement in science and technology later turned away from it. The same thing happened in the case of China. They failed to adopt new technological innovations from the West. Neither clock nor printing press was adopted. The failure was most evident in the field of military technology and naval technology in particular. Although Akbar’s court poet Faizi (Joshi, 2016) had dreamt of voyaging safely in the sea, it never happened. It was, however, impossible for Aurangzeb to do it in the face of immediate threats from its multi-ethnic land frontier. Both the Maratha threat in the Deccan and nomadic threat from the northeast kept him engaged. The decline of Muslim science and knowledge also contributed to it. Neither clock nor the printing press nor the new naval technology was adopted.
Finally, after the death of Aurangzeb, his weak successors failed to govern a fast disintegrating empire. A decisive blow to the wounded empire was struck with the invasions of Nadir Shah in 1739 that resulted in massive plunder and widespread massacre. The Mughal Empire almost collapsed and it was not possible for weak successors of Aurangzeb to reverse the fall of the empire. The sudden burst of monsoon rainfall drenching the uncovered magazine that sealed the fate of the Nawab of Bengal in the plains of Plassey marked the triumph of the sea-power against the outdated military technology of the Mughals and enabled travel stories to fill up and expand the ideological space for the rising West to dominate the rest of the world.

*The rise of the West*

_Herman Hesse wrote in Steps,*

“A magic dwells in each new beginning

protecting us, telling us how to live”

The ‘magic’ of the rise of the West has captivated the scholarly mind not only of the West, but all over the world. Yet what the past received knowledge has masked is the West’s cultural debt to Oriental civilizations. As Hobson (2015) demonstrates most of the scientific and technological inventions which are generally attributed to Europe, in fact, are products of cultural diffusion from the Orient. Europe which was the periphery of the global phase of early capitalism moved to the centre-stage of capitalistic development on the strength of ideas and technologies that emerged in the Orient. The key ideas and innovations of Italian Renaissance are of Oriental origin. Europe borrowed from the Muslim civilization basic ideas of algebra and trigonometry. Ibn Sina’s Canon of Medicine came to be widely used in European universities. Aryabhata, Brahmagupta and Bhaskara and their later improvement in Kerala, India led to sophisticated mathematical models without which Europe would have been unable to achieve its scientific breakthrough. The idea of rationalism that Weber made as the foundation of his theory of Western modernity was first developed by Muslim philosophers and the Chinese. The idea of experimental science also originated in the Muslim civilization. The lateen sail, compass and other important naval techniques which were crucial for European voyages of discovery owe their origin either to the Muslims or the Chinese. The gunpowder, paper and the model of printing press and possibly the prototype of cannon developed earlier in China flowed to Europe through trade routes and carried by travellers. Even Enlightenment owes its origin to China. The political economy of Adam Smith, in fact, springs from Confucius. China supplied most of the agricultural technology and practices including heavy plough that enabled Europe to launch its agricultural revolution. Even James Watt’s idea of steam engine may have come from China. In a similar way, the models of steel and cotton manufacturing had Oriental origin. A relatively backward Europe had absorbed the knowledge science and technology of the Orient and created a well-spring of innovations that allowed it to develop capitalism and its global domination. The Western capitalism now faces the same threat of decline as the Orient faced in the 18th century. It remains to be seen whether China or India can overtake the West within the next half a century or more. The Owl of Minerva began its flight through the twilight of the Orient to herald a new ‘magic’ beginning in the West. It was Columbus, Copernicus, coal and colony that led to the
development of the Western power and hegemony that started its ascent in a former Roman colony—Great Britain which became the master of the world and culminated after the Second World War into what Cromwell described as "a cold, poor and useless place,"—the New World (Findlay and O’Rourke, 2007: 233).

Conclusion

Said never attempted to explore the whole corpus of Oriental scholarship. His aim was to map out the underworld of Western civilization through an analysis of selected fictional and non-fictional texts and narratives. He has been immensely successful in this venture by developing what Kuhn (1970) calls paradigm in the broader sense of a world view and a technique of textual analysis. He only invented a specific way of seeing a key aspect orientalist discourse. Western culture like all other cultures manifests humanism and liberalism of enduring value. Said himself is a product of it. He no less than any other intellectual who prized it highly. To deny this essential humanism that he has cherished all life will be an injustice to him. In our troubled times when extremism of different kinds have reared their heads, Said becomes more relevant than any other intellectual.

Four decades after Said unmasked Orientalism, it is not enough just to elaborate the nature of Orientalism. We need to move beyond him to understand what gave rise to Orientalism as an ideology by locating it within the dynamics of the rise and fall of civilizations and how every dominant civilization rises on the basis of a fundamentally new technology and a new ideology. Although Said provides powerful perspective to unlearn, we need to develop a more complex and unified theoretical perspective to account for how civilizations rise and fall and how capitalism took over a minor ideological stream and turned it into a vast ideological arsenal of great power to exert its global dominance. Sociology and social sciences which were born in the interstices of colonialism (Wallerstein, 1978) and embody it and continues to hold sway over us. The superior knowledge and technology of the West continue to keep the discourse of Orientalism alive in different shapes and forms and it is likely to persist as long as it maintains its superiority of knowledge and hence power as Foucault asserted in the context of Europe. Through the power of discourse the West was able to turn the Orient into its other marked by a series and sequence of absences. The rise of India and China however, as the new core of global capitalism has largely undercut the political and economic foundation of Orientalism. It gives us new scope to move towards an enlarged horizon of historical and social scientific knowledge. Recent studies from the world-system perspective by Wallerstein, Frank, Chase-Dunn and his associates and the growing literature on how societies collapse lead us towards a new frontier of social theory grounded in a much more complex cyclical theory of social change. This paper is intended to make a small contribution towards this direction through a theoretical and historical review of the literature on Orientalism highlighting Said’s contribution and providing the sketch of a new model of social theory and apply it in the context pre-colonial South Asia. It is, however, necessary to emphasize that it is useless and sterile to eulogize the Oriental past and privilege the local ideologies to replace Orientalism. Nor it is enough to chronicle spread of Western ideology by ‘provincializing’ (Chakrabarty, 2000) the West. The task ahead is to enrich and expand the horizon of sociology to understand why a particular civilization emerges and then falls and how it transmits its heritage to a new civilization. All civilizations emerge on the ruins of
the old and absorbing their wisdom. Europe rose on the shoulders of the Orient absorbing its knowledge and technology. The emergence of China and India rests on the knowledge and technology of the West. As long as they continue to absorb Western knowledge and technology and add to it, they will enjoy the evolutionary spiral. It is neither necessary nor inevitable to develop an ideology of counter-orientalism. What is more necessary is to articulate the essential humanism of both Oriental and Western civilizations that Said symbolized and at the same time developing and deploying more complex social theory to understand better the barbarism of our time and stand against it. It is also necessary in our battle for survival against the looming risks and threats including climate change and dangerous biotechnological experiments that we will confront more and more in the 21st century. It is equally important as Weber reminded us many years ago in his conclusion to the essay entitled “Science and Vocation”, we must not succumb to and ‘obey’ the ‘demon’ ‘who’ holds ‘the fibers’ of our ‘very life’ (Weber, 1958:196).

References


*Comparative Studies in History and Society Comparative Studies in History and Society*, 21(2):151-167


Online Etymological Dictionary. "Orient". Available at https://www.etymonline.com/


Thapar, Romila. “Max Weber’s Hinduism and Buddhism: Reflections on a Sociological Classic 100 Years on,” SOAS University of London. Available at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TQnWQpkKBgM


Utilisation of Herbal Medicine among Pregnant Women Attending Formal Health Care Facilities in Okene Local Government Area of Kogi State

Alfred Eboh¹, Gabriel Mayowa Moyaki² and Patrick Okino³

Abstract: The peculiar challenges experienced by women during pregnancy could account for increased intake of herbal remedy as a form of alternative care among pregnant women in Nigeria and Okene community in particular. The focus of this study is to assess herbal medicine utilisation among pregnant women attending formal healthcare facilities in Okene Local Government Area (LGA) of Kogi State, Nigeria. The population of the study consisted of all the registered pregnant women attending both the public and the private healthcare facilities in Okene. Taro Yamane sampling technique was used to determine the sample size of two hundred and thirteen (213) while the use of simple random and purposive sampling techniques were adopted to elicit the data via questionnaire. The hypotheses were tested using One Sample chi-square. The results show that attitude of pregnant women had a significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene L.G.A. of Kogi State. Similarly, pregnant women’s belief system and orientations had a significant effect on herbal medicine utilisation in the study area. The study recommended that the government of Kogi State through the State ministry of health should set up an herbal institute that will modernize and regulate the practice of herbal medicine, in order to guarantee the safety use of it by the pregnant women in the state. Also, the herbal medicine should be made available, accessible and affordable as an alternative medicine to the pregnant women in their areas as a form of home remedy to aid effective child delivery.

Key Words:

Introduction

Traditional medicines (TM) from the time immemorial have obtained enormous popularity globally, despite predominant mainstream medicine available in the national healthcare system. TM includes the combination of or independent preparation and the use of herbal medicines, animal parts, and minerals which are most widely used across the globe. The World Health Organization (WHO) defined herbal medicine as any plant-derived material or preparations with therapeutic or other

¹Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social Sciences, Kogi State University, P.M.B 1008, Anyigba, Kogi state, Nigeria E-mail: eboh.a@ksu.edu.ng
²Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Ibadan, Ibadan, Nigeria
³Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social Sciences, Kogi State University, P.M.B 1008, Anyigba, Kogi state, Nigeria
severity, access to services and perceived quality of the services (Tipping & Segall, 1995) and also demographic aspects such as sex, age, level of education and occupation (Good, 1987). In sub-Saharan Africa, about 80% of the ever increasing population depends on ethnomedicine for their healthcare since conventional medicine is mostly expensive or unavailable in rural homesteads (Kanya, Ngi-Song, Sétamou, Overholt, Ochora & Osir, 2004; Ochora, Onguso & Kany, 2012), in addition to the fact that herbal medicine is regarded as effective and is the preferred system for many illnesses. Herbal medicines, including herbs, herbal preparations and finished herbal products, contain active ingredients of plants or other plant materials perceived to have therapeutic benefits. About 80% of the human population worldwide uses a variety of traditional medicine, including herbal medicines, for the diagnosis, prevention and treatment of illnesses, and for the improvement of general well-being (World Health Organization, 2013).

Pregnancy is a condition associated with immense physiological alterations resulting in many pregnancy-related problems, including nausea, vomiting, constipation, and heartburn (Lindzon, Sadry & Sharp, 2011). These ailments usually result in pregnant women self-medicating using over-the-counter (OTC) medications, seeking prescribed medications, or using herbs. Wells (2009) opined that herbal products are preferred over prescription medications due to the belief that herbs are safer for the fetus than modern medicine. Despite the fact that evidence on the safety profile of herbal products is inadequate to substantiate their use in pregnancy, it is increasingly used by expectant mothers. The prevalence of herbal medicine utilisation in pregnancy ranges between 7% and 55% in different geographical, social and cultural settings and ethnic groups (Dugoua, 2010).

In Africa, reliance on herbal medicines is relatively high among rural populations and is associated with a lack of access to public healthcare (World Health Organization, 2003). Use of herbal medicine may also be associated with social and cultural influences. Sindiga, Nyaigotti-Chacha and Kanunah (1995) perceived efficacy, beliefs about the safety of the herbs, and general ease of access (Langloid-Klassen, Kipp, Jahngri, & Rubaaale, 2007) as determinants for patronizing herbal medicine. However, even in the context of relatively high access to public healthcare, such as in urban areas, Africans still rely on alternative or traditional systems of care (Njoroge & Kibunga, 2007). Some studies have also shown that the attitudes of patients have a strong association with the utilisation of herbal medicine (Daly, Tai, Deng & Chien, 2009).

Rahman, Sulaiman, Ahmad, Salleh, Daud and Hamid (2009) asserted that many factors are responsible towards the usage of herbal medicines during pregnancy such as socio-demographic characteristics, health status, complications like miscarriage and infertility, pregnancy-induced symptoms, availability, accessibility, and affordability of conventional treatments, traditions and beliefs of pregnant women. Nordeng and Havnen (2001) argued that herbal remedies are used by women to relieve minor symptoms of pregnancy such as nausea, vomiting and low back pain, and also to prepare for labour or other unrelated health issues such as colds and respiratory illnesses or skin problems. In Nigeria, Gharoro and Igbafe (2000) reported that pregnant women used both traditional herbal medicines and
pharmaceutical drugs, with the highest prevalence of concomitant use among nulliparous mothers. Herbal products are preferred over prescription medications due to the belief that herbs are safer for the fetus than modern medicine. Despite the fact that evidence on the safety profile of herbal products is inadequate to substantiate their use in pregnancy, it is increasingly used by expectant mothers. The prevalence of herbal medicine utilisation in pregnancy ranges between 7% and 55% in different geographical, social and cultural settings, and ethnic groups (Dugoua, 2010). According to Mills, Cooper, Seely and Kanfer (2005), often times there is no detailed documentation of the traditional knowledge which is most times generally transferred verbally from generation to generation. The foregoing statements among the scholars about the use of herbal medicine necessitated this present study on herbal medicine utilisation among pregnant women attending the formal health care facilities in Okene Local Government Area of Kogi State.

Based on the statement of the problem above, the following research questions have been raised:

- What is the attitude of pregnant women towards the use of herbal medicine in Okene?
- How does the belief system affect herbal medicine utilisation among pregnant women in Okene?
- How do pregnant women’s demographic characteristics affect the use of herbal medicine in the study area?

Similarly, the main objective of this study is to assess the determinants of herbal medicine utilisation among pregnant women attending formal health care facilities in Okene Local Government Area of Kogi State. Specifically, the study aims to:

1. Examine the attitude of pregnant women towards the use of herbal medicine in Okene;
2. Investigate the effect of the belief system on herbal medicine utilisation among pregnant women in the study area; and
3. Determine how pregnant women’s demographic characteristics affect the use of herbal medicine in Okene.

The study is bound by the following hypotheses to be tested in due course:

**Ho1:** Attitude of pregnant women has no significant effect on the use of herbal Medicine in Okene.

**Ho2:** Pregnant women's belief system has no significant effect on herbal medicine utilisation in the study area.

**Ho3:** Pregnant women's demographic characteristics have no significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene.

It is observed that herbal medicine utilisation among pregnant women is a common practice across the globe. Plants and plant extracts have been used for the medical purpose before the recorded time as patients worldwide are more and more frequently turning to natural therapies and taking herbs to enhance their health and as a treatment for their diseases (Henry & Crowther, 2007). Approximately 80% of the world's population relies on herbal medicine to fulfil their daily health needs (Marshall, 1998).
According to the World Health Organization, because of poverty and lack of access to modern medicine, about 65-80% of the world’s population which lives in developing countries depends essentially on plants for primary health care (Akerele, Blass, Singh, Chowdhury, Kulshreshtha, Kamboj, Bishaw, 1993). Tamuno, Omole-Ohonsi & Fadare (2011) reported that the use of herbal medicine during pregnancy, labour or the postpartum period occurs at rates ranging from 30% to 70% in a healthcare setting in urban areas of sub-Saharan Africa. The health-seeking behaviour of the women can be influenced by some factors such as cultural factors (which includes the low status of women in the sense that they take authority from their husbands before taking/seeking medical aid), social factors like sex, age, educational level, marital status, occupation. Societal factors may include growth and equity, peer pressure, governance (which include overall approach of government toward health of the state), socioeconomic factors like standard of living, economic status/income, religion, cost of care , the type and severity of illness, geographical factors such as bad roads, weather/climatic changes, physical factors like the attitudes of healthcare personnel, long waiting at the healthcare centres/time wasting, standards of equipment, standard and availability of essential drugs, cost of care not equal to services rendered, interpersonal relationship between the health care team (Borras, 2004).

Regarding attitude and knowledge on the use of herbs during pregnancy in Norway, there was a study about the impact of socio-demographic factors, knowledge and attitude on the use of herbal drugs in pregnancy. The study included 400 women who gave birth at Ulleval University Hospital in 2001. They were interviewed by using a structured questionnaire within 3 days after childbirth and 36% of women reported herbal use during pregnancy. Both women who used and did not use herbal products had a positive attitude toward using herbs during pregnancy, while echinacea was the most common herb used. The factors that increased use of herbs were the prior use of herbs, high knowledge about herbs and age between 26-35 years. There was no association between herbal use and educational level (Nordeng & Haven, 2005). Similarly, Ondicho, Ochora, Mutai and Mutaai (2015) investigated the factors associated with the use of herbal medicine among patients in herbal clinics in Gucha District, Kenya. A cross-sectional study was carried out among 167 purposively selected patients. A semi-structured questionnaire was administered to patients. Quantitative data were analysed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 20.0. Their result was that 167 patients recruited into the study, 68.9% prefer using herbal medicine. However, 67.7% of the respondents occasionally visited the conventional hospital for the same or different health conditions. Among the patients interviewed, they all had a positive attitude toward herbal medicine. Respondents’ reasons for taking herbal medication were varied and included reasons such as herbs having better efficacy (83%) than conventional medicine, while 27.5% believed that herbal medicines being natural are safe to use.

Olowokere and Olajide (2013) examined women’s perception of safety and utilisation of herbal remedies during pregnancy in a local government area in Nigeria. Data was collected with the aid of semi-structured questionnaire using interviewer-administered method after informed consent had been taken from each participant. The findings showed that the women had positive perception about the safety and efficacy of herbs over conventional drugs in pregnancy. A Greater percentage of the
participants studied had used herbs at one point or the other during pregnancy. Local concoction also referred to as "Agbo" was the most used herbs by the women. They recommended the need for a laboratory exploration of these herbs because of the high usage by pregnant women without any empirical evidence on its safety and efficacy.

The use of herbal medicines play significant roles in the management of both minor and major illnesses (Eisenberg, Kessler, Foster, Norlock, Calkins & Delbanco, 1993) and has been influenced by patients' dissatisfaction with conventional allopathic medicines in terms of effectiveness and/or safety, satisfaction with therapeutic outcome (Abbot & Ernst, 1997) and the perception that herbal medicines are inherently safe. Some of the more complex reasons for preference of herbal medicines are associated with cultural and personal beliefs, philosophical views on life and health (Ernst & White, 2000), as well as a comparison of experiences between conventional healthcare professionals and complementary medicine practitioners by patients (Astin, 1998). Furthermore, Ondicho, Ochora, Matu, Mutai and Mutai (2015) investigated the factors associated with the use of herbal medicine among patients in herbal clinics in Gucha District, Kenya. A cross-sectional study was carried out among 167 purposively selected patients. A semi-structured questionnaire was administered to patients. Quantitative data were analysed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 20.0. Their result was that 167 patients recruited into the study, 68.9% prefer using herbal medicine. However, 67.7% of the respondents occasionally visit the conventional hospital for the same or different health conditions. Among the patients interviewed, they all had a positive attitude toward herbal medicine. Respondents' reasons for taking herbal medication were varied and included reasons such as herbs having better efficacy (83%) than conventional medicine, while 27.5% believed that herbal medicines being natural are safe to use.

Due to deeply rooted cultural belief that herbal medicine treated certain diseases and maintained good health, (6%) of the respondents preferred to use herbal medicine. The respondents believed in the better quality of service offered by the herbalists which were statistically significant in the influence on respondents' choice of medical care. The respondents mainly used herbal medicine for gastrointestinal disorders (46.2%) and malaria (9.7%). Relatives had a marked influence on 37.7% of the respondents using herbal medicine while media also played an important role in creating awareness. They recommended further research on herbal medicine use in Gucha in order to establish the efficacy and safety of the medicines used by the community. Tariku, Tadele and Fiseha (2016) examined the prevalence of herbal medicine use and associated factors among pregnant women attending antenatal care at public health facilities in Hossana Town, Southern Ethiopia. The facility based cross-sectional study was conducted among 363 pregnant women attending antenatal clinics from May to June 2015 at public health facilities in Hossana town, Hadiya zone, Southern Ethiopia. Pretested structured questionnaire was used to collect data from each study subject. Bivariate logistic regression analysis was used to see the significance of the association between the outcome and independent variables. The result showed that two hundred fifty-eight (73.1 %) of pregnant women used herbal medicine during current pregnancy. Commonly used herbal medicines during current pregnancy were garlic, ginger,
tenaadam, damakasse and eucalyptus. Educational status, occupation, knowledge on herbal medicine and second trimester of pregnancy were the major factors affecting the use of herbal medicine. They recommended health education about the effects of herbal medicine on pregnancy should be given during antenatal care sessions and through media. Health care providers, especially those that are involved in antenatal care should be aware of evidence regarding potential benefits or harm of herbal medicinal agents when used by pregnant women. In a related study, Oluyemi, Yinusa, Abdullahateef and Adejoke (2016) examined the utilisation of herbal medicine among inhabitants of an urban centre in North-Central Nigeria, 460 participants selected through multi-stage sampling technique was included in the study. The finding showed that Pile 20.2%, was the most treated illness with herbal medicine followed closely by malaria fever 17.7% and typhoid fever 14.9%. 46.0% of the participants utilise herbal medicine because of its efficiency in treatment while 15.8% used it because it works faster for them. Socio-demographic characteristics of participants found to affect utilisation of herbal medicine were: income (p=0.001), education (p=0.0001) and occupation (p=0.0005), while those found not to affect utilisation of herbal medicine were: age (p=0.5330) and sex (p=0.0054).The study recommended massive enlightenment on the dangers involved in the indiscriminate use of herbal medicine, regulation of herbal medicine, provision of health insurance scheme for Nigerians and more research into herbal medicine with a view to integrating it into the modern healthcare delivery system in Nigeria.

Chukwuma, Kenechi, Nnebue, Ikechukwu, Kevin, Chuka, Anthony and Irene (2016) carried out a study on socio-demographic determinants of herbal medicine use in pregnancy among Nigerian women attending clinics in a tertiary hospital in Imo State, South-East, Nigeria. Data was collected using a pre-tested, semi-structured, interviewer-administered questionnaire and participants were selected using the systematic sampling technique. Data were analysed using a computer software package (EPI-Info 7.1.3) and the p-value was set at 0.05 significant levels. The results showed a prevalence of herbal medicine use among the participants was 36.8% (184) and the commonest herbal used was bitter leaf/ironweed plant (Vernonia Amygdalina), 54.3%. Socio-demographic characteristics of participants found to affect herbal medicine use in pregnancy were; age, (p=0.035), Marital status, (p=0.000), educational level, (p=0.000), educational level of partner, (p=0.014) and monthly income, (p=0.003). They recommended that the prevalence of herbal medicine use was high and most of the determinants observed are modifiable, thus there is need to institute control appropriate measures by relevant authorities to tackle this problem.

Tamuno, Omole-Ohonsi and Fadare (2010) observe the use of herbal medicine among pregnant women attending a tertiary hospital in Northern Nigeria. A pre- piloted structured questionnaire was administered to 500 pregnant women attending the clinic to collect data on demographics, obstetric factors, knowledge and use of herbal medicine during pregnancy. Their results show that 31.4% of pregnant women used herbal medicines in the subsisting pregnancy. Over 40% of respondents had at least primary education while nearly 30% had an income of less than 20,000 nairas (130 USD) monthly. Statistically Significant associations were found between herbal medicine use and no formal education (p<.05), low economic status (p<5) and self-medication with orthodox drugs (p<.05). Ginger (zingiber
Officinale) and Garlic (allium sativa) were the most commonly used herbal medicines recalled by respondents. There was a significant association between education of respondents and their knowledge on the safety of herbal medicines while a disparity was found between their views and practice. They recommended that the use of herbal medicine among pregnant women in this environment was high. Clinicians and caregivers should have knowledge of the herbs commonly used by pregnant women and the potential for toxicity. Attention should be given to enlightenment of pregnant women and the community on the dangers of herbal drug use during pregnancy.

Methodology
This section deals with the methods used to arrive at the findings. It shows the research design, study area, population of the study, sample size and technique, the method of data collection, validity and reliability of the instruments and the method of data analysis. The study objective preponderantly necessitated the use of descriptive research design in which a survey method was adopted. The method is, however, triangulated with the use of both the questionnaire and In-Depth Interview (IDI) to examine herbal medicine utilisation among pregnant women attending healthcare facilities in Okene Local Government Area of Kogi State.

In terms of the study location and people, Okene Local Government Area was created in 1976 from the then Ebira Division by the Administration of General Olusegun Obasanjo, following the 1976 Local Government Reform. Ajaokuta and Ogori-Magongo LGAs were created from the old Okene LGA in 1991 and 1996 respectively. The people of Okene Local Government Area are a part of Ebira Tao people of the Central Senatorial District of Kogi State. They are believed to have migrated from Jukun in the present day Taraba State and had a brief stop-over in Idah before moving to its present location. The present Okene LGA is composed of Okene and Okengwe districts. There are 11 wards in the Local Government which are Bariki, Otutu, Orietesu, Lafia/Obessa, Okene-Eba, Idoji, Onyukolo, Obahira-Eba, Obahira-Uvete, Abuga/Ozuja and Upogoro/Odenku wards. The people are predominantly Muslims with a large size of Christian population too. The Local Government is bordered by four Local Government Areas of Kogi and Edo State. It is bordered to the West by Okehi LGA, to the East by Ajaokuta LGA, to the North by Adavi LGA and to the South by Ogori-Magongo LGA and Edo State. Okene LGA is located in the tropical zone, influenced by two climatic conditions namely: rain and dry seasons. The rainy season starts from April to October, while the dry season starts from November to April. The dominant vegetation of Okene Local Government Area by virtue of lying on the fingers of the equator is interspaced with erect and numerous trunks of trees. The ecological zone in which the Local Government is situated offers considerable potential for agricultural production. Okene is composed of two main clans: Okovi and Agada. Okovi is further subdivided into Asuwe, Omavi, Ehebe, Eyire, Omoaye, Adobe and onyi-Onwa clans while Agada is also subdivided into Akuta, Avi, Ogu, Ede Ohi-Monoko, and Esusu clans. The people are well known for the famous Okene cloth weaving, farming, hunting, and commerce among others. Some of the traditional festivals include Ekuechi, Ebe, Eyika, Echane, Unehe (Ichekene and Ikede) and a host of others.
The target population of this study comprises all the registered pregnant women of both private and public hospitals consisting of Charity Hospital, God's Glory Hospital, Victory Hospital and Okene General Hospital in Okene Metropolis. The entire registered pregnant women for the hospitals were four hundred and forty-three (443), pregnant women, as obtained from the antenatal care department registers, from the hospitals for the time frame of one month, January 2017. The In-Depth Interview (IDI) was conducted to ten (10) herbal practitioners and Traditional Birth Attendants (TBAs) in Okene Metropolis.

The sample size of this population was determined using Taro Yamane (1973) sampling technique. This technique is applied only when the population for the study is known. The formula for Taro Yamane is stated as:

\[
n = \frac{N}{1 + N (e)^2}
\]

Where
- \( n \) = Sample size
- \( N \) = Population of the Study
- \( e \) = error term

\[
\begin{align*}
n &= \frac{443}{1 + 443(.05)^2} \\
n &= \frac{443}{1 + 443(.0025)} \\
n &= \frac{443}{1 + 1.11} \\
n &= \frac{443}{2.11} \\
n &= 209
\end{align*}
\]

The source of data collection was primary. Primary data were collected for the study via the triangulation of the questionnaire and In-Depth Interview (IDI) instruments administered to the respondents. A four-point Likert scale of strongly disagree, disagree, agree and strongly agree was used. There are fourteen (14) questions in the questionnaire with each objective of the study having questions structured to address it. There are also nine (9) questions in the interview schedule to generate qualitative data. The researcher interviewed five (5) herbal homeowners' and herbal mid-wives who are herbal practitioners in Okene, Kogi State.
In order to ensure the validity of the research instrument, the questionnaire was properly structured by the researcher and cross-checked by the supervisor. The content validity was done by subjecting the questionnaire to the review by two lecturers in Kogi State University. To ascertain the reliability of the instrument, to ensure consistency in terms of survey, Cronbach's Alpha reliability test was conducted and a reliability coefficient of .934 was obtained as presented below. The data were presented using tables while the mean score was used to interpret the respondents' responses. The mean scores were compared with the average mean of 2.5 for decision-making. The average mean is computed as $1 + 2 + 3 + 4 = 10/4 = 2.5$. I.e. a 4-point Likert-type scale of Strongly Disagree, Disagree, Agree and Strongly Agree respectively. Any mean score that is equal to 2.5 and above shows agreement with the question while any mean below 2.5 indicates disagreement with the question. Also, Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 20.0 software was used to analyse the data while One-Sample Chi-Square test was used to test all the null hypotheses formulated. The In-Depth Interview was presented as generated from the interviewees and the contents analysed to corroborate the responses from the questionnaire instrument.

If the asymptotic significant is equal to or less than 5% (0.05) reject the null hypothesis. On the other hand, if the asymptotic significant is greater than 5% (0.05) accept the null hypothesis.

**Data Presentation and Analysis**

The sample size of two hundred and nine (209) comprises of all the registered pregnant women in Charity Hospital, God’s Glory Hospital, Victory Hospital, Okene General Hospital in Okene Metropolis was used. Out of a total of two hundred and nine (209) copies of the questionnaire distributed to the respondents, one hundred and seventy (170) copies were returned given a response rate of 81%. Data were analysed based on the questionnaire administered to the respondents to address the demographic characteristics, the research objectives and to test all the null hypotheses. Tables were used to present the data generated by the questionnaire instrument, while the qualitative data were content-analysed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Demographic Characteristics of the Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age of Respondents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24-28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion of Respondents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christianity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African traditional religion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 above shows that 31% of the total respondents were within the age bracket of 14-18 years, 16% of the total respondents were within the age bracket of 19-23 years, 35% of the total respondents were within the age bracket of 24-28 and 18% were within the age bracket of 29 years and above. This shows that the majority of the respondents fall within the age bracket of 24-28 years. Table 4.1 above also shows that 38% of the total respondents are Christians, 60% of the total respondents are Muslims while 2% of the total respondents are Traditional Religion worshippers. This shows that the majority of the respondents are Muslims. Table 4.1 above further shows that 47% of the total respondents are married, 29% of the total respondents are Divorced, 18% of the total respondents are separated and 6% of the total respondents are widowed. This implies that the majority of the respondents are married.

Table 1 above also shows that 24% of the total respondents had no formal education, 41% of the total respondents had primary education, 26% of the total respondents had secondary education and 9% of the total respondents had tertiary education. This implies that the majority of the respondents had primary education. Table 4.1 above shows that 48% of the total respondents are traders, 25% of the total respondents are weavers, 3% of the total respondents are nurses and 24% of the total respondents have no occupation. This implies that the majority of the respondents have are traders.
The results from the data and their various statistics are presented below. This starts with the reliability test using Cronbach’s Alpha, the descriptive statistics to obtain mean score and standard deviation and the Chi-Square result to test all the null hypotheses formulated. The Cronbach’s Alpha test of 93.4% shows a satisfactory result.

Table 3: Attitude of pregnant women and the use of herbal medicine in Okene L.G.A.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories/Variables</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min.</th>
<th>Max.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Use herbal med. during preg.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.9412</td>
<td>.83351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Safety of herbal med. during preg.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.7647</td>
<td>.88575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Use herbal med. for the safe delivery of babies.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.6941</td>
<td>1.00323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Use herbal med. to cure pregnancy-related sicknesses.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.6647</td>
<td>1.00851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Use herbal med. during pregnancy as a first health treatment.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.6824</td>
<td>1.02295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid N (listwise)</td>
<td>170</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Researcher’s Computation Using SPSS 20.0 Version

Table 3, item 1 above shows that the majority of the respondents agreed that herbal medicine was used during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A as indicated by the mean score of 2.9412 which is above the average mean score of 2.5. Similarly, item 2 also shows that the majority of the respondents agreed that herbal medicine was safe for use during pregnancy in the study area. This was indicated by the mean score of 2.7647 which is above the average mean score of 2.5. Furthermore, the variable category 3 shows that the majority of the respondents agreed that herbal medicine was used during pregnancy on daily basis to facilitate safe and easy delivery of babies as indicated by the mean score of 2.6941. The same table3, category 4 holds that the majority of the women agreed that herbal medicine was used to cure pregnancy-related sicknesses as validated by the mean score of 2.6647 which is considered significant as above the average mean score of 2.5. The category 5 in the same table shows that the majority of the respondents agreed that herbal medicine was used as the first line of treatment or primary health care during pregnancy. This response was authenticated by the mean score of 2.6824 which is above the baseline mean score of 2.5.
An investigation was conducted into the respondents' belief system and the inclination towards the use of herbal medicine among the pregnant women in the study area. The corresponding findings in table 4, variable 6 above shows that the majority of the respondents agreed that herbal medicine cures pregnancy-related ailments and afflictions faster than the orthodox medicine. The mean score of 2.6529 which is above the average mean score of 2.5 validated the fact. Also, category 7 clearly indicated that the majority of the respondents agreed that herbal medicine use during pregnancy had some minimal side effects among them as indicated by the mean score of 2.6588 while category 8 further shows that the majority of the respondents agreed that some pregnancy-related illnesses induced by witchcraft require the use of herbal medicine as indicated by the mean score of 2.7118. Equally, category 9 in table 4 above shows that the majority of the respondents affirmed the influence of their traditional beliefs on the use of herbal medicine to cure pregnancy-related ailments, given the mean score of 2.5412 which is above the average mean score of 2.5.

Table 5 borders on the respondents' demographic attributes and the propensity to utilize herbal medicine during pregnancy. The findings show in category 10 the majority of the respondents disagreed that their religious orientations and beliefs did not influence the use of herbal medicine during pregnancy as indicated by the mean score of 2.4294. Item 11 also shows that the majority of the respondents disagreed that their husbands did not influence the use of herbal medicine during
Table 5: Pregnant Women’s Demographic Characteristics and the Use of Herbal Medicine in Okene L.G.A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables/Categories</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min.</th>
<th>Max.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10 Religion influences the use of herbal med. for preg.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>2.4294</td>
<td>1.08145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 my husband supports herbal med. use for preg.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>2.4588</td>
<td>1.10462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 herbal med. use during preg. is affordable</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>2.5059</td>
<td>1.12132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Herbal med. use for preg. is available and accessible.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>2.6529</td>
<td>.93746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 my family members influence the use of herbal med. use for preg.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>2.8176</td>
<td>1.03016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid N (listwise)</td>
<td>170</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Researchers’ Computation Using SPSS 20.0 Version

pregnancy as proved by the mean score of 2.4588 which is less than the average mean score of 2.5. Furthermore, variable 12 shows that the majority of the respondents agreed that the use of herbal medicine is affordable for pregnancy maintenance as indicated by the mean score of 2.5059. Similarly, category 13 above also shows that the use of herbal medicine was informed by its availability and accessibility to the respondents in the study location as proved by the mean score of 2.6529. In a related finding, item 14 above finally shows that the respondents’ family members influence their use of herbal medicine during pregnancy as indicated by the mean score of 2.8176 which is above the average mean score of 2.5.

Test of Hypotheses

The hypotheses were tested using one-sample chi-square test. The hypotheses are, however, re-stated below:

Ho1: Attitude of pregnant women has no significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene

Ho2: Pregnant women’s belief system has no significant effect on herbal medicine utilisation in the study area.

Ho3: Pregnant women’s demographic characteristics have no significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene
Table 6: Chi-square Test Statistics for Hypothesis One

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Null Hypothesis</th>
<th>Test</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The categories of 1 Use herbal med. during preg. occur with equal probabilities.</td>
<td>One-Sample Chi-Square Test</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>Reject the null hypothesis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The categories of 2. Safety of herbal med. during preg. occur with equal probabilities.</td>
<td>One-Sample Chi-Square Test</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>Reject the null hypothesis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The categories of 3 Use herbal med. for safe delivery of babies occur with equal probabilities.</td>
<td>One-Sample Chi-Square Test</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>Reject the null hypothesis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The categories of 4 Use herbal med. to cure pregnancy-related sicknesses occur with equal probabilities.</td>
<td>One-Sample Chi-Square Test</td>
<td>.010</td>
<td>Reject the null hypothesis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The categories of 5 Use herbal med. during pregnancy as first health treatment occur with equal probabilities.</td>
<td>One-Sample Chi-Square Test</td>
<td>.008</td>
<td>Reject the null hypothesis.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Asymptotic significances are displayed. The significance level is .05.


The result from the above Table 6 indicated that since all the asymptotic significant levels are within 1%, as indicated by all the significant levels of .000, the null hypothesis one is rejected, indicating that attitude of pregnant women has a significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene L.G.A. in Kogi State.

Test of Hypothesis Two

H₂: Pregnant women's belief system has no significant effect on herbal medicine utilisation in the study area in Kogi State.

The result from the Table 7 below indicated that since all the asymptotic significant levels are within 1%, as indicated by all the significant levels of .000, the null hypothesis two is rejected, indicating that pregnant women's belief system has a significant effect on herbal medicine utilisation in Okene L.G.A. in Kogi State.
Table 7: Chi-square Test Statistics for Hypothesis Two

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis Test Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Null Hypothesis Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 The categories of 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbal med. curries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preg. stooliness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>faster than</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>orthodox med. occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with equal probabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The categories of 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbal med. has</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>minimal side effects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on preg. occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with equal probabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The categories of 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>witchcraft induced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preg. illness needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>herbal med. occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with equal probabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The categories of 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional supports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use of herbal med. for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preg. occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with equal probabilities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Asymptotic significances are displayed. The significance level is .05.

Source: Researchers’ Field Survey, 2017

Test of Hypothesis Three

H₃: Pregnant women’s demographic characteristics have no significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene in Kogi State.

Table 8: Chi-square Test Statistics for Hypothesis Two

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis Test Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Null Hypothesis Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 The categories of 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion influence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use of herbal med. for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preg. occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with equal probabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The categories of 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>my husband supports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>herbal med. use for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preg. occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with equal probabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The categories of 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>herbal med. use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preg. is affordable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>during preg. occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with equal probabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The categories of 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbal med. use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for preg. is available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and accessible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>occur with equal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>probabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 The categories of 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>my family members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>influence the use of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>herbal med. use for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preg. occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with equal probabilities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Asymptotic significances are displayed. The significance level is .05.

Source: Researchers’ Field Survey, 2017

The result from the above Table 8 indicated that since all the asymptotic significant levels are within 1%, except question 10 and 11 as indicated by the significant levels, the null hypothesis three is rejected, indicating that pregnant women’s demographic characteristics have a significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene L.G.A. in Kogi State.
Discussion of Findings

The study revealed that attitude of pregnant women has a significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene L.G.A. in Kogi State. This implies that herbal medicine is used during pregnancy, herbal medicine is safe for use during pregnancy and herbal medicine is used during pregnancy on daily basis to help safe delivery in Okene L.G.A in Kogi State. Also, herbal medicine is used during pregnancy to cure sickness and served as a source of primary health care during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A. of Kogi state. These findings are in line with some authorities' like Tamuno, Omole-Ohonsi and Fadare (2011) who asserted that the use of herbal medicine during pregnancy, labour or the postpartum period occurs at rates ranging from 30% to 70% in a healthcare setting in urban areas of sub-Saharan Africa. Adams and Connell (2001) also affirmed that herbal remedy is perceived to be safe due to its natural source. Eisenberg, Kessler, Foster, Norlock, Calkins and Delbanco (1993) further asserted that the use of herbal medicines plays significant roles in the management of both minor and major illnesses. Abbot and Ernst (1997) also perceived that herbal medicines are inherently safe.

The In-depth Interview (IDI) on the herbal medicine usage by pregnant women in Okene LGA of Kogi State. The view of one of the respondents captures this:

The use of herbal medicine is part of wetin we get from our fore fathers. Even when my own father where I learn this herbal practice day alive so many pregnant women come here for herbal solutions, they used herbs to take care of their pregnancy. Na wetin so many people, the use in this area for treatment of sickness. (Male/ 61 years/ Okene/ IDI/ 2017).

The study further revealed that pregnant women's belief system has a significant effect on herbal medicine utilisation in Okene L.G.A. of Kogi State. This means that herbal medicine cures pregnancy-related ailment faster than orthodox medicine, herbal medicine use during pregnancy has minimal side effects in Okene L.G.A. Also, pregnancy-related illnesses induced by witchcraft require the use of herbs and herbal medicine is used to cure pregnancy-related ailments in Okene L.G.A. in Kogi State. These are in agreement with the findings of scholars like Low-Dog (2009) who opined that the use of herbal medicine by women during pregnancy has to do with their belief system. Ernst and White (2000) also argued that some of the more complex reasons for preference of herbal medicines are associated with cultural and personal beliefs, philosophical views on life and health. Fakeye et al (2009) supported the findings that herbs being natural is safer during pregnancy and have better efficacy than conventional medicine. Ogunjuyigbe and Ayotunde (2007) reinforced that some pregnant women see their problems as either a result of traditional black magic or spiritual attack and as such, use traditional herbs to remedy such illness.

The In-depth Interview (IDI) on the factors that influence the use of herbal products/services by pregnant women in Okene LGA of Kogi State. The view of one of the respondents further captures this:

No be all pregnant women sicknesses hospital treatment go do am, so herbs make pregnant women babies position well inside womb and it also make them to born babies easily (Female/ 57 years/ Okene/ IDI/ 2017).
This means that herbal medicines is believed to aid pregnant women healthy delivery, checks issues of stillbirth, enhances proper positioning of the foetus during pregnancy among others. Similarly, the view of one of the respondents also captures this:

The major advantages of herbal products/services over orthodox products/services be say pregnant women go deliver their babies on their own without operation, it checks long duration of pregnancy than orthodox products and make women who give birth be okay than hospital products. (Male/ 53 years/ Okene/ IDI/ 2017).

The study finally revealed that pregnant women’s demographic characteristics have a significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene L.G.A in Kogi State. This finding sustains the discovery of Chukwuma et al (2016). The implication is that the use of herbal medicine is affordable for pregnancy maintenance reinforced by its availability and accessibility in the study area. Also, the respondents’ family members influenced the use of herbal medicine during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A. Though, their religious beliefs’ and husbands’ do not influence their use of herbal medicine during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A. The findings are in consonance with the work of Fakeye et al (2009) who opined that easier access to herbal medicines and low-cost influenced the use of herbal medicine in the study area. Also, a study conducted by Cuzzolin, Francini-Persenti, Verlato, Joppi, Baldelli and Benoni(2010), affirmed that the decision to use herbal products is mainly based on personal judgment and on the conviction that these natural substances would be safer than traditional medicines.

In summary, the study revealed that attitude of pregnant women has a significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene L.G.A. in Kogi State. This implies that herbal medicine is used during pregnancy, herbal medicine is safe for use during pregnancy and herbal medicine is used during pregnancy on daily basis to help safe delivery in Okene L.G.A in Kogi State. Also, herbal medicine is used during pregnancy to cure sickness and served as a source of primary health care during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A. of Kogi state.

The study further revealed that pregnant women’s belief system has a significant effect on herbal medicine utilisation in Okene L.G.A. in Kogi State. This means that herbal medicine cures pregnancy-related ailment faster than orthodox medicine, herbal medicine use during pregnancy has minimal side effects in Okene L.G.A. Also, pregnancy-related illnesses induced by witchcraft require the use of herbs and herbal medicine is used to cure pregnancy-related ailments in Okene L.G.A. of Kogi State.

The study finally revealed that pregnant women’s demographic characteristics had a significant effect on the use of herbal medicine in Okene L.G.A in Kogi State. This finding is in tandem with Tariku, Tadele and Fiseha (2016); Ondicho et al Ochora, (2015). This implies that the use of herbal medicine is affordable for pregnancy maintenance; the herbal medicine use is informed by the availability and accessibility in their area and their family members influence the use of herbal medicine during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A. in Kogi State. Though, their religious beliefs’ and husbands’ do not influence their use of herbal medicine during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A. of Kogi State.
There is a high use of herbal medicine on daily basis during pregnancy in Okene LGA of Kogi State. This is because of their positive attitude towards the safety of herbal medicine use for safe delivery of pregnant mothers in the area. The herbal medicine used during pregnancy equally cures sicknesses and served as a source of primary health care during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A. of Kogi state.

The people of Okene Local Government Area of Kogi State, strongly believed in herbal medicine utilisation to cure pregnancy-related illnesses and illnesses induced by witchcraft. They equally believed that it cures a pregnancy-related ailment, faster than orthodox medicine and that herbal medicine use during pregnancy has minimal side effects.

The use of herbal medicine in Okene Local Government Area of Kogi State by pregnant women is influenced by availability, accessibility and affordability of herbal medicine in the area. The family members of the pregnant women also influence the use of their herbal medicine during pregnancy in Okene L.G.A. of Kogi State. Though, their religious beliefs’ and husbands’ do not influence their use of herbal medicine during pregnancy in the area.

Arising from the findings above, the following recommendations are hereby offered:
1) The government of Kogi State through the State Ministry of Health should set up a herbal institute that will modernise and regulate the practice of herbal medicine, in order to guarantee the safe use of herbal medicine by pregnant women in the state.
2) The herbal medicine should be made available, accessible and affordable as an alternative therapy, to the pregnant women in their areas, to aid effective child delivery. The herbal medicine should be used as a form of remedial intervention by pregnant women before proceeding to the orthodox health centres.
3) There should be an enlightenment campaign in the state to educate the pregnant women, regarding proper intake of herbal medicine in combination with the orthodox medicine at the same time.

References


Job Satisfaction and Turnover Intentions of Police Officers in Rural Communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State, Nigeria

Ajibade David¹ and V. Kakwagh Venatus²

Abstract: This study examined the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intentions of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State, Nigeria with the specific objectives of ascertaining the levels of job satisfaction and turnover intentions, the relationship between the levels of job satisfaction and turnover intention, and the gender differences in the levels of job satisfaction and turnover intentions, using descriptive survey research design with quantitative approach. The study also utilized multi-stage sampling design. First, three divisional police headquarters were purposively selected in the study area. Second, nine police posts were purposively chosen from the divisional police headquarters selected. Third, one hundred and seventeen respondents were chosen from the selected police posts using purposive sampling technique. Data were collected using semi-structured questionnaire and the data collected were processed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences version 22, and statistically analysed using frequencies, percentage and weighted mean while Pearson product correlation and Levene’s independent t-test for equality of variance were used to test the study hypotheses. The results of the study show that respondents in the sampled area had low level of job satisfaction and high turnover intentions; these were however influenced by combination of factors such as poor compensation package (including salary and fringe benefits), work overload, irregular promotion and career advancement. Based on these findings, the study concludes with recommendations application of which will not only help the police organisation to reduce job dissatisfaction and turnover intentions among its personnel in the rural areas but also serve as the organisation personnel retention strategy.

Keywords: Job satisfaction, Turnover intention, Police officers, Rural communities, Dekina, Kogi State

Introduction

Police organisation is one of the agencies created by government to protect the life and property of the citizenry. However, there are many factors that should be considered especially with regards to the welfare of human resources in achieving the objective of the organisation. One of these factors is job satisfaction (as it is important for retaining employees). Conceptually, to be satisfied means to be happy or free from some desire or need by being supplied with what one desires, needs or wants. In other words, satisfaction connotes happiness and a state of well being as an outcome of need-fulfilment. This idea of well-being can be extended to job satisfaction to mean the sum total of a person’s feelings as

¹ Department of Sociology, Kogi State University, Anyigba, Nigeria. E-mail: abisoye_70@yahoo.com; ajibade.dl@ksu.edu.ng
² Department of Sociology, Kogi State University, Anyigba, Nigeria.
to the extent to which his needs have been met in his job. These needs related to/encompass pay, benefits, promotion, working conditions, supervision, organisational practices and relationship with co-workers (Misener, 1996).

Theoretically, the concept of job satisfaction has been explained by a number of theories ranging from Maslow’s theory of human needs, Herzberg’s motivation-hygiene theory, the Existence, Relatedness and Growth (ERG) theory, to the Equity theory. Each of these theories uses different postulations and assumptions in explaining job satisfaction. For instance, Maslow theory argued that individual have certain needs that influence their behaviour, and that these needs are arranged in an order of importance/hierarchy from the basic physiological to the complex self-actualisation needs. However, when these needs are not met, individual experience de-motivation/dissatisfaction. Herzberg’s motivation-hygiene theory, on the other hand, believes that an individual’s relation to work is basic and that one’s attitude towards work can determine success/failure. Conversely, Alderfer’s ERG theory suggest that all human needs can be accessed and satisfied simultaneously, rather than from bottom up, either way, as needs are satisfied, employees are motivated to strive to satisfy a new needs; while equity theory draws attention to one role of job comparisons with those of another in determining satisfaction (Ejiogu, 1992). In spite of these differences, they all came to a consensus that workers have needs, and that satisfactory job attitudes are function of congruence between the needs of an individual and the job situation. In other words, it is agreed that when the characteristics of a job are compatible with the needs of a workers, he will experience job satisfaction.

Job satisfaction has also been found by scholars such as Klassen, Usher & Bong (2010); Maertz & Griffeth (2004); Chang & Lee (2007); Mansor & Tayib (2010); Anik, Akinin, Norton, Dunn & Quoidbach (2013); Chen, Yang, Shiau & Wang (2006); Sesanga & Garrett (2005) to be a functions of many factors. For instance, Klassen, et al (2010) found promotion, pay, supervisory support, team/group cohesion and job requirement as the main factors of job satisfaction. Maertz & Griffeth (2004), on the other hand, discovered factors such as competitive salary, job autonomy, good supervision and interpersonal relationship, training and development opportunities, better working conditions and job security. Additionally, Chang & Lee (2007); Mansor & Tayib (2010); and Anik, et al (2013) found organisational culture as prime factor of job satisfaction; while Sesanga & Garrett (2005) identified factors such as good remuneration and supervision, opportunity for promotion, co-worker’s behaviour, working conditions, and the job itself as factors of job satisfaction. Likewise, Chen, et al (2006) discovered factors such as organisation vision, result feedback and motivation, management system, working conditions, pay and benefits, as influencer of job satisfaction.

Job satisfaction is a key antecedent of turnover intentions. This is so because the way people experience work in their place of work influences their intention to leave or stay in an organisation. Therefore, turnover intention connotes an individual estimated probability that he/she will stay or leave an employing organisation (Cotton & Tuttle, 1986). Aneil & Gretchen (2002) have classified turnover into two categories namely voluntary and involuntary turnover. Voluntary turnover occurs when an employee separates from the organisation by his/her willing. But if the separation occurs without the intention/interest of the employee, it is involuntary turnover. Voluntary reasons for leaving an
organisation include getting a new job that offers more responsibility and improved salary/benefits, education advancement, performance problems, unmet job expectations, job stress and lack of career development opportunities; while involuntary reasons for leaving an organisation include employee’s death, chronic illness, and spouse transfer (Aniel & Gretchen, 2002; Asmran, AbdulRazak & Osman, 2013).

Studies conducted by Cotton & Tuttel (1986); Hom & Griffeth (1996); Hom, Roberson & Ellis (2008); Shah (2011); Lee, Gerhart, Weller & Trevor (2008); Nel, VanDyk, Haasbrock, Schultz, Sono & Werner (2011) on the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intentions revealed job satisfaction exerting significant influence on employee’s turnover intentions. Further findings especially in the studies of Cotton & Tuttel (1986); Hom, et al (2008); Nel, et al (2011) show differences in male and female turnover intentions. Notwithstanding the efforts from previous studies, none of the studies examined the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention in police organisation. A plausible implication of this neglect is that it makes it difficult to know the level of job satisfaction/dissatisfaction that prevail among personnel of such organisation and how much it has impacted on their feeling to leave/stay in the organisation. For instance, previous studies by Ashraf & Joarder (2010); Chew & Chan (2008); Reichheld (1993); Schmalenberg & Kramer (2008) suggest that employees experiencing job dissatisfaction tend to have high intention to leave that organisation. This however has many implications as it often leads to organisations losing their skilled and experienced employees, causing decreasing performance, and increasing cost of training and expatriation. Hence, the need to investigate the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention in police organisation. This will however be done with particular reference to police formation in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State, Nigeria.

Research Questions

This study is guided by the following research questions:

(i) What is the level of job satisfaction and turnover intention of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State?

(ii) What is the association between level of job satisfaction and turnover intention of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State?

(iii) Are there gender differences in the level of job satisfaction and turnover intention of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State?

Objectives of the study

The general objective of this study is to examine the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State, Nigeria. Specifically, the study is set out to:

(i) estimate the level of job satisfaction and turnover intention of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State
(ii) assess the relationship between level of job satisfaction and turnover intention of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State

(iii) ascertain the gender differences in the level of job satisfaction and turnover intention of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State

Study hypotheses

The hypotheses for this study are stated in null form as follows:

(i) Ho: There is no significant relationship between levels of job satisfaction and turnover intention of police officers in rural area in Dekina Local Government Area.

(ii) Ho: There is no significant difference between male and female levels of job satisfaction.

(iii) Ho: There is no significant difference between male and female levels of turnover intention

Theoretical framework

This study is hung on the social exchange theory. Social exchange theory is a product of the research work done by Thibaut & Kelley (1959); Homans (1961); Rusbult (1983); and Levi-Strauss (1969). Although these researchers have different view point on modes of exchange, they all agreed that as humans, for example, people generally seek rewards, avoid punishments and are rational beings. The theory thus posits that human relationships are formed by the use of a subjective cost-benefit analysis and the comparison of alternative. Cost here means the negative consequences of a decision such as time, money and energy, while rewards (such as sense of acceptance, support and companionship) are the positive results of social exchanges. The theory argues that people calculate the overall worth/value of a particular relationship by subtracting its costs from the rewards it provides.

This theory explains the engagement of employees in organisations. By using the tenets of social exchange theory, one can argue that obligations are generated through a series of interactions between parties who are in a state of reciprocal interdependence. When an individual receives economic and socio-emotional resources from his/her organisation, he/she is obliged to respond in kind and repay the organisation (Saks, 2006). This thus describes engagement as a two-way relationship between the employer and employee. One of the ways by which an individual could repay his/her organisation is through their level of engagement. The more engaged the employees are to their work, the greater amounts of cognitive, emotional, and physical resources they will devote to perform their job duties. However, when the organisation fails to provide economic/socio-emotional resources, the employees are more likely to withdraw and disengage themselves from their roles/job duties.
Methodology:

Study Area: Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State

This study was conducted in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State between December 2017 and January, 2018. The local government has an area of 2,461 km² (950 sq m) and a population of 260,312 at the 2006 census. Dekina Local Government Area was chosen for this study because it is the largest (in term of population and land mass) and has the highest number of Police Divisional Headquarters (altogether 5) in the state. These Police Divisional Headquarters are sited in Dekina, Anyigba, Egume, Abocho, and Ogene Enugwu, all within the local government area.

Research design, study population, sample size and sampling technique

This study used descriptive survey research design. The study population comprises of police personnel serving in rural area in Dekina Local Government Area. As regards selection of sample, the study utilizes multi-stage sampling design. The first stage involves the purposive selection of three police divisional headquarters (out of five) that have police outposts namely Dekina, Egume and Abocho divisions. The second stage involves selection of the entire police outposts in each of the three divisions. This was done using purposive sampling technique. The selected village police outposts are Iyale outpost, Oduh outpost, Ologba outpost, and Ajiyolo outpost (representing Dekina division); Acharu Egwume outpost, Okura Olaifa outpost, Elubi outpost, and Ojikpadala egume outpost (representing Egume division); and Emewe Opada outpost (the only outpost) representing Abocho division. The third stage involves selection of sample of the respondents. All the police personnel in all the chosen police posts were selected as sample using purposive sampling technique; and they all totalled one hundred and seventeen (117).

Research instrument

Data were collected using semi-structured questionnaire. The questionnaire was self constructed and divided into three sections. Section A consisted of questions on socio-demographic characteristics of the respondents. It aimed to get information from the respondents regarding their gender, age, marital status, educational level, years of working experience, and income. Section B measured respondents’ job satisfaction levels. There were seventeen (17) items in this section and respondents were instructed to rate the items using four point rating scales (where 1 means ‘highly dissatisfied’, 2 means ‘dissatisfied’, 3 means ‘satisfied’, and 4 means ‘highly satisfied’. Section C assessed respondent’s turnover intentions levels. There were three items in this section and respondents were asked to rate the items using four point rating scale (where 1 means ‘strongly disagree’, 2 means ‘disagree’, 3 means ‘agree’, and 4 means ‘strongly agree’).

To test the reliability of the instrument, 15 copies of the questionnaire were administered on 15 respondents in police formations different from the ones sampled and the resulting data were then subjected to cronbach alpha reliability analysis and yielded 0.79 reliability coefficient. In all, relevant social science research ethical principles were observed and complied with in the study.

Data Analysis
Data collected were processed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 22, and statistically analysed using frequencies, percentage, and weighted mean; while Pearson product correlation and Levene's independent t-test for equality of variance were used to test the study hypotheses.

**Results**

A total of one hundred and seventeen (117) copies of questionnaire were administered out of which one hundred and seven (107) representing 91.5 percent were suitable for analysis and the remaining ten (8.5 percent) were not properly filled and thus not used in the analysis. The analyses done in this study are in two parts. Part A focuses on the analysis of the respondents socio-demographic characteristics while part B centred on the analysis of the objectives of the study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Socio-demographic Characteristics of the respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Variables</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age (in year)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 20 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 - 29 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 - 39 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 - 49 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 years and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital status</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Educational level</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary/Technical school certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tertiary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Years of working experience</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 9 years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 shows the respondents’ socio demographic characteristics. From the table, majority (82.2 percent) of the respondents were male while the remaining 17.8 percent were female. A situation whereby there are more male than female indicate that male more than female are often recruited and posted to rural areas. This may however be due to the fact that work in rural area is very hectic as rural area in Nigeria is characterised by no/less social amenities necessary for better living and women may find it difficult to cope, hence the reason for their limited numbers in the study area.

The age of the respondents’ shows that more than half (57.0 percent) were between ages of 30-39 years, about 19.6 percent were between ages of 40-49 years, 16.8 percent were between ages 20-29 years, 5.6 percent were between ages of 50 years and over while only 0.9 percent were less than 20 years of age. From the table 1 above, there are more respondents between ages 30-39 years than those in other age categories. This result indicate s that most of the respondents were young and are in their productive age. It also means that the Nigerian police has younger workforce in the sampled area. Younger work force can be associated with high energy level which may be good for policing work.

As regards the marital status of the respondents, substantial (78.5 percent) numbers of them are still married, about 15.9 percent were single, while 1.9 percent were separated, divorced and widowed respectively. The high numbers of the married respondents may indicate that the police organisation prefers more matured and responsible adults as its personnel/officers.

The educational level of the respondents shows that a little more than half (54.2 percent) have secondary/technical school certificate, about 45.8 percent have tertiary education such as National Certificate of Education (NCE), Ordinary National Diploma (OND), Higher National Diploma (HND), and Bachelors degree certificate. This result indicates that the respondents are literate, and this has implication on their policing duties as it will not only make them to perform well but also to firmly take control of their policing work.

The working experience of the respondents shows that most (45.8 percent) of the respondents have between 5-9 years of working experience, about 19.6 percent have 20 years and above years of working
experience, 16.8 percent have between 10-14 years of working experience, 11.2 percent have between 15-19 years of working experience while 6.5 percent have less than 5 years of working experience. The high number of respondents with 5-9 years of working experience indicates that most of the respondents working in the study area have had enough job tenure/experience that can make their policing work end in success.

The income of the respondents shows that majority (62.6 percent) of them earned between N41,000-N60,000, 16.8 percent earned between N61,000-N80,000, 8.4 percent earned between N20,000-N40,000 while 6.5 percent earned above N100,000. From the table, those respondents who earned between N41,000-N60,000 per month are in the majority. However, by comparing the income of most of the respondents with that of the private sector workers, it revealed that the respondents are earning lower income. This however has implication as it may not guarantee job satisfaction and commitment.

Apart from the respondents socio-demographic variables described above, efforts were also made to analyse the objectives of the study and the results of the analyses were presented below:

Table 2 shows the respondents’ job satisfaction measures. From the table, it can be seen that the majority of the respondents were satisfied with their relationship with superior officers, colleagues/co-workers, the policing work, location of work duty, their achievement, recognition for work accomplished, hours worked each day, police organisation policy and promotion opportunity. On the other hand, most of the respondents were dissatisfied with variety of job responsibilities they were subjected to, the kind of support they were getting for further training and education, lack/insufficient opportunities to utilize their skills and talents, degree of independence associated with their work roles, salary, and work conditions.

From among the job satisfaction measures listed in table 2 above, relationship with superior officers was most satisfied with by the respondents with an overall mean of 3.09, while work conditions (availability of working equipments/tools) was highly dissatisfied with by the respondents with a mean value of 2.03.

In addition to the foregoing, efforts were made to ascertain respondents’ overall level of job satisfaction. Results of the enquiries show that most (43.9 percent) of them reported low level of job satisfaction, about 8.5 percent picked very low level of job satisfaction while 38.3 percent and 9.3 percent indicated high and very high level of job satisfaction respectively. However, by collapsing the respondents’ answers into two groups of (i) low and (ii) high levels of job satisfaction, respondents who reported low level of job satisfaction were more than those who reported high level of job satisfaction. Based on this, respondents in the sampled area were found to have low level of job satisfaction.

Further enquiries were made to identify the factors responsible for low level of job satisfactions among majority of the respondents. The results of the inquiry are presented in table 3 below:

Table 2: Job Satisfaction Measures
Table 3 shows the factors responsible for low level of job satisfactions among majority of the respondents. From the table, most of the respondents strongly agreed/agreed that factors such as poor work conditions, inadequate fringe benefits (health insurance, pension scheme, etc), work overload, salary, inflexible work hour, irregular promotion and poor career advancement opportunities as well as other personal reasons influencing their level of job satisfaction; while some other respondents strongly disagreed/disagreed with factors such as job insecurity, police organisation, and lack of training as having any significant influence on their level of job satisfaction. However, from among the reasons
### Table 3: Reasons for low level of job satisfaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Reasons</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Fx</th>
<th>( \bar{x} )</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Poor work conditions</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>311</td>
<td>2.91</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Inadequate fringe benefits (health insurance, pension scheme, organizational vehicles, etc)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>308</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Work overload</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>299</td>
<td>2.79</td>
<td>3rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Dissatisfaction with salary</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>297</td>
<td>2.78</td>
<td>4th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Inflexible work hour/shift</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>5th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Irregular promotion and poor career advancement opportunities</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>278</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>6th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Personal reasons</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>2.55</td>
<td>7th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Job insecurity</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>2.46</td>
<td>8th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Dissatisfaction with the police organization</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>2.36</td>
<td>9th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Insufficient training</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>10th</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Field Survey, 2018

Listed in Table 3 above, poor work conditions ranked first with an overall mean of 2.91 while insufficient training was the least with a mean value of 2.16

### Table 4: Turnover Intention Measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Fx</th>
<th>( \bar{x} )</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>I will probably look for a new job in the next one or two years</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>2.40</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>I often think about quitting my present job</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>2.32</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>As soon as possible I will leave policing work</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>2.20</td>
<td>3rd</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Field Survey, 2018

Efforts were also made to examine respondents’ turnover intention in the face of their low level of job satisfaction. The results of this inquiry are presented in Table 4.

Table 4 shows the respondents turnover intentions. From the table, it can be seen that the majority of the respondents agreed that they will probably look for a new job in the next one or two years, and were often thinking about quitting their present job; while some other respondents agreed that they will leave
policing work as soon as possible. Further enquiries were also made to ascertain respondents’ overall level of turnover intention. Results of the enquiry show that most (37.4 percent) picked very high level of turnover intentions, about 29.0 percent reported high level of turnover intentions while 28.0 percent and 5.6 percent indicated low and very low level of turnover intention respectively. In sum, by collapsing the respondent’s response into two groups of (i) low and (ii) high levels of turnover intentions, respondents who reported high turnover intentions are more than those who reported low turnover intention. Based on this, respondents in the sampled area were found to have high level of turnover intentions.

Respondents were however asked that if they were to leave the police organisation what factors will apply. Most (60.5 percent) of them stated poor compensation package including salary, about 15.7 percent indicated educational advancement, 10.2 percent highlighted unmet job expectations, 7.4 percent indicated inadequate career development opportunities while the remaining 6.2 percent stated inadequate training.

Efforts were also made to test statistically the three hypotheses formulated in the study and the results of the test were described below:

**Testing of Hypotheses:**

**Hypothesis 1**

Ho: There is no significant relationship between respondents’ level of job satisfaction and turnover intention

Hi: There is significant relationship between respondents’ level of job satisfaction and turnover intention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall level of Job satisfaction</th>
<th>Overall level of Job satisfaction</th>
<th>Overall Turnover Intention Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correlation Coefficient</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.558**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Turnover Intention Level</th>
<th>Correlation Coefficient</th>
<th>0.558**</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>107</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)

The result of the hypothesis is presented in Table 5.

From the table 5 above, the Pearson Product Correlation Coefficient (R) of 0.558 implies that there is an average positive but imperfect association between respondents’ levels of job satisfaction and
turnover intentions. This association is however significant at both 1% (0.01) and 5% (0.05) level of significance, with a Sig. (2-tailed) value of 0.000. In other words, there is a significant relationship between respondents' overall job satisfaction and overall turnover intention levels.

**Hypothesis 2**

H₀: There is no significant difference between male and female respondents' level of job satisfaction.

H₁: There is significant difference between male and female respondents' level of job satisfaction.

The result of the hypothesis is presented in Table 6 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>2.5455</td>
<td>0.815</td>
<td>0.628</td>
<td>3.052</td>
<td>0.084</td>
<td>NS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2.4211</td>
<td>0.607</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*NS = Not significant at p>0.05

From the table 6 above, since the Sig. value (p-value) of 0.084 is greater than the conventional 0.05 level of significance; we have no reason to reject the null hypothesis. Hence, we concluded that there is no significant difference between male and female respondents' level of job satisfaction.

**Hypothesis 3**

H₀: There is no significant difference between male and female respondents' level of turnover intention.

H₁: There is significant difference between male and female respondents' level of turnover intention.

The result of the hypothesis is presented in Table 7 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>2.9659</td>
<td>0.87689</td>
<td>1.736</td>
<td>0.316</td>
<td>0.575</td>
<td>NS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2.5789</td>
<td>0.90159</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*NS = Not significant at p>0.05

From Table 7 above, since the Sig. value (p-value) of 0.575 is greater than the conventional 0.05 level of significance; we have no reason to reject the null hypothesis. Hence, we concluded that there is no significant difference between male and female respondents' level of turnover intentions.

**Discussion of findings**

This study was conceived with the specific objectives of ascertaining the levels of job satisfaction and turnover intentions, the relationship between the levels of job satisfaction and turnover intention, and
the gender differences in the levels of job satisfaction and turnover intentions of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State. As regards the respondents’ level of job satisfaction, it was discovered in the study that majority of them have low level of job satisfaction. This means that most of the respondents were dissatisfied with their job. Some of the reasons given for this by the respondents included poor work conditions, inadequate fringe benefits, poor salary, work overload, inflexible work hours/shift, irregular promotion and career advancement. These show that job satisfaction requires a combination of many factors. Overall, respondents who reported poor work conditions are in majority while those who picked insufficient job specific training are the least.

Generally, poor work conditions influence considerably employees level of job satisfaction. For instance, good working conditions reduce employee turnover and induce a lower degree of job stress (Schmalenberg & Kramer, 2008). However, undesirable outcome on employee’s dedication may be created if they are dissatisfied with the working conditions and consequently, it may affect turnover decision (Rahman & Parveen, 2006). Other consequences of job dissatisfaction include tardiness, absenteeism, union-organising activity and filing of grievances (Hackeits & Gulon, 1985; Judge & Locke, 1993; Crow & Hartman, 1995; Judge & Church, 2000; and Ajibade, 2016). Thus, employee’s job satisfaction is very important for the well being of an organisation.

Other key factors discovered in the study were inadequate fringe benefits, work overload, work shift, and irregular promotion and career advancement. Each of the factors is explained as follows starting with inadequate fringe benefits. Inadequate fringe benefits coupled with poor salary has been found by Hermann, Whitman, Wyler, Anton & Vanderzwagg (1990) to be the major cause of emotional distress among employees, whereas adequate compensation/rewards enhance job satisfaction and commitment of an employee in any type of organisation (Nazir, Khan, Fida, Shah & Zaman, 2013). Work overload, on the other hand, has been found by Townley (2000) to be associated with tiredness, and loss of temper which sometime increase the risk of workplace accidents. All these have implications on workers’ long term health and social life.

Work shift is an employment practice designed to make use of, or provide service across all 24 hours of the clock each day of the week (Ajibade, 2016). Shift work may impact on marital, family and personal relationship. These may decrease employee performance and efficiency (Costa, 1996); while job insecurity, according to Walsh & Taylor (2007), could lead to movement to an alternative job when better opportunities are offered by other employers. Promotion and career advancement opportunities in an organisation, on the other hand, lead to employee retention. However, when the opportunity is lacking, workers experience job dissatisfaction which is costly to the organisation. Job specific training, on its own is meant to support employees in acquiring the skills and new knowledge needed for the effective performance of their duties. Regular training enhances job satisfaction and employee performance since it helps to equip employees with skills. However, in an organisation where such training is lacking or irregular, employees’ turnover intention is always high.
With regards to the respondents level of turnover intention, it was found that majority of them have high level of turnover intention. High level of turnover intention means that respondents are having high feeling/intention of leaving their job. This is however not surprising since majority of the respondents reported low level of job satisfaction. Reasons given by the respondents for their high turnover intentions included poor compensation package (including salary and fringe benefits), unmet job expectation, inadequate career development opportunity and training. These reasons as given by the respondents’, support that discovered by Aneil & Gretchen, 2002; and Amran, et al, 2013; as they were found to be having influences on turnover intention of employees in an organisation. By and large, high turnover has implications of making organisations to loose their skilled and experienced employees, decreasing performance and increasing cost of training and expatriation losses (Reichheld, 1993; Asmran, et al, 2013).

On the hypothesized relationship between respondent’s levels of job satisfaction and turnover intentions, it was discovered that there is a significant relationship between respondent’s levels of job satisfaction and turnover intention. This finding is consistent with that of Rasch & Hanell (1990); Hom & Griffeth (1996); Lee, Gerhart, Weller & Trevor, 2008; Anthony & Stella (2012); Adeboye & Adegorye (2012); and Santrip & Ambatika (2012). These scholars in their separate studies found job satisfaction exerting significant influence on employee turnover intention. Likewise, on the difference between male and female level of job satisfaction, it was discovered that there is no significant difference between male and female respondents level of job satisfaction. This finding supports that of Truong (2014) indicating that a job satisfaction level of female employees’ group is not different from a job satisfaction level of the male employees group.

Further, on the difference between male and female level of turnover intention, the study found that there is no significant difference between male and female respondents’ level of turnover intention. This finding however contradicts that of Cotton & Tuttel (1986); Hom, Roberson & Ellis (2008); and Nel, VanDyk, Haasbrock, Schultz, Sono & Werner (2011). These scholars in their various studies found the turnover rate for females to be higher than that of male. Female high turnover was however attributed to factors such as family and child care responsibilities and a lack of career advancement/promotional opportunities.

Conclusion, Implications of the findings and Recommendations
This study examined the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intentions of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State, using descriptive survey research design with quantitative approach. The study population comprised of police personnel serving in rural communities in the study area, and purposive sampling technique was used to select three divisional police headquarters, nine police posts and one hundred and seventeen respondents. Data were collected using semi-structured questionnaire and the data collected were processed using Statistical...
Package for Social Sciences version 22, and statistically analysed using frequencies, percentage and weighted mean while Pearson product correlation and Levene’s independent t-test for equality of variance were used to test the study hypotheses. The results of the study show that respondents in the sampled area had low level of job satisfaction and high turnover intentions and these were however influenced by combination of factors such as poor compensation package (including salary and fringe benefits) work overload, irregular promotion and career advancement as well as unmet job satisfaction.

These findings imply that police organisation has not properly delivered factors of job satisfaction to its personnel especially those serving in the rural areas. Therefore, police organisation should give serious attention to ensuring that factors of job satisfaction are properly delivered to their personnel. This may be done through adoption of standard pay structure, suitable work schedule, regular promotion and job specific training as well as efficient supervision. This will not only serve as strategies for reducing employee’s job dissatisfaction and turnover intentions but also as the organisation employee retention strategy.

Limitation and Suggestion for Further Study
This study examined the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intentions of police officers in rural communities in Dekina Local Government Area of Kogi State. This however limits the generalisation of findings to other climate other than where it was carried out. Despite this, however, the study has both theoretical and practical significance. Theoretically, it has provided not only framework about levels of job satisfaction and turnover intentions but also revealed factors contributing to the development of positive/negative work attitudes among police personnel most especially in rural communities. Practically, the study has helped to provide guidelines for police management on ways of reducing job dissatisfaction and turnover intentions among its personnel.

As regards suggestion for further study, any researcher who is interested in replicating the findings of this study should do so in police formations different from the one used in this study and in other climates in order to know what is happening elsewhere.

References


Thibaut, N & Kelley, H (1959). The social psychology of groups, New York: Wiley

Townley, G (2000). Long hours culture causing economy to suffer, Management Accounting, 78 (6), 3-5


Evaluating the Impact of Organisational Culture on the Entrepreneurial Orientation of Small and Medium Enterprises in South Africa

Obey Dzomonda¹ and Olawale Fatoki²

ABSTRACT: SMEs play a pivotal role in the economic growth and development of nations, especially developing countries confronted with a plethora of socio-economic challenges. However, it remains indistinct on whether SMEs are a sustainable panacea to such challenges given their failure rate. On that backdrop, it becomes crucial to identify factors which can improve SMEs’ performance in South Africa. This paper aimed at investigating the impact of organisational culture on the entrepreneurial orientation of SMEs in South Africa. A quantitative research method was used and 103 SMEs participated in the survey. The random sampling technique was used. Self-administered questionnaires were utilised to collect data in a survey. A sample of 89 SME owner/managers participated in the survey. Data analysis included descriptive statistics, Pearson’s correlation and regression analysis. The Cronbach’s alpha was used to measure reliability. The results indicated that SMEs display average levels of EO and average levels of organisational culture. Furthermore, the results showed a significant positive relationship between organisational culture and (EO) of SMEs. SME owner/managers are encouraged to align organisational culture and EO to maximise the gains.

Keywords: entrepreneurial orientation, organisational culture, SMEs, South Africa

Introduction

Dada (2014) indicates that there is no universally acceptable definition for SMEs. According to Mahembe (2011), one of the reasons why it is difficult to define a SME is the fact that each and every country has its own definition. SMEs are defined differently in different nations (Etuk, Etuk & Baghebo, 2014). SMEs can be defined based on qualitative and quantitative definitions (Gibson &Van der Vaart, 2008; Mahembe, 2011; Wiese, 2014). According to the National Small Business Act of South Africa 1996 as amended in 2003, a small business as “a separate and distinct entity including cooperative enterprises and non-governmental organisations managed by one owner or more, including its

¹ Department of Business Management, Turflop Campus, University of Limpopo, Limpopo Province, South Africa. Email: obeydzoms@gmail.com
² Department of Business Management, Turflop Campus, University of Limpopo, Limpopo Province, South Africa. Email: olawale.fatoki@ul.ac.za
branches or subsidiaries if any is predominantly carried out in any sector or sub-sector of the economy mentioned in the schedule of size standards, and can be classified as an SME by satisfying the criteria mentioned in the schedule of size standards“ (Government Gazette of the Republic of South Africa, 2003).

“Growing the number of SMEs in the economy, and growing the size of existing SMEs, are both vital objectives for South Africa’s future prosperity” (SBP, 2013:8). A strategy towards promoting SMEs is a remarkable milestone towards achieving South Africa’s developmental needs such as sustainable employment, reducing poverty as well as income inequality. SMEs are credited for sustaining most economies in Africa (Ene & Ene, 2014). It is the innovative ability of SMEs which has resulted in the rapid expansion of economies of countries such as, India, Malaysia, Indonesia, Taiwan and Hong Kong (Odukwu, 2006). Approximately SMEs constitute 91% of businesses in South Africa. Chinomona and Pooe (2013) note that the SME sector contributes above 50% towards GDP in South Africa and a job creation capacity of 61%. Furthermore, the SMEs sector is considered to be a great productive source in the job creation process because it is labour intensive unlike capital intensive large organisations (Ali, Rashid & Khan, 2014; Agwu & Emeti, 2014). Kambwale, Chisoro and Karodia (2015) remark that small businesses’ activities have income distribution ability as most of their businesses employ the lowly skilled people hence boosting their purchasing power. Jain and Chen (2013) add that SMEs have a multiplier effect on employment creation as each SME can increase its branches and hence its workforce overtime.

Despite the active role SMEs play, they seriously experience a slow growth rate and premature death. Similarly, Ngek and Smit (2013) note that regardless of the overwhelming support for SMEs towards job creation, it is only a few high quality SMEs that critically play this role. Most small businesses, especially in Africa, do not have growth prospects to become large firms. According to World Bank (2015), small businesses third income countries exhibit lower growth rate compared to their first world country small businesses. Fatoki and Garwe (2010) reinforce the argument by indicating that South African SMEs face high business discontinuance. SMEs in South Africa continue to fail regardless of the substantive support from government and private initiatives (Cant & Wiid, 2013). Ramukumba (2014) remarks that in South Africa SMEs are failing to surpass the projected growth target for required job creation due to a plethora of challenges. Oni and Fatoki (2012) warns that this high rate of premature death among SMEs creates uncertainty among policy makers on whether if this sector is the solution to a plethora of challenges haunting South Africa. The major idea behind this chapter is that established SMEs must be sustained.

According to Awang et al. (2010), a significant number of SMEs fail because of the inability to have an EO strategy in their organisations. According to Fatoki (2012), SMEs need to adopt entrepreneurial orientation in order to attain organisational growth. Many factors can impact on the entrepreneurial orientation of SMEs. Brettel, Chomik and Flatten (2014) identify organisational structure, leadership styles and organisational culture as some of the key drivers of entrepreneurial orientation. Shihab, Wismiarsi and Sine (2011) indicate that there is a link between organisational culture and EO of SMEs. Abdullah, Shamsuddin, Wahab and Hamid (2014) note that it is internal factors like organisational
culture that has a strong influence on the EO of SMEs. Many studies about the organisational culture and EO relationship have been conducted outside South Africa. It is the scope of this paper to investigate the relationship under discussion from a South African perspective.

**Objectives:** The objectives of the study were: (1) to identify the entrepreneurial orientation (EO) of SMEs (2) to explore the organisational culture of SMEs, (3) to determine the nexus between organisational culture and the entrepreneurial orientation of SMEs.

**Hypotheses**

\(H_0:\) There is no significant relationship between organisational culture and the entrepreneurial orientation of SMEs

\(H_2:\) There is a significant relationship between organisational culture and the entrepreneurial orientation of SMEs

**Literature review**

This study derives its theoretical support from the entrepreneurial orientation theory and the organisational culture theory.

**Theory of Entrepreneurial Orientation**

The EO theory has gained popularity in the entrepreneurship field. Studies about EO has proliferated just after the inception of the concept by Mintzberg (1973). These studies include Khandwalla (1976/ 1977), Miller (1983); Covin and Slevin (1989), Miller and Friesen (1982) as well as Lumpkin and Dess (1996). All these studies concur on the importance of EO to firms which desire to attain rapid growth in sales and staying ahead of competitors. Miller (1983) argue that EO can better understood through three behaviours such as innovativeness, proactiveness and risk taking. He argues that these three factors distinguish an entrepreneurial mindset from the rest. However, Lumpkin and Dess (1996) believe that the EO scale can be detailed if competitive aggressiveness and autonomy are added to the existing scale. This study focuses on the three EO factors propounded by Miller (1983).

**Innovativeness**

The concept of innovation can be traced to the work of Schumpeter (1934). Schumpeter (1942) argues that the process of creative destruction yield innovation. Schumpeter (1983) identified innovation as the most critical element of EO. Hence, from this idea, innovation is the critical component of entrepreneurial orientation. It marks the basis from which firms can improve existing product lines which enables them to tap into new markets. For SMEs to be innovative, they should foster an atmosphere that promotes creativity among employees. According to Shahraki and Bahraini (2013), to be innovative firms need to adapt and adopt new technologies rather than focusing on old methods.
Proactiveness

Proactiveness entails that a firm should always be ahead of competitors instead of reacting to their actions. Lumpkin and Dess (1996) seminal paper point out that proactiveness enables a firm to enjoy first mover advantages such as higher profit margins and brand establishment ahead of competitors. Lumpkin and Dess (1996) further explain that firms that are proactive are able to manipulate the environment thereby creating demand for their products. Lumpkin and Dess (1996) indicate that proactiveness is likely to co-vary with innovativeness since both of them emphasise creativity and new product introductions.

Risk taking

Risk taking has various meanings depending on the context it is used (Lumpkin & Dess, 1996). Covin and Slevin (1989) elucidate that the willingness of entrepreneurs and managers to take risks in order to favour change and innovation determines the extent to which a firm demonstrate entrepreneurial orientation. Risk taking is the propensity to venture into the unknown with an expectation to make profit. The concept of risk taking is based on the concept that tapping into highly risky ventures is associated with high returns (Roux & Couppey, 2007). Nevertheless, risk taking should not be confused with gambling in the context of entrepreneurial orientation (Murimbika, 2012). Hence, firms should take calculated risk, which is based on the probability of failure and success before they can commit resource.

The EO theory sets a solid ground to understand how SMEs can benefit by promoting the entrepreneurial behaviour in their organisations. Literature indicates that those firms, which adopt EO stay ahead of those without EO in terms of sales growth and innovations. However, EO is influenced by a variety of factors. A firm planning to adopt EO should check for such factors to yield high gains from EO. Musa, Ghani and Ahmad (2011), identify organisational size, organisational structure and leadership style as crucial factors which can influence EO. The authors of this study believes that organisational culture greatly affect the EO of SMEs.

Organisational culture theory

According to Tharp (2009) the origins of studies about organisational culture dates back to the 1930s. Worse still, the term organisational culture defies a uniform definition in the existing literature (Hatch & Zilber, 2012; Puri & Bharti, 2015). Zaheer, Rehman and Ahmad (2006) concur by pointing out that a single definition for organisational culture proves to be elusive in the extant literature. Different However, Schein (1992) defined organisational culture as “a pattern of shared basic assumptions that the group learned as it solved its problems of external adaptation and internal integration, that has worked well enough to be considered valid and, therefore, to be taught to new members as the correct way you perceive, think, and feel in relation to those problems.” Other studies on organisational culture such as Tharp (2009) concur with Schein’s definition. In most cases organisational culture will become the personality of the entire organisation as it defines what the organisation does and what it does not do. This serves as a template which dictates the recruitment policy, marketing strategies and the type of
business deemed acceptable by the organisation. Similarly, Abdullah et al. (2014) express that organisational culture can be used as a referent point for desired worker behaviour.

Schein (1992) viewed organisational culture as comprising three domains: basic underlying assumptions, espoused values and artefacts. However, studies such as Cameron and Quinn (1999) describe organisational culture based on the four competing values model. According to Ubius and Alas (2009), the dominant organisational cultures are hierarchy, clan, market and adhocracy organisational culture. The framework propounded by Quinn and Rohrbaugh (1983) as cited in Ubius and Alas (2009) helps to explain the four different organisational types exhibited by organisations. According to Cameron and Quinn (1999), the framework tries to clarify whether an organisation is internally or externally orientated or alternatively if it values autonomy versus bureaucracy.

![The Competing Values Framework](source: Adopted from Ubius and Alas 2009)

According to Ubius and Alas (2009), the y-axis vertical axis indicates the organisation’s flexibility or central control in dealing with issues. The x-axis represents organisations that value control and follow hierarchical organisational culture which emphasises documented procedures and processes. On the other continuum are organisations which are flexible (clan culture) with less rules and regulations. The adhocracy and market culture types focuses on the external part of the organisation while the clan and hierarchy types focuses on the internal effectiveness of the organisation (Ghannay & Mamlouk, 2015).
Hierarchical organisational culture

According to Ubius and Alas (2009), this form of organisational culture is characterised by a formalised and structured place of work. Nelson (2015) remarks that routine work, chain of command, defined responsibilities, centralisation, rules and policies characterise the hierarchical organisational structure. The long-term concerns of the organisation are stability, predictability and efficiency. Ghannay and Mamlouk (2015) suggest that this type of organisational culture exhibit high levels of bureaucracy. Cameron and Quinn (2006) concur by indicating that hierarchical organisational culture stems from Weber’s classical attributes of bureaucracy: rules, specialization, meritocracy, hierarchy, separate ownership, impersonality, and accountability. Tharp (2009) gives McDonald’s as one of the organisations which uses hierarchical organisational culture. Nelson (2015) notes that hierarchical organisational culture can reduce an organisation’s competitiveness due to lack of flexibility and creativeness.

The clan culture

Ubius and Alas (2009) indicate that clan culture is characterised by teamwork, employee involvement programs and corporate commitment to employee. According to Cameron and Quinn (2006), in the clan organisational culture people are rewarded for completing a task as a team. Furthermore, Cameron and Quinn (2006) elucidate that the clan culture holds the assumption that the environment can best be managed by treating customers as partners and inciting loyalty in employees through teamwork and employee development programmes. Top management in the clan organisational culture acts as mentors to their employees.

The market culture

“The market culture is focused on transactions with external constituencies such as suppliers, customers, contractors, licensees, unions, regulators and so forth. The core values are competitiveness and productivity” (Ubius & Alas, 2009:92). According to Beytekdn, Yalçinkaya, Doğan and Karakoç (2010), the market culture primarily focuses on positioning the organisation on the external environment by actively using monetary exchanges to support the initiatives. Furthermore, the market culture emphasises goal attainment. The management clearly sets the goals in quantitative economic terms and effectively communicate it to employees. Beytekdn et al. (2010) remark that market culture driven organisations aim to be market leaders all the time.

Adhocracy culture

According to Ubius and Alas (2009), a major goal of an adhocracy is to foster adaptability; flexibility and creativity where uncertainty, ambiguity and/or information overload are typical. This type of organisational culture is highly entrepreneurial in that it encourages risk taking, openness to new ideas, innovation and experimentation (Ghannay & Mamlouk, 2015). According to Beytekdn et al. (2010), in adhocracy cultures the leaders are risk takers and innovative and as a result they earn respect and trust from their subordinates. On that note, both the organisation and employees emphasise on being
active problem solvers as well as being innovative in their area of expertise. Beytekdn et al. (2010) point out that innovation brings the entire organisation together in an adhocracy culture. In adhocracy culture, success is determined by the random inception of new ideas, products and services and unique technologies (Beytekdn et al., 2010).

The four competing variables suggested by the theory set the platform to understand how a SME can respond to both internal and external environments. Furthermore, the theory helps to uncover the appropriate and flexible organisational cultures such as clan, market and adhocracy which are favourable for entrepreneurial orientation development within SMEs. Tharp (2009) argue that an organisational culture can be used as a source of competitive advantage. He went further to say that, organisations should align these four competing variables to their goals if they wish to excel in the market. The competing values model is relevant for this study because it has been used in similar studies showing high levels of reliability (Brettel, et al., 2014).

Organisational culture and entrepreneurial orientation

The link between organisational culture and EO has been widely researched in line with large organisations than in SMEs (Shihab et al., 2011). Zaheer et al. (2006) argue that small firm culture is more informal, although not necessarily more relaxed. An organisational culture that is innovative enables the business to enter into profitable ventures and opportunities in an effective manner. According to Adelekan (2016:165), “in order to build innovative culture certain requirements must be met, involving six kinds of attitudes: the ability of managers to take risks, encouraging creativity, participation of all employees in building innovation-oriented culture, responsibility of both managers and employees for their actions, allowing employees to develop their interests and use their unique talents, developing the company’s mission, which the employees will identify with; providing employees with a sense that their work is meaningful and has a positive impact on the achievement of objectives.” Maher (2014) add that an organisational culture which supplies enough resources to employees and rewards new ideas tend to promote EO. Puri and Bharti (2015) remark that organisational culture can act as a guideline that can be used to align employee behaviour towards achieving innovation and flexibility organisational goals. Organisational culture influences the creativity and innovativeness of employees. Shihab et al. (2011) point out that organisational culture is a determinant of EO in that it inspires employees to surpass their expectations and to come up with creative and innovative ways to improve customer satisfaction as well as overall organisational competitiveness. According to Adelekan (2016), firms which wish to incorporate EO in their businesses ought to adapt, change and align their adhocracy organisational culture to the prevailing business environment. Engelen et al. (2015) found out that an adhocracy organisational culture effectively supports EO whereas hierarchical organisational culture inhibits EO. Similarly, Naranjo-Valencia, Jiménez-Jiménez and Sanz-Valle (2016) note that flexible externally oriented organizational cultures favours EO while stability oriented ones hinder the implementation of EO. An organisational culture which supports innovation has given Apple company a cutting edge to survive in the competition infested industry (Tharp, 2009). A study by Khalid, Pahi and
Abdullah (2016) indicate that more supportive cultures yield high levels of EO. Brettel et al. (2014) argue that externally orientated organisational cultures play a crucial role towards fostering EO within organisations. Chadwick et al. (2015) found a significant positive relationship between EO and three organisational culture dimensions: clan, market and adhocracy. Naranjo-Valencia et al. (2016) results show a significant positive relationship between adhocracy organizational culture and innovation. Empirical studies like, (Shihab et al., 2011; Chadwick, et al., 2015) report a significant relationship between organisational culture and EO. Organisational culture is a determinant of EO in that it inspires employees to surpass their expectations and to come up with creative and innovative ways to improve customer satisfaction as well as overall organisational performance. Therefore, it is hypothesised that there is a significant positive relationship between organisational culture and entrepreneurial orientation.

Methodology

This paper utilised a quantitative research methodology. The respondents were randomly selected to give each SME a chance to be selected. Self-administered questionnaires were utilised in a survey to collect data from the respondents following similar studies (Arham, et al., 2013; Arham, 2014). According to Monette et al. (2011:164), “a questionnaire is a set of questions recorded to collect data in a survey where participants fill in the questions in the absence of the researcher.” Closed ended questions were used where respondents were limited to respond to a set of answers provided in the questionnaire. The questionnaire for the study consisted of three sections; (1) Biographical questions (2) Entrepreneurial orientation (3) Organisational culture. The questionnaire was adapted from existing literature. This questionnaire was used following similar studies on EO (Fatoki, 2012; Soininen, 2013; Mahmood, & Hanafi, 2013) where the tool showed high levels of reliability and validity. The questionnaire to measure EO was adapted from Miller (1983) and consisted of 9 items which measure innovativeness, risk taking and proactiveness. On the other hand, the questionnaire to measure organisational culture was adapted from Ubius and Alas (2009) and consisted of 20 items which measure different factors such hierarchical, clan, adhocracy and market organisational culture. Licket scale questions ranging from: strongly disagree to strongly agree were utilised in the study to obtain data. Data analysis included descriptive statistics, regression analysis and Pearson correlation coefficient. Reliability was measured using the Cronbach’s alpha.

Research results and discussion

Response rate

Table 1 below reflects the response rate of the study. Two hundred questionnaires were distributed to SMEs in Polokwane Municipality and eighty-nine questionnaires were returned. The response rate was forty-five percent. Generally, the low response rate among SMEs is well documented.
Table 1: The Response Rate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>No. of questionnaires sent</th>
<th>No. Returned</th>
<th>Response rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SME owners/managers</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Descriptive statistics**

**Entrepreneurial orientation**

Table 2: Descriptive Statistics of Entrepreneurial Orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measures</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My business has introduced a number of new lines of products and services recently.</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>1.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My business is generally inclined towards new product and development.</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>0.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We have experienced dynamic changes in our products and services in recent times.</td>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My business aims to always be the first to introduce new products or services in the market.</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>0.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My business always take a proactive stance when dealing competitors.</td>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>0.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Due to the dynamic nature of the business environment, our business take a bold stance in order to meet our goals.</td>
<td>2.87</td>
<td>0.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My business tend to be aggressive in order take advantage of opportunities.</td>
<td>2.37</td>
<td>0.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My business has a huge appetite for high risk/high return projects.</td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td>0.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total entrepreneurial orientation</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>0.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cronbach’s alpha</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Biographical information

The results indicated that most of the respondents were males (63%) compared to only (37%) females, falling in the 31-40 age group. This is consistent with studies such as (Tsele, 2015; Masocha & Dzomonda, 2016). Civelek, Rahman and Kozubikova (2016) further explain this gap by asserting that males are more risk taking and innovative than females hence they end up owning more entrepreneurial businesses. From the findings it was discovered that the majority (38%) of the respondents of the study have matric qualification. The results indicate that the majority of SMEs (34%) in the study are sole proprietors with majority of them in the retail sector. It was discovered that majority of SMEs employ 1-5 people which indicate that SMEs’ contribution to employment creation in South Africa is weak due to the fact that most of them do not grow (FinMark Trust, 2015). Worryingly the results showed that most of the SMEs (41%) have been in operation for between 1 and five years.

Table 2 indicates the results of the entrepreneurial orientation of owners/managers of SMEs in Polokwane municipality. The results indicated that the owners/managers display average levels of entrepreneurial orientation as indicated by a mean of 3.05 (SD 0.62). Considering the single factors for EO, the results indicate innovativeness as the highest, followed by proactiveness and risk taking respectively. The highest score on innovativeness indicates that SMEs invest much in innovation than on the other two areas. The results of the study are consistent with the findings of similar empirical studies such as (Fatoki, 2012; Arham, 2014).

Factor analysis results for organisational culture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisational Culture Measures</th>
<th>Factor 1</th>
<th>Factor 2</th>
<th>Factor 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Market</td>
<td>Adhocracy</td>
<td>Clan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. In our organisation customer interests are never ignored in decision making.</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. During conflict everybody tries to solve it quickly and mutually profitable.</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. It is very important to feel market changes and react contemporarily.</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Workers of any division have equal perspectives.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. In our organisation information is readily available to everyone.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. In our organisation new ideas are applied immediately before they are obsolete.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
10. Agreement is easily achieved even concerning hard problems in the organisation. 0.81

12. In our organisation it is not allowed to talk about people behind their back. 0.60

13. In a group everyone should put maximum effort to achieve a common goal. 0.58

| Eigen value | 4.26 | 3.21 | 2.13 |
| Percentage of variance explained (53.82%) | 29.43 | 27.35 | 23.44 |
| Cronbach’s alpha | 0.76 | 0.78 | 0.77 |

Source: Principal components factor analysis with varimax rotation. Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO) test of sampling adequacy = 0.79; Barlett Test of Sphericity (BTS) = 469.001, p=0.001

Table 3 above present the factor analysis results for organisational culture. As shown above three factors with Eigen values greater than one were identified. These are Factor 1 Market culture, Factor 2 Adhocracy culture and Factor 3 Clan culture. Questions 1-5 which measure hierarchy culture were dropped, as their factor loadings were very low.

**Hypothesis Testing**

Correlation results

Table 4: Correlation Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>EO</th>
<th>Organisational culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EO Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.751*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td></td>
<td>.010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisational culture Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.751*</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.010</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Relationship between organisational culture and entrepreneurial orientation

The correlation between EO and organisational culture is (r=0.751, p=0.010). The results indicate that there is a significant positive relationship between EO of SMEs and organisational culture. This supports
the alternative hypothesis ($H_2$) that there is a significant positive relationship between organisational culture and EO of SMEs. The results are consistent with similar studies such as (Shihab et al., 2011:93; Chadwick, et al., 2015).

**Regression analysis results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent variables</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organisational culture</td>
<td>0.185</td>
<td>51.489</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data Analysis. Dependent variable, Entrepreneurial orientation. Sig.>0.05

**Relationship between organisational culture and entrepreneurial orientation**

The regression analysis results between organisational culture and EO are ($B=0.185$, $sig=0.001$). The results support the hypothesis that there is a significant positive relationship between organisational culture and the entrepreneurial orientation of SMEs. The results led to a conclusion to reject the null hypothesis ($H_0$) and accept the alternative hypothesis ($H_2$). The results are consistent with studies such as (Shihab et al., 2011; Chadwick, et al., 2015).

**Conclusion**

The argument of this study was that entrepreneurial orientation is a possible antidote to a plethora of challenges causing SMEs in South Africa to fail. Therefore, it was of significance to understand the factors that improve the entrepreneurial orientation of SMEs in South Africa. The results indicated that the owners/managers display average levels of entrepreneurial orientation. In addition, the results showed that SMEs display average levels of organisational culture. Furthermore, the study also revealed that SMEs use flexible organisational cultures with an external focus. From hypothesis testing, the null hypothesis was rejected. The final decision was to accept the alternative hypothesis. It was concluded that organisational culture is significantly linked to EO of SMEs. This calls for a strong need to improve on organisational culture factors as they are good predictors of EO in firms. Furthermore, recommendations to policy makers and SMEs owners/managers on the different measures they can embark on to improve EO were suggested.

**References**


Investigating the Effects of Parental Divorce on Academic Performances of Young People

Chauke Thulani Andrew¹ and Obadire Olusegun Segun²

Abstract: This study explores the effect of parental divorce on academic performance of youth and provides detailed analysis of the finding. The study was conducted in Madonsi Village, Limpopo Province, South Africa. The sampling procedure used was non-probability coupled with purposive sampling. The study shows lack of communication, infidelity, abuse, snoring, sexually incompatibility as reasons for divorce. It shows that divorce makes it hard for youth to focus on their school work due to lack of home support. The study recommends that youth work in South Africa should be professionalised to ensure that youth workers are recognised and they obtain license for professional counselling. This will enable them to provide necessary professional support for young people who come from marital divorced families. It was recommended that policies formulation that addresses the plight of young people from broken homes having financial hardships should be enacted.

Keywords: Academic Performances, Young People, Gender, Marriage, Divorce

Introduction
The escalation and the negative effect of parental divorce in Madonsi village and other places in South Africa are causing serious concern for many. Hence the researcher ventured into a qualitative approach to investigate the effects of divorce on academic performance among youth. Divorce is a painful and traumatic experience for all those who are involved and it can cause disruption of family life (Giddens & Phillip 2013: 382). Marriage is the foundational institution in which divorce protrudes. Therefore, it is crucial to analyse its composition. There are several factors which could lead to a divorce in marriage. According to Preller (2013: 03) sexually incompatibility is one of the factors that contribute to divorce. This may occur when a couple has been in a relationship for a long period of time and suddenly one partner developed cold feet sexually. Ill-health may also play a part by causing lack of interest in sexual relationships in marriage. In this way, it may lead a partner who is not sick to seek for sexual pleasure outside the marriage or deciding to leave the marriage since there is no more sexual excitement in it. Other reasons include infidelity, lack of trust, violence and emotional or physical abuse of substances or alcohol may be contributing factors.

¹ Institute for Gender and Youth Studies, University of Venda, South Africa. Email: Chauke.thuli@gmail.com
² International Relations, University of Venda, South Africa
Families may be unable to nurture and protect their children from social stigma due to parental divorce. Young people whose parents are divorced might be overwhelmed by anxiety and stress as they decide which parents they are going to live with. This decision may have consequential effects on their performance at school (Heaton 2010: 107). Divorce rates in South Africa have climbed astoundingly since the enactment of Act 70 of 1979. The consequences of this change in a family structure have had a negative academic and educational impact on thousands of young people between age 14 and 24 years from parental divorce (Bryan, DeVault& Cohen 2008: 494). The quality and stability of family relationships directly influence a young person’s behaviour, social competence and academic achievement. Therefore, parental divorce could be one of the contributing factors to the decline in young person’s academic performance. Every year from 2000-2011 between 20,000 and 39,000 young South African between ages 14 and 24 years experienced their parents’ marriage divorce (Statistics South Africa , 2012).

Statement of the Research Problem

Divorce tend to negatively affected parental involvement in their children’s school work, which leads to young people who come from parental divorce feeling unwanted and not loved by one of their parents. This usually leads young people expressing anxiety and anger at the same time. A boy child might begin to blame his father for divorcing his mother, which may lead to a relationship breakdown between father and son. Young people may feel they are not protected by both parents, therefore, lead them to find a place where they can feel protected such as staying in a foster care. Some eventually commit crime and drop of school because of lack of guidance.

Objectives

The aim of this paper was to investigate the effect of parental divorce on the academic performances of youth. This study seeks to raise awareness among Madonsi Village community on the effects of divorce on young people’s academic performance. This aim was achieved by looking at the following specific objectives:

- To explore the effects of academic performance of the youth
- To identify the strategies to address the effects of divorce on academic performance of youth at Madonsi Village

Research Questions

The researcher sought answers to the following research questions in the study:

- How does divorce affect the academic performances of the youth?
- What the strategies are for address the effects of marriage dissolution on academic performances among youth?
Literature

According to Madzhadzhi (2005: 53) young people from parental divorce tend to be reluctant to participate class. Young people from dissolved families also do not have the confidence to participate in class, compared to young people from unbroken families. Most of these young people do such because of low self-esteem and depression that might be taking place in their lives as a result of marital dissolution of their parents. Lack of participation in class will lead them not to engage in robust debates and presentations which may contribute to their school marks. These often lead to failure.

Madzhadzi (2005) prenatal divorce leads to a situation whereby youth from broken families change from one school to another. I fully support the statement which demonstrates how the academic performance of young people can be affected because of marital dissolution. After marital dissolution young people are likely to change schools. For instance, if it happens that both parents were staying at town, after the dissolution of the marriage, the husband may lose custody of children but not that of the house. In such instance the woman has no choice but to look for another place to live to another place. If it happens that the relocation is takes them to another province, these young people may have to change schools, have to learn new languages, usually find it difficult to adjust and their academic performance is likely to decline.

According to Morgan (1999: 262) young people who come from a broken family tend to show lack of social maturity. I agree with Morgan’s argument. However not every young person from a non-intact family displays lack of social maturity. They often show traits such as bullying because they always look for someone to take their frustrations on. Displaying lack of social maturity in the case of bullying other students tends to have an effect on their academic performances, especially if they would be reported and then suspended by the school authorities.

Mhlongo (2003:15) emphasizes that the academic performance of young people from parental divorce becomes affected, for instance a young person is a minor they often worry too much about whom they are going to stay with, whether they will be placed or taken away to a child and youth care centre or not. The result of this tends to have a huge impact cognitively which results in a situation where they start getting lower marks. Some scholars who have previously done research on marriage dissolution have shown that children from intact families often perform better than those children from non-intact family. I disagree with these scholars who demonstrated the above point; some children from non-intact family perform much better than children from intact family.

Theoretical Framework

A combination of theories, namely conflict theory, social exchange theory and lastly equity theory were used in this paper to provide theoretical explanation of parental divorce. The social exchange theory demonstrated that whoever decides to embark on marriage enters for exchange of certain benefits which a marriage can offer (Cox, 2006). Individual expectations differ from one person to another which might range from love, companionships, security, and procreation and so on. For example, wife may
enter marriage to love her husband with all of her heart. She may expect to be loved back by her husband or she want to gain the status of being called Mrs (title used for a married woman). It may also be for material possession in order to inherit the wealth of her husband when he died. When husband begins to physically or emotional abuse his wife, she may feel insecure or regard that marriage as unequal. She may not see herself as being equal partner in a marriage since the equity theory hold that indeed people enter into marriage for a sense of benefit that a marriage can bring. In addition, she may want to be equal within the marriage, such that no one might be above someone because of gender or status. An individual in marriage does not want to be treated as subordinates they want to be equal in every decision that needs to be taken within the marriage. Sharing of resources and love must be equal for and from both spouses. Failure to ensure that there is equity in exchange of resources in a relationship will lead to conflict. The conflict theory holds that tensions occur in a relationship when there is misunderstanding or abuse of power (Cox, 2006).

Material and Methods

The study was qualitative in nature and the sampling method was purposive, a sub-type of non-probability sampling. The goal is to provide findings that could be generalised for a category of South African youth. The participants were 12 young people between the age 14 and 24 years who come from marital divorced families using purposive sampling technique. There were five (5) males and seven (7) females, majority of the respondents were in secondary school and above while only one (1) was in primary school. Some participants completed the questionnaires in their home language which is Xitsonga and others in English. The researcher used open-ended questions as form of self-administered questions to ensure the respondents have the chance to provide answers in more details. The questionnaires were distributed in September 2015 to the selected respondents from Madosi village. The questionnaire booklet was handed out by the researcher in the presence of the guardian of all these young people especially those under the age of 18. The participants were informed about the purpose of the study. The researcher assured these youth about their safety during the course of the study. They were also briefed about their answers being treated anonymously. The researcher mentioned to the participants in the study about voluntary, privacy and confidentiality of their participation which will be fully respected.

The data was analysed through discourse analysis which focused on written and spoken words using Atlas.ti version 7.5.10 for qualitative data analysis.

Results

The effect of divorce on academic performance among youth

The negative effects of divorce on academic performance of young school children came out strongly in the findings as shown below. Figure 1 shows responses on how lack of both parental nurturing and supervision affects academic performance of young people. Lack of parental role, financial issues, family problems, lack of pastoral support, lack of emotional support are all contributing factors to poor academic performance. A respondent confirmed that lack of both parental supervision resulted in a
situation where there is no one to offer the youth emotional support in time of stress, which is sometimes caused by school overload.

One of the respondents alluded that lack of parental supervision had led her to a situation where she encountered financial problems and she could not attend school trip which was part of her semester marks. She further said that:

If my father was living with us, maybe he would be able to help my mother so I do not struggle at school work.

Another respondent alluded that she had no one to assist her with her school work because her mother was busy generating income for the family while her role of monitoring and supervising his school work suffered. Figure 1 shows that some of the respondents’ academic performances were not affected by lack of parental nurturing because they had joined youth clubs and church pastors played significant roles in their lives by showing them righteous paths which enabled them to perform well in their studies.

Academic performances of majority of the respondents were adversely affected. One respondent alluded that:

Lack of parental supervision affected my academic performance since I am staying with my grandmother and she didn’t go to school and my mother works far away from us as a domestic
worker. This resulted in a situation where there is no one at home to give me informal education which would enable me to perform very well in my formal education.

Another respondent said:

I lose concentration in class because I used to think much about what my mother was going through after her marital breakdown. She was always tense and she never helped me with my school work; neither did my father come along and helped me with my school work. He was focusing on his new family which led me to be left all alone and end up repeating grade 10.

Economic hardship and academic performance

Economic hardship was mentioned as a problem that young school children faced after their parents divorced their marriages. Figure 2 shows economic hardship being resulted in a situation where there was no food, no pocket money, no uniform, no school trips and no computer to complete assignments.

Figure 2: Economic hardship and academic performance

Figure 2 shows many of the respondents faced economic hardship to the extent that they could not afford proper school uniform, like some other learners. One of the respondents said that as a grade 11 learner, she needed a smart phone that would enable her to access internet and get information to complete school assignments, but could not get it because there was no one to buy it for her, this affected her academic performance. Although some of the respondents reported that they did not face economic hardship because they are financially supported by people around them.
Some of the respondents articulated that economic hardship affected their academic performances in a way that sometimes they would go to school without food or pocket money. One respondent alluded that after school he would sometimes come back home to find out there was nothing to eat, which led him to neglect his school work and cause a lot of stress to him.

Figure 3: Deterioration of academic performance

The majority of the respondents’ academic performances declined after the marital breakdown of their parents. One respondent alluded that seeing his father walk out of his life brought much more stress to his life, which resulted in a decline in his academic performance:

My mother tried her level best on encouraging me to do some school work, so we can break the cycle of poverty at home which I appreciate a lot to have someone like her in my life. My father never bother to encourage me it … he hated me so much. Stress makes me not to focus on my study.

Another respondent reported that he began to score low marks in class and he started taking dagga, believing it would take away his pain caused by his parents’ marriage divorce.

Although majority of the respondents did not encounter peer rejection after the marital breakdown of their parents. But some reported their experiences of peer rejections from their classmates. One respondents said:
After marital breakdown (of my parents), peers started to distance themselves (from me) which caused me to feel more alone and stressing all the times.

Some of the respondents said that their friends were nowhere to be found, unwilling to do school work with them which led them to feel so lonely and eventually could not perform well in their studies.

The psychological effects

Psychological effects that marriage divorce has on young people whose parents went through marital breakdown were mentioned by the respondents in the study.

In Figure 5, majority of the respondents said they experienced depression. One respondent alluded that when he went to school and happen to find that his friend has pocket money whilst he did not, it would hurt him and often results in stress. Another respondent emphasised that she got depressed when she could not get money for rent.
One of the respondents articulated that seeing her friends spending most of their times together with their parents and their parents coming to schools with them or to pick them makes her feel depressed, wishing her parents were still together. Figure 5 further shows that few respondents did not experience depression because they had support from families, pastors and friends.

The findings shows certain emotional tendencies such as aggression in young people which is as a result of parental marriage divorce. One of the respondent said:

I sometimes go where he (father) stays and start a fight with him
One respondent emphasised that she was very aggressive towards other learners at schools, especially towards boys because when she saw boys, it would remind her of her father’s wickedness. Another respondent articulated that he would get angry with her mother whenever she refused him from going to visit his father. He would also get angry when he saw her working as a domestic worker while his father was still alive (Figure 6).

Possible strategies to address the effect of divorce

The possible strategies to address the effects of marriage divorce are views from young people from broken families on what they believe could be done to address this issue.

Role of parents

One respondent wished that both parents would perform their parental roles despite their differences. Children must not be punished for their parents' separation. They alluded that they need both parents’ support, to assist them with their school work, not fight in front of their children and be responsible for their upkeep despite their situations.

The role of teachers

They emphasised that teacher’s roles are very essential in their academic and social life. One respondent articulated that teachers’ involvement or help could make them do well in their academics and develop a sense of confidence among themselves. Another respondent reported that sporting
activities at school must be prioritised as mechanism to deal with psychological effects of marriage divorce.

The role of the community

The community where the young people resides also has important responsibility to play. The respondents mentioned that the community should not see them as outcast or punish them for the mistake of their parents rather they should be encouraged and supported in their academic and other endeavours.

Discussion

The study revealed that lack of communication plays a dominant role in the parental divorce in the study area. Lack of communication and use of foul languages wherein one partner uses harsh words against the other spouse leading to domestic violence could lead to divorce. The researcher found that drunkenness in a marriage could lead to the use inappropriate words towards the other partner and being absent minded due to excessive use of social media could spell danger. These findings are consistent with the work of Preller (2013: 03) who emphasised that social networking increases the rate of divorce, proper channel of communication among couples no longer prevail.

The finding of the study regarding lack of parental nurturing and supervision reveals that most respondents reported that without the help of their parents they are unable to perform very well in their studies. This is consistent with the work of Ballantine and Hammerick (2009: 44) who found out that young people from broken families have lower grades, lower test marks and higher drop-out rates on average than those who come from two-parent (intact) households. According to Hetherington and Kelly (2002) the learning of the child is affected by the home background. If outlook for educational development of such a young person is not encouraging, they are likely to show poor cognitive functioning, which displays exteriorly in difficulty in maintaining the alertness, attention and concentration needed in classroom performance and which works interiorly to slow down the mental process of registering, selecting and reaching to information. An impoverished home environment would have a cumulative effect, so that a young person exposed to it would become progressively more handicapped in their performance as they grow older.

According to Ballantine and Hammerick (2009) most young people from broken homes are generally disadvantaged because they are generally regarded as deprived academically, economically, socially and culturally. Their environments are not conducive to learning and their education is not adequate. As a result of loss of one parent these young people suffer psychological problems. Furthermore, father-son bond is essential in moral development. Without it a young man’s moral bankruptcy arises. The effect of marriage divorce on academic performance among youth is devastating. The remark concerning the importance of father figure to a son in the study is found to be accurate. In many cases young boys from broken families who are in the custody of their mothers are likely to express anger in class and other disturbing behaviours Ballantine and Hammerick (2009). Mothers find it very difficult to
deal with such behaviour since we are still living in a patriarchy society; where African mothers still believe a boy must be treated with more respect more than a girl (Mudau and Obadire, 2017). Therefore these mothers are unable to discipline their sons.

Regarding economic hardship, the study revealed that the majority of the respondents faced economic challenges, which led them to perform poorly in their studies. Some could not attend school trips, they could not put on proper uniform or eat balanced food due to poverty. This is consistent with the work of Anant & Michaels (2008:44) they postulate that children from non-intact families are likely to perform poor academically compare to children from intact families due to lack of financial stability which enable school children to have access to school materials.

On the decline in academic performance, the study revealed that majority of the respondent's academic performance began to decline when the parents began to fight a lot within a marriage which drives one parent away. This is consistent with the work of Mhlongo (2003: 15), Cox (2006: 467)& Cooper et al. (2009: 47) who emphasise that the academic performance of young people from parental divorce becomes affected, for instance a young person who is a minor often worry about whom they are going to stay with (father or mother or relative), where they will be placed or taken away to a child and youth care centre or not.

Regarding infidelity, the finding of the study revealed that majority of couples cheat in their marriages which results in marriage divorce. This is consistent with the work of Demo and Fine (2010: 76) which stressed that unfaithfulness is mostly a commonly cited cause of marriage divorce especially among married couples. Couples who stayed in a marriage for long period of time tend to seek sexual pleasure outside the marriage and seek someone who will satisfy their sexual gratification. Some do so for sake of experimenting. Economic hardship also plays a vital role in infidelity; a wife can cheat on her husband by dating rich men in order to live glamorous life style or to be able to provide for her children.

On sexual activities, the study revealed that all respondents did not involve themselves in sexual activities due to the marital divorce of their parents. The researcher also found that the respondents did not engage in sexual activities because they believed it would lead to a situation where they will suffer similar fate as their parents. This finding is not consistent with the work of Radi and Bernardi (2014: 23) who postulate that children from non-intact families are likely to fall pregnancy and impregnate before they complete their first degree. These findings may be as a result of the different context in which the study was conducted.

**Recommendations**

Traditional authorities at the local level should ensure that they have youth desks, which should be manned by youth care workers. By doing so it would enable young people who come from broken families who are not performing very well academically to get some assistance from youth care workers in the form of informal education. This will improve their performance at school.
Youth development in South Africa should be professionalised to ensure that youth development workers to be recognized and obtain professional license. These youth development workers should provide service to young people who come from marital broken families. They should also work at schools and work hand in hand with the Department of Education by identifying these category of young people inorder to help them.

Many scholars have found that financial hardship among youth results in school dropout or scoring lower grades. Policy makers should formulate policies that would provide support to young people who come from marital broken families especially those who are facing financial hardships. These efforts will yield positive result if it could be tackled together with the assistance of care workers, traditional leaders and the community as a whole.

Conclusion

This study revealed the effects of parental divorce on young people’s academic performance. In addition to that parental divorce I social stigmas which have long lasting effect in the lives of young people. More so, Young people who are contemplating getting into a marriage must bear in mind that marriage is not a play ground. Marriage is a corner stone of a happy family and happy family is a cornerstone of a nation, anything that comes against marriage, such as divorce, brings a disease to the nation and terribly affects peace and economic growth of the nation hence should be address with all seriousness.

References


Mudau, T.J. and Obadire, O.S. 2017. The role of patriarchy in in Family Settings and its Implications to Girls and Women in South Africa. *J Hum Ecol.*, 58(1,2): 67-72


Malnutrition among Junior Secondary School Students in Lagos-State, Nigeria: A Consequence of Parental Socio-Economic Condition

Sulaiman Lanre Abdul-Rasheed¹ and Olusi Ahmed Adepeju²

Abstract: The road to good health is through good food which depends on the socio-economic condition of the giver of the food. Numerous studies had been conducted on the causes of child malnutrition among children less than 5 years, that of children between 8 and 16 years with keen interest on the socio-economic context of the giver has not been well documented. This lacuna is what this paper filled. Cross-sectional household survey was used for the study. A total of 322 respondents were selected using a multi-stage cluster sampling design. A well-structured pretested questionnaire was used to elicit the socio-demographic data from the respondents, while the respondents’ nutritional status was calculated using the Body Mass Index (B.M.I) method. Chi-square and bivariate logistics regression were used to test the hypotheses. The study discovered that parental education and parental income were the fundamental factors affecting child malnutrition in the study location. Hence, government should ensure that education is made compulsory and affordable to everyone. Also, the menace of poverty should be adequately addressed.

Keywords: Child Malnutrition, Nutrition, Poverty, Education, Body Mass Index

Introduction

One of the salient dimensions of well-being that has received less attention in the past few decades is nutrition. Adequate nutrition is helpful in enabling people to reap the fruits of their labour (Deaton, 1997:1). Nutrition is one of the most veritable ingredients of labour productivity; it also increases human potentialities of all kinds (Perkins, Radelet, Snodgrass & Roemer, 2001).

Nutrition during childhood is consequential to guarantee a good state of health, including social and cognitive development. Inadequate nutrition can be linked to at least about half of the 10.9 million child deaths yearly (Garcia & Sarmiento, 2007). Nutritional inadequacy leads to malnutrition, which is a condition in which the physical function of an individual is impaired.

¹ National Population Commission, Ilorin, Kwara-State, Nigeria. Email: rasheed_sulaimon@yahoo.com
² Nigeria Nuclear Regulatory Agency, Ikeja, Lagos, Nigeria
Liu and Lee (2015) defined malnutrition as a situation that results from taking an unbalanced or poor diet, in which certain nutrients are lacking in the wrong proportions or in excess (too high an intake). Malnutrition poses a serious threat to the world, close to 150 million children suffer from malnutrition and children are the most observable victims of malnutrition; they are not well nourished and suffer almost six months of illness yearly (UNICEF, 2010). Nigeria is among the top ten countries in the world with the highest number of children that are underweight, with an estimated six million children under 5 years who are underweight (UNICEF, 2006). National Population Commission (2008) shows that 54.6% of Nigerian kids under five years are considered underweight.

Malnutrition is the core factor in many diseases in both adults and children, and it contributes largely to the disability-adjusted life years globally (Murray & Lopez, 1996). Children who are malnourished have lower resistance to infection and are likely to die from common childhood sicknesses such as diarrhea disease or respiratory infections, malaria, fever etc., and this poses serious threat to the economic institution as many future labour workers might have lost their lives before they attain they age of five which will affect the manpower and workforce of the nation.

Malnutrition can be said to be the consequence of poverty, since most malnourished children live in the underdeveloped and developing nations of Africa, Asia, and Latin America where those mostly affected are from poverty stricken families (Agarwal & Taneja, 2005). Many childhood diseases are an offshoot of malnutrition and they achieve their worst effects in socially deprived and poor homes (Ramachandran & Gopalan, 2011). In Nigeria, poor households mostly do not have the resources to eat balanced diets on a regular basis, hence, they mostly go for foods that they can afford and not foods needed for the optimum functioning of the body. In addition, they are also most likely to live in an unpalatable or poor environments that are plagued by poor hygiene, bad water, mosquitoes etc. All these in turn will affect the nutritional status of the child.

Child malnutrition, however, is not synonymous with the poor ones alone. It is not uncommon to see child malnutrition among the children of the rich ones. The availability of money at their disposal, at times, makes them to overfeed their children, making them to be overweight. Also, mother’s employment enhances the household’s accessibility to income and this also has negative effects on the nutritional status of children, as it reduces a mother’s time for childcare.

Various studies (for example, Safari, Masanyiwa & Lwelamira, 2015; Sharma, Yadav, Mishra & Tiwari 2015; Awoyemi, Odozi & Ogunning 2012; Kamal & Aynul Islam, 2010 etc.) in the past had explored the causes of child malnutrition among children of under 5 years. Malnutrition among junior school students with keen attention on the social and economic factors responsible for it has not been explored. This lacuna is what this paper filled.

**Literature Review**

The degree and distribution of micronutrient deficiencies and protein-energy malnutrition among a population depend on a number of factors including the socio-political and economic situation, the level of education, the cultural and food customs, seasonal and climate conditions, prevalence of infectious
diseases, breastfeeding habits, the availability of quality health services and the existence and effectiveness of nutritional programmes (Young, Borrel, Holland & Salama, 2004; de Waal & Whiteside, 2003).

Demographic and socio-economic factors seem to be more relevant than genetic features in growth disparities among children (Amugsi, Mittelmark & Larrey, 2013). There is substantial evidence in the health literature that suggest that the nutritional status of a child is related to a number of socio-economic factors such as mother’s education, household wealth, place of residence, access to health care services, nature of occupation etc. For instance, some studies showed that households’ wealth can be linked to child nutritional status (Mushtaq, Gull, Khurshid, Shahid, Shad & Siddiqui, 2011; Ortiz, Van, Wijaya, Donoso, & Huybregts, 2014).

Sharma, Yadav, Shweta and Pankaj Tiwari (2015) carried out a survey on the socio-economic and demographic correlates of acute under-nutrition among pre-school children in rural and urban wards of Allahabad, North India. The researchers used chi-square and logistics regression to test the relationship between the socio-economic factors and under nutrition. They discovered that socio-economic factors such as per capital income, family size, place of residence and parent’s education have a significant relationship with under nutrition. For instance, it was observed from the study that the educational status of both father and mother had an adverse effects on the nutritional status of their wards. As for the influence of per capital income on malnutrition, it was seen that children whose families had the lowest per capital income of 100-500 rupees were the most undernourished and wasted and this relationship was significant at (p<0.001).

Mostafa and Aynul Islam (2010) investigated the socio-economic determinants of malnutrition among ever married women in Bangladesh. The researchers used multivariate logistics regression to determine the social and economic factors affecting malnutrition. They discovered that except for employment status of women, education, age, wealth index, place of residence and current marital status had a significant relationship with women malnutrition. Study by Ali-Idris (2005) on the social and economic correlates of malnutrition among children below the age of 5 also confirms that there is a sharp relationship between social and economic factors and child malnutrition. Specifically, the study found out that parents of malnourished children were stark illiterates and majority of the families lived in slum areas and had low income.

The reasons parental education especially that of mothers affects child health and nutrition are not far-fetched. Glewwe (1999) suggests two possible reasons mother’s schooling contributes to child nutritional and health status: formal education exposes mothers to health knowledge; it also makes women to be more receptive to modern medicine and health facilities.

Some studies, however, found no relationship between the socio-economic factors and malnutrition. For example, study by Awoyemi, Odozi and Ogunniyi (2012) on the socio-economic and environmental correlates of malnutrition among children in Iseyin area of Oyo-State, Nigeria showed that only environmental factors and not social and economic factors, affect child malnutrition. Specifically, the study identified poor sanitation and diarrhea infection as the salient factors that increase the likelihood of child malnutrition in the study location. While socio-economic factors used in the study such as sex,
household size, place of residence, parental education, and parental occupation had no significant relationship with child malnutrition. Thus, this reflects the relative significance of environmental factors in the study location. Similarly, study by David, Moncada, and Ordonez (2004) on the determinants of child health and nutritional status in Nicaragua and Western Honduras confirmed no significant relationship between maternal’s schooling on child nutrition in Nicaragua.

It is imperative to note that although women’s employment enhances household’s income, it may also have adverse effects on the nutritional and health status of children as it reduces mothers’ time for child care. Abbi, Gujral, and Gopaldas (1991) analyzed the data on 1990 rural children in the Chandrapur area of Maharashtra, India to determine the influence of mothers’ work on the health and nutritional status of children. They found that 57% of the children whose mothers were working were cared for by their siblings; 30% were cared for by their grandparents, while 13% were by the parents. The researchers also reported that children of mothers who were working had low weight than children of mothers who were not employed and this relationship was statistically significant. Hence, mother’s employment status can be said to be related to child malnutrition in the study location. The reason for this could be that most working mothers do not have the required time to take good care of their children or that have little access to the income they are generating.

Methodology

The study was conducted in Lagos-State, Nigeria. Lagos-State is one of the 36 states that makes up Nigeria. Lagos State was created on May 27, 1967 by virtue of State (Creation and Transitional Provisions) Decree No. 14 of 1967, which restructured Nigeria’s Federation into 12 States (Lagos-State, Nigeria, n.d). The state is located in the South-Western geo-political zone of Nigeria. Lagos state occupies an area of 3,577 sq kilometers out of which 787sq. km or 22% consist of lagoons and creeks. The state is the smallest state in area among all the 36 states of Nigeria. It shares boundary in the North and East with Ogun state, and West with Republic of Benin (Lagos State, Nigeria, n.d). The state has 20 local government areas and it is the commercial capital of Nigeria and the second most populated state in Nigeria with 9,113,605 based on the 2006 national census (FRN, 2009).

Cross-sectional household survey was conducted to generate data for the study. A multi stage cluster sampling design was used to select eligible respondents for the survey. The inclusion of respondents from different enumeration areas in the study location necessitated the adoption of a multi-stage cluster sampling in the survey exercise. To select eligible respondents, three stages of cluster sampling were adopted. In the first stage, 46 enumeration areas were selected among all the enumeration areas in all the local government areas that make up the study location, and this was done with probability proportional to the size of enumeration areas in each local government area of the study location. In the second stage, a fixed number of seven households were selected in each of the 46 enumeration areas by equal probability systematic sampling. Thus, a total of 322 households were selected for the study. In the last stage, one eligible respondent was randomly selected from the list of all eligible respondents 8 to 16 years of age along with either the mother or father.

The parents of the selected children were interviewed using a well-structured pretested questionnaire. It is imperative to note that only 300 households were successfully interviewed. Although the consent of
The respondents’ parents was obtained, the respondents also consented to the survey before being enrolled and they had an option to discontinue or opt out of the exercise at any time.

The nutritional conditions of the children were measured according to the standardized procedures to ensure accuracy. The height of the children was measured using the vertical boards, while the children’s weight was measured using scales. The Respondents’ nutritional status was calculated using the Body Mass Index (B.M.I) method. Each Respondent’s weight and height was recorded then we later calculated the Body Mass Index (B.M.I). This calculation was done by:

\[
\text{Weight of the adult (kg)}
\]
\[
\text{Height for the adult (m)}^2
\]

The respondents were then classified or categorized into one of the following categories: underweight, healthy weight, overweight, obese or morbidity obese. It is important to note underweight, obese and morbidity obese were the units of analysis. Any child that falls in these three categories: underweight, obese and morbidity obese was regarded as being malnourished. Statistical Packages for Social Statistics (SPSS/PC) Version 21.0 was used to analyze the data. The percentages, the mode, chi-square, contingency coefficients and bivariate logistics regression were the statistical methods employed in the analysis.

**Results**

**Respondents’ Socio-Economic and Demographic Characteristics**

Table A in Appendix shows the respondents’ socio-economic and demographic characteristics. From the table, 71.3% (214) were females, while 28.7% (86) were males. The age distribution of the respondents shows that 43% (129) were in the age group 33-37 years; 26.3% (79) were in the age group 38-42 years; 18.3% (55) were in the age group 28-32 years; 10% (30) were 48 years and above, while 2.3% (7) were in the age group 23-27 years. 81% (243) of the respondents were married; 11.6% (35) were separated families, while 7.3% (22) were single.

57% (171) reported to be Christians, 41% (123) were Muslims, while only 2% (6) were traditional worshippers.

Data on the ethnic group shows that 70.3% (211) were Yorubas, 16% (48) were Igbos, 8% (24) were Hausas, while 5.7% (17) were from other ethnic groups. Concerning the respondents’ family types, 83% (249) were monogamous family, 17% (51) were polygamous family. With reference to the educational qualification of the respondents, the table shows that 33% (99) had secondary education; 26.6% (80) had OND/NCE education; 20.3% (61) had B.SC/HND education; 15% (45) had primary education; 4% (12) did not have any formal education, thus they can be termed as illiterates, while 1% (3) had Quranic education.

Data on the occupation of the respondents shows that 31% (93) were traders; 28% (84) worked in the private sector; 17.3% (52) were civil servants; 14% (42) were artisans; 6% (18) were unemployed, while
3.7% (11) were farmers. The economic status of the respondents shows that 46.3% (139) were medium income earners; 34.7% (104) were high income earners, while 19% (57) were high income earners.

**Respondents’ Nutritional Status and Knowledge**

Table B in Appendix shows the respondents’ diet and nutritional knowledge. Question concerning number of times respondents feed their wards per day shows that: 41.7% (125) claimed that they fed their wards more than three times a day; 40% (120) fed their children at least three times daily; 16.3% (49) fed their wards at least two times daily, while 2% (6) fed their wards once a day. Majority of the respondents 91.3% (274) were aware of the classes of nutrients, while 8.7% (26) were not aware of the classes of nutrient. 55.7% (167) were conscious of the classes of nutrient when feeding their wards. Hence, they ensure that they give their children balanced diet. However, 44.3% (133) were not conscious of the classes of food when feeding their children. Hence, they did not bother about balanced diet.

It is important to note that 88% (264) have heard of child malnutrition before, while 12% (36) claimed not to be aware of the child malnutrition. Probing question on the medium shows that 56.8% (150) heard child malnutrition from the hospital; 21.6% (57) chose television; 8.7% (23) heard it from school; 6.1% (16) heard through the internet, 4.6% (12) heard it through the newspaper, while 2.3% (6) heard it through family members and friends. From the analysis, it is obvious that majority of the respondents (57.3%) heard about child malnutrition from the hospital. On the causes of child malnutrition, 52.3% (157) believed poverty is the major cause of child malnutrition in the society; 23% (69) believed child malnutrition is a result of illiteracy; 14.3% (43) went for unemployment, while 10.3% (31) subscribed to shortage of food.

Data on the gender of the children used for the exercise show that 56.3% (169) were females, while 43.7% (131) were males. Data on age of the children show that 39% (117) were 14-16 years, 32.7% (98) were 11-13 years, while 28.3% (85) were 8-10 years. Data on the nutritional status of the children show that 49.7% (152) had <18.5 BMI, thus they were considered underweight; 34.3% (103) had 18.5-24.9 BMI, thus they were considered healthy weight; 11.3% (34) had 25-29.9, thus, they were considered overweight; 6% (18) had 30-39.9, thus they were considered obese, while 1% (3) had >40, thus, they were considered morbidity obese.

It is imperative to note that for the chi-square and logistics regression analyses, those who were underweight, obese and morbidity obese were considered to be malnourished. However, those who were healthy and overweight were considered to be nourished. Therefore, 54.3% (163) can be said to be suffering from child malnutrition, while 45.7% (137) were not suffering from malnutrition.

**Hypothesis I**

\( H_0 \): There is no significant relationship between the parental economic status and child malnutrition

\( H_1 \): There is a significant relationship between the parental economic status and child malnutrition
Table 1: Cross Tabulation of Parental Economic Status and Child Malnutrition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parental Economic Status</th>
<th>malnutrition</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>low income</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>medium income</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>high income</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ X^2 = 130.609^a; \text{ d.f.} = 2; P = 0.000; C = 0.551 \]

Table 2: Coefficients, Odds ratio and standard error from the Logistics Regression Model of the Effects of Parental Economic Status on Child Malnutrition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Status</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Wald</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Exp(B)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Step 1ª</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium income</td>
<td>2.981</td>
<td>.454</td>
<td>43.153</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>19.704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High income</td>
<td>6.107</td>
<td>.834</td>
<td>53.665</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>449.167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low income (RG)</td>
<td>-2.793</td>
<td>.421</td>
<td>53.665</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>0.061</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

-2 Log likelihood= 254.684ª; Cox & Snell R Square= .411; Nagelkerke R Square= .550; Model Chi-Square= 158.948; N= 300

Decision rule

Table 1 shows the cross tabulation of the parental economic status and child malnutrition. The chi-square value of the relationship is \( X^2 = 130.609^a \), degree of freedom = 2, \( P = 0.000 \). Therefore, the null hypothesis was rejected while the alternative hypothesis that there is a significant relationship between the economic status of parents and child malnutrition was accepted. The contingency coefficient of the two variables is 0.551. This means that about 55 percent of the occurrence of child malnutrition is a function of parental economic status.

The results of the model on Table 2 show that parental economic status is a determinant of child malnutrition. The odds ratio result show that the children from low income families had 0.061 odds of not suffering from child malnutrition; those from middle income families had 19.704 odds of not suffering from child malnutrition, while those from high income families had 449.167 odds of not suffering from child malnutrition. These relationships are significant at 0.05 level of significance.

Hypothesis II

\( H_0 \): There is no significant relationship between the parental education and child malnutrition

\( H_1 \): There is a significant relationship between the parental education and child malnutrition
Table 3: Cross Tabulation of Parental Education and Child Malnutrition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parental Education</th>
<th>Malnutrition</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no formal education</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>primary education</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>secondary education</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OND/NCE</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.SC</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quranic</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ X^2 = 179.109^a; \text{ d.f. } = 5; P = 0.000; C = 0.611 \]

Table 4: Coefficients, Odds ratio and standard error from the Logistics Regression Model of the Effects of Parental Education on Child Malnutrition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step 1\textsuperscript{a}</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Wald</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Exp(B)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>18.564</td>
<td>11602.703</td>
<td>94.016</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>115391292.246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>19.222</td>
<td>11602.703</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>222824564.337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OND/NCE</td>
<td>22.302</td>
<td>11602.703</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.998</td>
<td>4846434274.330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.SC/HND</td>
<td>25.297</td>
<td>11602.703</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.998</td>
<td>96928685486.605</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QURANIC</td>
<td>21.896</td>
<td>11602.703</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.998</td>
<td>3230956182.887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No formal education</td>
<td>21.203</td>
<td>11602.703</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\text{-2 Log likelihood= 199.170\textsuperscript{a}; Cox & Snell R Square= .511; Nagelkerke R Square= .683; Model Chi-Square= 214.463; N= 300}

Decision rule

Table 3 shows the cross tabulation of the parental educational qualification and child malnutrition. The chi-square value of the relationship is \( X^2 = 179.109^a \), degree of freedom = 5, \( P = 0.000 \). Therefore, the null hypothesis was rejected while the alternative hypothesis that there is a significant relationship between the parental education and child malnutrition was accepted. The contingency coefficient of the two variables is 0.611. This means that about 61 percent of the occurrence of child malnutrition is a function of parental education.

Table 4 shows the results of the model parental education and child malnutrition. The results show that parental education is a determinant of child malnutrition in the study location. The odds ratio of children whose fathers had no formal education of not suffering from child malnutrition is 0.000. Hence, they are more likely to be malnourished. The odds ratio of those whose parents had B.SC education of not
suffering from malnutrition is 96928685486.605 which is more than those whose parents had OND/NCE, secondary, Quranic and primary education respectively. This identified relationship is significant at 0.05 level of significance.

Discussion of findings

The study revealed the parental social and economic factors affecting child malnutrition in the study location. The first hypothesis was on the relationship between parental economic status and child malnutrition. This hypothesis was accepted at P < 0.05. Thus, there is a significant relationship between parental economic status and child malnutrition. The contingency coefficient of the two variables was 0.551. This means that about 55% percent of the occurrence of child malnutrition in the study location could be attributed to the economic status of the parents. Similarly, the logistics regression model also lends credence to the chi-square results. The logistics regression model shows that the higher the parental economic status of the children, the higher their chances of not being malnourished. This finding corroborates Sharma, Yadav, Shweta and Pankaj Tiwari (2015) finding on parental socio-economic factors and malnutrition. They found out that there was a significant relationship between parental income and child malnutrition.

The second hypothesis was on parental education and child malnutrition. This hypothesis was accepted at P < 0.05. Thus, there is a significant relationship between parental education and child malnutrition. The contingency coefficient of the two variables was 0.611. This means that about 61% percent of the occurrence of child malnutrition in the study location could be attributed to the educational qualification of the parents. The result of the logistics regression model also shows a significant relationship between the parental education and child malnutrition. This finding is in line with the work of Ali-Ildries (2005) which confirms that there is a sharp relationship between social and economic factors and child malnutrition. Specifically, he found out that parents of malnourished children were stark illiterates and majority of the families lived in slum areas and had low income.

Conclusion and Recommendation

The kernel of the study was to find out the parental socio-economic factors responsible for child malnutrition. From our findings, it is established that parental education and parental economic condition are the fundamental factors contributing to the prevalence of child malnutrition in Lagos-State, Nigeria. In order to address the menace of child malnutrition, governments at all levels and non-governmental organizations should ensure that education at least to the level of OND/NCE should be made compulsory and affordable to all and sundry. Government and non-governmental organizations should provide welfare and robust palliative measures that will adequately tackle poverty in the society.

References


**APPENDIX**

**Table A**
Percentage Distribution of Respondents by their Socio-Economic and Demographic Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Socio-Economic Characteristics</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sex</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>28.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>71.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-27 years</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28-32 years</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>18.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33-37 years</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38-42 years</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>26.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 years and above</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital Status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>243</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separated</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>11.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Religion</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christianity</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islam</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic Group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yoruba</td>
<td>211</td>
<td>70.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hausa</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Igbo</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>16.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Type</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Monogamous</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polygamous</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No formal education</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary education</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OND/NCE</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.SC/HND</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quranic</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Civil Service</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private sector employee</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trading</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farming</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artisan</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Status</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low-income</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>34.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium income</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>46.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High income</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Researchers’ Survey (2016)
Table B

Percentage Distribution of Respondents by their Nutritional Status and Knowledge

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nutritional Status and Knowledge</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>No of times you feed your children daily?</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twice</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>16.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three times</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than three times</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>41.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Are you aware of the classes of nutrient?</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>91.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Do you consider the classes of nutrients when feeding your children?</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>55.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>44.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Have you heard of child malnutrition</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Through which medium</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hospital</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>56.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Television</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>21.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family and friends</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Causes of Child Malnutrition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cause</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>52.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiteracy</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shortage of food</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Child’s Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>43.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>56.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Child’s Age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8-10</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>28.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-13</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>32.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14-16</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Child Nutritional Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Underweight</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>49.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthy weight</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>34.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overweight</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obese</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morbidity obese</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Researcher’s Survey (2016)
Transgression of Corporate Governance in South Africa’s State-owned Enterprises

K.A. Mashamaite¹ and P.S. Raseala²

Abstract: State-owned enterprises (SOEs) play a very important role in South Africa’s socio-economic development trajectory, and a strong, transparent and accountable government is central to such course. Accordingly, the immediate attention for the post-apartheid government was to lay the basic foundation for democracy and good governance. SOEs are critical mechanisms to assist government to achieve economic growth, service delivery, poverty reduction, employment creation and in the development of the country’s strategic sectors such as finance, energy, transport, telecommunications, manufacturing and natural resources. However, most of these important SOEs in South Africa are characterised by poor leadership, maladministration, corruption, antagonism, animosity, impunity, weak financial reporting, chronic under-performance, debt burdens, insufficient performance monitoring and accountability systems. Some of these setbacks are associated with corporate governance failures including weak managerial accountability, excessive politicisation and unclear objectives. As a result, SOEs no longer contribute strongly to development or perform their public service role effectively and efficiently thereby undermining government’s intentions to achieve growth and development objectives. The paper therefore argues that the absence of effective good corporate governance is central to the failures of most SOEs to fulfil the mandate which they were created for. Basis of the paper is that, the success of SOEs is dependent on whether the governance systems are placed towards responsiveness to the needs of individuals, communities and society in general. This paper therefore strives to explore the corporate governance quagmires in the SOE sector which impede socio-economic development efforts of government. The paper concludes that SOEs are muddled with governance problems which are the nemesis of good corporate governance, therefore governance transformation in the SOE sector is essential.

Keywords: state-owned enterprises, corporate governance, good governance, accountability

Introduction

State-owned enterprises (SOEs) are a significant element of most African economies such as South Africa, as such their participation in the corporate governance regime is important (Corrigan, 2014). These are public enterprises owned by governments, in full or in part and provide essential public services such as water, electricity, energy, communication and transportation among others. SOEs in South Africa play a very significant role in socio-economic development trajectory, thus a strong, transparent and accountable government is central to such course. Building strong and accountable government has been a critical component of South Africa’s transformation agenda since 1994 and the immediate primary focus was therefore on laying the basic foundation for democracy and good

¹ Department of Development Planning and Management (DDPM), University of Limpopo. Email: kgalema.mashamaite@ul.ac.za
² University of South Africa. Email: PRaseala@hsrc.ac.za/raseala.raseala@gmail.com
Therefore, SOEs should structure their systems on the basis of good corporate governance principles (Corrigan, 2014:1). Corrigan (2014:1) further states that SOEs are potentially powerful tools in states’ developmental inventories, and the manner in which they operate has considerable influence on the wider business and corporate governance landscape.

Although SOEs can play a critical role in the achievement of developmental mandate in strategic sectors such as finance, energy, transport, telecommunications, manufacturing and natural resources, SOEs in South Africa face distinct corporate governance challenges. These common challenges include unformed regulatory systems, politicised board appointments, unclear mandates and objectives, excessive politicisation, weak managerial accountability, poor leadership, maladministration, corruption, antagonism, animosity, impunity, weak financial reporting, chronic under-performance, debt burdens, insufficient performance monitoring and accountability systems (Corrigan, 2014). These setbacks impede strongly on SOEs from contributing towards their developmental mandate or performing public service role effectively and efficiently thereby undermining government’s intentions to achieve growth and development objectives. The paper therefore seeks to explore corporate governance challenges facing the SOE sector, and their prospects in South Africa. To achieve these, the paper starts, firstly, by understanding the transversal legislative prescripts on corporate governance, and secondly why good corporate governance is so significant in the SOE sector. Thirdly, the paper examines the role that SOEs play towards the attainment of development objectives. The oversight role of government in the SOE sector is assessed in section four. Then, section five explores corporate governance challenges and prospects in the SOE sector. Lastly, the paper provides conclusions and recommendations from the preceding argumentative discussion.

Transversal Precepts for Corporate Governance in South Africa

In recent years, South Africa experienced unprecedented corporate governance challenges and failures of many companies which propelled government to establish systems that promote higher standards of ethical conduct, accountability and transparency in companies and by directors (Moyo, 2010). As such, government developed legislative and regulatory corporate governance framework to enhance corporate transparency and accountability. The main legislative and regulatory corporate governance framework in South Africa include among others the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996, the King Reports on Corporate Governance, the Companies Act 71 of 2008, Public Finance Management Act 1 of 1999 and Local Government: Municipal Finance Management Act 56 of 2003.

In terms of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Section 1(c) and (d), South Africa is founded on the principles and values of the rule of law, accountability, responsiveness and openness. Section 41(1)(c) of the Constitution further state that all spheres of government and all organs of state within each sphere must provide effective, transparent, accountable and coherent government for the Republic as a whole, while Section 152(a) and (e) require local governments to provide democratic and
accountable government for local communities and encourage involvement of communities in matters of local government. Public administration must as well be governed by the democratic values and principles enshrined in Section 195 which include promoting a high standard of professional ethics, efficient, economical and effective use of resources, encouraging public participation in decision making, accountable and transparent public administration. These principles, as enshrined in the Constitution, apply to all administration in every sphere of government, organs of state and public enterprises. The latter also suggests that, these principles and values have an inherent influence on legislation and policies that impact SOEs (Kanyane & Sausi, 2015:31).

Corporate governance in South Africa became well-established since the establishment of the King Committee on Corporate Governance in 1992 (Armstrong, Segal & Davis, 2005; Moyo; 2010). The King Reports on Corporate Governance form the basis for the debate on corporate governance in South Africa. It is, therefore, important to note that all these reports, King I, King II, King III and King IV are aimed at promoting good corporate governance in South Africa (Nevondwe, Odeku & Raliglilia, 2014: 663). The King I represented a significant milestone in the evolution of corporate governance and served as a point of reference for policy makers in the development of legal and regulatory frameworks for corporate governance aimed at encouraging highest standard of corporate governance (Moyo, 2010). The main aim of the King I Report was to encourage the highest standard of corporate governance in South Africa by recommending standards of conduct for directors and emphasizing the need for responsible corporate conduct (Moyo, 2010: 42).

The King Report was distinguished by its integrated approach to good governance with regard to financial, social, ethical and environmental practice, to serve the interests of a wide range of stakeholders (Armstrong, Segal & Davis, 2005: 9). Accordingly, the first King Report was instrumental in raising awareness of what constitutes good governance, both in the private and public sectors. It offered to companies, and state-owned enterprises, for the first time, a coherent and disciplined governance framework that was relevant to local circumstances and offered practical guidance (Armstrong, Segal & Davis, 2005: 9). However, King III report on corporate governance became necessary because of the new Companies Act no. 71 of 2008 and changes made in international governance trends (Institute of Directors in Southern Africa (IDSA), 2009: 4; Nevondwe et al., 2014:663). According to Nevondwe et al. (2014:663), King III boldly declared that it applies to all entities regardless of the manner and form of incorporation or establishment, whether in the public, private sectors or non-profit sectors. The fourth report is the draft King IV of 2016. King IV Report sets out the philosophy, principles, practices and outcomes which serve as the benchmark for corporate governance in South Africa. The King IV aims to promote good corporate governance as an integral to running a business or enterprise and delivering benefits such as ethical culture, enhancing performance and value creation, enabling governing body to exercise adequate and effective control; to reinforce good corporate governance as a holistic and interrelated set of arrangements to be understood and implemented in an integrated manner; and to present good corporate governance as concerned with not only structure and process but also an ethical consciousness and behaviour (IDSA, 2016: 2).
Currently State-owned companies (SOCs), also known as SOEs, are regulated by the Companies Act 71 of 2008 which replaced the Companies Act 61 of 1973 as the driver of good corporate governance in South Africa (Nevondwe et al., 2015). The Act was signed by the President on 8 April 2009 and gazetted in Gazette No. 32121 (Notice No. 421) and came into effect on 1 May 2011 (Nevondwe et al., 2015:663). Part C of Chapter 2 which deals with transparency, accountability and integrity of companies provides in Section 34(1) that ‘in addition to complying with the requirements of this Part, a public company or SOC must also comply with the extended accountability requirements set out in Chapter 3’. Chapter 3 of the Companies Act deals with enhanced accountability and transparency of companies including SOCs or SOEs.

Running parallel with these developments was the introduction of the Public Finance Management Act (PFMA) in 1999, which introduced much more rigorous standards for reporting and accountability by adopting an approach to financial management in public sector institutions that focuses on performance in service delivery, and economic and efficient deployment of state assets and resources (Armstrong et al., 2005: 9). The PFMA gives effect to financial management that places a greater implementation responsibility with managers and makes them more accountable for their performance. However, without strong vision and committed leadership; an enabling legal environment; effective performance evaluation; and appropriate competencies and capacities effective and sustainable change will not occur in the SOE sector (Presidential Review Committee (PRC), 2013: 13). As in government, good corporate governance standards demand leadership with integrity and authority working together at the highest levels to make successful decisions for the greater good (McGregor, 2014: 7).

**Why Corporate Governance in SOEs?**

The concept governance is in recent years being used as an interdisciplinary concept which has fast become critical in the field of development studies (Edoun, 2015). The concept has since generated much debates as far as what governance means and entails. As a result, there are wide range of definitions which indicate that governance means different things to different people depending on the context in which the concept is being used. Governance refers to how government exercises its power and authority to manage state’s affairs, goods and services (White, Heymans, Favis and Hargovan, 2000). Kanyane and Sausi (2015: 29) affirm that governance means constitutional, legal and administrative arrangements by which governments exercise their power as well as the related mechanisms for public accountability, rule of law, responsibility, effectiveness, transparency, ethics, integrity and citizen participation. Furthermore, International Federation of Accountants (IFAC) & Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) (2014: 8) state that that governance comprises of the arrangements put in place to ensure that the intended outcomes for stakeholders are defined and achieved.

Edoun (2015) sees governance as a paradigm which represents something more than government and considers governance as a system of values, policies and institutions by which a society manages its
economic, political and social affairs through interaction within and among state, civil society and private sector. White et al. (2000: 10) further posits that governance encompasses the state’s institutional and structural arrangements, decision making processes and implementation capacity and the relationship between government official and the public. Kanyane and Sausi (2015: 29) argue that without governance, government remains an empty shell. In this regard, governance implies the creation of state institutions and structures of government to enable the former to effectively deliver services in line with the mandate entrusted to it by the people (Edoun, 2015: 353).

Corporate governance, on the other hand, refers to the set of systems, principles and processes by which a company is governed (Nevondwe et al., 2014: 664). Corporate governance is understood to be how a company is directed and controlled. Therefore, corporate governance is important for ensuring that certain individuals in an organisation are held accountable and that organisations are properly directed and controlled (Moyo, 2010:1). Corporate governance is defined as the building of a balanced between the economic and social goals, and between individuals and communal goals with the aim of aligning as closely the interests of individuals, organisations and society (King Report, 2002:7). According to Nevondwe et al. (2014: 664), corporate governance is based on the principles such as conducting the business with integrity and fairness, being transparent with regard to all transactions, making all the necessary disclosures and decisions, complying with all laws of the land, accountability and responsibility towards the stakeholders and commitment to conducting business in an ethical manner. This means that corporate governance is based on relationships and networks between individuals, corporations and society. Kanyane and Sausi (2015) are of the view that good governance is about steering society through networks and relationships between governments’ entities and civil society organisations.

Edoun (2015) suggests that good governance should embody transparency in decision making informed by an enlightened professional bureaucracy, an accountable executive and a strong civil society participation, all functioning under the ambit of the rule of law. The function of good governance is to ensure that entities act in the public interest at all times. This requires strong commitment to integrity, ethical values and the rule of law, openness and comprehensive stakeholder engagements (IFAC, 2013). This means that good governance is the manifestation of aspects such as accountability, openness and transparency, independence, responsibility, discipline, fairness and social responsibility as well as engagement between government and the governed (King Report, 2002; Edoun, 2015). IFAC (2013: 20) argues that achieving good governance requires, firstly, defining outcomes in terms of sustainable economic, social and environmental benefits and determining the interventions necessary to optimize the intended outcomes; secondly, developing capacity of the entity including capability of its leadership and individuals; thirdly, managing risks and performance through robust internal control and strong public financial management; and lastly, implement good practices in transparency and reporting to ensure effective accountability. These preceding aspects of governance are critical in understanding why corporate governance is so important in the SOE sector.
The World Bank (2014:16) outlines several positive outcomes of good corporate governance:

- Better access to external finance by firms, which in turn can lead to larger investments, higher growth, and greater employment creation.
- Lower costs of capital and higher firm valuation, which make investments more attractive to investors and thus also lead to growth and more employment.
- Improved strategic decision making and operational performance, through better allocation of resources and more efficient management, which create wealth more generally.
- Reduced risk of corporate crises and scandals, a particularly important outcome given the potentially large economic and social costs of financial crises.
- Better relationships with stakeholders, which improve social and labour relationships, help address such issues as environmental protection, and can help further reduce poverty and inequality.

Furthermore, many, if not all, of the above benefits apply to SOEs, and while few empirical studies specifically analyze the direct impacts of corporate governance on SOE performance, anecdotal evidence shows that better governance benefits both individual companies and the economy as a whole (World Bank, 2014: 16):

- Improved operational performance of SOEs.
- Increased access to alternative sources of financing through domestic and international capital markets, while helping develop markets. As governments face continued budget constraints, better-governed SOEs are more easily able to raise financing for infrastructure and other critical services through the capital markets. In turn, SOE issuances can help develop capital markets.
- Financing for infrastructure development.
- Reduced fiscal burden of SOEs and increased net contribution to the budget through higher dividend payments. Improved governance also increases transparency of the contingent liabilities associated with SOEs, thereby reducing fiscal risk.
- Reduced corruption and improved transparency. Corruption remains a serious problem in SOEs and can influence the financial strength and valuations of the companies, negatively affect investor perceptions, lead to the misallocation of scarce government resources, and constrain overall economic and financial growth. Better-governed companies with integrity and accountability mechanisms are likely to be less corrupt and more transparent.

Good corporate governance ensures proper accountability and transparency in the conduct of a business or entity creating a business environment that is fair and transparent where companies can be held accountable for their actions (Zinkin, 2010; Youssef, n.d). In other words, a company that is well-governed is one that is accountable and transparent to its shareholders and other stakeholders.
The Role of State-owned Enterprises

In most countries, including South Africa, SOEs in strategic sectors such as finance, infrastructure, manufacturing, energy and natural resources are increasingly viewed as tools for accelerated development and global expansion (World Bank, 2014). Additionally, SOEs are critical mechanisms to assist governments to achieve economic growth and service delivery, but also to reduce a country’s tax burden (Fourie, 2014: 30). Fourie argues that SOEs are vital to the growth of the economy and in the development of the country’s strategic sectors such as energy, transport, telecommunications and manufacturing. According to the World Bank, SOEs continue to play an important economic role and are especially prominent in key sectors of the economy that provide critical services for businesses and consumers which contribute directly to economic growth and poverty reduction. Most of these SOEs are established by most countries to develop strategic industries in order to compete in an increasingly globalized economy becoming global players (World Bank, 2014).

In South Africa, the government mandate for SOEs, as articulated in the National Development Plan and other policy statements, is to provide infrastructure services and to help improve social and economic conditions (McGregor, 2014: 6). As South Africa aspires to be a developmental state, SOEs are expected to assist the State in addressing issues of social and economic transformation and in bridging the gap between rich and poor; black and white; rural and urban and other divisions in our society (Presidential Review Committee (PRC), 2013: 7). The PRC, however, argues that SOEs are not regarded as a panacea for solving all challenges of South Africa but are an added strategic and catalytic State instrument for transformation, growth, development, service delivery and employment creation. Therefore, they can play a significant role towards attainment of a developmental state. While SOEs have an indispensable role to play in service delivery and have crucial performance and transformation potential, they are nevertheless faced with significant weaknesses and threats that might become grave impediments to their optimum contribution (PRC, 2013: 7).

Corporate Governance Challenges of SOEs in South Africa

Although SOEs play a crucial role in providing critical services for urban development, there is concern around the poor performance of some South Africa’s SOEs (Wendy Ovens and Associates, 2013: 9). The current state of SOEs in the country paint bleak picture about the performance and future of these SOEs. Recently, the performance of and challenges associated with SOEs in South Africa has put these entities under severe pressure and public scrutiny. Chilenga (2016: 40) states that SOEs tend to face lots of scrutiny and are pressured into providing better results mainly because of their level of strategic importance. According to Youssef (n.d), weak corporate governance may lead to waste, mismanagement, and corruption. Similarly, SOEs have also become increasingly ineffective and inefficient in achieving their strategic and developmental mandates as a result of poor governance and mismanagement. This is because these SOEs are faced with challenges ranging from administrative, institutional, and technical to financial mismanagement.
Compared with private sector companies, SOEs face distinct governance challenges that directly affect their performance (World Bank, 2014). Most of these important SOEs in South Africa are characterised by poor leadership, politicised board appointments, maladministration, unformed regulatory systems, corruption, antagonism, animosity, impunity, weak financial reporting, chronic under-performance, debt burdens, insufficient performance monitoring and accountability systems. Some of these setbacks are associated with corporate governance failures including weak managerial accountability and lack of transparency, excessive politicisation (political interference) and unclear mandates and objectives (Links and Haimbodi, 2011; Corrigan, 2014; OECD, 2015b). All these challenges are a function of poor corporate governance of SOEs. Accordingly, SOEs no longer contribute strongly to development or perform their public service role effectively and efficiently thereby undermining government’s intentions to achieve growth and development objectives.

Kane-Berman (2016) makes several observations with regard to financial problems in SOEs, firstly, SOEs are faced with three financial burdens of i) negative overall return on equity; ii) their losses are a risk to public finance and iii) SOEs with fragile balance sheets have difficulty raising the money to invest in the economic infrastructure the country needs. Compared with private companies competing in the sector, overall financial situation of the country’s SOEs is worrying. Most SOEs are heavily indebted, less profitable and rely on government guarantees (Marrez, 2015). High indebtedness and low rates of return generate payment problems for SOEs. According to OECD (2015b), SOEs are characterised by chronic under-performance with poor returns on government investments and continuous reliance on government support, whether in the form of explicit government guarantees or subsidies which stood at R469.9 billion at the end of 2015/16. In some cases, it is not clear exactly what or whose mandate should or is being implemented in some SOEs (Kane-Berman, 2016). All these problems and challenges depict the volatile nature of the environment SOEs in South Africa finds themselves in.

SOEs in South Africa: Governance Oversight Role

SOEs are known by different names such as government business enterprises, government corporations, parastatals, public enterprises, state-owned companies (SOCs), etc. with a differing purpose, mission and objectives in relation to some aspects of public service and/or social outcomes and their definition varies across countries with respect to institutions they consider ‘SOEs’ (Price Waterhouse Coopers (PWC), 2015; Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), 2015a). SOEs (or public entities) are defined as independent bodies partially or wholly owned by government and perform specific functions and operate in accordance with a particular Act (Pillay, 2011; Wendy Ovens and Associates, 2013). In South Africa, Section 1 of the Public Finance Management Act (PFMA) (No.1 of 1999) introduces the term national government business enterprise which means an entity which, a) is a juristic person under the ownership control of the national executive; b) has been assigned financial and operational authority to carry on a business activity; c) as its principal business, provide goods or services in accordance with ordinary business principles; and d) is financed fully or substantially from sources other than, i) the National Revenue Fund, and ii) by way of tax, levy or other statutory money.
All national government business enterprises are by definition ‘national public enterprises’ as described and referred to in the PFMA (No. 1 of 1999), of which some are companies and some are not (PWC, 2012: 3). On the other hand, Section 1 of the Companies Act (No. 71 of 2008) introduces the term ‘state-owned company’ which means an enterprise that is registered in terms of this Act as a company which either, a) is listed as a public entity in Schedule 2 or 3 of the PFMA (No. 1 of 1999), or b) is owned by a municipality, as contemplated in the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (No. 32 of 2000), and is otherwise similar to an enterprise referred to in paragraph a). According to PWC (2012: 4), SOCs fall within the ambit of the PFMA (No. 1 of 1999) which means that they need to comply with additional provisions over and above of the Companies Act.

The Presidential Review Committee on SOEs established in 2010 reported that there were 715 such entities listed in the PFMA in the country (Kane-Berman, 2016). The PFMA lists approximately 300 public organisations consisting of nine constitutional institutions, 21 major public entities, 153 national public entities, 26 national government business enterprises, 72 provincial public entities, and 18 provincial government business enterprises. Constitutional institutions are listed as Schedule 1 organisations, major public entities as Schedule 2 organisations, and the remainder as Schedule 3 organisations (Fourie, 2014:). Some of the largest state entities in South Africa include among others Eskom, Central Energy Fund, Transnet, South African Airways (SAA), South African Post Office (SAPO), Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa (Prasa), South African National Roads Agency (Sanral), Trans-Caledon Tunnel Authority, Denel, Telkom, SABC, Industrial Development Corporation (IDC), Airports Company of South Africa (ACSA) and Alexkor (Kane-Berman, 2016). Some of these entities are listed as one of the 21 ‘major public entities’ in the PFMA. Respective government departments, either jointly or individually as shareholder representative on behalf of government, are entrusted with the oversight responsibility of SOEs, provide strategic direction, align their priorities to national growth, create efficient, competitive and responsive economic infrastructure network and ensure that SOEs are implementing their mandates and are delivering the intended outputs (McGregor, 2014).

According to McGregor (2014), the Department of Public Enterprises (DPE) is the largest department responsible for Energy and Mining, Manufacturing and Transport, together with the specific functional departments, while other departments such as Communications, Defence, the Trade and Industry, and Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries are responsible for other specific SOEs. As its primary mandate, the DPE provides oversight and strategic direction for the SOEs (DPE, n.d). As shareholder representative, the departments have responsibility for providing strategic direction, the alignment of priorities to national growth and creating an efficient, competitive and responsive economic infrastructure network. Part of their role is to ensure that SOCs are implementing their mandates and are delivering the intended outputs. This involves the analysis of the operations and performance, improving the delivery and maintenance of infrastructure, achieving policy and regulatory clarity, improving operational efficiencies and providing operational indicators of each of the required outputs. (McGregor, 2014: 6; DPE, n.d).
This clearly shows that the management of SOEs is currently dispersed across different shareholder departments on behalf of government. Some SOEs are managed by line ministries or entities in central government and some are managed by local government which have the ownership rights (Marrez, 2015). Each ministry has a shareholder department overseeing the SOEs under its responsibility. The Board of Directors of SOEs is the governing body of the SOE with absolute responsibility for the performance of the SOE and is fully accountable for the performance of the SOE (National Treasury, n.d.). According to Marrez (2015: 6), such a governance structure is not an ideal setup for avoiding political interference in the day-to-day management of the companies, or guaranteeing a separation between the authorities’ ownership and policy-making functions. Adherence to sound corporate governance principles is therefore utmost significant to ensure that SOEs perform the role they were created for.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

Governance, in particular of SOEs, is central to comprehending how well a country is performing, as it is one of the indicators used in sovereign rating of a State. Governance is the way in which organisations are directed and controlled. It focuses on performance and conformance, and is different from management. This applies to corporations in the realm of corporate governance, and to governments in the realm of public sector governance. However, the performance of many SOEs in South Africa remains in distress as a result of poor corporate governance. Good corporate governance systems ensure that the business environment is fair and transparent, that company directors are held accountable for their actions, and that all business contracts made by the company can be enforced. Similarly, company committed to good corporate governance has strong board practices and commitment, effective internal controls, transparent disclosure, and well-defined shareholder rights. Therefore, the critical role of SOEs in the economy and in advancing the agenda of a developmental state is pivotal to exploring and understanding the need for transformation in the SOE sector’s corporate governance challenges. Accordingly, addressing corporate governance challenges can contribute to improved performance of SOEs as part of a comprehensive and contextually relevant approach that also includes policy reforms, restructuring, external incentives, such as increased competition, and more private sector participation, as well as fiscal discipline. The complex nature of the SOE environment required a review of the legislative environment in order to clarify their mandates and funding issues.

**References**


Institute of Directors in Southern Africa. 2009. King code of governance for South Africa. IDSA.

International Federation of Accountants. 2013. Draft International Framework: Good Governance in the Public Sector. IFAC and CIPFA.

International Federation of Accountants and Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy. 2014. International Framework: Good Governance in the Public Sector. IFAC and CIPFA.

Kane-Berman, J. 2016. Privatisation or bust. @Liberty, 4(27). South African Institute of Race Relations.


Wendy Ovens and Associates. 2013. The Role and Significance of State Owned Enterprises, Public Entities and other Public Bodies in the Promotion of Urban Growth and Development in South Africa.


Youssef, M.T. Corporate Governance: An overview – around the globe. Egyptian Institute of Directors.

Accentuating the Right to Access Quality Education in Rural South Africa: Lessons to be learned from other Countries

Isaiah Mmatipe Sefoka

Abstract: This paper emphasize the intervention and interpretation of the right to quality education as contemplated in the 1996 Constitution, Freedom Charter, South African Schools Act and other policies and documents. This paper articulates that jurisprudentially speaking, education as a right was first recognised internationally after the end of World War I, and the delivery of the right to access quality education was first expressed in the international arena under the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) in 1948 which was then followed by other instruments from the four walls of the world. As per interpretation of these instruments, the right to quality education must be enjoyed by everyone despite one's age, color or race. However, it is an undisputed fact that the right to access quality education is still under serious fractures in as far as enforcement is concerned and as such it requires special attention. This paper therefore used non-empirical (qualitative) methodology generally acceptable in legal research activities which relies heavily on scholarly legal lexicons. This paper concludes that government must promote the realisation and enforcement of the right to (further) education and further recommends that South Africa must use other countries as its model and it should learn and adopt their educational system.

Keywords: Enforcement; Freedom Charter; International Arena; Intervention; World War I.

Introduction

Education as a right was first recognised internationally after the end of World War I (UNESCO 2007: 7). This took place through the treaties adopted for the protection of certain minorities in Europe in the aftermath of the war. Thereafter, a Declaration on the Rights of the Child was adopted (The Geneva Declaration of the Rights of the Child 1924). This Declaration stressed social and economic needs over the traditional civil and political rights of the child. Though this Declaration did not expressly refer to a child’s educational right, one of its Principles required that the child ‘be placed in a situation where he/she will be able to earn a livelihood” (The Geneva Declaration 1924). This means that educating children is implicit in enabling them to earn a livelihood. After this declaration other declarations follow which recognised the right to education.
Legislative frameworks promoting and supporting the right to education

The Constitution (1996) accentuates the consideration of international law as well as the foreign law by a court, tribunal or forum when interpreting any Right in the Bill of Rights (Constitution 1996, section 93 (1) (b) and (c)). These sections provide government with the opportunity to consult international and foreign law and apply it when there is a need and were applicable. Moreover, Mbazira is of the view that in order for the right to education to be fulfilled it is significant to consider international law (Mbazira 2009).

The Constitution (1996) provides everyone with the right to elementary education which encompasses the right to adult elementary education. The Constitution further provides everyone with the right to further education which the state is obligated to make it progressively and sustainably available and accessible to everyone by the implementation of reasonable measures (Constitution, 1996: s 29). The Constitution further provides everyone with a right to choose language/s to be used as medium of instructions in state educational institutions if that education is reasonable and practicable. The state is further obligated to consider all reasonable educational alternatives which include inter alia a single medium language of instruction in ensuring the effective access and in doing so, attention must be paid to equity, practicability and remedying harm caused by the past racially discriminatory laws and practices (Constitution, 1996: s 29).

According to the White Paper on Education and Training “education is the cornerstone of any modern, democratic society that aims to give all citizens a fair start in life and equal opportunities as adults” (White Paper on Education and Training 1995). According to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights “education must be ensured, accessed and guaranteed without any discriminatory basis” (CESCR 1999).

Nasson and Samuel shares the same sentiments by saying that education is particularly equipped both to maintain the existing social order and also to promote varying kinds of change or mobility” (Nasson and Samuel 1990: 1). On the other hand Nasson asserts that as a question of social change, education must be seen as an important participating force, but not as an arbitrating one (Nasson 1990: 103). According to Robinson education is not necessarily the only instrument that can be used to transform the world; however the world cannot be transformed without equipping people with education (Robinson 1982, Nasson 1990).

Modisaotsile highlight that quality education is also significant for ensuring that there is a progressive human development as well as economic and political systems which are socially responsive (Modisaotsile 2012). Modisaotsile further opined that education is the vehicle which the society can utilize to reproduce and structure themselves (Modisaotsile 2012). This means the society which acquired quality education has a range of ideas on how such society should be structured presently and in the future (Modisaotsile 2012). Tomasevski demonstrates that quality education if acquired is the
starting point for every individual to understand and enjoy other fundamental rights and also to empower such individual to participate meaningfully in the society (Tomasevski 2006). Tomasevski further posits that quality education contribute immensely towards the fulfilment of other socio-economic rights and also increase the individual's chances of securing a better employment which as a result secures access to food, housing as well as health care services (Tomasevski 2006).

However, Nevondwe and Matotoka concurrently opined that the right to education as envisaged in the Constitution (1996) can be regarded as a “hybrid right” for the fact that it a socio-economic right which compels the Government to make education accessible and available to every individual (Nevondwe and Matotoka 2013). Nevondwe and Matotoka asserts further that these right is also a civil and political right because it afford people the opportunity to choose the language of their choice in schools and to establish and maintain independent institutions where applicable (Nevondwe and Matotoka 2013).

Bekker is of the view that the right to education, more in particular the right to basic education which include adult basic education is not inextricably intertwined and attached to the principle of progressive realisation and the availability of the state’s resources which distinguishes it from other socio-economic rights (Bekker 2000). This means that the right is immediately realizable. According to Dwane quality education is a bridge which a disadvantaged and marginalised society can utilise to cross over from poverty to a better life and to uplift themselves (Dwane 2012). On the other side Van Leeve is of the view that education which is of low quality and standard and fragmented by under resourced, unsafe and unhealthy environment deprive students from exercising and enjoying their right to quality education (Van Leeve 2014).

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR)
The right to education was firstly expressed internationally in 1948 under the UDHR (Arendse 2011). Article 26 provides that everyone has the right to education. It further provides that the elementary and the fundamental stages of education shall be free and compulsory. Vocational, technical and professional education including higher education shall be equally accessible to all based of merit. Education shall further be used as a tool to develop human personality and standard and also to strengthen the promotion development of other fundamental human rights (UDHR 1948). It shall also assist the United Nationsto further its activities by keeping and maintaining peace and stability amongst the signatories. This declaration provides parents with a right to choose the kind of education that should be received by their children (UDHR 1948: Art 26 (1) (2) and (3)).

South Africa is implementing the content of this declaration because the Constitution provides that everyone has the right to education (Constitution, 1996: s 29 (1) (a)). Nine years of schooling (grade 1 to 7) is free and compulsory as provided by South African Schools Act (SASA), and the state is making further education progressively available and accessible through reasonable measures to everyone (SASA, 1996: s 3 (1); Constitution, 1996: s 29 (1) (b)).
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) is an international human rights covenant of the United Nations (UN) which South Africa is a state party to. This covenant is aimed at protecting, promoting and realising socio-economic rights such as the rights to quality education. The ICESCR provides that all the signatories to this covenant shall make education accessible to everyone. The signatories agree that education shall be used as a tool to develop human personality and it shall enable every individual to meaningfully participate in all societal activities (ICESCR 1996).

The ICESCR provides further that every signatory shall strive to full realisation of the right to quality education in that elementary education shall be free and compulsory while secondary education which includes technical and vocational education shall be made available and accessible to everyone through progressive introduction of free education (ICESCR, 1966: Art 13 (1) (2) (a) and (b); Art 14).

On 12 January 2015 the South African government ratified the ICESCR which ratification was set to be in force on 12 April 2015. The ratification provides that signatories are obligated to work towards the effective realisation of every socio-economic rights as set out in the ICESCR. The ratification further provides that the ICESCR must ensure the realisation of every learners’ rights to elementary education as enshrined in Section 29(1) (a) of the Constitution (ICESCR ratification 2015).

This covenant provides that the South African government shall give progressive effect to the right to education, as contemplated in Article 13 (2) (a) and Article 14 of the ICESCR. This means that covenants and declarations should not limit the scope of the right to basic education and related obligations, nor limit access to education, particularly in relation to free and compulsory elementary education. Accordingly, South Africa’s Constitution does not subject the fundamental right to elementary education to progressive realisation (ICESCR ratification 2015; Durojaye 2015).

The Dakar Framework for Action

South Africa is an active party or signatory to the Dakar Framework for Action, where it commits itself to combating poverty and uplifting its people through the provision of basic education that is compulsory for all children of school-going age that is of good quality and in which financial capacity is not a barrier to access for any child which target must be attained by 2015 (Dakar Framework for Action 2000). The Dakar agreement provides that more emphasis must be placed on ensuring that funding strategies and mechanisms are implemented and developed and fund poor schools so as to improve those schools and to attain sustainable quality education. The objective of this framework is far beyond free education for the indigent in that it seek to achieve an educational system that is of good quality and fee-free for the indigent of the country (Dakar Framework for Action 2000).

South Africa is implementing this action as it is making basic education free and compulsory for every child of school-going age and making sure that financial incapacity or predicaments is not a barrier for
any child to access basic education (ICESCR ratification 2015; Durojaye 2015). This is a way of combating poverty and uplifting South African people.

**Convention on the Rights of the Child**

Convention on the Rights of the Child is one of the International human rights treaties to which South Africa is a party, which also support the right of access to education (Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989). Article 28 provides that signatories shall on the basis of equal opportunities promote and make available and accessible quality elementary education free and compulsory to every child which include elementary technical and vocational education. It further provides that appropriate measures should be taken such as introducing free education and affording financial aid in needy cases, making higher education accessible based on merit and capacity and also encourage regular attendance at schools which will reduce drop-out rates and contribute to the capacity building of individuals (Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989: Art 28 (1) (a) (b) (c) (d) and (e)).

It further provides that in eliminating ignorance and illiteracy, the signatories shall forthwith promote international cooperation in educational matters by introducing scientific technical knowledge and teaching methods which are consistent with the child's human dignity (Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989: Art 28 (2) and (3)). South African government is promoting the content of this convention because it provides for free and compulsory basic education and encourages the development of adult basic education and other forms of further education through the Constitution (Constitution, 1996: s 29 (1) (a) and (b)).

**Declaration on the Rights of the Child**

This Declaration provides that children are entitled to free and compulsory elementary education. It further provides that education should improve and promote the child’s culture and help the child to become a useful member of society (Declaration on the Rights of the Child, 1959: pri 7). The Declaration set out the best interests of the child as the guiding principle for those responsible for his or her education, and in this way further entrenched a child-oriented approach on matters affecting the child (Declaration on the Rights of the Child, 1959: pri 2; Alston 2004). It followed the lead of the UDHR in prioritizing elementary education. The Declaration provided that a child who is physically, mentally or socially incapable shall be given the special attention, education, and care necessary required by his respective condition (Declaration on the Rights of the Child, 1959: pri 5; Murungi 2013).

**African (Banjul) Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights**

South Africa is a member state to the African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights (ACHPR) which is one of the International human rights treaties that also suggest that states have an obligation to make primary education compulsory and free of charge. Article 17 concisely provides that every individual shall have the right to education (ACHPR 1981: Art 17 (1)). To support the right stipulated in article 17, Article 1 provides that all the signatories shall promote every right including the right to education enshrined in this charter and shall adopt relevant legislative measures to promote and protect such
Article 2 further stipulate that every individual shall enjoy every right provided for in this charter without discrimination of any kind (ACHPR 1981).

South Africa is promoting the contents of this charter because it undertook to adopt legislative frameworks and other measures such as the Constitution and SASA to give effect to the right to basic education. This shows that the state is obligated to make primary or basic education free and compulsory to every person without any kind of discrimination and to make sure that everyone is entitled to the enjoyment of every right including the right to basic education.

**UNESCO, Convention against Discrimination in Education**

The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) Convention was the first international treaty to recognize a binding right to education (UNESCO, 1960). Article 1 provides that this convention prohibit discrimination in education on the grounds of race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, economic condition or birth. The prohibition is effective if the discrimination had the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing equality of treatment in education, and particularly if such discrimination had the effect of excluding certain groups of persons from any kind of education, or of establishing separate education systems for groups of persons with the effect that the education offered in those separate schools was of an inferior quality (UNESCO, 1960: Art 1). As the first international binding treaty on education, article 4 of this convention further provides that state parties to the UNESCO Convention undertook to make primary education free and compulsory, to ensure compliance by all with the obligation to attend school as prescribed by law and to establish equal standards of education in all public education institutions (UNESCO, 1960: Art 4 (a) and (b)).

**Declarations on the Rights of Mentally Retarded Persons (1971), and on the Rights of Disabled Persons**

The 1971 Declaration was adopted in the context of a growing consensus amongst non-governmental organisations that specified conventions defining the rights of disabled persons were necessary to complement the general human rights contained in the universal instruments. The Declaration targeted a specific group of people with disabilities, but it became the basis for the subsequent one which extended the entitlements to all persons with disabilities (Declaration on the Rights of Disabled Persons, 1975: preamble). The declaration provides that “the mentally retarded person has a right to education, training, rehabilitation and guidance as will enable him to develop his ability and maximum potential” (Declaration on the Rights of the Mentally Retarded, 1971: par 2).

Subsequently, the 1975 Declaration called for measures to enable persons with disabilities to be as self-reliant as possible, and specifically recognised their right to education, vocational training and rehabilitation that will make it possible for them to develop and as well as to transform their educational skills and capabilities (Declaration on the Rights of Disabled Persons, 1975: para 6). These Declarations did not have binding force. However, they constituted moral and political persuasion to secure national
policy changes in the 70s and 80s. They also greatly enhanced the visibility of persons with disabilities and their exclusion from mainstream human rights protection. Hence, soon after the 1975 Declaration, the year 1981 was designated to be the international year of Disabled Persons by the United Nations General Assembly (Murungi 2013).

The right to free and compulsory education in South Africa is also enjoyed by people with disabilities to develop their abilities and potential, to be self-reliant and to recognise their right to education. This means that people with disability are included to enjoy the rights in the Bill of Rights which also include the right to education, hence the word “everyone” as contemplated in section 29 of the Constitution.

The Jomtien Conference
This Conference was held in Thailand (Jomtien) in 1990 against the backdrop of continuing exclusion of a significant proportion of both child and adult populations from education, the UDHR’s proclamation of a right to education for everyone notwithstanding (World Declaration and Framework for Action, 1990: preamble). The conference adopted a Declaration on Education for All and a Framework for Action to Meet Basic Learning Needs. This Declaration reiterated the right of every person to benefit from educational opportunities designed to meet their basic learning needs (World Declaration and Framework for Action, 1990: Art I (1)). The Declaration identified the need to review the meaning and scope of basic education to embrace an expanded vision that entails, amongst other things, broader resource levels and institutional structures (World Declaration and Framework for Action, 1990: Art ii). The expanded vision would also encompass the universalisation of access and promotion of equity which would entail expansion of measures and equal opportunity for all children to achieve and maintain an acceptable level of learning (World Declaration and Framework for Action, 1990: Art ii (2); Art 3).

Lessons drawn from other Countries

Australia
Legislative Frameworks and the Right to Education in Australia
In Australia the states and territories governments are responsible for a variety of educational aspects and financial assistance thereof. Most of the Australian legislative frameworks make compulsory school attendance from the age of six (6) to 15 or 16. In Australia, there is no Commonwealth statute explicitly containing the right to education as an individual right like in the South African context. However there are laws or legislation dealing with the right to education which is relevant to the responsibilities of the Commonwealth.

Australian Constitution
Australia has a written Constitution which has no Bill of Rights to protect human rights in a single document. The Australian Constitution is largely concerned with pragmatism rather than ideology (Glèeson 2000). This means that it says very little about what it is to be Australian. It says practically nothing about how Australians finds themselves there. It says nothing of how they should behave
towards each other as human beings and as Australians (O'Donoghue and Brennan 1994; Williams 1999). The right to education is not incorporated in the Australian Constitution as an individual right, nevertheless, there are five explicit individual rights in the Constitution, namely the right to a trial by jury, the right to vote, freedom of religion, protection against acquisition of property on unjust terms and prohibition of discrimination on the basis of State of residency (Commonwealth of Australia Constitution Act 2010 sec 80, sec 41, sec 116, sec 51 (xxx) and sec 117).

**The Education Act**
The right to education in Australia is provided for in Education Act (Education Act 2004; republication 21). Section 7 (1) of the Education Act provides that everyone involved in the administration of this Act, or in the educational institution of any kind in the Australian Capital Territory (ACT), must promote the principle that every child has a right to receive an education of high quality. Section 8 outline the responsibilities of parents and government in relation to education and the obligation which government and non-government school including home education schools has in promoting compulsory education by ensuring progressive participation which include the opportunity to participate in training or employment after schooling (sec 8 (a) and (b) (i) (ii) of the Education Act 2004).

**Other Legislation Promoting the Right to Education**

**Canada**

**Federal Legislative Frameworks Promoting Education in Canada**
The governments of Canada has established a robust legal frameworks that intend to put together laws and policies which stand against discrimination of any kind which include discrimination on the grounds of race, colour, sex, language, religion etc. The right to education is also a significant human right in Canada that is guaranteed in federal, provincial, and territorial legislations.

**The Canadian Human Rights Act**
The Canadian Human Rights Act (1985) was passed to uphold the principle that all individuals should have equal opportunities. This Act provides that discrimination is prohibited on the basis of race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, family status, disability, and conviction for which a pardon has been granted (sec 3 (1)Canadian Human Rights Act, 1985). In defining discriminatory practices, the Act states that it is illegal, for any of the reasons listed above, to deny, or deny access to, any good, service, facility, or accommodation to any individual or to differentiate adversely in relation to any individual. Access to education is included in this prohibition (Canadian Commission for UNESCO, Promoting Equality of Educational Opportunity 2012).

**The Canadian Citizenship Act**
The Canadian Citizenship Act provides that all Canadians, whether by birth or by choice, are entitled to the same rights, powers, and privileges and are subject to the same obligations, duties, and liabilities (sec 6 of the Canadian Citizenship Act 1985).
The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms
The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms (1982) provides every individual with equal protection and equal benefit of the law without any discrimination of some sort and guarantee that every individual must be equally treated before and under the law. It further ensures that this guarantee of rights does not preclude any law, program, or activity that has as its object the amelioration of conditions of disadvantaged individuals or groups including those that are disadvantaged because of race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, sex, age, or mental or physical disability (sec 15 Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, 1982).

United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP)
In November 2010, Canada joined other countries in supporting the UNDRIP as a reaffirmation of its commitment to promoting and protecting the rights of Indigenous peoples in Canada and around the world. The declaration sets out the individual and collective rights of Indigenous peoples, as well as their rights to culture, identity, language, employment, health, education, and other needs (UNDRIP resolution 61/295). The ratification provides that the Canadian government, with the provincial and territorial support, ratified the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in order to protect and promote the educational rights and dignity of persons with disabilities. The core obligations of this ratification relate to non-discrimination and reasonable accommodation, with specific provisions for education (Canada press release 2010).

Territorial and Provincial Legislations Promoting Education
Every province and territory has its own legislative frameworks and procedures and human right commission or equivalent to guard against discrimination and foster human rights. The commissions promote and educate people about human rights and anti-discrimination laws, as well as to do away with any sort of discrimination amongst the community. Education is integrated in each human right legislation and policies as a right subject to the provisions of the law (Canadian Commission for UNESCO, Promoting Equality of Educational Opportunity 2012).

Within the framework of this legislation and policy, the rights of students to be free from discrimination encompass not only access to education, but also the quality of the educational experience itself. Educational jurisdictions in Canada are reaching beyond the idea of anti-discrimination to the concept of truly inclusive education. In inclusive education, educational values and beliefs are centred on the best interests of the students, promoting social cohesion, belonging, equal opportunities for success, and active participation in learning (The Development of Education 2008).

Australia as a Model of South Africa in Promoting the Right to Education
Compulsory education should be implemented and enforced until the child is in a position where it is presumable that he/she is capable of making decisions on his/her own rather than in his early ages. In terms of SASA, compulsory education in South Africa is only the first nine (9) years of schooling or until
the child is fifteen (15) years of age which is presumably too soon for such a child to make sound decisions. Whereas in Australia compulsory education under the Education Act requires a child to participate in education until a child is seventeen (17) years of age or has completed year twelve (12) (whichever happens first). This means that the child is of compulsory age if he/she is six (6) years old and up until he/she is seventeen (17) year and/or the child completes year 12 which is grade 12 in our case (sec 9 Education Act, 2004). South Africa should therefore learn and adopt Australian compulsory educational system and change its own system.

Conclusion

This paper has proved that South Africa as a country has ample legislative and other instruments aimed at supporting, promoting and protecting the fundamental right of access to quality education. Moreover, these frameworks are supported by international instruments on the right to education. Further, the courts have also contributed in interpreting this right by consistently reiterating in their judgements that the right to education is an empowerment right that enables people to realize their potential and improve their living conditions. Despite this, there are continuing challenges taking place in the educational sector which bring along poor realization of this right, particularly in rural areas. It is clear in as far as this study is concerned that as a country we have less difficulties or problems with regards to the realization of the right to basic education as compared to that of further education. The realization and enjoyment of the right to further education is still a problem which need serious attention.

Recommendations

This paper therefore recommends that in order for this country to have the quality and the best educational system it must

- Government should no longer separate education as basic and further education but treat it as one in as far as realization is concerned.
- Increase the compulsory school attendance from grade 1 to 7 and make it compulsory from grade 1 to grade 12. This is because a person who is in grade 7 does not have a clear and sound capacity to face the world and its challenges independently and cannot make rational decisions and choices as to what is it that he/she want, and in most cases he/she is still under the control and auspices of his/her parents. A person who is in grade 12 is in a better position to fully understand the choices he/she make and the repercussions that will follow and therefore can make choices independently.
- Make education completely free from the primary to the tertiary or university level. This will help people who are ambitious and eager to study further, because there are quite a number of people who have passed grade 12 but are unable to study further because of financial predicaments. There are also those who are already within the four walls of institutions of higher learning but cannot finish their respective studies because of high fee rate and they end up sitting at home despite their ambition and eagerness.
While in the process of making education completely free, increase the budget of National Student Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS) and other states financial aids and also stringent their rules and selection criteria of selecting who is to be funded to preclude the misuse of the funds.

Increase the budget of bursaries such as FunzaLushaka and to create others in order to draw the attention of young people to participate in the teaching fraternity and became expert in their fields.

Provides sufficient funding for postgraduates to meet the NDP’s vision of having 75 percent of PhDs among university staff in 2030 in order to improve the research and innovation capacity. This vision must not be made for 2030 only but rather be made perpetual and ongoing.

Retain highly motivated and ambitious teachers and pay them enough to produce high quality education. Young people have since lost interest in the teaching fraternity and no longer take it serious and as a profession. This is as a result of the low salary that teachers receive while they are doing a great job of creating all these professions. It should be kept in mind that for every profession to come into existence or for one to be a professional, he/she must have went through school or to put it differently, through the hands of a teacher. It is therefore important for government to draw the attention of the youth in this profession and make them not to look the other way.

References


Canadian Human Rights Act, 1985

Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR), 1999.


Declaration on the Rights of the Child, 1959.


Disability Discrimination Act 135 of 1992, as amended

Geneva Declaration of the Rights of the Child, 1924.


Indigenous Education (Targeted Assistance) Act 147 of 2000


National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996

South African Schools Act 84 of 1996.

Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), 1948.


What has the law achieved so far? 2014. Also available on https://twitter.com/yana_amy Retrieved 03.03.16.


Yoliswa Dwane, Founding Affidavit, Equal Education & Others v Minister of Basic Education & Others 81/2012 (ECB), para 34. Also available on www.sabc.co.za/wps/portal/news/main/tag?tag=Yoliswa%20Dwane Retrieved 03.03.16

Emergent Social and Economic Relations after Land Reform: Exploring the Farm Compound System in Zimbabwe

Clement Chipenda

Abstract: The article explores the social and economic dimensions of the Fast Track Land Reform Programme (FTLRP) undertaken in Zimbabwe from the year 2000. The focus is on the farm compounds found on former large scale commercial farms in the Goromonzi District of Zimbabwe. The article presents the argument that the socio-economic reconfiguration of rural Zimbabwe which occurred due to the FTLRP, has not only had an impact on those who benefitted from the programme but it has also had both negative and positive impacts on former and current farmworkers. Using the farm compounds as the focus of analysis, the article shows that these places are now a site of new and dynamic socio-economic and political relationships which are having an impact on individuals and the society as well as on the emergent rural economy. The article goes on further to try and understand the new rural landscape in the new farming areas of Zimbabwe and the overall impact which the land and agrarian reforms have had on people’s lives from a sociological perspective.

Keywords: land reform, agrarian structure, farm compound, farm workers

Introduction

The fast track land reform programme (FTLRP) which was undertaken in Zimbabwe from the year 2000 is one of the most radical and unprecedented land and agrarian reform programmes in recent history. It has been described as being comparable to the ‘…leading land reforms of the 20th century which include those of Mexico, Russia, China, Japan, South Korea, Taiwan, Cuba and Mozambique’ (Moyo and Chambati 2013:1). The FTLRP had the effect of reversing the racially skewed agrarian structure which the country inherited at independence in 1980. In a very short period of time it had expanded ‘…thenumbers of small and medium scale farmers, while diminishing the numbers and hectarages of large farms and estates’ (Moyo 2011: 261). Given the nature and extent of the FTLRP, it is beyond any doubt that such a radical and unprecedented programme has had impact not only on agrarian relations and the agrarian structure in rural Zimbabwe but also on the social structure. It is the aim of this article to assess how the FTLRP has impacted on rural communities using the farm compound as its point of reference. The farm compounds are areas of residence which were built by the old large scale commercial farmers for their workers. These compounds have continued to exist in the aftermath of the FTLRP. They are seen as an important institution in the agrarian structure of the country as well as in

---

1 Postgraduate Research Student at DST/NRF SARChI Chair in Social Policy, University of South Africa.
Email: clement.chipenda@gmail.com
the rural economy and the social structure. They have been in existence for decades serving important functions on the farms and even to date they are still serving important functions which will be explored in detail in this article.

Farm compounds are places of residence which farmers built on the farms for their workers. Depending on an individual farmer, farm compounds were not uniform in their appearance or the type of housing which they had. Some comprised of traditional thatched huts while others had brick houses or a combination of both. Despite their lack of uniformity and differences, farm compounds are regarded as important and at the centre of the farming economy in rural Zimbabwe. Besides being areas of residence they are shown to be sites of agrarian power relations, political and economic contestations, social groupings and class stratification. They are also important centres for social transformation as shall be shown below.

This article seeks to understand the functions, relevance and the roles which these farm compounds are playing in the new dispensation. This is in the backdrop of radical changes which have been brought about by the FTLRP. It presents a brief history of land and land reform in Zimbabwe and the farm compound system in colonial and post-colonial Zimbabwe. Basing on empirical evidence obtained from Goromonzi District in Zimbabwe, it shows how farm compounds are a site of labour provision for the farms. The socio-cultural functions of the farm compounds as well as economic and political issues are explored in this article in the context of the FTLRP. The article is quite important and significant in exploring one of the most important and integral structures which has supported the agrarian system in rural Zimbabwe. Despite the importance of this structure it has remained generally understudied and ignored in dominant literature which has emerged in contemporary times which explores the social and economic outcomes of the FTLRP.

Land Issues and Land Reform in Zimbabwe

The year 2000 is a year which will be remembered in Zimbabwe as a year in which the country officially undertook a radical and unprecedented land and agrarian reform programme. It marked the beginning of a decade in which there was the reversal of a land and agrarian structure which successive colonial administrations had developed for almost a century. In Zimbabwe, as in other countries land has always been viewed as a resource which was essential for social and economic well-being. Land dispossession by the colonialists (the British and their descendants) using institutional and legal statutes had resulted in a racially skewed land tenure system which favoured the white minority and had been a major source of concern and antagonism between the races in the country for decades. Ultimately this antagonism which was further fuelled by demand for political independence had culminated a protracted liberation struggle which had ushered in Zimbabwe’s independence. From the year 2000, over an 11-year period the government of Zimbabwe managed to resettle 170 000 families on 4 500 former large scale commercial farms comprising of 7.6 million hectares of land. This figure represented approximately 20% of the total land area of the country (Scoones, Marongwe, Mavedzenge, Murambinda, Mahenene and Sukume 2011; Manjengwa, Hanlon and 2014). This was in a context where at independence in 1980
there were 6,000 farmers or 1% of the population owning 45% of the prime agricultural land while the majority of the indigenous black population could be found residing in marginal and poor areas. These areas were heavily congested and the soils so poor that the people were unable to undertake in any meaningful agricultural activities there (Ruswa 2007:3).

Post-colonial land reform programmes had scored limited successes with the government over a period of 20 years from 1980 to 2000, only managing to resettle 70,000 families on 3.4 million hectares of land. This number fell far short of its intended target of 162,000 families which it had set in the 1980’s (Moyo 2005). A variety of factors had combined to slow down land reform in the post-independence era. Scholars have indicated that constitutional constraints brought about by the Lancaster House Agreement of 1979 (which had ushered in the country’s independence), lack of commitment to pledges made at Lancaster House by donors and the British government in particular to fund the land reform programmes, ideological orientations favouring the protection of ‘property rights’, a perceived alliance between the ruling nationalists and settler capital the adoption of neo-liberal economic policies in the 1990’s among other factors and dynamics had contributed to this slow progress (see Masiiwa 2004, Chitsike 2003, Moyo 2005, Moyo and Yeros 2005, PLRC 2003, Sadomba 2013, Palmer 1990, Sachikonye 2004). It was due to slow pace of land reform which had stimulated the FTLP resulting in the resettlement of thousands of families.

Farm Compounds and Farm Workers in Colonial and Post-Colonial Zimbabwe

A century of institutional and legal tinkering by successive colonial governments on the country’s agrarian structures has had impact on tenure systems and socio-economic relationships in farming areas. The farm compound system is one of the most important and prominent legacies of colonialism. The farm compound was a system in which the farmers reserved a piece of land on their farms which they gave their workers to build houses on. In some instances, the ‘kind hearted’ farmers built houses on the land for their workers on land set aside for that purpose or they simply allocated ‘stands’ to the farmworkers who constructed the houses on their own. Clarke (1977) and Palmer (1977) have argued that the compound system found on farms can be best understood as a labour system which the farmers used to control and regulate labour. The creation of farm compounds during colonialism was closely tied to land dispossession. The aim of this was to create a readily available labour reserve which would serve the colonial capitalist economy. The imposition of taxes had forced the black population to engage in labour on farms and mines and the colonial administration brought in migrant labour from neighbouring countries to supplement available labour (Arrighi and Saul 1973). It was this labour that resided on the farm compounds.

Residence in a farm compound was subject to a person providing their labour to the farmer thus the right to residency on the farms was subject to the worker providing labour. These rights to residency could be withdrawn if the worker failed to provide labour to the farmers as per the contractual agreement. The system was thus designed to tie down or bond workers to a particular commercial farm and it was based on what Moyo (2011) views as insecure residential tenure rights which farm
employment as a key pre-requisite. Rutherford (2009) has argued that the labour and social relations between farmers and farm workers was developed as a form of ‘domestic government’ in which the farmers had their own system in place on their farms. They used this system to resolve issues as per their own laws. A consequence of this was lack of uniformity in the application of laws especially labour laws and the powers of the State were appropriated by the large scale commercial farmers giving them a lot of power and authority over the farm workers.

The living and working conditions of the farm workers have always been seen poor with residents in the farm compounds accessing social services based on the goodwill of the farmer. In the farm compounds, farm workers resided with their families and in the majority of cases the men were fully employed by the farmers in different capacities with women and children usually engaged in seasonal or part time work although some were fully employed. The physical set up of the compounds was such that each family was allocated a house or houses to use. In the majority of cases the houses were the traditional thatched huts but on some farms, there were brick houses. Each family had their own homestead but they were in close proximity with other homesteads. The foremen and senior personnel on the farm were the ones who were usually allocated brick houses and in most instances their houses were located a distance away from the other homesteads in the compounds. The overall responsibility of taking care of the houses, repairing and building huts rested on the farm workers. The farm owners were known to undertake periodic inspections of the farm compounds just to make sure that all was in order, no illicit activities were taking place and there were no ‘undesirable’ elements residing in the compounds. It is during these inspections that there are documented incidents of brutalisation of farmworkers by farm owners. Across all the farms, the working structure was usually uniform with workers being put into grades based on their experience and technical expertise but to a large extent one’s location on the grading system was dependent on the goodwill of the farmers.

Moyo, Rutherford and Amanor-Wilks (2000) argue that farm workers, who were residents of farm compounds when looked at in colonial and post-colonial Zimbabwe, are a constituency which was completely ignored and seen as being tied to the white commercial farmers. Consequently, when it came in issues of land redistribution (in the early post-independence reforms and the FTLRP) they were never taken into consideration or considered as part of the landless indigenous population. This was in a context were the majority of these farm compound residents were seen to be of foreign origin or descendants of foreign migrant workers hence they were never seen as citizens or fully integrated into Zimbabwean society and this is observable even in contemporary times. Most of the farm workers can trace their origins to Zambia, Malawi and Mozambique and by virtue of them staying together on the farm compounds (far removed from other people and cultures) and their continued use of their language and practising their culture they were never fully integrated into Zimbabwean community hence negative perceptions on farm workers and the ‘outsider tag’ has never been removed. The negative perceptions of farm workers also has its roots in the days of the liberation struggle in which Raftopolous (2003) has argued that farm workers were associated with the white farmers and they were seen as being far removed from their counterparts in the communal areas. This was in addition to the ‘foreigner tag’ and
consequently they were never taken to be a part of the ‘native community’. They were seen as being opposed to the liberation struggle. Post-independence land reforms according to Moyo (1995) saw in the 1980’s farm workers from a government policy perspective being viewed as foreigners, unproductive and lacking an identity. Such perceptions have shaped the way in which farm workers are perceived in Zimbabwe. It was only in the 1990’s that there was effective lobbying for the recognition of farm workers as citizens who are also entitled to social protection and land rights (Moyo et al ibid). With the coming in of organisations like the General Agriculture and Plantation Workers’ Union of Zimbabwe (GAPWUZ), the Farm Workers Action Group (FWAG) and the Farm Community Trust of Zimbabwe, there was effective lobbying for the observance of the interests of farm workers who for decades been exploited. Despite the lobbying on behalf of farm workers by these groups the social relations that existed between farmers and farm workers which Amanor-Wilks (1995) has termed as a ‘master-servant’ relationship has never changed. Both on and off the farms, the commercial farmers controlled the farm workers and they remained in charge of a social system which saw them controlling social and economic relationships between them and the farm workers.

As labour and civic organisations in the late 1990’s fought for the rights of farm workers, the FTLRP brought in a new dimension to the situation of the workers. Farm workers prior to the FTLRP process found themselves being used as pawns between the political fights between the trade union movements which later became a fully-fledged political party, the Movement for Democratic Change (MDC), white commercial farmers and the ruling Zimbabwe African National Union-Patriotic Front (ZANU PF) party and its affiliates. Raftopolous (2003) indicates that farm workers during the FTLRP process were mobilised by the trade unions together with the commercial farmers to oppose the government and its overtures towards land reform. A consequence of this was what Raftopolous perceives to be a ‘demonization’ of farm workers by the ZANU (PF) government. They were viewed as championing white interests and the situation was worsened by white capitalists and western media which supported farm workers and made them appear to be victims of the FTLRP. This resulted in them being viewed with suspicion by the government. Thus, the FTLRP, in its own way had diverse and complex impacts on farm workers. Research undertaken by Sachikonye (2003) and Magaramombe (2010) has shown that due to the FTLRP, many farm workers lost their jobs and there was the physical displacement of the farm workers from their places of residence after farms were acquired for resettlement. This was in a context where there was seen to be massive negative impacts of the FTLRP and sharp declines in agricultural production in the country. This has been attributed to the reforms and it has been accused of precipitating a decline in farm labour as a source of employment (Masiiwa and Chipungu 2004; Richardson 2005).

The farm compound is thus an important feature of the agrarian structure in Zimbabwe which has existed for decades. It was used by the farmers as a labour pool which they could easily monitor and control and it was essential that every farmer had this own farm compound so that they were assured of labour which they could effectively use for their agricultural production processes. The FTLRP effectively transformed the land tenure system with farms becoming subdivided into smaller plots
housing the small A1 (villagised) farms and the larger A2 (small scale commercial) farms. Farm compounds continue to be found on the farms with former and current farm workers residing on these farms. The main question’s that exist is the role which these farms compounds are playing in this new dispensation and the socio-economic and political realities of those who live in these farm compounds. It was with this in mind that a study was undertaken in Goromonzi District in the Mashonaland East Province of Zimbabwe.

Due to the stigma attached to the farm workers the government of Zimbabwe never really prioritised them in land allocations and neither did it seriously consider their welfare in the disruptions that occurred during the FTLRP process. It however protected them by directing that no farm workers were to be evicted from the farm compounds as the farm compounds were located on State land over which the new farmers did not have jurisdiction over. This directive tended to provide a form of security for the farm workers who in most instances did not have anywhere else to go. What cannot be doubted is that the FTLRP affected farm workers in different and diverse ways. Moyo and Chambati (2004) have said that some farm workers lost their jobs due to the FTLRP while others retained their jobs with others getting new jobs. What has been clear from the FTLRP was that it altered the lives of farm workers. Due to its nature and impact, the FTLRP has given rise to a new rural landscape which has new socio-economic and political dimensions which are only becoming evident now that the FTLRP has been concluded.

Research Methods
The research which informed this article was undertaken in the Goromonzi District of Zimbabwe. The district lies approximately 39 km from the capital city of Harare and agro-ecologically it is considered to be one of the best in the country. The research was broad based focusing on the social outcomes of the FTLRP of which issues to do with the farm compounds are just one. It entailed eight months of fieldwork using both qualitative and quantitative research approaches. Research tools which were utilised included focus group discussions, in-depth interviews and the administering of a structured survey questionnaire. Additionally, secondary sources of data and observations were employed to augment the research tools indicated earlier. Purposive, random and snowballing sampling methods were employed and the study managed to reach 150 newly resettled A1 farmers who are now settled on 24 former large scale commercial farms, 48 key informants and 66 former and current farm workers. The study focused specifically on 10 farm compounds which were purposively chosen in the district. The research was undertaken ethically in accordance with international best practice.

Presentation and Discussion of Findings
The Reality of Farm Compounds in Goromonzi District
The FTLRP in Goromonzi resulted in the resettlement of 2 822 A1 farmers on 75 old large scale farms and 846 A2 farmers from 51 former large scale farms (field interview held with the Lands Officer on (12 October 2015). The FTLRP resulted in the creation of two distinct resettlement models which the Lands Officer above refers to as the A1 and A2 models. The A1 comprises of either a ‘villagised’ settlement
scheme in which the household was allocated 5 to 6 hectares of land in addition to a ‘common’ grazing area like a village system in the communal areas. Alternatively, it is a self-contained variant in which households are allocated a plot of land in which they decided where to place the homestead and the rest was divided into grazing and arable land. This model was aimed at decongesting communal areas and providing land to landless urbanites. The A2 model on the other hand was designed to be more commercially oriented and it was much larger than the A1 farms. ‘In practice (however), the distinction between these two models varies considerably, and there is much overlap’ (Scoones et al 2011:2).

During the fieldwork, farm compounds were found to be very much in existence on the old large scale commercial farms which have since been subdivided into smaller, A1 and A2 farms. It was noted that the farm compounds were not only serving the new farmers on the farms where they are located but they also serve neighbouring farms as well. Some of the residents of the farm compounds reported that they were no longer employed on the farms but they were working for companies or doing domestic work in the nearby towns of Harare and Marondera. Some indicated that they were now informal traders running their own businesses. All the ten farming compounds had a population of approximately 1 635 people who were coming from 322 households. The number of houses in the three compounds was 212 of which the majority of houses were thatched huts with a few brick houses usually reserved for those with supervisory or managerial positions on the farms.

The perceptions of key informants on the nature and functions of the farm compound system in Goromonzi District support the observation by Clarke (1977) and Palmer (1977) that the farm compound system was developed as a means to control labour and to create a labour reserve on each large scale commercial farm.

Graver Phiri (not real name, aged 66) who is a former farm worker but now a landowner at Mashonganyika farm and a third-generation Malawian indicated that the farm compounds were a place which the farmers deliberately set up so that their workers could reside. The farmers chose an area were the houses were built and it was usually in areas were no agricultural activity could be undertaken and was not in close proximity to the farmhouse. In these compounds workers were allocated a ‘stand’ to build their houses and it was usually three houses per individual. Depending on the farmer, workers had access to water and basic health and primary education for their children although this was not always guaranteed. Residence in the compounds was subject to the worker or members of each family providing labour to the farmer and those who became too old or sick depending on the character of the farmer were at times made to leave the compounds and go back to their areas of origin or go and leave in communal areas and make way for productive individuals. Some farmers according to Graver however did not mind having their old workers residing in the farm compound even after leaving employment (field Interview held on 3 October 2015).

The ages of the farm compounds encountered differed from farm with some reporting that the farm compounds in which they resided had been built as far back as 1905 as in the case of Dunstan farm,
early 1900’s as in the case of a compound at Warrendale farm or as recent as 2013 as shown by a compound found at Mashonganyika farm after some farmers decided to build their own farm compounds where their employees would reside. On the reason behind the creation of the farm compounds in the district the Provincial Vice Secretary of the Zimbabwe National Liberation War Veterans (field interview held on 24 September 2015) had this to say:

When the white men came to this district they chased the original inhabitants of this land the vashawasha and confined them to the communal areas in this area the likes of Chinyika and Chishawasha. On their farms, they needed people to work on the land hence they established these farming compounds with poorly built houses but for them they were sufficient and cheap for the natives to live and work on the land. You will realise that the farm compounds were places were farm workers lived and the white farmers preferred migrant workers rather than local people. These farm workers tended to tied down in a cycle of exploitation which they could not easily run away from. Employing locals was a problem for them because the locals if the job was too painful they could run to their homes in the communal areas hence they preferred foreigners who came from far and could not run away easily and some came through employment agreements and were only paid on completion of their contract so you can see how the whole system was designed as a means of each farmer having their own labour pool to use on the farms.

The Farm Compound in the Post FTLRP Era

One of the major aims of the study was to find out the functions of the farming compounds in the aftermath of the FTLRP. Having established that farming compounds are in existence the major question is the role of these farming compounds in contemporary times. The functions of the farm compounds are outlined in sections below.

Farm Compounds as Sites of Labour Provision

The majority of farmers who were interviewed during the fieldwork indicated that the farm compound for them is an important source of labour. In the farm compounds, they indicated that they are able to have access to a variety of skills and expertise which was developed by the former commercial farmers in the form of human capacity development of the former farm workers. It was indicated that the majority of residents of the farm compounds especially the older generation had been employees of the former large scale commercial farmers and thus they had a lot of experience and specialisation in the production of ‘difficult’ crops like tobacco, soya beans, wheat, flowers, seed maize among others. In addition, some of the workers had specialisation in servicing farm machinery and these skills were seen as being an important asset for the farmers. Due to the nature of the set-up in the new farming areas which farmers claim has seen a shift from the rigid labour tenancy system former farm workers are seen by some of the new farmers as being free agents who can provide labour to a farmer of their choice and whom they can hire at any time should they require their skills. Farmers also indicated that they normally utilise labour that is found in the farm compounds for menial tasks which include digging, planting, weeding and harvesting. Labour for these tasks is usually provided by women and youths with men who are mostly experienced former farm workers providing specialised expertise in crop production or operating farm machinery. Residents in farm compounds who are hired on a part time bases are usually hired between the months of October and May when most agricultural activities are undertaken. Farm compound residents are given tasks to perform which are subject to an agreed contract. It is a popular form of labour provision known locally as maricho or mugwazo and payments for these contacts
are according to agreed terms which in the new farming areas range from cash payments, provision of agricultural products or groceries.

Large farms in the district especially A2 farms that are into tobacco production and irrigation usually have large number of employees ranging from 10 to upwards of 100 comprising both permanent and part time labour. These farms are seen as utilising the farm compound system to their full advantage as it is an important labour pool. These farms due to the nature of their operations and impressive output enable them to engage in profitable productive activities. They are able to get credit to finance their activities, they engage in contract farming and often times they are run professionally hence their ability to hire and maintain a high labour pool which they utilise for productive purposes. Due to the way, they are set up and their operations, workers can be found residing in the farm compounds on these farms which are usually well built and electrified. This is in contrast to the old farming compounds and an example of such a compound is one found at ZB farm in Goromonzi. The conditions of the farm compounds on these highly productive and mechanised farms are in sharp contrasts to the conditions at farm compounds found on ‘poorer farms’ or the small scale A1 farms which in most instances are not commercially oriented.

One of the major aims of the study was to find out the functions of the farming compounds in the aftermath of the FTLRP. Having established that farming compounds are in existence the major question is the role of these farming compounds in contemporary times. The functions of the farm compounds are outlined below.

The majority of farmers who were interviewed during the fieldwork indicated that the farm compound for them is an important source of labour. In the farm compounds, they indicated that they are able to have access to a variety of skills and expertise which was developed by the former commercial farmers in the form of human capacity development of the former farm workers. It was indicated that the majority of residents of the farm compounds especially the older generation had been employees of the former large scale commercial farmers and thus they had a lot of experience and specialisation in the production of ‘difficult’ crops like tobacco, soya beans, wheat, flowers, seed maize among others. In addition, some of the workers had specialisation in servicing farm machinery and these skills were seen as being an important asset for the farmers. Due to the nature of the set-up in the new farming areas which farmers claim has seen a shift from the rigid labour tenancy system former farm workers are seen by some of the new farmers as being free agents who can provide labour to a farmer of their choice and whom they can hire at anytime should they require their skills. Farmers also indicated that they normally utilise labour that is found in the farm compounds for menial tasks which include digging, planting, weeding and harvesting. Labour for these tasks is usually provided by women and youths with men who are mostly experienced former farm workers providing specialised expertise in crop production or operating farm machinery. Residents in farm compounds who are hired on a part time bases are usually hired between the months of October and May when most agricultural activities are undertaken. Farm compound residents are given tasks to perform which are subject to an agreed contract. It is a
popular form of labour provision known locally as maricho or mugwazo and payments for these contacts are according to agreed terms which in the new farming areas range from cash payments, provision of agricultural products or groceries.

Large farms in the district especially A2 farms that are into tobacco production and irrigation usually have large number of employees ranging from 10 to upwards of 100 comprising both permanent and part time labour. These farms are seen as utilising the farm compound system to their full advantage as it is an important labour pool. These farms due to the nature of their operations and impressive output enable them to engage in profitable productive activities. They are able to get credit to finance their activities, they engage in contract farming and often times they are run professionally hence their ability to hire and maintain a high labour pool which they utilise for productive purposes. Due to the way, they are set up and their operations, workers can be found residing in the farm compounds on these farms which are usually well built and electrified. This is in contrast to the old farming compounds and an example of such a compound is one found at ZB farm in Goromonzi. The conditions of the farm compounds on these highly productive and mechanised farms are in sharp contrasts to the conditions at farm compounds found on ‘poorer farms’ or the small scale A1 farms which in most instances are not commercially oriented.

It should be noted that depending on farm size and level of agricultural production, the levels at which farmers utilise farm compound labour differs. The larger A2 farmers can have a large number permanent workers working for them who reside in the farm compounds and would occasionally hire part time workers either from the farm compounds or elsewhere. In some cases, senior staff at some farms who once resided in the farm compounds would upon promotion be offered alternative accommodation which is not in the farm compounds. In contrast the smaller A1 farmers may not even utilise labour from the farm compounds as some may not have high production levels and they would utilise labour which is provided by their families and a small number workers who usually are not full-time employees. Some farmers including A2 farmers have preferred to utilise labour from communal and urban areas due to various individual factors.

In as much as the farm compounds are an important labour pool for the farmers the study discovered that due to changes which have been brought about by the FTLRP they have become areas of much contestation and antagonism between the farmers themselves and the and residents of the farm compounds. The tenure system under the FTLRP saw the subdivision of a single farm into several plots and usually on that farm there would be a single farm compound. Disputes have arisen between farmers as they have fought to control the farm compounds. Some farmers feel that since the area where the farm compound is located is close to their plots then they have rights over the farm compound while others have felt that since they have more workers residing in the farm compound or since they may be providing the farm compounds with basic amenities then they are entitled to be in charge of the compounds. In some instances, it was indicated that farmers had disputes over workers or remuneration to be paid to workers.
The most common disputes are seen arising from the farmers especially A2 farmers demanding that farm workers or persons residing in farm compounds on their farms were obligated to give them labour or the first preference in providing them with labour. This is in the backdrop of farmers inheriting social and physical infrastructure which although it is owned by the State they have been granted user rights and responsibility over it. Farmers are seen as using it as a tool to threaten farm compound residents who refuse to provide them with labour of consequences should they withhold their labour. In most instances farmers are said to provide amenities like electricity, water and transport to hospitals in emergencies. They also support local schools and clinics some of which are located on the farms. The support which they give, makes them believe that they have the powers to demand labour from the farmers in return of access to services and residency rights. These contestations especially those between the farmers themselves over the farm compounds and between the farmers and residents of farm compounds have seen some new farmers building their own compounds over which they now have total authoritarian control. They decide who resides and who does not reside in the farming compounds and they have the powers to evict. Thus, relationships between farmers and farm workers have not always been and are not perfect. This is seen as stemming from the days of farm invasions when farm workers were seen as siding with the former large scale commercial farmers. Farmers indicated that they don’t trust the farm workers and they believe that they will never be fully faithful to them. Some farmers even view farm compound residents as thieves who steal their agricultural products and assets.

Focus group discussions held with current and former farm workers (at Dunstan farm (27 June 2015), Banana Groove farm (11 July 2015), Ingwenya farm (16 August 2015), Warrendale farm (19 September 2015), Mashonganyika farm (3 October 2015) and Chibvuti farm (2 November 2015) had similar issues raised on the issue of labour in which it was agreed by most of the participants that there was the continuation of the repressive labour tenancy system. The farm workers indicated that they were third to fifth generation migrants whose parents had originated from neighbouring countries. They had no alternative places to go or stay and they felt that this made them vulnerable to abuse by farm owners who forced them and their families to provide them with labour at low remuneration as a condition for them to continue residing in the farming compounds.

The farm compound as a labour pool for the farmers is thus a very important asset which assists farmers in their endeavours to attain high levels of agricultural productivity on their farms. High levels of production can be achieved in agriculture if the productive potentials of the farmers are enhanced, there are adequate agricultural support services and there is adequate and knowledgeable human capital. Having specialised, experienced and committed labour can make a huge difference in farmers increasing their agricultural output. In this context, the farm compound is seen as providing a diversified and rich labour pool which lies at the disposal of the farmers. In most instances, most of the workforce was trained by the old large scale commercial farmers hence for the new farmers it is a cheaper form
of labour in which they do not invest much except to provide on the job training and additional refresher courses.

Issues raised above on the farm compound system highlighted above are indicative of the continued importance of the farm compounds as a source of labour for farmers. The challenge which has arisen has been that the majority of the farm workers did not directly benefit from the FTLRP with some of them now only having secondary access to the land. Given the history of the farming areas and farming areas in which there were structural constraints to them accessing education some of the farm workers now find themselves trapped in an equally vicious cycle of labour tenancy which is very much similar to that which was developed and enforced during colonialism. Lack of education has limited their opportunities to relocate and being descendants of migrants they do not have any alternative places of residence and the need to make a livelihood forces them to continue providing labour to the new farmers whom one of the farm workers described as ‘... not paying at all, they would rather we go for months without paying a cent even after selling their produce at the markets and they would rather spend the money on luxuries and pay us in bits and pieces’ (field Interview held with farmworker Sandiforo on 12 October 2015).

Farm Compound Residents and Social Protection

Barrientos (2010) wrote on social protection and labour and argued that workers when workers are employed, they receive protection in the form of social insurance (pensions, health benefits, funeral assistance etc). He also indicated that there can be labour market interventions that can be put in place which are aimed at protecting the basic rights and standards of work for those people who will be working. In labour interventions Barrientos (ibid) said there can be active interventions like trainings and policies to stimulate employment. There can also be passive interventions like maternity benefits, injury compensation, sickness benefits which are financed by the employer. When we look at the ideas of Barriento’s in the context of the social protection of farm compound residents especially the farmworkers it can be seen that the FTLRP has brought on new and interesting dynamics. Farmworkers who participated in the study believed that the FTLRP had negatively impacted on their lives if one looks at it from a social protection perspective. Firstly, they indicated that for those lucky enough to be working they are not guaranteed of a written contract or gazetted wages, At the time of the field-work negotiations by government, workers unions and farmer organisations had seen wages pegged in the following categories: C1 – US$250.00 a month, C2 - US$200.00 a month, B – US$144.00 a month, A2 - $78.00 a month and A1 - $74.00 a month. Many of the farmworkers were complaining that the new farmers did not use this salary scale and it was challenging for them to demand these salaries as they were afraid of being dismissed. They felt that their union, the General Agriculture and Plantation Workers Union (GAPWUZ), was failing to stand up for their rights.

The farm compound residents especially workers were in agreement that the FTLRP had brought new issues and challenges for them. Firstly they were no longer guaranteed of full-time employment and the contracts which they had mostly were not written down or were just verbal agreements. This stripped
them of some benefits like pensions, health, maternity and funeral insurance which some had when they were employed by the old large scale commercial farmers. They felt that this new dispensation had hindered the transfer of income from the farmers to the workers leaving them vulnerable. Their basic rights and working conditions were no longer as well regulated as before and most of the farm workers were said to be at the mercy of the new farmers who now had a lot of power. Thus, for the workers, the new dispensation created by the FTLRP, has left them more vulnerable than ever before and they felt that the new farmers have an indifferent attitude towards their welfare. The responses by a farmer and a farmworker below aptly summarise the attitudes that the two groups have towards social protection of the farm workers in the aftermath of the FTLRP:

I have no idea about the welfare of the farm workers. This is because personally I don’t have permanent workers and I only employ seasonal labour. In this type of arrangement, we rarely have contracts or any water tight arrangements. It is usually a verbal agreement. We agree on the work which they are supposed to do and we pay them as soon as they complete the task. I think the things which you are talking about like medical aid and pensions apply to A1 farmers with permanent staff. But I doubt they will be having such packages for all workers maybe for managers (farmer No: 35 field interview held on 19 September 2015).

We have been let down by government and GAPWUZ. Before farms were taken, farmworkers had pensions and the farmers assisted a lot in times of illness or death. They did it because it was part of their obligation to workers. Unions during those days were also very strong. Even the working conditions were not too bad as the machinery was maintained and safe. The only problem was that the white farmers were too harsh and cruel at times. But compared to now we don’t have contracts to speak of. We don’t have benefits and there are no working clothes. I work in my own clothes from home. So, in all fairness if we are to speak the truth we are not protected. If I get fired today I go with nothing and the people at GAPWUZ cannot do anything (Focus Group Participant - Farmworker on 11/07/15 at Banana Groove Farm).

Farm Compounds and their Social and Cultural Functions

Observations which were undertaken in Goromonzi District show that farm compounds in the aftermath of the FTLRP are an important site for cultural and social class reproduction and they are seen demonstrating the individual agency of the farm compound residents which they use to shape their lives. According to Stolley (2005) culture is an important and integral part of human society making up society’s ideas, behaviours and beliefs which shape people’s interaction and their world view. Social class on the other hand is seen as a ‘continuum of economic positions that leads to differences in lifestyle or life chances’ (Stolley 2005: 242). Rodrigues (2007) adds on social class to say that economic differentiation cannot be the sole criteria that can be used to define social class. Although Max Weber provided a distinction between social classes based on one’s position in the economic he also indicated that there is also social status in which people share a common lifestyle and thus social class is shaped by the interaction which occurs between both class and status.

The study showed that farm compounds are not just houses or homesteads located on a farm but they are in fact communities. These communities which have been in existence for decades are seen to be sites cultural and social class reproduction serving multiple functions on the farms and in local communities. From a sociological perspective, the study discovered that farm compounds are not just facilities which provide farm workers with a place of residence but they are in fact communities which have their own unique characteristics and dynamics. Traditional views on residents of farm compounds
have focused on the farm workers who are usually the male heads on full time employment on the farms or their spouses or widows providing part time employment or seasonal labour on the farms. Interactions with residents of farm compounds in Goromonzi revealed interesting patterns which give a new face to farm compounds. It was seen that in these compounds there can be seen to be households comprising of the nuclear family, single parent, joint, monogamous and polygamous families making up the households thus creating unique and dynamic family structures. Respondents in the study who reside on farming compounds indicated that the social relationships that are found in farming compounds are unique and different from conventional social relationships found in either urban areas or communal areas in Zimbabwe. This was said to be due to the evolution of the farm compounds which over a long period of time have seen residents developing strong friendship ties which have been cemented by marriages resulting in a unique spider web of kinship ties in the farm compounds. The majority of residents in the farm compounds as indicated earlier originate from countries like Mozambique, Zambia and Malawi and they are seen to share areas of origin and kinship relations from their forefathers and intermarriages have strengthened and at times complicated the relationships to outsiders. These relationships are further strengthened by shared cultures, customs and traditions which are seen as having continued to exist in the farming compounds.

The strong friendship and kinship ties which are found in the farm compounds are shown as being of much importance and as serving various functions. Friendship ties are especially important given the years in which residents have lived together. It is strengthened by social processes including the occasional beer drinking of illicit beers like kachasu (this is home brewed illegal beer) during weekends. The spider web of social relations has served functions which have not only contributed socially to the farm compound residents but it has also enhanced them economically in different and diverse ways. These strong social ties which have rarely been studied or empirically understood in dominant literature have contributed and shaped the farm compounds as we understand them today. They have played important roles in ensuring that they remain in existence and are in a gradual process of reproducing themselves in response to changing dispensations and environments in the farming areas. A new phenomenon which was noted was that the families of the new farmers and the people whom they brought with them after being allocated land are also becoming part of this social system usually through marriages.

Social stratification was also seen as being quite evident in the farming compounds. Ones location on the social ladder was reported as being based on one’s position at the farms basing on seniority at work, the closeness of a farm worker to the farm owner, age, marital status, access to resources, standard of living and one’s membership and hierarchy in a traditional, religious or any social institution. The social class which residents in the farm compound were seen as having was not only restricted to the household head but it tended to extend to that particular individual’s household as well. An example of the existence social stratification is shown by farm compound residents at Gilnockie farm who referred to some household members and individuals on the farm as vana vaatoromani (children of the foreman), mwana waadriver (child of the driver), amupurisa (the police – referring to farm security),
ashoot bhoyi (shoot boy). These terms although at first appeared to us outsiders as derogatory were in fact acceptable and quite respectable to the farm compound residents themselves. The social classes in the farm compounds were seen to be closely linked to kinship and social ties which were seen as being quite prevalent in the farm compounds and they were quite fluid and always in a continuous process of changing and reproducing themselves. Some respondents indicated that these social classes which are found in the farming compounds are a major source of antagonism and contestation as there is a lot of competition by the residents themselves to achieve high social status at the workplace and at home and the situation is further complicated by kinship ties with no-one wanting to be of low social status or low class.

Respondents who participated in focus group discussions indicated that these close knit social ties help the farm compound residents in various ways which include:

- Assisting each other to secure employment. This is especially important as some farmers rely on informal social networks to find the best and affordable workers and a word of recommendation of one farm worker can be used as the basis for the farmers to call someone and assess their suitability for employment or to perform a certain task.

- As a social support system and as a means for social protection. In instances of sickness, bereavement, food shortages among other calamities, these communities support each other in numerous ways. This has been in a context where some of them were migrants with their relatives and communities far away which made it impossible to support those facing challenges and in such instances, support has come from the farm compound communities.

- Supporting, sustaining and preserving cultural identities.

- Developing individual identities at a physical, social and intellectual level.

- The farm compounds were seen a presenting a united front for the workers which they could utilise in instances when they felt that they were being unfairly treated by farmers. Some examples were given on farms were workers had used the farm compounds as a base and symbol of resistance to forced labour and evictions by the new farmers especially in the early days of the FTLRP and such actions were made stronger by social and kinship ties.

As indicated above, farm compounds are seen as important social institutions which embody traditions, cultures and religions of the people. Cultures and religions are an important part of African societies and the study on the role and importance of the farm compounds in the aftermath of the FTLRP sought to understand the social relationships that exist in the new farming areas which are based on cultures and religions. As stated earlier, the farm compounds house residents of diverse origins but the majority share common ancestry and traditions of which those of the Chewa and Nyanja people were seen as being the majority. These residents indicated that they share the same traditions and cultural practices and despite being far away from their original homes in Zambia, Mozambique and Malawi they have kept their traditions alive on the farm compounds. To them the farm compound is a sanctuary where they are able to freely practice their traditions and religions which they see as having some features and practices which are incompatible with their ways of doing things. The cultures of these farm compound residents are said to have been passed from generation to generation and it was indicated
that there are no changes to these cultures which still remain very similar to practices held by communities in rural Malawi, Mozambique and Zambia. These cultures are shown by the way in which farm compound residents practice their burial rites, marriages, practices during pregnancy and childbirth, initiation rites into adulthood among other practices.

One of the most common, frightening, secretive and most misunderstood religious and traditional practice which was encountered on most of the farming compounds which has continued to exist after the FTLRP is that of the nyao dancers or nyao groups who trace their origins from Zambia and Malawi. Farm compound residents especially those of foreign descent and those who at some stage been members of the nyao groups view the nyao as serving important societal functions as they are important for rituals and traditional purposes and they associate the dancers with issues of spirituality. Ordinary societal members however indicated that for them the nyao groups are for recreation and entertainment purposes while others who said ‘tiri vanhu vanonamata’ (we are people who pray) saw the groups as evil secret societies which practise black magic and witchcraft.

During the fieldwork three important leaders of the nyao groups named the Chairperson of the Dunstan Nyao Dance Club, the Leader of the Gule waMkulu based at Alymersfield farm and the Leader of MusuwoNyao divulged some information on the nyao groups who are a very common feature on the farms. These leaders of the nyao dancers indicated that their societies are sacred hence they do not give out information about their activities as this is sacred and doing so is ‘dangerous.’ Membership to the nyao groups was said to be a lifelong commitment and if one wanted to join they were supposed to bring a chicken with them and have ‘sponsors’ from members of the nyao group who would vouch for the suitability and character of that prospective member to join. The rituals which were performed to the prospective member were said to be sacred but were said to be by no means easy as they involved beating here and there to strengthen the member’s character and ascertain their commitment to join the group. Traditional medicine was also given to the prospective member and its aim was to strengthen the heart of the member and to make sure that the particular member would never divulge the secrets of the group and doing so would result in misfortune and death.

Membership of the nyao groups is mainly made up of residents from the farm compounds and at face value their activities comprise of dancing to the drum wearing masks while women, men and children sing along during different occasions. For the leaders of the nyao groups however, it is more than wearing masks and dancing. They view it as a dance spiritual which has deep meanings and significance which cannot be understood by non-members. The nyao leaders indicated that the nyao dancers are an important part of the farm compounds and one cannot speak of farm compounds and the history of these compounds without referring to the nyao groups. The dancers perform at funerals, memorial services, initiations, marriages among other important social functions. Increasingly these groups are performing at commercial and social events and not only in the farm compounds. The nyao groups have a ranking system in place with members wearing the masks according to seniority and
personal preferences. For one to understand the ways and roles one needs to understand the traditions and customs of the Chewa and Nyanja people.

For the residents of the farm compounds, the nyao groups despite their controversies are seen as important as safeguarding the people’s cultures, they provide a connection between the people and the ancestors and they are a place where the young are taught their history, traditions and roots. Physical beatings which are at times ordered by the leaders act as a means to ensure adherence and discipline to acceptable social behaviour. Acceptable societal norms and values are seen as being transmitted through these groups which also provide entertainment and recreation. The nyao groups are thus a prominent feature in the new farming areas which have continued to exist in the aftermath of the FTLRP. The old large scale commercial farmers had gradually over the years accepted the groups as an integral part of the people’s culture but some of the new farmers expressed reservations on the groups which they viewed as ‘demonic’ and as disrupting their farming activities. Thus, there was a seemingly cultural clash between farm compound residents who believe in the nyao and the new farm owners with the nyao leaders saying that some of the new farmers had attempted to ban the dancers but had met with resistance.

Religions like Christianity and the Islam are practised in the farm compounds with Christianity seemingly becoming more popular among the younger generation while a few of the older generation are Muslims. Most of the Muslims in the farm compounds were not very visible preferring to practice their religion in a seemingly private manner as opposed to their Christian counterparts who were witnessed publicly worshipping through conducting open air services and church crusades at different farms during different periods at the farms across Goromonzi. These religions are seen to be playing an important role in teaching good moral values, norms and practices and ensuring social cohesion by strengthening social relationships and personal responsibility by individual residents of the farm compounds. This according to the Apostle of the Royal Priesthood in Goromonzi South (field interview held on 19 September 2015) is achieved through teachings on praying, fasting, reading the word of God and works of charity). In terms of Christianity, most of the residents indicated that they are either members of the apostolic church, the new and flamboyant Pentecostal churches or the old traditional church’s. Religion has always been an important part of the farm compounds traditionally with the old commercial farmers allowing the farm workers to have freedom of worship as long as it did not interfere with their agricultural activities and in the majority of cases these farmers are reported as availing their buildings for use by churches like the Anglican and Catholic churches on Sundays. The majority of the new farmers did not seem to have a problem with farm compound residents practising their religions. The relationship between these church’s and farmers has been strengthened by the strong relationship between the church’s and the ruling elite in the country whom they have supported over the past years more so especially on the issue of repossessing the land. These apostolic churches are very popular to residents of farm compounds and during the study it was noted that a huge number of residents as well as farmers belong to these church’s whose members are distinctive in their white and red gowns.
Economic and Political Issues Surrounding Farm Compounds

The study undertaken in Goromonzi District showed that the farm compounds exhibit interesting dynamics as they show interplay between economic and political issues. In addition to their role as being critical in the agrarian structures of Zimbabwe, the farm compounds showed that they are an important economic centre in the new farming communities. This is due to the fact that not only do they provide labour on the farms but they are an important part of the rural economy and farm compound residents engage in various economic activities both on and off the farms. They are a market for both agricultural and non-agricultural products and they engage in legal and illegal economic activities like gold panning, farming, brick moulding, firewood cutting, animal poaching, and sand poaching among other activities which provide them with incomes. This engagement in illegal activities has tended to result in conflicts and physical confrontations between farm compound residents and farm owners. The farm compound residents provide a market for agricultural and non-agricultural products and merchants have exploited this market by setting up stores and beer halls in the farming communities which target farm compound residents. Traders usually bring their goods into the farm compounds and sell them there for cash, credit or as barter exchange. Farm compound residents were also shown to be active customers for major wholesalers were they purchase goods in bulk and they are also traders in their own right. The households that are found in the farm compounds are seen to undertake productive activities in their own right which are separate from the mainstream farm level agricultural production system and they are quite effective in generating income and supporting the rural economy and they are seen to be active in creating a functional economic linkage between the rural economy in the farming areas and the larger regional and national economy.

In addition to economic issues, farm compounds are also affected a lot by issues of politics. As stated earlier farm compounds have traditionally been viewed with suspicion politically due to the perceived alliance which farm workers are seen as having had with the former large scale commercial farmers, the trade unions opposed to the post-colonial Zimbabwe government. They are seen as supporting opposition political parties in the country especially the MDC whom the ruling ZANU (PF) party believed that the farm workers were sympathetic to. During the FTLRP process the farm compounds were areas of intense emotional and physical confrontations which sometimes erupted in violence due to political allegiances. The farm workers and old large scale commercial farmers were perceived to be a threat to the ruling party such that legislative enactments like the Citizenship Amendment Act of 2001 which banned dual citizenship and disenfranchised thousands of Zimbabweans from participating in the electoral processes until they had renounced their foreign citizenships. This was seen as just one of the many examples which show the political contestations around farm workers. The perception of the State towards farm workers has in the long term shaped the general political perceptions of Zimbabwean society towards farm workers as opposed to state sponsored reforms.

In the aftermath of the FTLRP, the farm compounds are areas of much political contestation especially given that the majority of farm owners are members of the ZANU (PF) party and most feel bound to support the party as it gave them land hence they are not tolerant of opposition supporters on their
farms. The need to politically control the farm compounds and to shut out opposition political parties has seen ZANU (PF), the powerful Committees of Seven which are found on the farms and the Zimbabwe National Liberation War Veterans Association setting up cells and branches in the new farming areas with residents of the farm compounds making up the membership. Intense political mobilisation is periodically undertaken involving farm compound residents and in most cases attendance to rallies and membership to the ruling party in enforced. Engaging or being sympathetic to the opposition political parties can result in victimisation or forced eviction and the farm compounds have become an integral part of the political system in rural Zimbabwe. Participants in focus group discussions indicated that this the poor relationship between the residents and the ruling party and its affiliates had a negative effect on the farm workers. Firstly, they said that in terms of programmes like the Presidential Well-wishers Input Scheme or the free input scheme by the Ministry of Agriculture and Agricultural Development which provides agricultural inputs each year they were usually side-lined with preference being given to new farmers and communal farmers. They usually were not seen as deserving for Public Assistance or Public Works Programmes as it was said that they were not vulnerable or having labour constrained households hence they were not enrolled to receive assistance. They felt that this was being done despite the fact that there were some people including the elderly and orphans who needed assistance but this was not happening because of soured relations with the ruling party. Lastly, they felt that the relationship which was usually strained had contributed and was still contributing to them being side-lined in resettlement processes with very few of them being considered. For them these examples showed the relationship which exists between them, the ruling party and the government and it depicts the prevailing relations in the aftermath of the FTLRP.

Conclusion
Farm compounds can thus be seen as providing interesting dynamics characterising the emergent rural landscape which has come about due to the FTLRP. They are shown to be representing some important features of the rural landscape in Zimbabwe which is made up of unique agrarian power relations and social stratification which has resulted in the emergence of diverse social classes. They show contestations over resource use and space as well as interesting socio-economic and political realities which are now evident in the aftermath of the FTLRP. The farm compounds are shown to be persistent and important in the new dispensation and have evolved with the changing times to remain relevant in the aftermath of the FTLRP. They have become sites of social solidarity, social reproduction, production, culture, tradition and are an important site for resources which has boosted agriculture in rural Zimbabwe. The FTLRP has not destroyed the farm compound system but it the farm compounds remain as an integral and indispensable part of the rural landscape in the country serving important functions and contributing to some of the successes which the new generation of farmers is shown to be enjoying as their lives have been positively transformed after gaining access to land.

References


Governance of Land in South Africa and the Fallacious Bantustan Urbanisation

Johannes Tsheola\textsuperscript{1} and Olga Makhudu\textsuperscript{2}

Abstract: Land governance has historically been contested due to its intricate connections with occupancy and settlement. For Africa, the latter phenomena have involved emotive issues of colonialism and land expropriation that came to define the access to means of capitalist production and/or absence thereof. For this reason, Africa is now synonymous with the ironic continent of mineral and biodiversity wealth amidst millions of socially excluded and impoverished people. Theoretically, the concept of extraverted subjugation invokes the idea of Africans themselves participating in the use of land resources in discriminatory ways that perpetuated enduring societal inequalities. In tribal societies, whose land governance was defined by traditional authority, such contestations have tended to be deep and volatile as part of the specific breed of accumulation and, to a large extent, capitalist development. The paper argues that land governance in a democratic South Africa’s tribal non-urban settlements has simultaneously sustained the old standing fallacious Bantustan urbanisation. Populations therein, largely Black Africans, have remained estranged from territorial, socio-economic and substantive land ownerships. The persistence of communal tenure system has meant that the populations in tribal non-urban settlements would be denied access to four of the seven basic institutions of democracy, which are: access to alternatives, independent sources of information, autonomous associations and inclusive citizenship. To this extent, the paper concludes that the state has abrogated its constitutional mandate of ensuring that the right to substantive land ownership is realised by all, especially the Black Africans. The paper recommends that the communal landholding system needs to be reconstructed because it serves to deny the majority of Black Africans their fundamental rights to territorial, socio-economic and substantive land ownership.

Keywords: Governance, Land, Localism, Tribal Settlement, South Africa

Introduction

Land dispossession in South Africa has had enduring impacts, rendering the indigenous populations denationalised in sophisticated ways that encompassed the politics of race, economics and, recently, democracy (Ramutsindela, 2017; Rutherford, 2017). Generally, access to land has remained a “pressing concern for citizens and states” in the global South (Lombard & Rakodi, 2016: 2683). Land governance in Africa has, for example, played a key role in the acceleration of the investment in land and natural resources in the recent decades (Cotula, 2013 cited in Rutherford, 2017). Consequently,

\textsuperscript{1} Authors would like to acknowledge and appreciate research funding provided by the National Research Foundation.

\textsuperscript{1} Department of Development Planning and Management, University of Limpopo, South Africa.
Email: Johannes.tsheola@ul.ac.za

\textsuperscript{2} Department of Development Planning and Management, University of Limpopo, South Africa
Email: Corresponding Author: olga.makhudu@ul.ac.za
land governance and ownership have remained contentious, over 20 years in a democratic South Africa. Whereas the notion of land dispossession being “the primary root of poverty” (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994; Mamabolo & Tsheola, 2017; Steel, van Noorloos & Klaufus, 2017) continues to be in currency even in public discourse, the National Development Plan’s stated drivers of transformation do not include it (see National Development Commission, 2013). Ironically, the advent of the democratisation experimentation in South Africa has meant that a large section of the population, predominantly Black Africans, came to genuinely expect land reform for both “political and economic reasons” (Letsoalo, 1994: 204). As Rutherford (2017: 240) puts it, Africa has since at least 2000 attracted increasing interest “for land investment by companies, investment funds, governments, and national elites due to a confluence of wider economic pressures, policy openings, environmental changes, and political conditions”.

There is, therefore, convergence on the notion that governance has become the “lodestone for policy analyses and scholarly attention to land investments in Africa” (Rutherford, 2017: 245). Indeed, the increased investment in Africa’s land and natural resources is characterised by its critics as “land grab” through formalities of governance (Rutherford, 2017). The participation of state “structures of authority and power” in the definition of landownership rights and claims thereto, especially in the borderlands which are sites of peace parks, is viewed as the legitimation of “land grab” or “theft” (Ramutsindela, 2017; Rutherford, 2017). The Honest Accounts reports that Africa’s people should be thriving and its economies prospering (Curtis & Jones, 2017); yet, the continent has remained in the grip of poverty, especially among sections of the population living in tribal non-urban settlements. African scholars have historically searched for understanding and explanations for “what is often derided as the African crisis” (Ramutsindela, 1999: 180). There is universal acceptance that Africa’s social, economic and political problems are partly explicable through colonial governance institutions, structures and legacies (Ramutsindela, 1999, 2017), which placed race and ethnicity at the centre of societal existence (Desai, Maharaj & Bond, 2011). To be precise, land ownership has been at the centre of the construction of colonial and apartheid estrangement (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994; Ramutsindela, 1999, 2017; Desai et al., 2011). For this reason, Mbongwa (1994: 221) asserts that “land ownership can help bring about a new rural order”. However, land governance has continued to be delusional for former colonies because it consists of both territorial and socio-economic possessions, which do not automatically accord the holders substantive land ownership. This paper examines landownership categories and types in a democratic South Africa in order to present it as a democratic mechanism for the perpetuation of the fallacious Bantustan urbanisation.

**Governance of Land Ownership: Interface of Localism and Communalism in Democracy**

As Samuels (1978 cited in Johnston, Gregory & Smith, 1994: 176) puts it, the struggle against estrangement is in essence about spatial ontology, which is “a history of human efforts to overcome or eliminate detachment … through the creation of meaningful … ‘authored’ places”. The question is
whether struggles of the populations in a democratic South Africa’s tribal non-urban settlements against estrangement have created “meaningful authored places” within which detachment could be overcome? This paper draws from three broad ontological meta-theoretical traditions of classical empiricism, transcendental idealism and transcendental realism in order to “understand and explain” the land governance through which tribal non-urban settlement populations in a democratic South Africa remain excluded from substantive land ownership. Social reality is indeed complex and land provides the backdrop for its manifestation. To this extent, understanding and explaining land governance requires integration of knowledge for ontological depth. The search for the latter in a context of a social world of extraverted existence and estrangement of citizens as objects entails cognitive depth. This paper is seeking for understanding and explanation of the imposition of democratic dispensation over tribal non-urban settlements with localised traditional institutions created as fallacious Bantustan urbanity wherein democratic regimes have sought to transform through western-grown land reform governance. For this reason, the paper insinuates that the democratic land governance in South Africa perpetuates the land estrangement through the fallacious Bantustan urbanisation.

Democratic Governance and Africa
The tensions of modern and traditional governance systems play out within localities of tribal non-urban settlements in a democratic South Africa. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (RSA, 1996) provides for the right to property ownership in section 25. However, tribal authority ownership structures have made the realisation of the ideals of land reform virtually unachievable in South Africa. It is fact that democratic practices were first applied in towns and cities where the “basic democratic institution was ... the citizen assembly” (Dahl, 2001: 3407), implying that non-urban settlements have always lagged behind in terms of lived experiences of democratic principle. It is tenable to question the existence of “access to alternatives”, “independent sources of information”, “autonomous associations” and “inclusive citizenship” within tribal non-urban settlements in a “democratic” South Africa. That is, manifestations of four of the seven basic political institutions of democracy in tribal non-urban settlements is questionable. Therefore, vexed questions need to be framed, among which it has to be asked: Are South Africa’s localised political institutions adequately democratic in the context of the sections of the population living in the tribal non-urban settlements? But democracy has never been perfectly democratic in terms of its fundamental criteria and basic institutions, especially those operational at the local scale. The situation has been worse for Africa. But states could be accepted as democratic if they accorded full citizenship to all adults with entitlements to “all the rights and opportunities” (Dahl, 2001: 3406). To be precise, there are fundamental and difficult questions to be addressed when democracy is applied to the state and the politics of land (Dahl, 2001), especially when private interests predominate in land investments in the global South (Lombard & Rakodi, 2016; Rutherford, 2017; Steel et al., 2017).

Increasing number of African states have flirted with a variety of democratic experimentations during the 21st century (Tsheola, 2017). The question that remained unresolved is about the localities wherein the principles of democracy have to be lived and experienced. To understand and explain the localism
of land governance in tribal non-urban settlements in a democratic South Africa, it is imperative to examine the idea and practice of democracy as well as the emergence of representative institutions that came to shape it over time (Dahl, 2001). From its Greek origins, democracy came to be universally understood as “people rule” or “rule by the people” (Dahl, 2001: 3405). However, democracy has been used variously and, at times, in contradictory fashion wherein “citizens” had no right to decision-making and institutions of governance; and, tribal non-urban settlements in South Africa are not an exception to the norm.

Localities in South Africa are places wherein ethnicity and tribalism play out in discriminatory ways that cause societal estrangement. But Section 25(5) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa “orders the state to take reasonable legislative and other measures, within its available resources, to put in place conditions which will enable the citizens to gain access to land on an equitable basis” (Mamabolo&Tsheola, 2017: 162). Importantly, section 25(6) “obliges the state to address insecure land tenure of the people and communities” caused by apartheid institutional regimes (Republic of South Africa, 1996; Mamabolo&Tsheola, 2017: 162). The process of land redress in the global South was never destined to be smooth sailing in tribal non-urban settlements, largely due to the governance imperatives of communal land and traditional authority regimes (Ramutsindela, 2017; Rutherford, 2017; Steel et al., 2017). For countries steeped in tradition such as South Africa, “Chieftaincy has been bureaucratised and many policies were made with their connivance - betterment planning, forced removals, and Bantustan independence” (Letsoalo, 1994: 205). That is, the political-economy of tribal non-urban settlements was historically constructed through localised extraversion of the traditional authorities; and, this paper asserts that the sustenance of the status quo under the democratic dispensation is inextricably linked to the persistence of communal landholding governance and the apartheid “spatial fix”. But there is common acceptance that transformation in South Africa could be achieved through land redress, after years of colonialism, segregation and apartheid estrangement (Mamabolo&Tsheola, 2017). The post-apartheid state has, however, created a fallacy of land reform especially in relation to the sustenance of communal land in tribal non-urban settlements, wherein territorial, socio-economic and substantive land ownerships were tacitly made improbable. Unsurprisingly, Letsoalo (1994: 216) concludes that “… there are no success stories in the developing countries, when the most productive land has remained in the hands of a few wealthy farmers, or when peasants and rural workers have had no say over their own destiny”. To this extent, democratic experimentation in Africa has instilled popular hope about the transformative qualities of land governance and societal progress, inclusive of sections of the population resident in remote non-urban settlements.

Democratic dispensation in South Africa has appeared to install reflexivity in land governance, under the rubric of land reform, in order to accommodate persistence of the old tribal non-urban settlements political-economy order and/or disorder. Mamabolo&Tsheola (2017:154) corroborate the notion that the broader political-economy of governance is inherently biased against poor communities within localities of tribal non-urban settlements in South Africa. Hence, this country’s over 20 years of trotting with land
reform has remained contested, agitating for public discontent (Bennett, 2013; Mamabolo&Tsheola, 2017). The Department of Land Affairs has “managed land on behalf of the rural communities in tribal settlements” (Mamabolo&Tsheola, 2017: 161). However, communal land ownership structures continue to be afflicted with disputes, which Loate (2014: 2) blames on alleged “ignorance of traditional councils, absence of skills of the CPA members, lack of institutional support, dearth of operating capital and poor information management”. The interface of communal land ownership structures and democratic dispensation in localism has created protracted challenges for land reform. On its part, Communal Property Associations Act, 28 of 1996 “places undue emphasis on western-grown corporate models of registration, at the expense of tribal customs of land tenure” (Mamabolo&Tsheola, 2017: 162). Communal Land Rights Act, 11 of 2004 provides for “legal security of tenure” as a way of giving pragmatic effect to the provisions of section 25(6) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. It purportedly seeks to transfer communal land to ownership of deserving citizens. In reality, the majority of populations in tribal non-urban settlements continue to be deprived of land ownership and security of tenure as well as access to some basic institutions of democracy due to the interface of communal tenure, localised tribal authority and national democratic governance institutions.

For this reason, a democratic South Africa presents vivid tales that attest to the governance challenges on land, occasioned by colonialism and perpetrated by apartheid and, currently, sustained through democratisation experimentation over traditional authority cultures. The underlying discourse about land reform in South Africa is reflective of “the politics of local knowledges and their associated regimes of truth” described as ethnocentrism (Johnston et al., 1994: 69). Over 20 years after 1994, South Africans in the tribal non-urban settlements continue to engage the struggle against estrangement from land ownership, being situated in the middle of nowhere away from both rurality and urbanity. Land reform legislative framework in South Africa does not have the capability to redress historical discrepancies within “tribal settlement communities” (Erlank, 2014 cited in Mamabolo&Tsheola, 2017: 162) because it does not address the primary challenges of land governance (Bennett, 2013; Loate, 2014). Therefore, Mamabolo&Tsheola (2017:164) concur that “the shift from government to governance” has reinserted the “same old lines in the sand of a racialised spatiality of land reform inequities at the expense of tribal settlements” populations in South Africa. As a result, “the notion that the broader political-economy of governance of land reform in a democratic South Africa is inherently biased against poor communities at the local scale of rural tribal settlements” (Mamabolo&Tsheola, 2017: 164) has gained traction. It is tenable, as Mamabolo&Tsheola (2017: 164) put it, that “a democratic South Africa’s land reform institutional frameworks together with the liberationist constitutional governance have merely papered over the longstanding political-economy inequities that were founded on racial spatialisation”. The perpetuation of the fallacy of Bantustan urbanisation under democracy cannot be tenable dismissed for tribal non-urban settlements.

**Land Governance, Categories Holding and Types of Ownership**

Land governance in southern Africa has had enduring impacts, rendering the indigenous populations denationalised in sophisticated ways that encompassed the politics of race, economics and, recently,
democracy. Land governance continues to be “the primary root of poverty” (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994; Rutherford, 2017; Steel et al., 2017). Land ownership has been at the centre of the construction of colonial and apartheid estrangement (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994; Ramutsindela, 1999, 2017; Desai et al., 2011). But democratic land governance has continued to be delusional for former colonies because it consists of both territorial and socio-economic possessions, which do not automatically accord the holders substantive land ownership.

The relationships of the categories and types of landownership explains the possibility of the exercise of governance formalities wherein communal “land grabbing” takes place in service of private capital interests. In this process, the state legalises and legitimises “land grabbing” and appropriation of natural resources (Alden Wily, 2012; Apostolopoulou & Adams, 2015; Ramutsindela, 2017). In so doing, the state alienates land and natural resources through the so-called “control grabbing” (Ramutsindela, 2017). Through “control grabbing”, land investments actively legitimises and legalises alienation of state and communal land for speculation whilst simultaneously situating freehold lands for continuation of private land rights (Alden Wily, 2012; Barros, C.P., Chivangue, A. & Samagaio, A, 2014; Apostolopoulou & Adams, 2015; Ramutsindela, 2017). Accordingly, Ramutsindela & Noe (2012) note that states exploit the “trusteeship of communal land and the ambiguity of rights” over such land, with the appearance of being local citizens managed. According to Ramutsindela (2017), the expansion of peace parks in southern Africa has, for example, progressed largely through state alienation of land rights. Hence, Ramutsindela (2017: 111) frames the practice of the state undermining the communal land rights in the creation of peace parks as “legalised ‘theft’”.

From a political ecology perspective, Ramutsindela (2017: 107) examines the “political and economic processes affecting control, ownership, access and use of natural resources, including land”, to point to “land grabbing”. According to Ramutsindela (2017: 111), “Freehold land is generally known as an enabler of investment and as a collateral asset” to the extent that private holding rights are preserved. As Samuels (1978 cited in Johnston et al., 1994: 176) puts it, the struggle against estrangement is in essence about spatial ontology, which is “a history of human efforts to overcome or eliminate detachment … through the creation of meaningful … ‘authored’ places”. The question is whether struggles of the populations in Southern Africa against estrangement have created “meaningful authored places” within which detachment could be overcome? Reading from Leftwich (2004: 14), Ramutsindela (2017: 110) asserts that politics of land manifest in issues of “power, control, decision-making and resource allocation”. From this positioning, Ramutsindela (2017: 110) pronounces that “Dichotomies of land tenure regime in Africa arise from the colonial allocation of property rights and the inability of post-independent states to radically transform agrarian and land relations”. For this reason, democratic land governance in the global South has instead served to perpetuate the old status quo on land ownership and rights to determine use.
Substantive Land Ownership versus Enstrangement and De-nationalisation in Africa

Land ownership is crucial to human existence in that it allows for settlement and access to resources (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994; Ramutsindela, 1999, 2017; Rutherford, 2017; Steel et al., 2017). For South Africa, as has been for the rest of the world,

“Land reforms are changes of land ownership and occupation rights with the aim of changing the distribution of income, social status and political power structures.... It is an instrument of human rights and social justice” (Letsoalo, 1994: 203).

In South Africa, though, landownership became starkly racialized wherein “whites had exclusive rights to freehold land” and blacks being largely “confined to communally held land” (Ramutsindela, 2017: 110). Thus, it is imperative to examine the categories and attendant types of landownership in South Africa. Respectively, there are three categories (state, freehold and communal land) and three types (territorial, socio-economic and substantive) of landownership (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994; Ramutsindela, 2017).

Territorial and socio-economic land possession “confers the right to a stream of benefits to citizens of a country whilst member states of the international community respect the conditions which govern the protection of such benefits” (Mbongwa, 1994: 221). The increased interest in land investment in Africa through the invisible hand of the state mediate these types of land ownership for insertion into financial intermediation. Protection of the benefits from territorial land ownership are “institutionalised in the constitution, legislation, courts of law, organs of government, social structures and economic systems” whereas socio-economic land ownership “invests the bearer with the right to the flows of benefits of land usage within a country” (Mbongwa, 1994: 222). Territorial land ownership is the precondition for access to socio-economic land ownership. Within the socio-economic land ownership, resides the potential for substantive land ownership implying differentiation through “size of land owned, land productivity, land value, number of farm lands owned, distribution of land owned, land type, technology of land usage, location of land, and land use” (Mbongwa, 1994: 222). Where territorial land ownership is a necessary condition for substantive land ownership to be realised, socio-economic land ownership is a sufficient condition. The absence of territorial land ownership is equivalent to the denial of access to land rights. The majority of the population do not have territorial land ownership largely due to the prominence of the state, public and/or communal land (Ramutsindela, 2017; Rutherford, 2017).

According to Ramutsindela (2017: 111), communal landownership is not only complex, but it “takes multiple forms that range from public tenure to local control by the resource users themselves”; and, it is often understood as “open access or as a common-pool resource” available for use by multiple actors. In this way, communal landownership is often treated in practice as state land with “competing jurisdictions” wherein land rights are “held under customary law and usufruct arrangements” (Ramutsindela, 2017: 111). Unlike communal and state lands, freehold land rights “are protected by domestic and international laws” (Ramutsindela, 2017) and this arrangement has been a feature of almost all democratisation experimentations in southern Africa. As the states violate the communal and
public land rights and protects the freehold land rights, the net effect has been to establish conditions for privatism and neoliberalism.

Land ownership is crucial to human existence in that it allows for settlement and access to resources (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994; Ramutsindela, 1999, 2017; Lombard & Rakodi, 2016; Rutherford, 2017; Steel et al., 2017). The current discriminatory rural economic structure of bantustanisation in South Africa was created through specific governance of land ownership. Hence, “the new rural economy” (Mbongwa, 1994: 225) could be created through substantive transformation of land ownership. However, land ownership for its own sake will remain inadequate; and, the Community Property Association (CPA) model within tribal non-urban settlements has not dented the prominent communal land tenure system.

**Governance and Decision-making Powers**

Geographic scales have always presented a dilemma in democracy, especially in African countries such as South Africa where colonialism and apartheid created a “spatial fix” of Bantustans. Whereas smaller geographic units could provide the greatest opportunities for participation in self-governance, nation-state jurisdiction and institutional frameworks create additional difficulties for localities, especially in environments of tribal non-urban settlements. Hence, local political institutions have become a novel imperative for operationalising state democracies. Tacitly, governance determines through specific institutions, inclusive of the democratic, variable access to substantive land ownership. According to Thondhlana, Shackleton & Blignaut (2015: 121), local institutions allow for “more effective decision-making in the management of and access” to land by mediating “participation in decision-making, information dissemination, transparency, trust and accountability, power relations, divergent interests and unequal access”. Appropriate local institutions of governance can ensure that democracy is inclusive of multiple actors.

A pertinent question need to be asked: Do traditional authorities hold decisional, discursive or regulator power? Decisional power refers to “policy making and political influence”, discursive power involves “the framing of discourses”; and, regulatory power is about “rule-making and institution building” (Arts, 2003: 13 cited in Buscher & Dietz, 2005: 5). Tribal non-urban settlement actors “do not command any of these capabilities” (Mamabolo & Tsheola, 2017: 159). At the national scale in South Africa, ingredients of successful governance are constantly being retorted; and, they are: inclusivity; fairness; participation and legitimacy, transparency and accountability (Thondhlana _et al._, 2015; Mamabolo & Tsheola, 2017). In reality, all these ingredients are not experienced at the local scales of most tribal non-urban settlements in South Africa. Indigenous populations, exclusively resident in tribal non-urban settlements, have largely been excluded from substantive land ownership and their “colonial status was also left intact and was continued under the Union and Republic of South Africa” (Mbungwa, 1994: 222). Historically, “state power and public institutions” were used in South Africa to create the rural economy structure that excluded the indigenous populations from access of territorial and/or socio-economic land ownership.
Non-urban Settlements: The Fallacy of Bantustan Urbanisation in South Africa

In South Africa where land reform policies came to be overshadowed by concerns with food security and reconciliation, the majority of the population in tribal non-urban settlements have remained alienated and estranged from land ownership and agricultural activities, consistent with the apartheid-created fallacy of functional “Bantustan urbanisation” under liberal democracy. The sense of urbanised former Bantustans has impaired the potential for productive land reform with a measure of permanency, because localised institutions of traditional authority have come to instil discipline for top-down control. Bantustan populations were denied the opportunity to farm by “being uprooted from large fertile lands” (Letsoalo, 1994: 206) and being fallaciously urbanised. That is, “Bantustan urbanisation” was a functional fallacy created with the process of agricultural deskillling (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994). To this extent, a perception was created that “Bantustan populations are functionally urbanised and will not demand land for agriculture” (Graaf, 1990 cited in Letsoalo, 1994: 206). Indigenous populations were alienated from territorial land ownership primarily through the Native Land Act No 27 of 1913 (Mbongwa, 1994). Plaatjie (1982) shows that “African land rights within the reserves excluded private land ownership ...” (cited in Mbongwa, 1994: 224). Reserves consisted of about 7.78% of total land area by land tenure system in the Union of South Africa, which was 9 538 300 ha (Mbongwa, 1994). The size of the land in the reserves was increased in 1936 from 7.78% to 13.7% through the Native Trust and Land Act No 18 of 1936 (Mbongwa, 1994). The Native Administration Act of 1927 instigated further changes to the indigenous African land tenure systems by installing “the Governor General (State President) the ‘traditional’ Supreme Chief of African Chiefs, with overriding powers on African land matters” (Mbongwa, 1994: 225). The passing of this Act has meant that African Chiefs were reduced to virtual “government civil servants” (Mbongwa, 1994: 225). To understand and explain the territorialisation of tribalism in South Africa, it is imperative to briefly evaluate the interfaces of the concepts of tribe, culture, rurality, territory and settlement.

Tribe is defined as “a primitive social unit formed by the alliance of a number of smaller, mainly farming groups to further a common purpose”, and “it consists of a number of kingship groups bound together by common language and common rules of social organisation” (Goodall, 1987: 482). The phrase “farming group” is crucial in this regard. South Africa, especially within former Bantustan settlements, continue to be characterised by tribalism and apartheid-created “spatial fix”, which has instead eclipsed “farming” out of tribal non-urban settlement. The interface of tribe and territorial-boundedness has created spaces within localities that may not necessarily realise lived experiences of democracy in contemporary South Africa, largely due to the prominence of communal tenure and traditional authority systems. Without farming, tribes are virtually devoid of rights to territorial land. Territory is “a legally bounded space belonging to a sovereign state”, in terms of commonly received wisdom (Goodall, 1987: 468). In a behavioural context, inclusive of tribalism, territory would mean “spaces related to individuals, groups and their activities” (Goodall, 1987: 468), especially agriculture. The term rural, in this regard,
does not necessarily refer to non-urban settlements. According to Goodall (1987: 417), rural refers to “those parts of a country which show unmistakable signs of domination by extensive uses of land, either at the present time or in the immediate past”. The non-urban does embrace the purity of rurality as well as those settlements where “the domination of extensive (rural) uses over an area has lapsed … (and such) settlements still appear rural to the eye although … (they would) have become little more than an extension of the city …” (Goodall, 1987: 417). In its original meaning, settlement referred to the processes of “grouping-up and peopling (or colonising) of previously uninhabited or thinly populated area” (Goodall, 1987: 427). In time, the meaning mutated to embrace the socialisation of spaces such as in the tribalisation of territory and/or territorialisation of tribes. For many populations in tribal non-urban settlements, tribe has cemented itself as a key consideration of existence ahead of statehood.

Mamabolo & Tsheola (2017: 158) note that “Tribal settlements in South Africa consist of communities that are steeped with traditional and respect of traditional authority as subjects; and, the expectation that they could already participate in Western-grown democratic institutions implied that they could shed their culture, tradition, virtues, values and institutions overnight”. Given the effects of estrangement from agricultural activities, former reserves in South Africa continued as non-urban rather than rural settlements. South Africa’s tribal non-urban settlements are exclusively confined to the six “self-governing territories” of Gazankulu, KaNgwane, KwaNdebele, KwaZulu, Lebowa and Qwaqwa, as well as the four so-called TBVC independent states of Bophutatswana, Ciskei, Transkei and Venda (Letsoalo, 1994; Mbongwa, 1994). The specific tribal non-urban settlements are numerous, virtually covering the rest of the area of the former homelands, which consists of 13.7% of South Africa’s total land area, which is not large by any stretch of imagination.

Evidently, the creation of native reserves and then homelands formed the legal basis on which the fallacy of functional Bantustan urbanisation was established. Confinement of Black Africans to reserves reaffirmed territorialisation of tribalism and tradition in non-urban settlements. Paradoxically, apartheid capitalism too has sought to simultaneously thrive through the reserves, whilst undermining “tribal settlement traditions, value systems, virtues, and beliefs” (Mamabolo & Tsheola, 2017: 156). Populations in tribal non-urban settlements in South Africa are “tacitly excluded from the processes of modernisation and development, implying that when they access land, they are already locked into a subsistence, rather than commercial, mode of farming” (Mamabolo & Tsheola, 2017: 158). To this observation, it could be added that the tribal non-urban settlement populations are virtually excluded from access of some basic institutions of democracy, except for regular voting, official representation and freedoms of expression.

Paradoxes of Communality and Substantive Land Ownership in a Democratic South Africa

Tiffen (1996: 169) notes: “In relation to land, there is a tendency to romanticise common-property arrangements without serious effort to find out whether they are locally preferred by potential users and non-users, whether they complement individual land rights which may have already become established, or whether they are feasible within the local socio-political reality”. Indeed, “communal
tenure has administrative attractions, because it seems easier to control a few ‘traditional’ authorities than many individual owners (as evidenced in the former homelands of South Africa) …” (Tiffen, 1996: 169). Also, Tiffen (1996: 176) states that “Reluctance to accept the capacity of customary tenure arrangements to evolve dynamically, and the convenience of ‘communal’ control for the state, has also been manifested in other parts of Africa”. The sustenance of tradition in land reform under democracy was always going to deny citizens within specific localities some rights to territorial land ownership and access to democratic institutions. Described as “the sum total of the original solutions that a group of human beings invent to adapt to their natural and social environment”, culture is more complex (Verhelst, 1990: 17 cited in Treurnicht, 1997: 93). According to Aina (1989: 125 cited in Treurnicht, 1997: 93), culture involves “values or personality” as well as “the greater corpus of techniques, knowledge, models of social organisation, ideals and aspirations specific to a society, which is handed down and learned in each generation and enables a form of social life to take place”. Tacitly “culture is a resource for development” because “it conveys important information on the maintenance and adaptation of social systems to changing conditions” (Treurnicht, 1997: 94). Societal progress is therefore interlinked with culture; yet, South Africa’s land reform has its origins in western cultural local knowledges. Western democracy and development paradigms are equally cultural exports into Africa; and, it is not surprising that even after the abolishment of formal colonialism the continent has continued to witness increased proportions and severity of human sufferance and misery.

**Land, Race and Substantive Ownership in a Democratic South Africa**

A democratic South Africa is administratively organised into nine provinces, two of which are more metropolitan than otherwise; and, these are Gauteng and Western Cape. KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province are, conversely, dominated by non-urban populations and rurality. However, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape, Western Cape and Limpopo Province are, in descending order, the largest in terms of sheer population size (figure 1). Notwithstanding the intensification of urbanisation, the five provinces have uniformly experienced population increases between 2011 and 2016. In the era of globalisation and urbanisation, it is note worthy that KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province have equally experienced population increases, just as it had happened for metropolitan provinces Gauteng and Western Cape.
Apartheid construction has created covariation of spatiality with race. Whereas South Africa's total population is largely Back African, provinces are in general identifiable with concentrations of particular population groups. In fact, areas of former Bantustans are exclusively confined to KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape, Limpopo Province; and, to a lesser extend North West, Free State and Mpumalanga. The significance of Black Africans' concentrations in KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province have serious implications on land reform and governance in tribal non-urban settlements because poverty and estrangement from agricultural activities are deep and severe there. To this extent, the coincidence of poverty, estrangement from land ownership and provincial spatiality is suggestive of the elusiveness of territorial land ownership. It is in KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province where large tracks of land are in communal land tenure, inaccessible to the majority of the population, which is exclusively Back African.

However, the number of households has conversely decreased in KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province between 1996 and 2016 (figure 2). It is understandable that domestic migration from rural areas to urban areas in South Africa has been a household decision-making process involving the "economy of affection" wherein the survival of members in both places is intricately connected. In this regard, the increase in population of the three provinces at the same time as the number of households decline, is indicative of the continued attractions of Gauteng, which is the sole province that experienced pronounced increase in the number of households (figure 2). The drop in the number of households is pronounced in the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal, and less in Limpopo Province.
Given that the South African economy has continued to underperform in terms of job creation, with the result that 30.4 million South Africans, which is 55.5%, lived in poverty in 2015 (StatsSA, 2017), a rush away from land-based activities is paramount. That is, whereas households are drifting towards Gauteng, where land is scarce, the fallacy of Bantustan urbanisation has captivated the rest of South Africa, erroneously taking land out of the equation of socio-economic transformation. That effect is consistent with the failure of land reform. In terms of sheer land size, the semi-arid Northern Cape is the largest with a total land area of 361 830 square km (29.7%), followed by Eastern Cape at 169 580 square km (13.9%), Free State at 129 480 square km (10.6%), Western Cape at 129 370 square km (10.6%), Limpopo Province at 123 910 square km (10.2%), North West at 116 320 square km (9.5%), KwaZulu-Natal at 92 100 square km (7.6%), Mpumalanga at 79 490 square km (6.5%) and Gauteng at 17 010 square km (1.4%) (StatsSA, n.d). Being the smallest province in terms of land size, the attractions of Gauteng to households suggest that the use of land as a pillar of societal transformation has become elusive.

This observation is supported by the distribution of agricultural households and the types of lands used for agricultural activities. As it would be expected, notwithstanding the dominance of Gauteng Province in terms of the number and increase in households between 1996 and 2016 amidst declines in those for KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province over the same period, there are more agricultural households in KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province (figure 3). However, the total national numbers of agricultural households have decreased between 2011 and 2016, which is insensitive to South Africa’s economic slump during the same period (Watavire, 2017). During a slump, "business operations are struggling to keep and maintain a healthy balance sheet due to the tough economic environment" (Watavire, 2017: n.p.); and, investments are at their lowest, employment prospects are reduced and purchasing power declines, with a general economic downturn (Johnston,
1986; Orrell, 2010; Watavire, 2017). The trend of decreasing agricultural households in the three provinces that have historically housed tribal non-urban settlements with the fallacy of Bantustan urbanisation points to the failure of land reform and captivation with communal tenure, which collectively frustrated substantive territorial land ownership.

![Figure 3: Agricultural Households per Province, Census 2011 & Community Survey 2016](image)

Source: Statistics South Africa, 2016

There is indisputable evidence that agricultural households have generally decreased across South Africa at the same time during 2011 and 2016 as Gauteng experienced increase in the number of households, beyond all other provinces. The largest contributions to the decreasing number of agricultural households in South Africa are the same in three provinces of KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo (figure 4) that are expected to host the majority of land reform beneficiaries and usage of farmlands. This eventuality highlights the decreased reliance on land for societal progress. That is, land reform has failed to renew interest through a combination of territorial and substantive land ownership, especially in tribal non-urban settlements. To this extent, it would not be far-fetched to insinuate that the modern land reform within a democratic South Africa is essentially creating the same effect of a fallacy of Bantustan urbanisation as that under apartheid. An average of about 15% decrease in the number of agricultural households in five years is significant as it drifts against the land reform currency in a democratic South Africa.
Whereas it is understandable to have an overwhelming majority of households in Gauteng and Western Cape being non-agricultural, it is concerning to have a similar pattern of lesser agricultural households in KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province (figure 5). The fact that the same pattern is almost true in all the nine provinces to variable extents, should suggest that land has not been prioritised as the driver of societal transformation. With this situation, a deduction can be drawn to the effect that substantive land ownership is not promoted as the key driver of societal progress, which is not surprising as the National Development Plan 2030 Vision itself does not appear to adequately appreciate the value of land. This observation does not suggest that South African households are uninterested in agricultural activities; and, the types of lands that are used by active agricultural households are revealing.

In the rest of South Africa, an overwhelming majority of agricultural households are practicing in the backyard (figure 6). Farmland is at a distant second in terms of use by agricultural households, which raises questions of access and availability. In relative terms, usage of farmland for agricultural activities by households is prominent in Northern Cape, followed by Western Cape, North West and Free State. In KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province, the usage of farmland for agricultural activities by agricultural households is just above 5%.
The proportion of agricultural households using communal land is on average below 5% at the national level. Only in the Eastern Cape and Northern Cape does that measure approach 10% (figure 6). This pattern attests to the failure of communal landholding system and the constitutionally-mandated land reform. The struggles with land ownership in South Africa are far from over because they have continued to be racially evident. Whereas the practice of agricultural activities in the backyard is predominant among all the race groups, it is less so with the White population group (figure 7).
Reliance on backyard for agricultural activities is heavy among the Indian/Asian, Coloured and Black African population groups (figure 7). Whereas the usage of farmland is about 5% for both Black Africans and Indians/Asians, it approaches 10% and 38%, respectively, for Coloureds and Whites. Evidently, this measure demonstrates that territorial and socio-economic land ownership remains dominated by Whites, at the same time as communal tenure systems continue to be indifferent in terms of societal transformation. As already stated elsewhere, the fallacy of Bantustan urbanisation has continued to captivate former reserves, which are exclusively habited by Black Africans where landholdings are predominantly communal. Yet, usage of communal land by Back African agricultural households is about 5% as of 2016, suggesting that sustenance of the communal landholding in tribal non-urban settlements has reinvented the so-called fallacious Bantustan urbanisation. Conversely, the total number of Black Africans has increased significantly between 2011 and 2016, relative to that for other population groups (figure 8).
Evidently, the desire for democratisation and the attendant land redress for both political and economic motives has remained a pipedream for the majority of Black Africans, who had suffered the wrath of colonialism, segregation and apartheid land governance. The extraversion in tribal non-urban settlements through the land governance that subjects land reform to chieftaincy controls, based on the local institutions, amidst national democratic dispensation has meant that populations there are denied the rights to at least four of the seven basic institutions of democracy. Prospects of South Africa becoming highly unstable cannot be discounted in this environment where the proportion of Black Africans continues to increase whilst their access to land, which is supposed to be the key driver for societal transformation, continues to be undermined through the “spatial fix” of apartheid fallacy of Bantustan urbanisation and communal landholding tenure system. In the final analysis, Black Africans who have suffered the legacies of colonialism and apartheid continue to have no access to territorial, socio-economic and substantive land ownership amidst constitutionally-mandated rights and entitlements. The latter could potentially agitate for societal upheaval as the economic slump continues to exclude the majority of Black Africans who are migrating away from the estrangement perpetrated through the communal land ownership under traditional authority jurisdictions.

Conclusion
This paper has argued that substantive land ownership, which is predicated upon territorial and socio-economic ownerships, has not taken root in South Africa’s tribal non-urban settlements amidst constitutionally-guaranteed rights. It has demonstrated that communal landholding in tribal non-urban settlements has perpetuated the old fallacy of Bantustan urbanisation within the democratic institutional frameworks. Black Africans continue to be at the centre of sufferance of the failure of land reform from delivering territorial land ownership, which is a precondition for socio-economic and substantive land ownerships. At the core of the estrangement of Black Africans from land ownership, the paper argues,
is the dearth of progressive land governance within tribal non-urban settlements in a democratic South Africa. The paper concedes that land governance in a democratic South Africa is creating unsustainable futures. Populations in tribal non-urban settlements within KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape and Limpopo Province are increasing at the same time as households drift to Gauteng. On both sides, land is scarce. To this extent, the paper concludes that the state has abrogated its constitutional mandate of ensuring that the right to substantive land ownership is realised by all, especially the Black Africans. The paper recommends that the communal landholding system needs to be reconstructed because it serves to deny the majority of Black Africans their fundamental rights to territorial, socio-economic and substantive land ownership.

References


An Assessment of Community and Social Development Projects (CSDPs) on Beneficiaries in Damaturu Local Government Area of Yobe State - Nigeria (2009-2013)

M. Tasiu Dansabo¹ and M. Mustapha Gambo

Abstract: The study assessed the impact of community and social development projects (CSDPs) in Damaturu, (LGA) Yobe State - Nigeria (2009-2013). The study examined the effects of the intervention on the livelihood of beneficiaries. The specific objectives of the study are; to find out the impact of CSDP on the socio-economic status of the beneficiaries; to identify the impact of CSDP on accessibility of water to the beneficiaries. Empowerment theory was used as a theoretical framework for the study. The study was conducted in five communities that benefited from the intervention. The study population was identified and sample size of 380 was determined using sample size calculator. The instruments used to collect data from the sample were questionnaires for the community members and interview guide for chairmen of Community Project Management Committee (CPMC). The data collected were analysed using statistical tools i.e. descriptive and inferential statistics such as frequency distribution, percentage and chi-square to aid the quantitative analysis while the qualitative data were subjected to content analysis. From the analysis, the study found that the intervention had made positive impact on the lives of beneficiaries in terms of accessibility to social services and reduced people’s expenditure on water and education. The study also revealed that the intervention improve the learning environment to pupils in the study area. Based on the findings, it is recommended that government should try to improve access of social services to people, the study also calls on policy makers to discard top-down approach to community development and embrace bottom up approach.

Introduction

The World Bank Poverty Index reveals that about 1.2 billion people live below poverty line; majority of which are in developing countries where sub Saharan Africa has greater percentage of 48.5%, Europe and central Asia having least number of 0.7%, The Bank also ranked Nigeria third out of the five countries that have the largest number of the poor (World Bank, 2014). According to World Health Organization (WHO) only 32% of rural population in developing countries has access to safe drinking water (Aper and Agbehi, 2011). Khalid (2014) observed that, Nigeria is confronted with many developmental challenges particularly the rural communities where poverty, diseases, unemployment, inadequate social amenities are features of most of the communities.

Against this background, governments and non-governmental organizations embarked on policies and strategies to mitigate the situation in their societies. Kiprotich and Njoroge, (2014) observed that,

¹ Corresponding author’s Email: dansabo.tasiu@udusok.edu.ng
various development agencies, governmental and non-governmental agencies have initiated several developmental projects in marginalized areas, one of which is community development projects. Galadima, (2014) notes that, community development programme is one of the veritable tools for improving human condition. Within a decade (1985-1995), quite a few governmental grassroots development programmes were introduced in Nigeria such as the Directorate of Food, Roads and Rural Infrastructure (DFRRI), The National Directorate of Employment (NDE), the Community Bank scheme and the likes, although the impact of these programmes on the poor varies, but they have succeeded in, at least, generating more awareness about poverty and, to some extent, mobilizing the poor for development (Mboho and Inyang, 2011).

However, Mansuri and Rao (2013) note that, World Bank lending for community development projects worldwide has gone up from $325 million in 1996 to $2 billion in 2003. Samuel, Artkum, and Ebenezer, (2013) note that, during the period between 1950s and 1960s, Community Development (CD) was actively promoted throughout the developing world as part of the state building process and as a means of raising living standard of the people by governments and the United Nations through its affiliated institutions in Africa. Since independence, rural and community development has been declared a priority by the successive Federal governments-civilian or military alike... (Egbe, 2014). Mark (2002), notes that from 1984-2002 Nigeria has had thirty-seven poverty alleviation and community development programmes implemented to address the issues of poverty and provision of social services to communities but no any meaningful development was witnessed by communities in Nigeria.

Ajadi (2010), observe that Corruption and embezzlement at all levels of the government is hampering the effective implementation and consequent realization of community development programmes in Nigeria. Mohammed (2002), observed that most of the community development programmes adopted in Nigeria emphasize the infrastructural aspect of development at the expense of other facets of development.

The importance of community development in contemporary Nigerian society cannot be exaggerated, as community development ensures national development. Emeh, Eluw and Ukah(2012) state that, Community development is an important element and a sure way to the speedy development of Nigeria. Community development is a strategy of intervention or coordinated activities aimed at bringing about social and economic development, a process of helping a community to strengthen itself and develop towards its potential (Adedokun, Adeyemo, and Olorusola (2010). Khalid (2012), also notes that, provision of infrastructural facilities is one of the essential pre-requisites for the overall economic and social development of a country.

Yobe State economic summit and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) notes that Yobe State is among the states with highest poverty incidence in Nigeria, agrarian and Majority of its inhabitants are
peasants and lack all sought of social services that will improve their standard of living (Yobe, 2008 and Khalid, 2009).

Community and Social Development Projects (CSDPs) are part of World Bank assisted projects with the overall goal of improving access to human services for human development. It is an intervention built on previous poverty reduction projects structured to effectively target social and environmental infrastructure at community level. CSDP is specifically meant to empower communities to plan, part finance, implement, monitor, and maintain sustainable and socially inclusive multi sectoral micro projects (Abatcha, 2014). In the light of this, this study intends to study the impact of CSDP in improving the standard of living of the beneficiaries.

Handemlan (2006), notes that one of the salient characteristics of most developing countries is poverty, more especially in rural areas where there are poor social amenities. Communities in Nigeria are in condition of poverty, low income and investment, unemployment, low productivity and near absence of social and physical infrastructure (Obetta and Okide, 2012). Absence of or inadequate social amenities in rural communities has contributed to the problems in urban centers because such problems emanate from the unprecedented rural-urban migration which is derived from underdevelopment (Emeh, Eluw and Ukah, 2012). Egbe (2014), argue that problems of urban areas cannot be solved unless those of the rural areas are solved such as mass poverty and deprivation, social unrest and political instability- the types Nigeria is facing today, such as the uprising by the Boko Haram, ethnic militia, armed robbery and kidnapping, due to improper policies that touch people at the grassroots. Olubenga (2012) in his discussion on the causes of Boko Haram observe that the lack of adequate social amenities in the communities have given rise to hostilities and tension in most of North Eastern communities. Ebuka and Ifeanyi, (2010) observe that, the lopsidedness in community development programmes in Nigeria has bred many social problems as the youth in rural areas migrate to urban centers in search for better living. Aliyu (2008), note that the socio-economic problems of Yobe State have kept it to nearly the State at near bottom of the socio-economic development indices in Nigeria. Yobe State is typically a state with poverty level of 83.3% and second worst in the country in terms of infrastructure and public utilities (Gulani, 2008). During the dry season, communities in Damaturu use donkeys with rope to help pull the water from well for consumption and most settlements in rural areas may have one well serving the whole community. Similarly, two or more settlements/wards in urban areas may share a water source and residences in the major town depend on water that is sold in containers by vendors (ACF, 2011).

Despite the fact that many intervention programmes such as: Community-Based Poverty Reduction Programme (CBPRP), Fadama I, II, and III programmes, and other intervention programmes were introduced in the state with the aim of improving standard of living of the populace, most communities have remained underdeveloped in terms of basic social amenities (such as pipe borne water, educational facilities, electricity, employment opportunities etc.). Failure and non-sustainability of the previous development programmes have contributed to the low standard of living among the people, more especially in the rural communities, which later generate influx of rural people in to the urban
areas in order to improve their socio-economic status. Against this backdrop, this study is aimed at assessing the impact of CSDP in Damaturu, Yobe State. The study is a pioneer one in the area. To the best of the knowledge of the researcher, a similar work has not yet been done in Yobe state.

Research Questions

Against this background, the study is guided by the following research questions:

1. What is the impact of Community and Social Development Projects (CSDPs) on the socio-economic status of beneficiaries?
2. How does the CSDP improve accessibility of water to the beneficiaries?

Objectives of the Study

The broad aim of the study is to assess the impact of Community and Social Development Projects (CSDPs) in improving standard of living of beneficiaries in Damaturu LGA in Yobe State. The specific objectives are:

1. To determine the impact of CSDP on the socio-economic status of the beneficiaries.
2. To identify the impact of CSDP on accessibility of water to the beneficiaries.

Research Hypotheses

1. \( H_0 \) CSDP project has not made impact on the socio-economic status of the beneficiaries.
   \( H_1 \) CSDP project has made impact on the socio-economic status of the beneficiaries.
2. \( H_0 \) CSDP has not increased accessibility of water to the beneficiaries.
   \( H_1 \) CSDP has increased accessibility of water to the beneficiaries.

YSACSDP (2010), baseline survey revealed the availability or otherwise of basic infrastructural facilities across sectors. The sectors are education, health, water, economy, transportation, natural resources/environment and vulnerable/gender. The study revealed that, people had limited access to infrastructural facilities across the 17 LGAs (State) and, where it exists, the facilities are grossly inadequate both in terms of number of structures available and number of items or equipment put in place. On the poverty level, the study revealed that 51 % of rural households sampled were poor while 49 % were non-poor across the 17 LGAs. The study used regression model where variables like formal education, household size, and membership of association and ownership of farmland were used to determine the level of poverty.

Furthermore, in the case of the study area i.e. Damaturu LGA, the study revealed that, 70 % of the respondents believed that the existing primary schools were not adequate, 78 % also said they did not have access to secondary education for their wards, 90 % said the existing secondary schools were not adequate in terms of structures. The study revealed that 76 % of people did not have access to dispensary and about 95 % of the respondents said that the dispensaries were not adequate; 78 % said they did not have access to clinic and about 87 % said the availability of the clinic is not adequate (YSACSDP, 2010).
Socio-economic Impact of Community and Social Development Projects

The World Bank (2014) has revealed that, over 1600 community development plans are being implemented with about 3,435 micro projects, of which more than 50 percent have been completed and put to use. CSDP has benefited more than 2,500 communities with an estimated population of about 3 million people. There has been increase in primary and secondary school enrolments in the project communities in water sector, average distance to water source reduced. Abatcha (2014) note that CSDP in Yobe State has achieved substantially in improving the access of rural poor to social and natural resource infrastructure services, over one hundred communities were assisted with three hundred and twenty six micro projects. Gambo (2014) in a study conducted on the impacts of CSDP in Damaturu stated that, the projects had made significant impacts in the lives of people where people’s spending in purchasing water and transport fees had decreased.

CSDP projects have helped to increase the number of people with access to social services such as education, water supply, health services, and transport in the State. Number of person requesting for social services such as water, health, education, transport, rural electricity, recreational/commercial and gender/vulnerable were 325,833 male and 172,917 female. The total population having access to social services before intervention was 108,611 male and 86,458 females. Numbers of people found by the study with access to health facilities were 25,750 male and 29,231 females. The number of people with access to water, health and educational facilities increased by about 73%, 85% and 63% respectively (YSACSDP, 2012).

From this, one can conclude that the intervention has succeeded in increasing social services to people, but the point of contention is that would these projects sustain for a long period of time and salvage people from the menaces of underdevelopment?.

An empirical study conducted by Bello, Iliya and Ahmed (2008) on the effects of community development programmes on rural communities, traced the causes of underdevelopment of communities to poor governance which emanated from corruption, mismanagement and poor planning/implementation. The study revealed that, communal efforts with external interventions are solution to community’s problems. The study further revealed that, community development programmes in the study area have improved socio-economic life of people. In acknowledging the study, however, the sample size of 195 against 276,321 used for the study was inadequate by general estimate to make a generalised conclusion. Therefore this study makes effort to obtain a larger sample size that will be adequate for generalisation.

CSDP Water Project on Beneficiaries

United Nations general assembly recognised the right of every human being to have access to sufficient water for personal and domestic use between 50-100 liters per person per day which must be safe, acceptable and affordable (water cost should not exceed 3 percent of household income and
physically accessible). The water source has to be within 1,000 meter of the home and collection time should not exceed 30 minutes (Nkwede and Samuel, 2014).

A study conducted by Nkwede and Samuel (2014) on the impact of CSDP on rural water infrastructure revealed that Nigerian communities are characterised by the absence of poor social infrastructure, water inclusive. The study found that, effort of CSDP to provide communities with safe water supply were not realised because despite the intervention project People trek long distance and spent much time to fetch water, which is contrary to United Nations assertion. In acknowledging the study, however, the application of modernization theory which is a grand theory will not give a clear understanding to the impact of the project in a community. Therefore, this study makes effort to use micro theory in assessing the impact of CSDP water projects.

Empowerment Theory

Empowerment theory serves as a theoretical base for this work. The theory emerged from the need to humanise development policies and programmes. Development recognises power as a key element for bringing about effective social change. Empowerment as a concept is seen as freedom of choice and action that increases control over the resources and decisions that affect the life of an individual. Fride (2006) sees empowerment as an increase in the resources and capability of the poor to participate, negotiate, influence, control and ultimately demand accountability from the institutions that affect their lives. Empowerment is a social-action process that promotes participation of people, organisations, and communities toward the goals of increased individual and community control, political efficacy, improve quality of community life and social justice (Wallerstein, 1992 cited in Lord and Hutchison, 1993). Empowerment puts people at the center of the development process. It implies a participatory approach to development focusing on bottom-up approach rather than top-down approach. Empowerment is generally seen as a key to quality life, increased human dignity, good governance, pro-poor growth, project effectiveness and improved service delivery (Narayan, 2002 cited in Duncan, n.d). Empowerment is a technique that can have meaningful outcomes on community development. It is achieved through a thorough understanding of how each community is made up culturally. Empowerment theory expands the capabilities of the poor to undertake future self-help programmes through the concept of participation. It is a people oriented approach of making the community involved in the whole process rather than one with a focus on process and system which can exclude the community.

In integrating the theory to this study, the theory sees that major goal of development is to improve the quality of community life and social justice. This proved the literature reviewed that community development is a measure to reduce the inequitable system that leaves certain population isolated, marginalised and without access to important resources (Khalid, 2012). Objective of CSDP is to improve access to human services for human development. The theory emphasised that participation of beneficiaries in project implementation has significant impact in achieving community development goals which is the main approach uses by the Community and Social Development Project (CSDP) in
determining community need. The theory which also has the assumption that empowerment can improved the standard of living of beneficiaries and create good governance in a community, this also proved the literature reviewed that community development encompasses ability to feed, cloth, shelter, more income and provision of infrastructural facilities, good health to live longer, good education and participation in decision-making. Objective of CSDP is to improve standard of living of poor people through provision of social services.

Location of the Study

Damaturu Local Government Area (LGA.) is situated along the latitude and longitude of 11.75’ N and 11.96’ E respectively and 456 meter elevation above the sea level. History of Damaturu can be traced as far back as to 1910. The founders of Damaturu town were hunters. According to oral tradition, the hunters came to a stream in the northern part of the present Damaturu town in search of drinking water. They noted the place has plenty of wild animals which could serve as their source of food. They settled there and named the place Daturum in Kanuri language (meaning abundance of meat) (ACF, 2011).

Furthermore Damaturu LGA is among the first set of local government areas created in 1976 out of the former Borno State by the military government of General Murtala Muhammad. With the creation of Yobe State, from the defunct Borno State on 27 August 1991, Damaturu became the State capital. Farming and animal rearing are the main occupations of the people of Damaturu, the main crops grown are beans, millet, guinea corn, groundnut and gum Arabic. It has a traditional authority figure called mai Damaturu (Emir of Damaturu) and the Emir’s palace is situated in the ancient area of the town.

Sunday is the market day when people from within and outside Damaturu come for commercial activities. Majority of the people of Damaturu are Muslim with the exception of few settlers. The predominant ethnic groups in Damaturu are Kanuri and Fulani but with changes in status as the state capital, now many ethnic groups live in the town (ACF, 2011). The 2006 National Census revealed that, Damaturu LGA had a population of 87,361 inhabitants and the projected population as at 2014 is 90,281 (NPoC Gazette, 2009).

There are three tertiary institutions in Damaturu: State University, Federal Polytechnic and Dr. Umar Sule College of Nursing and Midwifery. There are also three public health care institutions i.e. Specialist Hospital, Maternity Hospital and Primary Health Care Center. Damaturu LGA is divided in to eleven (11) political wards namely Njiwaji/Gwange, Nayinawa, Damakasu, Murfakalam, Kalallawa/Gabai, Sasawa/Kabar, Bindigari/Pawari, Gambir/Moduri, Kukareta, Damaturu central and Maisandari. The LGA has four districts namely Shehuri, Maisandari, Sasawa and Bulaburin. These four districts are further divided into numerous communities. Damaturu LGA is bordered with Kaga LGA in Borno State in the East, Tarmuwa LGA in the North, Gujba LGA in the South and Fune LGA in the West (ACF,
Study Population

The study population consists of persons that are above the age of 18 from the benefiting communities. The reason for considering only persons from 18 years and above is to have accurate information. The research assessed the impact of CSDP in improving the standard of living of beneficiaries. The study was limited to five out of ten communities that benefited from CSDP intervention in Damaturu Local Government Area. The ten communities are Al-Ansar community, Pawari/Shagari Low cost community, Ben-Kalio/Moduri community, and Murfa Kalam community. Others are Waziri Ibrahim.
community, Don Etibet community, Kasaisa/University/mobile base community, YBC/Abbari community, Tijjani Zanna Zakariya community and Mohammed Al-Amin community with a total population of 48,829. The research is limited to five communities within Damaturu LGA, because of security reasons.

Sample Size and Sampling Techniques

The study focused on five out of ten communities that have so far benefited from the interventions of CSDP in Damaturu LGA. In selecting the communities purposive sampling technique was applied because of security reasons in the study area. The five communities have a total population of 28,840 inhabitants (YSACDP,n.d). Using Raosoft (2004) sample size calculator, the sample size for the study stood at 380 with a confidence level of 95%.

Table 1: Distribution of Sample size

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Communities</th>
<th>Projects</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AL-Ansar Community</td>
<td>Water, education, and environment</td>
<td>2,497</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pawari/Shagari Lowcost Community</td>
<td>Education and Water</td>
<td>4,340</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waziri Ibrahim Community</td>
<td>Education and Water</td>
<td>15,000</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YBC/Abbari Community</td>
<td>Education and Water</td>
<td>4,890</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tijjani Zanna Zakariya</td>
<td>Education and Water</td>
<td>2,113</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>28,840</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sample size of each of these communities was determined by its population percentage and CPMC Chairman of each of these communities also served as source for qualitative data (In-depth Interview).
Methods of Data Collection

The research employed both quantitative and qualitative methods to generate the data, using structured questionnaire for the quantitative method and In-depth Interview for qualitative method. Respondents were selected using simple random sampling technique, which was found to be appropriate to the study and it gives equal treatment to all the respondents for the quantitative data while five Chairmen of Community Projects Management Committee (CPMC) were interviewed for the qualitative data. The justification for using Community Projects Management Committee chairmen is to generate data that are not amenable to the questionnaire. These two methods were used to enrich the work. Research assistants were employed and trained to assist the researcher in the administration of questionnaires. For non-literate respondents, items were read and interpreted, and the responses appropriately ticked on their behalf by the researcher/research assistants.

(a) Quantitative Method

Questionnaire was used as the main instrument of data collection containing relevant questions. The questions were basically open and close-ended with fixed alternatives for the close ended questions. Also interview guides were used to collect qualitative data from the Chairmen of CPMC.

The questionnaire was divided into four sections, as follows: Section one consists of questions about the demographic data of the respondents such as sex, educational qualification, age, marital status, occupation, income etc. Section two consists of questions, on the impact of CSDP towards improving socio-economic status of the beneficiaries. Section three contains questions on objective two of the study, impact of CSDP in improving access to water. Section four contains questions on objective three of the study, which is to seek answers to questions, on the sustainability of projects.

(b) Qualitative Method

The interview schedule contained questions that focused on factors responsible for success or otherwise of the CSDP projects in the community, measures taken by the CPMC or community as a whole for the sustainability of the projects, process followed in getting the intervention, difficulties faced in the implementation process etc. The interviews were conducted with five CPMC chairmen of the sampled communities.

Methods of Data Analysis

In analysis of the data, a Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS, version 16.0) computer software was used as an aid to analyse the quantitative data. Frequency distribution, percentage and Chi-Square test were used to analyse the data. Frequency distribution shows the number of different responses to a particular question while percentage shows the proportion of each response and Chi-Square test was applied to test the hypotheses because the data are numerical and the research is interested in understanding relationship between two variables such as (participation and sustainability). The qualitative data were analysed using content analysis and matrix table. The data
were transcribed through converting recorded conversation into writing form translated verbatim and integrated to the quantitative data.

Data analysis and interpretation

This chapter deals with presentation, analysis and interpretation of the data generated from the field. Three hundred and eighty (380) structured questionnaires were administered on the beneficiaries out of which 378 were successfully retrieved and the analysis was therefore based on 378 respondents. The chapter is divided into six sections. These include socio-economic and demographic characteristics of respondents, impact of CSDP on socio-economic status of the beneficiaries, how CSDP improve accessibility of water to the beneficiaries, relationship between participation and sustainability, hypotheses testing and discussion of the findings.

Impact of Community Social Development Projects on Socio-Economic Status of Beneficiaries

This section discusses the impact of CSDP intervention in improving the socio-economic status of the beneficiaries. There are many intervention projects either by government or NGOs in the state aimed at to improving the socio-economic status of the people.

Table 2: Views of Respondents on Specific Aspects of Intervention Benefited

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specific aspect</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increased accessibility to infrastructure</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>63.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced expenditure</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>25.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved income</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Majority of the respondents 63.0% reported that the intervention increased their accessibility to infrastructure provided; 25.1% said that the intervention reduced their expenditure, 8.0 % reported that the intervention improved their income level while 1.9 % said they benefited from the intervention in other forms.

The data shows that the intervention made positive impact on the lives of the people. Projects like water and education apart from increased accessibility it also made both water and education affordable to the beneficiaries. The intervention provided conducive learning environment and increased the rate of enrolment of pupils in schools. The reduction in expenditure can be attributed to the amount spent in accessing the items provided to the respondents by CSDP. This reduction would help beneficiaries in saving or improving their purchasing power in some areas. In some instances, respondents reported that the intervention improved both their accessibility and reduced their
expenditure, 8.0% of the respondents said the intervention improved their income, and such respondents are either traders or vendors where the intervention projects opened opportunity of getting more money or had improved their businesses. About 1.9% said the intervention benefited them in other forms such as reduces time spent by children during fetching water and health condition of the beneficiaries. The effects of these benefits would have impact on the life style of the people in terms of socio-economic status.

Table 3: Views of Respondents on Whether the Intervention has Improved Standard of Living

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>318</td>
<td>84.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows that 84.3% said the intervention had impacted on their standard of living while 14.1% said the intervention had no impact on their standard of living. The improvement in standard of living is in the areas of reduction in expenditure, access to clean water and health. Cumulative effect of these services improved the standard of living of the beneficiaries. To support this, in an interview, a chairman of CPMC had this to say;

... CSDP had improved people living standard, Without CSDP some communities in Yobe state would not have access to water, will not have access to education, would not have access to road, so CSDP improved people’s living standard (in-depth interview with CPMC Chairman, 10/9/2015)

Impacts of CSDP on Water Project

This section discusses the impacts of CSDP intervention on water project before and after the intervention. Water project is one of projects that almost all the communities in the study area benefited. According to the United Nations, every human being should have access to portable water between 50-100 liters per day and total cost should not exceed 3 percent of household income with distance of not more than 1000 meters and time should not exceed 30 minutes.

Table 4 shows that 41.4% of the respondents reported that they get water from vendors; 32.1% used to fetch from other places, while 26.5% had water in their homes. The information on the table shows that majority of the respondents did not have access to portable water in their homes. They
Table 4: Means of Getting Water by Respondents before Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Means of getting water</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Buying from vendors</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>41.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fetching from another place</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>32.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Available at home</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>26.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>378</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

were either buying or fetching from other sources. Only few 26.5% of the respondents had water in their houses. This shows that most of the respondents were either spending money or time before getting water which had effect on their socio-economic lives considering the importance of water in human life. Substantial amount of respondents’ income and time are being spent on water which if improved the impact will change their life style. In support of the data, the chairmen had this to say:

before the intervention we used to patronised the service of water vendors, and our children are going to the state university which is far from here to fetch water (CPMC Chairman, 10/9/2015).

In the same vein, a respondent said:

CSDP have reduced the suffering of the community members, before the intervention we seriously suffered due to water scarcity in this community. (CPMC Chairman, 21/10/2015)

Table 5: Types of Water Used by Respondents before the Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of water</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Well water</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tap water</td>
<td>314</td>
<td>83.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>River water</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stream water</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>378</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 shows that, 12.7 percent of the respondents were using well water before the intervention; 83.0 % were using tap water; 2.9 % were using river water, 0.8 % were using stream water and 0.5 % were using other sources of water such as buying from vendor.

Table 6 presents the types of water used after the intervention. From the data, 7.1% had been using well water, 91.5 % used tap water, 0.3 % had river water; also 0.3 % used stream water, 0.8 % using other sources of water. The research found that, there was a slight positive change in the type of water used by the respondents after the intervention; where there was a noticeable decrease in number of people using well water from 12.7 % to 7.2 %, the number of people using tap water rose
from 83.0 % to 91.5 %, decrease in river water users from 2.9 % to 0.3 %. There was also decrease in stream water users from 0.8% to 0.3%. This shows that, the intervention made significant impact on the lives of people in terms of water.

Table 6: Types of Water Used after the Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of water</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Well water</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tap water</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>91.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>River water</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stream water</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>378</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was found that 43.5% of the respondents had access to water in less than 400 meters, 31.8% had access to water between 401-800 meters, 17.0 % had access to water in between 801-1,200 meters and 7.7 % of the respondents said they walk for more than 1,201 meters before getting water. This indicates that more than 7.7 % of the respondents had to go beyond the United Nations’ recommended distance of 1,000 meters before getting water. This has implication on children’s education as pupils whofetched water in the morning and evening before going to school missed classes or were always late.

The CPMC chairmen had this to say:

Before the intervention their children had to go to neighboring communities to get water, in a situation where there is no water in the neighborhood communities they find it very pathetic (chairman, 7/9/2015).

Also a respondent said before the intervention, “the situation is very pathetic they cover a distance of at least 2000 meters or more to get water” (21/10/2015).

Another respondent said before the intervention, “if they don’t get from water vendors or they have no money to buy they had to go to the State University which is almost half a kilometer from the community” (10/9/2015)
Table 8: Distance Covered by Respondents to Get Water after the Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Distance by meters</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than 400 meters</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>72.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-800 meters</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>801-1200 meters</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1201 meters above</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data shows that 72.1% of the respondents had access to water in less than 400 meters, 18.6% had access to water between 401-800 meters, 6.6% of the respondents covered distance of 801-1,200 meters to get water and more than 2.7% covered distance of more than 1,201 meters to get water. The research found that there has been a reduction of distance covered by the respondents before getting water. This reduction of distance had impact on their children’s education and improved their accessibility to clean water and good health condition.

“Now the water is in their doorstep, they have no problem” (Chairman, 21/10/2015).

In the same vein one of the respondents also said with the intervention they have no problem of water in the community and 70% of the houses are connected to the water source (Chairman, 8/9/2015).

Also another respondent said if the bore-hole is working they have no problem they are not going anywhere because the bore-hole is supplying water on daily basis (Chairman, 7/9/2015).

Table 9: Time Taken by Respondents to Get Water before Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than 30 minutes</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>49.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-60 minutes</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61 minutes-1 hour. 30 minutes</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 hr. 31 minutes -2 hr.</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 indicates that 49.9% of the respondents were getting water in less than 30 minutes, 29.2% spent around 31 to 60 minutes before getting water, and 14.1% spent 1hr to 1hr 30 min to get water, while 6.9% would spend 1hr.31 min to 2 hrs. to get water. From the data presented majority of the respondents spent more than 30 minutes to get water, which is against United Nations recommendation, which states that collection time should not exceed 30 minutes. The study revealed
that communities in the study area were lacking all sought of social services as some rural communities use donkeys to pull water from well during dry season and two more communities sharing one source of water. To support the information, the chairmen had this to say:

They use to fetch water at the University before the intervention which they had to trek for at least 15 minutes from their community for them to get water to their community they spend at least 30-45 minutes (Chairman, 10/9/2015).

Another respondent also said they spend at least 20-30 minutes to get water before the intervention (8/9/2015).

“Sometime for them to get vendor they spend not less than 30 minutes or 1 hour” (Chairman, 21/10/2015).

Table 10: Time Taken by Respondents to Get Water after Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than 30 minutes</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>72.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-60 minutes</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61 minutes - 1 hr. 30 minutes</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 hr. 31 minute - 2 hr.</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10 shows that 72.4 % of the respondents were getting water in less than 30 minutes, 12.7 % were getting water within 31 to 60 minutes, 10.6 % were getting water within 61 to 1hr30minutes and 3.7 % spent 1 hr. 31 min to 2 hrs to get water. From the data, there was a significant reduction of time taken by respondents to get water. Before the intervention, 49.9 % spent 30 minutes to get water. After the intervention it increased to 72.4%. Those that were getting water within 31to 60minutes reduced from 29.2 % to 12.7% and those getting water within 61 min to 1hrs 31min to 2hrs also reduced from 6.9 % to 3.7%. This indicates that there was improvement in access to water which had positive effect on socio-economic life of people by reducing the expenditure on water, and access to clean water.

The chairmen had this to say:

Now the water is in their doorstep, they need not to spend much time only a matter of on the borehole by the operator (Chairman, 21/10/2015)

With few minutes now they get water even if a person has not connect his house in not more than 5 minutes they get from his/her neighbor (Chairman, 5/9/2015)

Also another respondent said with the intervention, now their houses are now connected to the water source they need not to go anywhere to fetch water (Chairman, 7/9/2015)
Table 11: Monthly Expenditure on Water before the Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than ₦1,000</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>38.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>₦1,001-₦2,000</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>23.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>₦2001-₦3,000</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>26.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>₦3001- above</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11 indicate that 38.5 % of the respondents spent less than ₦1,000 per month on water, 23.3 % spent ₦1,001 to ₦2,000 per month, 26.5 % spent ₦2,001 to ₦3,000 monthly and 11.4 % spent more than ₦3,001 on water every month. According to the United Nations recommendation, water cost should not exceed 3 % of household income. The finding shows that, Yobe State Water Corporation charged only ₦200 per month as water bill in the state and water vendors’ were selling 300 liters of water at the cost of ₦150 to ₦300. If government and other donor agencies intervene in providing boreholes and other sources of water in communities, the cost of water paid for by people would reduce. To support this data, the chairmen had this to say:

we only pay ₦200 monthly to state water cooperation as water bill (CPMC Chairman, 10/9/2015)

With the intervention we only pay ₦200 per month to Yobe State water cooperation (CPMC Chairman, 8/9/2015)

Table 12: Monthly Expenditure on Water after Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than ₦1,000</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>65.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>₦1,001-₦2000</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>15.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>₦2,001-₦3,000</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>₦3,001- above</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 12 shows that about, 65.8 % of the respondents were spending less than ₦1,000 on water monthly, 15.9 % spends ₦1,001 to ₦2,000, 14.1 % spent ₦2,001 to ₦3,000 and 4.0 % spent more than ₦3,001. From the data, it was revealed that the intervention reduced respondents’ expenditure on water. Before the intervention only 38.5 % of respondents were spending less than ₦1,000 on water monthly but after the intervention the percentage increased from 38.5 % to 65.8 %, those that spent ₦1,001 to ₦2,000 also reduced from 23.3 % to 15.9 %, and those that spent ₦2,001 to ₦3,000 also reduced from 26.5 % to 14.1 % and those that spent more than ₦3,000 also reduced from 11.4 % to 4.0 %. From this analysis the research revealed that the intervention made impact on the livelihood of respondents and this also improved the socio-economic status of beneficiaries. Such developmental
project had meaningful impact in addressing poverty in the society, as chronic poverty seriously deprived people’s progress over a long period of time.

**Hypothesis I**: CSDP projects has made impact on the socio-economic status of the beneficiaries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 13: Relationship between CSDP Projects and Socio-Economic Status of the Beneficiaries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CSDP Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**X²** | Df | Significant level |
| 8.554 | 01 | 0.003 |

Source: SPSS output

*Note: (**) indicates significant at 5% level.*

The information shows that coefficient of Chi – square of 8.554 with degree of freedom one (1) is significant at 5% level of significant. In testing hypotheses one, we accept the alternative hypothesis which states that “CSDP has impact on the socio-economic of the beneficiaries. This is because the calculated value is higher than the critical value which is 3.641 the result shows that CSDP intervention has significant impact on the socio-economic of the beneficiaries.

**Hypothesis II**: CSDP has increased accessibility of water to the beneficiaries

The information shows that the coefficient of Chi – square of 46.351 with degree of freedom one (1) is significant at 5% level of significant. In testing hypothesis two, we accept the alternative hypothesis which states that “CSDP has increased accessibility of water”. The result shows that CSDP has significantly increased accessibility of water to the beneficiaries. This is because the calculated value is higher than the critical value which is 3.641
Table 14: Relationship between CSDP Water Project and Accessibility of Water

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CSDP Project</th>
<th>Accessibility of Water</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>X²</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Significant level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>46.351</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SPSS output

Note: (**) indicates significant at 5% level.

Discussion of the Major Findings

The socio-economic and demographic data for the study are sex, age, marital status, number of children, income level, education and occupation. On the sex variation there was quite significant difference as males constituted 74.3% while females 25.7%. On the age, majority of the respondents found were youth under age category of 18-40 years which constituted about 61.5%. Similarly on the marital status, the finding revealed that 64.2% of the respondents were married and the majority had children while on the income level, the finding showed that only 35.3% of the respondents earned above ₦ 40,000 per month, the study also reveals that majority of the respondents were educated either in Quran or western knowledge.

The findings of the study clearly revealed that people had low access to social services in the study area. Social amenities like water and education which are essential amenities for human survival were inadequate in all the sampled areas where people had to spend high percentage of their income in buying water, and this also affected children’s education as they had to fetch water before going to school. This is also evident in the literature reviewed where the baseline study conducted before the intervention found poor access to social services in the study area (YSACSDP, 2012).

The study found that there was no conducive learning environment for children in the study area where children were congested in a temporary class. It was found that with the intervention pupils’ learning environment improved and parents’ expenditure on children education also reduced in terms of transportation and school fees. Though provision of physical infrastructure alone would not suffice the development of education in the community, still there is the need for the communities to be provided with more teaching aids. Orji (2005) notes that the scarcity of basic textbooks and other instructional
materials as well as teaching aids, inadequate motivation of the teaching force at the primary, secondary and tertiary institutions contribute to the deterioration of educational system.

United Nations General Assembly recognised the right of every human being to have access to sufficient water for personal and domestic use between 50-100 liters per person per day which must be safe, acceptable and affordable and the water cost should not exceed 3 percent of household income and physically accessible the water source has to be within 1,000 meters of the home and collection time should not exceed 30 minutes. This study discovered that there is significant improvement with regards to United Nations recommendation for access to water in the study area. Before the intervention only 83 % had access to tap water which rose to 91.5% after the intervention. Also before the intervention, only 38.5 % spent less than ₦ 1000 per month on water while after the intervention it was increased to 65.8 % which shows that there was reduction in people’s expenditure on water. It was also observed that before the intervention more than 24 % of the respondents had access to water in a distance of 1000 meters, and after the intervention it was reduced to 9.3 %. In terms of time, the research found that only 49.9 % of the respondents have access to water in less than 30 minutes before the intervention with the intervention it increased to more than 72 %. As shown in the above tables. The researcher notes that, if such effort were to be continued, the United Nations recommendation and goal 6 of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) would be realised and this can usher in to the desired level of economic growth which cannot be attained unless the social sector is properly developed.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study, the study proffers the following recommendations:

i. Government should try to improve access of social services to people since provision of these services is one of the bedrocks of development.

ii. Governments at all levels should improve their budgetary allocations in micro community projects to address poverty in the society.

iii. Federal government should establish a similar agency like that of the CSDP to approach community development in the country

References


Counselling and Government Policy as Panaceas for Repositioning Girl Child Education in Nigeria: Some Lessons from Edo State

Henrietta Ijeoma Alika¹ and Oyaziwo Aluede²

Abstract: Counselling is a service targeted at enhancing the potentials of the individual through self-understanding and self-development. So, counselling girls, who are denied access to education will help them acquire basic education since one of the goals of counselling is to help individuals learn how to make informed decisions. Current authors posit that government policy at various levels is a strong instrument for effecting positive changes that would enhance the education of the girl child. This paper further posits that if government makes it a policy that counsellors should be trained, working tools and facilities provided for the counsellors, and ensures that each school has a counsellor, with the primary objective of counselling girls at risk of dropping out of school and those denied access to basic education, enrolment of girls in school would be increased. This paper recommended that government should as a matter of urgency, train more counsellors and ensure that counsellors are equipped with professional tools/facilities and posted to all schools in the Federation. In addition, the government should put in place policies that would ensure conducive atmosphere where the girl child can maximize her potentials, contribute towards national development, transformation and secure her own empowerment.

Keywords: 3, Government Policies, Girl Child Education, School Success Increased Access to Schooling

Introduction

Nigeria considers the education of her citizenry as an indispensable tool to fulfill the desires of the country of having “a free, just and democratic society … a land full of bright opportunities” (Federal Republic of Nigeria, 2004). Education no doubt is a vehicle through which individuals could acquire appropriate skills, abilities and competencies, as well as, train their minds in understanding the world around. Repositioning Girl Child Education in Nigeria will therefore go a long way in ensuring that the gender gap which hitherto exists is reduced to the barest minimum. In pursuance of the desire to ensure

¹ Dept. of Educational Evaluation and Counselling Psychology, University of Benin, Benin City, Nigeria. Email: hennietta.alika11@gmail.com
² Dept. of Guidance and Counselling, Ambrose Alli University, Ekpoma, Nigeria. Email: oyaziwoalude@gmail.com
that education is accessible to all children in the country, the National Policy on Education (Federal Republic of Nigeria, 2013) stipulates that:

Pursuant to the commitment to the global education for All (EFA) initiative, the millennium Development Goals (MDGs) as well as National Developmental Goals encapsulated in the National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (NEEDS) document, Basic Education is by law, compulsory for all children of school age in Nigeria…. education is compulsory and a right of every Nigerian irrespective of gender, social status, religion, ethnic background and any peculiar individual challenges.

As can be observed from the statement above, education will be highly rated in national development plans, including the education of the Girl Child. No wonder the National Policy on Women in section 6:1:3 (Federal Republic of Nigeria, as cited in Federal Republic of Nigeria, 2011) states that:

For the Nigerian women to enjoy the full benefits of contemporary living, they require basic education to contribute meaningfully to the development of the country. Government shall in this regard increase girls and women participation in education, irrespective of their location and circumstances.”

Consequently, it is expected that if government fulfills her obligation in this regard, that is, in ensuring an increase in girls and women participation in education, as this will go a long way in enhancing and repositioning girl child education in the country. Unfortunately, government, certain factors subsumed in historical, religious, socio-economic, cultural beliefs and school-related factors, affect the Girl Child’s access to education. Research in developing countries indicates that females in the household, especially young daughters, act as providers of free childcare at home (Pitt & Rosenzwig, 1990).

Mohammed (2000) reports that a girl may be withdrawn from school if lucrative marriage prospect arises. Alika and Egbochuku (2008) in a study on the factors hindering the girl child access to education found that poor socio-economic status ranked the highest (53%), followed by poor academic performance (16%), bullying by the opposite sex (10%), unfriendly school environment (9%), distance of school from home (5%), pregnancy/early marriage (4%), while ill health, inadequate teaching and death of parents (1%).

UNICEF (2004) report indicates that girl’s school attendance still lags severely behind that of boys. Moreover, the same report by UNICEF on “Progress for Children”, shows that the current rate of progress in Nigeria is too slow to achieve gender parity and universal primary education.

In Nigeria, about 10 million children are out of school and 52% are girls (Alika, 2009). UNICEF (2004) report indicates that the gender gap favouring boys has remained consistently wide in Nigeria over the years. This could be as a result of some factors identified above. Therefore, there is the need to explore the role of counselling in repositioning Girl Child education in Nigeria. Educating girls is a priority as stated in the National Policy on Women. Each year, a girl in school is a progressive step towards eliminating poverty, advancing sustainable human development and controlling preventable illnesses. In this paper therefore, efforts were made to explore the role of counselling and government policies in repositioning the education of the girl child in Nigeria.
Girl Child Education in Nigeria

Education remains a vital tool for self-reliance and national development in Nigeria, including the education of the Girl Child. Studies (Egbochuku & Alika, 2005; Egbochuku & Alika, 2008) have shown that education or human development is at the core of every socio-economic development. No wonder Alika and Egbochuku (2009) found that the socio-economic status of the girls in Nigeria imposes considerable constraints upon their stay in school. In fact, they asserted that a girl’s particular socio-economic inheritance may have a direct and important effect on her educational attainment. Moreover, Girl Child education in Nigeria is a mirage in the lives of some Nigerian girls because some of them are forced into early marriage as from the age of 12 and the regression in basic education is reflected in the fact that the net enrolment rate for girls is very low, with a high drop-out rate (Ocholi, 2002).

UNICEF (2004) reports that Nigeria is one of the 25 developing countries of the world with low enrolment rates for girls with a gender gap of more than 10% in primary education and more than 1 million girls out of school. The same report indicates that Girl Child Education leads to more equitable development, stronger families, better services, better child health and effective participation in governance. Osakwe, Osagie, Madunagu and Usman (1995) observed that Nigerian girls, for various cultural, socio-economic, health and school related factors are not given a fair chance in the educational sector. In Nigeria about 7.3 million children do not enroll in schools of which 62% are girls (UNICEF, 2004). The same report indicates that girl’s primary school completion rate is far behind that of boys, at 76% compared with 85% for boys. Moreover, gender variation still exists in school attendance in Nigeria. For example, in 2010 female attendance in schools stood at 81.2% lower than that of males with 88.1% (Federal Republic of Nigeria, 2010). Nigerian males continue to constitute a significant portion of the student body in the country, increasing its percentage share each year from 77.55% in 2010 to 83.82% in 2012. The number of Nigerian male students enrolled in schools increased by 59.12% between 2010 and 2012. Nigerian female students increased only by 8.43%. In fact, Nigerian female students number increased at an average of only 4.13% between 2010 and 2012, while their male counterparts number increased at an average of 26.42% (Federal Ministry of Education, 2015).

Meaning of Counselling

Counselling is the skilled and principled use of relationship to facilitate self-knowledge, emotional acceptance, growth and optimal development of personal resources. The overall aim of counselling is to provide an opportunity to work towards living more satisfactorily and resourcefully with a view to facilitating normal development and prevent frustrations, anxiety, stress and disengagement from school. Guidance and Counselling focuses on a programme of relevant services as well as processes of helping individuals within and outside the school environment to realize their fullest potentialities in their emotional, moral, social, academic and vocational development (Okobiah & Okorodudu, 2004). Egbule (2002) opined that guidance and counselling is discerned to help people cope with their problems with the assistance of an expert whose aim is to facilitate behaviour change, enhance coping skills, promote decision making process, improve relationship with others and facilitate the development
of individual’s potentials. When the Girl Child is counselled appropriately, she could reconsider the need to go back to school and complete her education. UNESCO (2000) asserted that there are three major components of Guidance and Counselling; these are educational, vocational and personal social guidance. The main goals of counselling are to enable each individual to derive maximum educational benefits, so as to enhance his/her potentials. In line with this goal, one of the objectives of the Nigerian National Policy on Education states “in view of the apparent ignorance of many young people about career prospects and in view of personality maladjustments among students, career officers and counsellors will be appointed in post-primary institutions” (Federal Republic of Nigeria, 2004).

Counselling and Girl Child Education

It is pertinent to note that despite the issuance of the statement above and how vital these statements are in repositioning the education of the Girl Child who, if given the privilege of counselling would have completed her education, the stated objective has not been given the attention it deserves in the country, in that studies have shown that counsellors and career masters are only posted to a few urban schools in Edo State, Nigeria (Egbochuku and Alika, 2010).

The neglect of this objective of the National Policy on Education may be responsible for the high incidence of drop out from schools among adolescents in the country (Alika & Ataha, 2012). There is the need to accord counselling a position of pre-eminence in our society, if the education of the Girl Child is to be prioritized and repositioned. No wonder Abiri (1978), Alika and Ohanaka (2013) asserted that if the society is not to be plagued by a band of disgruntled, frustrated and unrealistic individuals, it is desirable that adequate guidance, counselling and career information be provided to the adolescents. These would enable schools, parents, government and the society to arrive at a realistic vocational choice for the girl child.

Counselling helps the individual to see things more clearly, possibly from a different view-point. This can enable the individual to focus on feelings, experiences or behaviour with the goal of facilitating positive changes and enhancing his/her potentials. Counselling has a broad range of activities, programmes and services all with a view to assisting individuals to understand themselves, their problems, their school environment, family environment, their world and to develop the capacity for making wise choices and decisions. With adequate access to counselling, the Girl Child could complete her education and contribute towards national development. However, studies have shown that, Education which is the right of every child male or female, according to article 29 of The Convention on the Right of the Child is a mirage in the lives of some Nigerian girls because some of them are forced into early marriages as from age 12 (Ocholi, 2002; Alika & Egbochuku, 2008; Alika 2013). In a study conducted by Alika (2005) it was discovered that there was a decline in the enrolment of girls into school in Edo State. Therefore counselling becomes a viable tool in ensuring that the education of the girl child is given a position of pre-eminence in the nation as there is a positive correlation between counselling and re-entry of girls into school (Egbochuku & Alika, 2005). In addition, theories and policies have
identified the significant role of counseling families and the government in ensuring school re-entry and achievement (Fan & Chen, 2001; Hill & Chao, 2000; Seginer, 2006).

The Role of Counselling in the Repositioning of the Girl Child Education

In view of the role of counseling in repositioning Girl Child Education, there is the need for the application of counseling approaches in ensuring school completion by the Girl Child. This could be done by organizing self-confidence workshop or training for the girls who are at risk of dropping out of school, equipping them with skills on how to adjust, knowing that is not the life events that create problem but how the individual experiences life events and how positively they feel about themselves which no doubt will boost their self-esteem and confidence in harnessing their potentials. Moreover, the behavioural approach to counseling could be adopted in counseling girls on the need to complete their educational pursuits especially those who hitherto had dropped out of school as a result of some life challenges. The girls may be taught some skills to help them manage their lives more effectively. Edo State Government in Nigeria has been responsive in this regard by establishing Skill Acquisition Centres in the State and the construction of Model Schools for adolescents and girls who have been denied access to education. Also, cognitive behavioural counselling like Rational Emotive Behaviour Therapy could be one of the counselling approaches that could be utilized in helping the Girl Child access education and complete her educational career. This approach aims at getting them change whatever negative beliefs they may be experiencing, with the view of boosting their self-esteem and optimally enhancing their potentials. In addition, Alika (2008) advocated that academic advisers should create environments that are students friendly and help them build their self-confidence; provide adequate counselling facilities and tools amongst others.

Some Barriers to Girl Child Education in Nigeria

- Poverty and Economic issues could be hindrance to the girl child access to education, with 70% of the population living below poverty line. Girls are often sent to generate income to families by selling wares in the market or on the streets. Thus, the social economic status of the girls imposes considerable constraints upon their continuous stay in school; they asserted that a girl’s particular social economic inheritance may have a direct and important effect on her educational attainment (Egbochuku & Alika, 2005).
- Early Marriage and Teenage Pregnancy may hinder a girl’s access to education. This has also militated against girl’s attendant, retention and achievement in schools. About 30% of school age girls drop out of schools Ocholi, (2002) having begun child bearing before the age of 18. Mohammed (2000) also found that a girl may be withdrawn from school, if a good marriage prospect arises.
- Inadequate Infrastructure may affect the Girl Child access to school. For example, if class room space, furniture and equipment are lacking and if the schools are in rugged and unsafe physical condition with no water, poor health and sanitation facilities and if pupil teacher ratios are high with as many as 100 students in one class, especially in school in urban slums, these factors may hinder the Girl Child’s access to school. No wonder, Azikiwe (2000) and Egbochuku and
Alikas (2005) reported that unfriendly school environment may account for girls drop out of school.

- Cultural and Religious Biases could be a factor that hampers a Girl Child’s access to education, in that many Nigerian girls especially in large families with limited resources may enroll boys in schools instead of girls. Some parents also keep their daughters out of school due to misinterpretation of tenets of Islamic Religion. This is in line with the findings of Osakwe, Osagie, Madunagu and Usman (1995) who reported that Nigerian girls for various reasons bordering on religion and cultural factors are not given a fair chance in the educational sector.

**Nigerian Government Policies and Girl Child Education**

The role of government policy in Nigeria as regards the repositioning of girl child education is of paramount importance to all stake holders in the educational sector. The Federal Government of Nigeria formulated and maintained a body of educational policies to help create an effective and viable Educational Sector. One of these policies is the Universal Basic Education (UBE) programme, with the aim of providing “free universal basic education for every Nigeria child of school age, reducing the incidence of drop out, catering for the learning needs of young persons who for one reason or the other have to interrupt their schooling through appropriate forms of complementary approaches ….” (Universal Basic Education Commission, 2004). Moreover, the government established the National Commission for Mass Literacy, Adult and Non-Formal Education to ensure the provision of functional education to individuals.

**Some Efforts by the Edo State Government in Repositioning the Girl Child Education**

It has been observed that government policy of Free Education and Scholarship Scheme for all in Northern Nigeria had enabled children of school age to access education. The scheme or policy also made provisions for girls who dropped out of school as a result of early marriage, some of these girls were awarded scholarship, this is with the view of updating their education, skills and knowledge so as to secure jobs and adjust to the needs of the society (Daily Trust, 2014). Omoruyi (2012) opined that government policy in Edo State have facilitated the re-entry of girls into schools, in that the Universal Basic Education Act of 2004(Universal Basic Education Commission, 2004), it stipulates free education for all children in Primary and Junior Secondary Schools, thus making education affordable and accessible to all children of school age. Also, as stated in the National Policy on Education (Federal Republic of Nigeria, 2013), government shall provide the following, educational services for the Basic Education level, School Libraries, School Health Services, Guidance and Counseling, Educational Resource Centres, Laboratories and Workshops. To complement the efforts of the federal government, state governments in Nigeria established Mass Literacy Programmes, in some State Ministry of Education, Women Education Unit, Adult and Non-Formal Education Department are established to encourage functional education for Women, Youths and Adults, and eradicate illiteracy. Despite these efforts, government policy as a tool for educational development continues to be a question of critical concern in developing countries in Africa (Tikly, 2001). Specifically, in Edo State, Nigeria the establishment of Institutes of Continuing Education, Skill Acquisition Centres and the introduction of
the Universal Basic Education Programme has no doubt ensured that most girls who should have been out of school are engaged in schools, as observed by Alika (2005) who found in a study on pattern of dropout and re-enrolment of girls in Secondary Schools in Edo State, that girls usually re-enter school after dropping out as a result of some life challenges.

As laudable as the Universal Basic Education programme has been, studies indicate that non-politicization of the programme is key to ensuring its success (Oleri, Ibukun, Oyedeji & Tahir, 2005). In a study by Ohanaka and Alika (2011), found that most adolescents who dropped out of school, re-entered school as a result of government policies. Outreach Programmes by government on the need to be educated, establishment of Model Schools by government, introduction of Free Education, nearness of schools to homes among others. Government policies if well implemented no doubt is a strong instrument for repositioning the education of the Girl Child. Stuart (2010) reported that the formulation of a policy for financial aid option for adults who want to continue their education is a welcomed trend. In Edo State, the construction of Model Public Schools by government, implementation of the UBE programme has restored confidence in parents who now send their children to these schools. The State Government in its determination to make learning conducive for students, procured and distributed 37,440 units of single seaters and 43,242 units of double seaters furniture for use by Public Primary and Secondary Schools, all these have added impetus to the enrolment of the Girl Child in schools. The Government also embarked on training and retraining of teachers in schools so as to meet with current standards and enhance service delivery, and the abolition of illegal levies imposed on students among others (Edo State Government, 2011).

Moreover, the state government embarked on Skill Acquisition Education for the females who could not access formal education. These females were given monthly stipend and at the end of their training they were given take-off grants. In addition the government ensured regular release of the monthly

Table 1: Male and Female Enrolment figures for 2014/2015 Academic Session in Edo State

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary 1</td>
<td>29522</td>
<td>28723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary 2</td>
<td>27549</td>
<td>26879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary 3</td>
<td>28794</td>
<td>27403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary 4</td>
<td>28590</td>
<td>27641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary 5</td>
<td>26915</td>
<td>26825</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary 6</td>
<td>26660</td>
<td>25403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Secondary School 1</td>
<td>20533</td>
<td>20613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Secondary School II</td>
<td>20389</td>
<td>20807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Secondary School III</td>
<td>19460</td>
<td>19946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>228,407</td>
<td>224,210</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Edo State Basic Education Ministry 2015.
subvention to the Edo State Skills Acquisition Centre at Evbomodu, Benin City, so as to ensure that the education of the Girl Child at the centre is not disrupted. These policies, no doubt, have enhanced the enrolment of the students in schools, as can be seen in the table 1.

The statistics above shows that more needs to be done by all stakeholders to ensure that girls enroll and complete their educational pursuits in the nation. Though, statistics for enrolment of males and females into the Junior Secondary Schools shows that the female enrolment figure is higher than that of the males, this may be attributed to the country’s Universal Basic Education policy which is free from the Primary School level to the Junior Secondary School level.

Some Lessons from Government Policies in other African Countries Regarding Girl- Child Education

In Guinea, studies found that Government Policy support or enact a culture of having greater investment on girls’ education, such that girls of all ages are beneficiaries of Government Financial assistance. Study postulates that in times of adverse financial condition boys can be withdrawn from school while girls are encouraged to go to school (World Bank Group, 2014).

There is the need to take note of the example of Zambia where the government has put in place a policy to facilitate re-entry of girls into school. Some of the actions that are being taken include:
- Advocacy to ensure that pregnant girls go back to school after delivery her baby.
- Counselling services are offered to girls who get pregnant.
- Bursaries are provided to vulnerable girls to enable them complete their education.
- Affirmative action for girls which lowers entry points in higher grades and tertiary education amongst others. Findings indicate that a consistent 38% to 40% of girls who might otherwise have dropped out of school are being readmitted and are confident of completing their education (Zambia Ministry of Education, 2000).

Conclusion
Counselling is a veritable tool in repositioning the education of the girl child. Consequently, there is the need to ensure that stakeholders are counselled on the need to prioritize the education of the Girl Child. Therefore, Counselling Services as a matter of priority should be made available in schools and the society in general. Also, there is the need to encourage Guidance and Counselling activities for teachers and parents in schools, with a view to getting them involved in the education and continued stay in school of the Girl Child, since they are major key players in this regard. Counsellors could adopt various counseling approaches in ensuring that the Girl Child access to education is not hindered by various challenges.

The Federal Government policy on education sees Education as an indispensable instrument to ensuring that her citizens enjoy a free, just and democratic society. The introduction of Universal Basic Education, Mass literacy Programmes, establishment of Skill Acquisition Centres by Federal and State
Governments no doubt have contributed towards the reduction of drop out from schools and the repositioning of the girl child education in Nigeria. However, it is regrettable that the enrolment figure for the Girl Child still remains low compared to that of their male counterparts.

Recommendations

It is recommended that counseling facilities and tools should be provided in schools. Counselors should identify girls that are at risk of dropping out of school or who may have dropped out of school and provide some counseling services to them with a view to getting them effectively engaged in school. It is the view of the researchers that appropriate counseling approaches should be adopted in counseling the girl child on the need to develop her potentials. Cognitive Behavioural Counseling like Rational Emotive Behaviour Therapy could be utilized among other approaches; this is with a view to enhancing their self-esteem, and ensuring that their potentials are optimally enhanced.

In addition, laws should be promulgated by government to ensure that the girl child has access to education, and the prohibition of all cultural barriers that hinder the education of the Girl Child. Schools should be established for the education of girls who may have dropped out of school as a result of some challenges beyond their control. There is the need for the provision of gender responsive school environment, massive sensitization on the education of the Girl Child, and the introduction by government of a mechanism to decisively and systematically deal with all types of gender violence against women.

References


Ocholi, E.F. (2002, August). The girl child is vulnerable in access to quality education. A paper presented at the 26th Annual Conference of the Counseling Association of Nigeria held at the University of Benin, Benin City, Nigeria.


